



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program**

Citizens' Oversight Committee Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, July 25, 2018 4:30 pm

**Conference Room 1700
Kaiser Center Tower, 17th Floor
300 Lakeside Drive, Oakland CA 94612**

Meeting Number	Meeting Date	Meeting Time
Term 6, Meeting 5	July 25, 2018	4:41 pm – 5:30 pm
Attendees	<i>Current Members</i> Clinton J. Loftman Derek Schaible, chair Ching Wu Karen Varnado, vice chair	<i>BART Director</i> Robert Raburn <i>Staff</i> Zecharias "Zach" Amare Thomas Horton Jose "Ramiro" Salazar Rachel Russell Diann Castleberry Christopher Vasquez
Agenda Item	Action Taken	
Welcome & Introductions	<p>D. Castleberry called the meeting to order at approximately 4:41 pm.</p> <p>D. Castleberry acknowledged the following BART representatives in attendance: Director Robert Raburn, ESP Group Manager Zecharias "Zach" Amare, Group Manager Thomas "Tom" Horton; Senior Planner Rachel Russell (Systems Development); and Christopher Vasquez, The Allen Group (On-Call Community Relations).</p> <p>D. Castleberry took roll call, noted members in attendance and confirmed there was a quorum.</p> <p>The Committee was informed that committee member Sang Bak Lee was excused. Additionally, the Committee was informed that Community At Large member Janine DeHart submitted her notice of resignation as she is moving outside the area. Consistent with the Earthquake Safety Citizens' Oversight Committee Bylaws section 7.2 Membership Alternatives and 7.6 Membership Vacancy, Karen Varnado, who has served as an alternate, has accepted the Community At Large member seat. No Board action is required.</p>	



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>D. Castleberry noted one member of the public in attendance.</p>
Informational Report	<p>Service Plan for TBT</p> <p>Rachel Russell, Senior Planner, representing Systems Development provided an update on the service plan for the TBT retrofit contract.</p> <p>The report is a follow-up to the April 25 meeting and covered the following presentation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. General Board feedback from the July 12 meeting2. Outreach activities completed in Phase 1 and planned for Phase 23. Survey results4. Ridership Demographics5. Summary of origin stations ranked by passenger passthrough in first hour6. Top 9 destination stations in first hour of service7. Bus network design, including features, span, sample trips, and factors considered8. Proposed parking plan9. Next steps and schedule <p>R. Russell reported that current work activity is focused on finalizing the bus network with the goal to go back to the Board late September 2018 to present a final plan for their review and adoption. She also confirmed that the service change will not occur in September 2018. The new service hours are expected to start on February 11, 2019.</p> <p>R. Russell further explained that the public and Board showed preference towards Bus Network Option B, which requires working with local bus service providers to enhance/add express bus service.</p> <p>R. Russell reminded the committee that this service plan does not meet the threshold for Title VI, however, working with the Office of Civil Rights (OCR), the analysis and outreach was done following a Title VI methodology. Outreach and survey feedback was conducted from April 4 through April 23, consisting of on-board train surveys, in-station outreach events, along with online survey and communication outreaches, and media ad placements in multiple languages. The objective was to inform BART riders of the planned change and to identify the public's preferred bus network option. Nearly 1,300 surveys were captured, which is nearly half of BART's ridership in that first hour of morning service.</p>



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

Subsequently, BART opened a new station in Antioch. This station is now the 3rd largest origin station in the system for early morning service with 349 BART riders in the first hour, with Pittsburg/BayPoint remaining in the #1 largest origin station spot with 418 riders.

Moving forward, we are working with many bus network agencies to make this service work for BART riders – particularly aiming to create a robust service that can get people to work on time and paying the same rate or less.

Beginning in September, we will begin Phase 2 Outreach, which will involve talking to many individuals, chambers, hospitality groups (i.e., San Francisco Hotel Council), food service, airport and on-airport employees (i.e., rental car company employees, FedEx, UPS, airlines and concessionaires) along with a series of in-station outreach events. The focus will be to inform stakeholders of the timeline, to refine the concept, to share bus network operations and use, as well as other practical information sharing around daily parking and connections to key service such as SamTrans and Muni public transportation from the Salesforce Transit Center to SFO, Millbrae, and other locations.

Currently, the service plan calls for 15 new direct lines of connecting bus service and expects the first bus to arrive at the Salesforce Transit Center by 4:45 am and the last bus to arrive at approximately 5:45 am. Additionally, we will be working to connect with Owl (nighttime) services. We are also proposing to create midline starts to move BART trains to the core of our system a little faster for early morning service.

Below is a summary of questions and comments presented by members and BART representatives of the Earthquake Safety Citizens' Oversight Committee:

1. In your Bus Network B option, should the green line from El Cerrito del Norte Station to the San Francisco Sales Force Transit Center be identified in orange as an express bus line? (Staff will make the correction).
2. Will *eBART* (from Antioch Station) continue to run?
3. Do you know how many buses you will be running as part of this change in service hours?
4. How are you accommodating luggage for travelers trying to get to the airport?



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)
Earthquake Safety Program**

	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Will buses take Clipper cards? 6. Who handles the ticketing for BART? 7. Will bus companies collect cash payments to use their express service or will they have to use a Clipper card? 8. Will the bus service providers honor current BART discount programs? 9. How do you currently pay for daily parking, can riders access parking vending machines outside the gate entrance? 10. How will parking work with the service change? 11. Please remind us of the duration of this service change schedule – is it 3 ½ years? 12. Comment: After the Loma Prieta earthquake in 1989, BART started service one hour earlier to help commuters, which reduced time available to maintain the system. A maintenance study was presented to the Board as an informational report about a year ago examining opportunities for improving maintenance throughout the system. Returning to the pre-1989 hours would garner an extra hour of <i>wrench</i> (work) time as the travel time is already taken care of. This would also be consistent with federal transportation priority for “State of Good Repair”. This project is for 3 ½ years to support the seismic retrofit activity in the TBT. 13. Is the bus operator workshop scheduled for tomorrow open to the public? 14. In the presentation you mentioned that there is a cost and time savings? What is the true benefit of this additional hour in the morning? <p>The final bus network plan is expected to go to the Board for discussion and adoption at its September 27, 2018 meeting. Pending approval, the new service plan is expected to start as early as February 11, 2019.</p>
<p>Review of Administrative Matters</p>	<p>D. Castleberry reviewed the following administrative matter:</p> <p>The April 25, 2018 meeting minutes were reviewed, approved and accepted with a motion by D. Schaible and second by Clinton Loftman. The motion passed by unanimous vote. The minutes will be posted on the BART website.</p>
<p>Project Update</p>	<p>Z. Amare provided an overview of the program’s progress since the last COC Meeting, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The status of completed activities remains at 32 contracts to date.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

- The remaining ESP projects are:
 - TBT Retrofit (09AU-120)
 - A-Line Stations (Fruitvale and Coliseum)
- For the TBT, a notice to proceed (NTP) was issued in February 2017. Today, work includes steel fabrication, scanning and installing 5 KV cable lines to provide the contractor with their own power for the work.
- Z. Amare walked through a couple of photos showing current work in the TBT, such as cable pulling, concrete chipping and scanning for where they will install the steel plates, and lead abatement activity in limited workspace areas.
- Submittal work and materials ordering (i.e., steel) is also in progress in preparation of the heavy construction work to begin early next year.
- This is a very complicated project.
- For example, the *eBART* extension project, which constructed two, 10-mile tracks, required procurement of some 4,000 tons of steel. For the TBT project, some 7,000 tons will be procured, not including the complexity of the logistics of fabrication, delivery, installation, anchoring and welding sequence that is required for the construction operations.
- Additionally, they are fabricating locomotives that will be able to accommodate 800ft. load work trains to bring in equipment to the work area.
- TBT walls are not flat (they are rounded), the Contractor is using equipment to smooth out the walls and essentially custom fitting the steel plates.
- Question: How will the plates be affixed to the wall?
- At the last couple of meetings, we reported that there is a schedule delay associated with the changes to the safety monitoring program. An update will be provided at the next meeting.
- Question: Inside one bore it looks like there is new lighting?
Comment: Good observation. Yes, the Contractor has installed LED lights for his own use where the contractor will be working.
- Z. Amare walked through a few more photos taking the time to describe current work at the A-Line Fruitvale Station. He reported that the first stage of four piers located on the south end of the Fruitvale Station alignment near 35th Avenue is nearly complete. Work has begun at Coliseum station as part of this standard seismic retrofit work.
- This contractor is very aggressive. Brosamer & Wall, received a notice to proceed (NTP) in October 2017 and are projecting



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<p>completion in spring 2019. The contract allows for 1200 days through 2021.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress of the job on the last two ESP stations is going well and proceeding as expected.
<p>Schedule and Financial Report</p>	<p>Z. Amare provided an overview of the Program’s schedule and finances, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reviewed the general map that shows completed and remaining seismic retrofit work in the system visually. Comment: You need to add Antioch and Warm Springs to the map. (Staff will make that update) There is no notable change to the report. As of this reporting, three tranches have been issued to date, totaling about \$780M. The 3-month average spending is \$4.2million and we expect that to climb to about \$5 million over the next few months. The completion of the TBT will mark the completion of the Earthquake Safety Program. Estimated completion of the overall program schedule is expected to be 2022. \$687 million of the projected \$980 million general obligation bond funds total has been spent to date. Once the TBT moves into full construction in 2019, you will see an increase in the average monthly expenditures. The ESP Group Manager provides a quarterly update to the treasurer. We currently have about \$60M in this current tranche remaining. We expect that winter or spring of 2019 we will need to alert the treasurer to issue another tranche. Question: Earlier it was communicated that the bus bridge service and extra hour are projected to save \$15M. Is there room in the budget without that extra hour? Question: There is a reference to the Fremont line showing that it is complete. Isn’t there work still to be included at Fruitvale station? Comment: The A-Line aerial structures seismic retrofit work is complete. There is a separate line item for the Fremont Station work, which represents one of the last two stations of the ESP.
<p>Public Comments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There was one public speaker, Peter Norkse, a citizen. Mr. Norske commented that the planned express bus service to be used for the next 3 ½ years, is used regularly around the world and known as a BRT – bus rapid transit. He shared that he would like to see more integration of buses with BART.



San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) Earthquake Safety Program

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• D. Schaible, committee member and chair commented that he saw the COC meeting advertised on BART platform signage – it was great to see as he had never seen that before.• Comment: Use of BART’s platform DSS boards for all COC meetings are advertised as a public service announcement.• D. Schaible, committee member, disclosed that last year he was appointed to the San Francisco Civil Grand Jury. D. Schaible’s term expired on June 30, 2018 and he is disclosing this information for the record.
Next Meeting	Members and staff tentatively agreed to meet Wednesday, October 3, 2018 at 4:30 pm.
Adjournment	The meeting was adjourned at 5:30 pm.