

# **APPENDIX D**

## **Seat Prototypes: Research Exercises**



# Seat Prototype Survey

Thanks for participating in this research project to evaluate seats for BART's new train cars. We have 3 different seat options for you to try today – **Types A, B, and C**. The **bottom seat cushions** differ slightly, and we want to know what you think. *As a reminder, please don't discuss the seats with each other during this exercise - we want to get everyone's individual opinion.*

## SEAT EVALUATION - PART I

Please sit in your first assigned seat, and get situated as you would for a typical BART trip. You will be in each seat for **2 minutes**. We will tell you when the time is up. At that time, we will ask you to answer the questions below about your experience. Do not answer the questions until we ask you to do so.

**1st Seat:** \_\_\_\_\_

1. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?

- Excellent  Don't Know
- Good
- Only Fair
- Poor

2. Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. If specific areas are comfortable or uncomfortable, please describe.

---



---

**2nd Seat:** \_\_\_\_\_

3. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?

- Excellent  Don't Know
- Good
- Only Fair
- Poor

4. Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. If specific areas are comfortable or uncomfortable, please describe.

---



---

**3rd Seat:** \_\_\_\_\_

5. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?

- Excellent  Don't Know
- Good
- Only Fair
- Poor

6. Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. If specific areas are comfortable or uncomfortable, please describe.

---



---

7. Which seat do you prefer for the new BART train cars? (Check only one.)

- Seat Option A  No preference - please explain: \_\_\_\_\_
- Seat Option B  None of the above - please explain: \_\_\_\_\_
- Seat Option C



## "BACK ROW" EXERCISES

### Center Armrests

8. BART riders have different opinions about the center armrests. **Some don't like the center armrests** because:
- they make it more difficult to get in and out of window seats;
  - they don't leave enough room for larger passengers who need extra space.

**Others like the center armrests** because:

- they provide a greater feeling of separation between people in adjacent seats;
- they provide a place to push up against when getting up (for those who need it).

**Taking all of this into consideration, should BART's new train cars have armrests between the seats, or not?**

- Yes, armrests between the seats
- No, no armrests between the seats
- No preference

### Seat Handle

Now please stand up using the handle on the back of the seat in front of you. Then answer the questions below.

9. **How do you rate the seat handle?**

- Excellent
- Don't Know
- Good
- Only Fair
- Poor

10. **Please tell us why you rated the seat handle this way.**

---

---

---

## SEAT EVALUATION - PART II

Please get situated as you would for a typical BART trip. You will be in this seat for **18 minutes**. During this time, do whatever you would normally do on BART. We will tell you when the time is up. At that time, we will ask you to answer the questions below about your experience in the seat. Do not answer the questions until we ask you to do so.

**4th Seat:** \_\_\_\_\_

**11. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?**

- Excellent                       Don't Know  
 Good  
 Only Fair  
 Poor

**12. Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. Mark up the illustration to indicate specific areas on the seat that are particularly comfortable or uncomfortable and describe below:**

---

---

---

---

---

---



---

---

---

---

## FINAL QUESTIONS

13. As you may be aware, BART has replaced the fabric seat covers on some of its train cars with vinyl seat covers. Have you sat in the vinyl seats on a BART train car in the past 30 days?

- Yes, I've sat in them in the past 30 days.
- No, not in the past 30 days - but I have sat in them before.
- No, I've never sat in them (skip to question 15)
- Don't remember (skip to question 15)

14. Please compare the seat prototypes you tried here today against the vinyl seats on BART's current train cars. Are the seat prototypes here today better, the same, or worse than the current vinyl seats in terms of:

	Seat prototypes are significantly better	Seat prototypes are about the same	Seat prototypes are significantly worse	Don't Know
Amount of space for me				
Comfort of bottom cushion				
Comfort of back rest				

*Note: you should have one check in each row.*

15. Do you have any other comments about the seats for BART's new train cars?

---

---

---

---

---

---

**Thank you for completing this questionnaire. We appreciate your feedback!**

## APPENDIX D: Frequencies

### Fleet of the Future Seat Prototypes - Research Exercise Data

#### SEAT EVALUATION PART I (after sitting in each seat for two minutes)

Questions 1, 3, and 5: How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?

##### Seat A (least dense)

	Frequency	Percent
Excellent	29	16%
Good	93	50%
Only Fair	55	29%
Poor	8	4%
Don't Know	1	1%
<i>Blank</i>	1	1%
Total	187	100%
Top 2 box	122	65%

##### Seat B (most dense)

	Frequency	Percent
Excellent	26	14%
Good	93	50%
Only Fair	61	33%
Poor	6	3%
Don't Know	1	1%
Total	187	100%
Top 2 box	119	64%

##### Seat C (medium density)

	Frequency	Percent
Excellent	38	20%
Good	91	49%
Only Fair	53	28%
Poor	5	3%
Total	187	100%
Top 2 box	129	69%

Questions 2, 4, and 6: Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. If specific areas are comfortable or uncomfortable, please describe.

Refer to verbatim report.

**7. Which seat do you prefer for the new BART train cars?**

	Frequency	Percent
Seat A (least dense)	49	26%
Seat B (most dense)	46	25%
Seat C (medium density)	58	31%
None	14	7%
No Preference	17	9%
<i>Blank</i>	3	2%
Total	187	100%

**8. (Refer to questionnaire for full question text.) ...Taking all of this into consideration, should BART's new train cars have armrests between the seats, or not?**

	Frequency	Percent
Yes, armrests between the seats	63	34%
No, no armrests between the seats	89	48%
No preference	30	16%
Some armrests (written in)	3	2%
Other	2	1%
Total	187	100%

**9. How do you rate the seat handle?**

	Frequency	Percent
Excellent	45	24%
Good	70	37%
Only Fair	50	27%
Poor	17	9%
Don't Know	5	3%
Total	187	100%
Top 2 box	115	61%

**10. Please tell us why you rated the seat handle this way.**

Refer to verbatim report.

**SEAT EVALUATION PART II (after sitting in one seat for 18 minutes)**

**11. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?**

	A		B		C	
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
Excellent	8	13%	8	13%	12	19%
Good	30	48%	30	48%	30	48%
Only Fair	18	29%	19	31%	17	27%
Poor	4	6%	4	6%	2	3%
Don't Know	1	2%	0	%	1	2%
<i>Blank</i>	2	3%	1	2%	0	%
Total	63	100%	62	100%	62	100%
Top 2 box	38	60%	38	61%	42	68%

**12. Please tell us why you rated the seat this way...**

Refer to verbatim report.

**FINAL QUESTIONS**

**13. As you may be aware, BART has replaced the fabric seat covers on some of its train cars with vinyl seat covers. Have you sat in the vinyl seats on a BART train car in the past 30 days?**

	Frequency	Percent
Yes	165	88%
No, not in past 30 days, but I have sat in them before.	8	4%
No, I've never sat in them ( <i>skip to q15</i> )	5	3%
Don't remember ( <i>skip to q15</i> )	8	4%
<i>Blank</i>	1	1%
Total	187	100%

**14. Please compare the seat prototypes you tried here today against the vinyl seats on BART's current train cars. Are the seat prototypes here today better, the same, or worse than the current vinyl seats in terms of:**

**Amount of space for me**

	Frequency	Percent
Better	26	15%
Same	89	51%
Worse	47	27%
Don't Know	10	6%
<i>Blank</i>	1	1%
Total	173	100%



**Comfort of bottom cushion**

	Frequency	Percent
Better	49	28%
Same	46	27%
Worse	71	41%
Don't Know	6	3%
<i>Blank</i>	1	1%
Total	173	100%

**Comfort of back rest**

	Frequency	Percent
Better	83	48%
Same	46	27%
Worse	35	20%
Don't Know	8	5%
<i>Blank</i>	1	1%
Total	173	100%

**15. Do you have any other comments about the seats for BART's new train cars?**

Refer to verbatim report.

## APPENDIX D: Verbatim Report Fleet of the Future Seat Prototypes – Research Exercises

### SEAT EVALUATION PART I (after sitting in each seat for two minutes)

*Questions 2, 4, and 6: Please tell us why you rated the seat this way. If specific areas are comfortable or uncomfortable, please describe.*

#### **Seat A – Rated Excellent or Good**

- Great lower back/lumbar support! Very important for me - and I think a lot of people.
- My whole body feels relaxed and cozy. I can't scan any place of discomfort. Lovely! It's easy to forget I'm sitting.
- Not too hard, good support. Liked the finish - will probably be easy to clean.
- The cushion and back of the seat are comfortable.
- Comfy with enough legroom. It also supports your back!
- I feel comfortable because the bottom seat cushion is firm.
- It seems to support my lower back quite well.
- The back and bottom feel extra cushiony and the armrest is longer than the current ones.
- Seemed to have better cushion/lumbar support.
- Slightly more padded - seeming than C3. Good support. Pretty stiff material still but that probably is so they last longer/don't break down as easily over time.
- Seat cushion feels softer than C4. For some reason the back rest is more comfy and seems to align better to my lower and upper back.
- Stuck between good and excellent. Comfort is there, and leg space is great. Great back comfort.
- No sliding :). Not sure about armrest, though. Comfortable. Good low back support.
- Good because it seems to have slightly more cushion on it which makes it comfortable for my back and buttocks. I also like the armrest.
- Again, firm bottom and back. But not hard. I could ride long and short rides in this. Read or nap or do nothing.
- I think they are so comfortable, and very soft seats, you can relax.
- Very solid seat option. Nearly as comfortable as C. All areas of equal comfort.
- Just the right amount of back support and seat cushion firmness.
- This seat comfortable. Padding of seat back rest was a good degree of firm and soft. Felt comfortable for sleeping! Height of seat to floor felt good to me.
- Very similar to C. Back height is comfortable; cushion seems sturdy but not too firm.
- Not too stiff yet not as comfortable as C3. Yet still very comfortable because it wasn't too stiff.
- Felt more spacious and comfy.
- Sits very well, formed to body - just enough slant in back, long ride, more legroom, seat (cushion) formed very well - no armrest.
- It fit my body the best, I have curvature in my lower back.
- I like this seat.
- I like the posture, set firm.
- Arch was supportive, didn't push me out of seat. Bottom cushion was not hard very nice.
- Good back support. Good seat support, but a little more cushion would be great. It is a little hard.

- In general feel ok. The seat is a little bit firm. So it's more like a formal sitting environment, less like a relaxed one.
- Felt comfortable. Good support. Not too hard or too soft.
- It's comfortable although not very cushioned. It feels as though it has no cushion.
- The bottom is comfortable but the back is not.
- Cushion appears slim; no give; so my feet are not comfortably flat on the floor
- Slightly firm - might be uncomfortable for a longer period of time.
- The back is a little uncomfortable but the butt part feels pretty comfy.
- I like the back comfort. It's comfortable - just not to the excellent category.
- Enough space for my hips. Cushion isn't too thin. Feel generally supported.
- Good comfort on the bottom, but not excellent.
- The seat is harder so it's good for supporting my back yet it is not soft enough to feel really comfortable. The back support is excellent though.
- Not too soft, not too hard.
- The seat felt good in the beginning, but lost a little support in the end. Still a nice seat. Needs more back bottom seat support.
- It would be more relaxing if seats are little bit inclined instead of upright than I felt.
- Felt ok - didn't slip from seat cushion. A little pressure on the back of the upper thighs.
- It seems a little stiff and feels kind of weird, but it's fine.
- Firmness of the seat is good. I felt like I had to shift around in my seat a little to get comfortable but overall I feel like it would have been a good ride.
- The seat is firm and comfortable. I like the seat divider. It gives me the feeling like I have a little more personal room. It would be good for a long trip.
- The seat was a little hard it did not have much back support. I could see a longer ride being uncomfortable.
- I like the feel of support on my back. Chair cushion is comfortable- sturdy.
- It is not excellent because I like soft cushion. It is rather comfortable other than a little harder than I expect.
- Could have been excellent if wider and head part higher.
- No specific complaints. Maybe could use more padding.
- Good lumbar support, seat cushion too hard.
- Comfortable for short trip.
- The seat is comfy and good. The seat is soft.
- Adequate knee/legroom, seat seems flexible, maybe too flexible. If its legs at appropriate distance, ok curvature for back.
- It can definitely use more cushioning on the bottom seat part, but the reclining angle of the back ups (increases) the comfort level to good and not fair, in my opinion.
- Comfortable enough though not cushy. Easy to sit upright.
- It was a bit harder than I'm used to. The back of the chair seems to slope away too quickly (above the lower back part). I felt my weight slide forward a bit, but it's not bad.
- The overall shape is quite comfortable. My back feels supported. Seat cushion feels a little thin: might get uncomfortable on longer "trip".
- I feel very comfortable in this seat. It's good for my small body size.
- Hard to tell difference between 1st and 2nd – cushion maybe not as comfortable as 1st seat.
- Seat was better than C1. The small back on this seat was better, seat seems wider than the previous.

- The seat is a little bit more comfortable, the cushion feels a little bit more softer than C1 because it's not as firm or hard.
- Well shaped back-piece; bottom still not the best.
- Strangely, I really notice the part where my shoulder blades back the back of the seat. The bottom cushion is more comfortable than #1.
- Cushion is less than the previous seat, but it's still comfortable as you get used to it after 2 minutes.
- Supports lower back. Feels the same as above.
- The seat cushion is firm, but I like that I didn't have to lean back as much as I did with the first seat.
- Feels cushion on this compared to C not as much lumbar support not as prominent as C (curve).
- Seems softer than the previous one, sinks in a bit more. My feet are comfortable, no handle. Would be nice to have a handle to hold on to.
- Good back support, still, bottom cushion too short.
- Comfortable seat cushions!
- Feels about the same as C2, maybe just a tad softer/ less firm. For some reason, this seat feels wider.
- Bottom cushion feels much better than seat C2. Back support hit the spine better.
- Better than the C2 seat. Wider and roomier.
- Cushion not as hard. Back rest is at a comfortable back angle; seat seems to be a little short meaning back of my knees are far from the edge of seat.
- Slightly more cushiony than C2, better, more stable and can assure comfort more than the present bumpy ride.
- I like the shape of this seat. It feels rather firm even after 2 min but is reasonably comfortable.
- Similar "sliding off" feeling to C3, perhaps slightly worse? Armrest seems uncomfortably low.
- Back lumbar seems same as "C" bottom seems thinner but wider.
- This seat is also comfortable - feels less stiff and back support is good.
- Also nice and firm but it feels the back is more comfortable as it seems the back is a little slanted and not so upright.
- Seems lower to ground - better for my legs. Armrest - is it lower? I still don't like it being there. Seats pretty close together, not much room when I bring more stuff with me. Cushion good, like the wrap around behind my legs. Lower back still uncomfortable.
- Thinner seat (?) than C3, still just as comfy. Thanks for the armrest.
- Seat seems short - I would have trouble holding a child on my lap as my legs hang too far over the front.
- The padding is comfortable.
- I felt more supported than previously, something about my seat is making me feel too close to the seat in front. I can't extend my left foot and my left knee hits the seat in front as well.
- A little harder (not as cushy). Fit better under legs.
- Easy to sit down in and feel comfortable- don't need to shift around a lot. Feels flat to sit in. Like it. Good back support.
- The padding was firmer, so I didn't sink to the bottom. It provided more support and was more comfortable. My bones didn't dig into the frame.
- This one feels the best of the 3.
- A1 cushion like B1. I would prefer a seat which supported more of my legs. I did not consider this in rating B1 and C1, A1, but I assume their dimensions are identical to A1.

- Both lower and back portions were great. The firmness was just right on both.
- Comfortable again, similar to B1.
- This one was still better than B1 in terms of where my back falls. It seems like the front of the seat is harder than C1, when I lean forward which digs into thighs.
- The lower back cushion was very noticeable and comfortable. Something the previous seats lacked.
- It was ok. Couldn't tell much difference between C and A, where I placed my arm was a little more comfortable.
- This is my favorite seat cushion - was not too thick, it didn't feel like a strain when I sat down.
- This was the best of the 3 seats, but close in comfort level with the C-group.
- It doesn't get more uncomfortable like the B-group when I first sit, it doesn't feel unduly hard.
- Not as comfortable but not super uncomfortable. Back seems a little straighter.
- Seemed firm and sturdy like B2, but not as plush. Like it compared to C2.
- Cushion was a little too firm although provided good support.
- A little hard to get comfortable- I felt like I kept scooting back.
- Both seat and back cushions feel firm. Probably okay for ride.
- Comfortable/supports back.
- A little flat, but better firmness than C2.
- Also a good mix of comfort and support, but slightly less comfortable than C2.
- Seat A seemed close to seat B in terms of comfort because the back of the seat did not fit me as well as C.
- Too short on seat. Appeared to be - in firmness - between B and C.
- Seat bottom seems medium hard.
- It is a comfortable seat. Seem very spacious for some reason. Sturdy.
- This seat has more comfort and cushion. The seats are wider which means I can put my purse next to me rather than in my lap.
- Seems to be leaned back more comfort.
- The lumbar support didn't feel as bulged out. It could be higher but it wasn't annoying. Seat could be wider. Backpack fit at the base of the seat.
- Not as good as "C" but way preferable to "B". Good back. Bottom feels not as comfortable as "B".
- All seats seem to be similar, and just as equally comfortable. Better back support than the current seats.
- Not as hard as B, but still rating below C.
- This is most comfortable seat- too short front to back- the cushion will probably get mushy with time.
- Again - fine. The back feels a little less comfortable. Maybe more sticking out on the bottom?
- Nice lumbar support.

**Seat A – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- Seat hard, short seat bottom, uncomfortable on lower back for someone my height.
- Not much cushion, but sturdy enough. Feel a little small even with my petite size with usual jacket put on.
- Very firm - too firm for long ride.
- The seat back is a bit too straight up. It would be more comfortable if the angle of recline was a little greater.

- It was a little hard, stiff, with not much give, so not the most comfortable but not entirely uncomfortable.
- The seat is pretty stiff compared to current seats.
- Bottom seat cushion a bit thin. Not sure how I feel about the lumbar.
- Very hard at the back, narrow. Feel too close to next person, hard to rest my back.
- The padding is very thin and is much less comfortable compared to current BART seats. Back of seat feels like it has no padding.
- Cushion is not big enough; back is too firm; no headrest. Seats are too close to each other.
- Oddly shaped, it may be the vinyl but I feel like I am going to slide right off my seat in a moving train without the proper shoes for support; kind of round and firm.
- Seat depth is too short, and is uncomfortable on the back of my thighs. Would make my legs fall asleep on a long trip. Height is also too tall.
- A little too firm. Armrest too narrow to be shaped.
- Seat cushions too shallow and narrow and thin. No back or neck support. Sitting for a while can cause back pains.
- Back support awkward. Seat cushion little too firm.
- The seat is hard and doesn't fit my form. I feel like I'm sitting in the center seat of the backseat of a car (no one wants that). Lumbar region of the seat is protruding.
- Kind of hard. More comfortable than the bus but not as comfortable as the BART is now. Not too crazy about the armrest. Kind of hard as in the cushion is a little too thin. Not a whole lot of room between seats.
- The seat was a little less than the general comfort I expected. Not as wide as I would have liked. Needs more padding. Back padding adequate.
- Cushion wasn't dense enough, not enough legroom, didn't like the elbow rest (wasted space plus uncomfortable), cushion width okay (without elbow rest) unshaped.
- Bottom part is not as cushiony, back support is not as good, back tends to slouch.
- It's not enough cushion.
- Not thick enough material on bottom seat cushion, otherwise pretty good.
- This seat felt too hard.
- I liked the first seat better because the seat seems harder on the bottom/back.
- Firmer than previous seat, not as relaxing. I might still have said "Good" if I tried this one first. Firm better for back but seat should be more giving.
- Seat is hard as hell but my lower back feels better. Probably won't be a hit with the seniors.
- No particular feeling.
- This seat is firm to the point of being hard. Not shock absorbent. Uncomfortable.
- Supportive on the back; cushion is too thin for the bottom; feeling sore after a while; good height for my legs; uncomfortable.
- The angle is better than C2 but the cushion is more dense and less comfortable.
- Feels ok.
- Seat padding doesn't feel like it conforms to body very well; too firm.
- Less comfortable than the first one. I don't like the surface of it which makes it hard.
- Bottom cushion feel all right but it makes the back support feel like it's making my back push forward in an odd manner.
- Back is comfortable. Seat bottom stiff.
- Lower back cushion is a little uncomfortable - is making me slouch a little. The angle isn't quite right. Bottom still fine.

- Felt similar to the last seat. I didn't enjoy the hand rest in the center. It felt too constrictive. What if the seat is empty and I want to put my bag in that space?
- Feels like the angle of the back of the seat leans too far back. The padding below and behind is adequate.
- Again, the lumbar bump can get annoying. The armrest is nice, but I can see it being problematic for entering and sitting.
- Seat is shorter in the back to knee area. Don't like armrest.
- Armrest between seats feels restricted. Seat was less firm.
- Needs to be more cushion-y.
- The bottom seat feels hard but a little more formed. Still feels like it wouldn't be as comfortable as the ones before.
- Not much cushion.
- The seat feels flatter on this one, which is unpleasant, makes me feel more like my butt is going to fall asleep.
- The seat length feels shorter. Where the edge of the seat is hitting a different part of my thigh. Much more rigid feeling on the back, less comfortable than seat C2. When back row uses front seat handle to get up, it really pulls badly on the front seat/jostles.
- Very firm, felt angled forward (bottom), didn't like that.
- I did not feel the seat provided much comfort/support. I also felt that I slid off the seat.
- The seat feels like it is slanted downward and I might slip forward. The back of the seat is also hard.
- Least comfortable, bottom cushion feels thin.
- Seat feels more firm, may not be all that great for longer rides.
- It's okay, but doesn't feel as cushiony. I felt myself restless in the seat as soon as I sat down.
- Less comfortable than previous two.
- Cushion comfort is not very good. Back cushion is also kind of hard. Sitting on this chair for two minutes now. I feel like getting up already.
- Seat is a bit stiff, back padding feels all right, conforms to back, overall feels not so comfortable
- The seat cushion is very hard, the seat should also be a bit wider for larger people.
- Not comfortable at all, very hard.
- Poor: lumbar support is too low. Seat bottom is too hard.
- Really hard. Like sitting down on plywood. Would probably start going numb if sitting here for upwards of an hour.
- Another too firm and too stiff seat.
- Very firm and hard.
- Still too tight for me in the shoulders and can't help but feel the armrest is dangerous.
- Too hard of a seat cushion. Seems uncomfortable, not shaped for comfort.

### Seat B – Rated Excellent or Good

- Firm bottom and back with support to lower back and with room to recline a little. Very good.
- It's not uncomfortable and has back support.
- Firm and sturdy. Really like in comparison to what's currently on BART.
- Lumbar support is nice, I like that the bottom part of the seat cushion (sitting surface) is not too squishy.
- Nice firm support without being too "cushiony".
- Comfortable especially the back of the chair.
- Shapes of seat back contour is comfortable. Seat seems short, but fine for my frame. Back of armrests will become an issue I think.
- Very comfortable, curved back and seat, relaxing for the back and body. Don't like the armrest. Too small. Good foam density on the seats.
- Nice overall support; lumbar, upper back and rear end, contours to body.
- Provided good support. Felt like more cushion than previous seat (A).
- Feel better than 1st. (A1). The seat is less firm but it still gives enough support. Feel more relaxed.
- This seat felt a little more plush and thicker. It would probably be better for longer ride. I preferred this seat over #A1.
- Felt similar to A2, perhaps a slight difference but not enough to indicate a better feel. Liked both.
- It surprisingly felt natural and I didn't have to reposition. Very comfortable.
- This is a nice seat - not too firm - could go further in this seat.
- It's a little harder than my first. Overall it's good and comfy. Supports your back.
- Comfortable because the bottom seat cushion is firm enough.
- Comfortable seat cushion, good lumbar support. Armrest is good height.
- Cushion felt more firm yet comfortable. Might be more comfortable for longer rides.
- Cushion thickness is right. Does not feel as far reclined back as C1; it's good.
- Has the right combination of firmness and softness.
- The seat cushion wasn't too soft or too firm. I like that the back has padding and that I didn't have to lean back.
- Uncomfortable but allows me to rest my legs and stay awake; love the back support; ok with the thin cushion; would like BART to use this for seating.
- It seems squishy and supported; like I won't slide off if train stops short.
- Maybe less cushy than A but somehow better suited to me personally. Seems like just the right amount of cushion.
- There seems to be more cushion on this chair. It felt more comfortable. The only problem is the chair in front of me hit my bag when he leaned back.
- It's very comfortable where I first sit down! .Very Soft!! (seat)
- The back of seat I like the way it feels. The bottom is ok, but not soft.
- I prefer a more flexible cushion - in part for sprawling over two seats for late-night napping from Millbrae to Rockridge.
- The lower seat is very firm but was fairly comfortable for this short duration. The back portion was very comfortable.
- Comfortable seat, nothing negative to describe.
- My rear slips back into the seat, which over time I think will make my feet lose some circulation. Otherwise fine. Back is a bit strange.



- Seat shape - Excellent. Cushion comfort - excellent. Headrest - Very poor, can't rest, very hard - (1)
- Overall not too soft and not too hard.
- The cushion is not too soft but not stiff either. Definitely an average comfort.
- I rated this seat "good" because it was stable to my body and my back felt comfortable and straight, not arched.
- Is a little stiff/hard. Doesn't really curve with the body, at first, but gets comfortable later on.
- Seat was comfy. It was a bit too firm, but I would prefer that to too soft.
- Back support is comfortable as well as seat. But is a little too firm.
- A little too firm with the back rest. Sitting upright, but slumped down slightly, the back was good. Cushion/seat was firm-felt pretty comfortable.
- Back of seat height is comfortable for me; cushion seems quite firm - not very much give which could get uncomfortable on a long commute.
- Seat feels comfortable, but a little firm. This may soften with use. Back has excellent comfort, does not feel as firm- more a cushion.
- Back is too far back, otherwise comfortable supports back.
- I like the firmness of this seat, but the contour could be improved.
- The seat is a little stiff and takes a bit of getting used to but eventually gets better.
- Seat bottom seems a bit hard.
- I found myself slouching a bit. I don't know what height this seat would be most ideal for. I also don't like the idea of an armrest, you'd have to figure out which passenger would get the armrest.
- Needed more room for my legs while taking a nap.
- Backpack could be comfortably placed. Good back support.
- Back curve support on lower back - great after working all day. Bottom seems too narrow - short length - no armrest struggle.
- Both the back and the bottom are comfortable in general.
- There was too much space between my lower back and the back rest. The cushion was comfy and felt substantial.
- Seat feels nice, a lot more cushion compared to current seats on BART.
- Feels comfortable. I have a bony butt and can sometimes feel the seat underneath. Not with this seat cushion.
- Feel good. But when sit too close to the back can feel the edge of the seat cushion.
- The bottom part seems raised too much, a lot of pressure on the butt, lower back. Upper back very comfortable.
- The general firmness and ergonomic back were disarming at first. More legroom please! Maybe 2-3 inches.
- Back is a little stiff; leg a little short.
- I like the armrest, lower cushion is a bit firm. Back arch support is nice. Spacing seems quite narrow.
- Butt padding good, probably a little better than A1, but lower back support doesn't seem as good. Still decent back support but I preferred A1 I think.
- Comfortable but the cushion seems to be hard when you first sit down then it kind of molds into your body.
- The bottom is comfortable, a little harder than A1 but the back shape is not.

- Better padding, more 'give,' feet are mostly flat on floor (almost excellent) feels more like a chair.
- Better seat contour? Better firmness but still on the firm side. Would sitting in this seat for 40 minutes be comfortable?
- Seat not as hard - and seat is more comfortable overall.
- The seat seems a little softer and is comfortable to sit on. The back support is again excellent.
- Seat back feels thicker, similar to A2 supports lower back better.
- The seat is wide and the back reclines at a comfortable angle.
- Perhaps a little more give and softness than A2? Or close to the same.
- This was much more comfortable-firm but good level of cushion-don't feel top uncomfortable on the behind. There is a light arch to back seat.
- More comfy than seat A. Feels about right.
- Wider, better than the first one (A2). Fits my back better. Able to open my legs a little bit without interrupting others.
- Seems to support lower back less. I feel too high in the chair.
- I felt it same as previous seat. I didn't feel any changes in comfort.
- Slightly more comfortable than "A" especially pressure on back of legs seem less. Not a lot of difference.
- This one's nicer than A3 was; I think it's a little softer.
- Firmness of this seat better than A. The armrest may be a little too low.
- After a minute I couldn't tell the difference from the first seat but when I first sat down I noticed it was more firm with less cushion.
- The seat had better back support. But the seat itself seemed much harder with less padding.
- Noticeably harder.
- Back has more cushion than bottom but not too hard. Armrest feels shorter. More cushion on bottom in back of top.
- More comfortable then A4, 1/2 for trip should be feeling fine, good back support.
- The seat is comfy. It is a lot more firm than the A4 seat.
- Less leg/knee room than A-4, seat still flexible, felt more upright not as much curvature for back, like the armrest.
- The bottom seat is very comfortable, it is not stiff in any area on bottom cushion. For some reason I feel like the back rest in this seat is not reclined enough? My back feels stiff in this seat.
- Also comfortable enough. Not quite as good as A4. Might be hard on long trip. Not sure about that.
- Same as A4: Not soft enough, and the back slopes away too fast. Feels like there's not enough room for my butt in the back. But still, those are minor complaints. It's fairly comfortable at least when I'm sitting still with no train movement.
- A little bit more comfortable. Cushion seems better. Still concern with no neck support. Back support is better.
- Back support very good. Seat cushion firm yet gives enough for comfort.
- Bottom is fine - back support is also fine.
- Very small if no difference to me.
- It is fairly comfortable. A little more cushion than one other. The cushion feels wider.
- This seat seems to even out a little bit. It's not firm or soft. It's in between, however the backside seems a little comfortable.
- I may be getting more comfortable the more I sit.

- Now I really notice where the backs of my thighs connect uncomfortably to the bottom cushion.
- Feels like there's more cushioning than A, but it doesn't feel any more comfortable. In fact, if I had to choose, it feels less comfortable than A.
- Has you sitting more upright versus leaning back.
- This seat is less hard but not as supportive as the first.
- Seat is firmer than A but not C. Lumbar support is there but not as much as C; might be same as B.
- Similar to A, can't discern any differences.
- Not different than other two.
- Comfortable seat cushions!
- Similar to seat A2.
- Similar to A2 but not as comfortable as the newly-installed BART seat.
- Feels as if my back is over-extended. Not a comfortable fit for me.
- I could sit in this seat for a while but would feel uncomfortable eventually; there's enough support but not soft enough.
- The contour bump is more appropriately sized for me, still rather firm.
- It feels less like I'm sliding off than the other 2, but the differences are marginal and possibly just my imagination.
- Bottom better than "A" - back lumbar not as good.
- It feels similar to C3, but harder than C3.
- No additional comments - thinner pad is best for short leg people like me.
- Less comfy, still fine.
- Short on my legs - don't like armrest.
- Rather rigid; short under legs. Like the height (from floor).
- Seat cushion feels soft. I like the height of the back rest just like in A4. However, A4 seems to be the most comfortable.
- The seat in my opinion was very firm. Not the best, but is something I could stand on BART. Between good and fair in my opinion.
- Easy to sit in and feel comfortable- don't need to shift. Good balance of firmness and "give." Good back support.
- The lumbar bump is less pronounced so it's a bit more comfortable. But if you slouch it is a tiny bit uncomfortable. The armrest is so small so it will likely be annoying rather than nice.
- More legroom.
- Better support? Not firm, comfortable. Still do not like armrest in between seats.

#### **Seat B – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- Bottom cushion- a bit hard. Ok for shorter trips, but longer would be rough.
- The seat felt slightly too high for me and it was too flat.
- The seat is padded but very firm. It would not be comfortable for a long ride, or if I had an object in my pocket.
- Good support but lacking in comfort. On the hard side.
- Does not seem to have a lot of padding.
- Too short in the seat. Seat cushion firm. Back-ergonomically-a little too rigid on lower back.
- I felt it had too much material in the lower back
- Leans back a little bit too much. I don't feel as if I am sitting upright. Doesn't seem steady
- The seat is not comfortable and the seat is a little short. The front of the seat does not hit the back of my knees.

- The front of the seat bottom is raised in a way that makes it feel like I am about to slip off of the chair, and one not securely seated. The armrest is also very close, and seems unnecessary.
- It's not too comfortable, seat is stiff.
- Lumbar support too low. Material seems very rigid not good, in my opinion, for long rides. Height is appropriate, not wide enough. My leg is hitting center divider. I like the slots at the top of the seat in front of me. Helps to get up if necessary there.
- Bottom does not seem very cushioned. The train I was on to get here had more cushioning, also back was very curved.
- Feels hard on my posterior, especially where bones meet the seat.
- Seat is too short and too firm, too close to seat in front.
- It's fine. I'm not uncomfortable. It feels slightly high off the ground.
- Not really comfortable from the back. The area near the knees was rather uncomfortable.
- Felt very stiff when first sat down. Feels a bit more comfortable in the butt area afterwards. Back area feels fine.
- It's okay, but not comfortable especially if I were on a train I would only be happy that I had a seat or perhaps I would prefer to stand. I don't like this seat.
- Butt part is slightly harder, and uncomfortable. Back is kind of stiff.
- Back not comfortable - doesn't support in proper area.
- Firmer than seat A1 and ultimately less comfortable because of mat, seems like on a long commute my butt would hurt.
- Feel very much the same as A1, probably felt more of the back arch which feels good. Cushion is still minimal.
- This seat and cushion are pretty stiff and a little uncomfortable.
- Good support, but too firm. Would have liked more of a softer seat.
- Better than A2 but still has a very stiff feel to it.
- Cushion is too firm, not big enough. Seats are too close; armrest would be nice. Back support feels uneven.
- Somehow feels rounder and firmer than the first seat, but doesn't feel as slippery.
- Better than the A seat, but still too shallow and too high. Noticed less pressure on the back of my legs, which is good, but seat felt uncomfortably firm on my rear.
- Chair cushion uncomfortable, too hard, felt larger seat (good). The back support was not good. Chair seemed to recline I felt like I was sliding.
- The seat is not large enough and has some declining angle. I am afraid if I sit on it for one hour I'm going to feel tired. The seat is too small for large bodies.
- Seat felt wider and not so hard bottom - but pole ahead of me on seat in way of leg.
- Firmer than 1st seat. I think it would be less comfortable over long periods. No specific complaints.
- Good firmness. Armrest too narrow to be shared not enough legroom. Not enough width.
- Seat is more padded than A4, but maybe too stiff/firm. Also, it might be higher which means alignment with backrest off and not as comfortable/supportive.
- Seat cushion is more firm than A's seat. Overall comfort in seat A was better than B.
- Slightly better than A4, but I still feel like I'm elevated (like the center backseat of a car). The lumbar region of the chair is too convex.
- Cushion feels firm. Still not liking the armrest. Cushion feels too firm. Still not enough room between seats.

- Again more seat padding would be ideal, but seems to be ok for short trips. Would like more legroom. Back padding adequate.
- Not enough legroom, cushion not dense enough, wasteful elbow rest. Width okay (without armrest).
- No cushion at all and I feel like I am sliding and slouching.
- Not as comfortable on small back, seemed like the seating area was smaller and the seat did not extend out as far to the back of my knees.
- I think this seat back has additional lumbar support. Maybe I'm imagining that. But I like it. If you don't have that, add it.
- Good back support, not as good as "C" but good. Cushion hard.
- Seat shape better than A but discomfort arises. Lumbar support is better (higher) than A
- Best of both worlds. Seat cushion not as hard as A1, but lower back feels better on the seat than on C1.
- Too firm. Feels closer to sitting on a plastic seat (like on MUNI) than on a padded seat.
- More harder cushion, but not so cushiony as A2. Would be a good fit for hard top cushioned seats.
- Not much difference-feel less cushioning.
- There's better back padding feel to this seat; however the height is too high for shorter patrons. But cushion comfort is good overall.
- Seat is also nice and firm but I feel a little uncomfortable because of the curved back and it feels like there's an indentation in the middle of the seat.
- Bottom cushion feels ok but the lower back support feels like it's gone with this seat.
- Feels stiff.
- Also seemed too hard. Ass numbing comes to mind. Not as bad as C3, but still not something I would be happy sitting on for an extended time.
- Back is comfortable. Seat bottom real stiff.
- Back is better than the second one - but still making me slouch a little. The angle is better though. Bottom still fine.
- Feels more firm, but also better/more room in front? If I were working on a laptop, this seat would provide the most room.
- Not as comfortable as C4 but I could imagine this seat lasting longer and getting more comfortable as it ages. Firm. Lackluster.
- Very firm seat. A little too firm for me. Don't like how it feels on back of my thighs, behind knees. Too firm. Not sliding off though :)
- The cushion is hard and offers minimal support. It did displace my weight.
- At least the cushion is better than the other options.
- When I first sat down, the seat felt hard and flat. No support or cushion, it feels like. Even though it looks like there is a cushion it feels hard.
- Cushion wasn't very thick, but real concern in the back rest - it feels uncomfortable pushing into the lower back - feels like I am sitting unnaturally. Cushion not very comfy.
- Very uncomfortable. Too upright, too rigid in structure - not enough give bottom feels too short, awful.
- Armrest is dangerous and restrictive. Too close to the person in front. Not roomy enough. Tight and uncomfortable. No legroom.
- The seat cushion is even harder than the first, very uncomfortable for long rides.

- Poor because it seem as it has less cushion and comfort than seat A and C. Feels hard and uncomfortable. Would contribute to back and butt pain.

**Seat B – Rated Don't Know or No Answer**

- Not sure, kind of between fair-poor range.

### **Seat C – Rated Excellent or Good**

- Support on the bottom is good, also has good lumbar support. I feel my posture is better.
- The cushioning was soft. The back rounded into my back at least what it feels like to me. Plenty of space between other person.
- Cushion feels substantial like there's more cushion than I am used to.
- Supports behind and back. Actually has comfort. Doesn't feel like I will fall right through.
- This seat is very comfortable. The back area is supportive and seat is firm yet molding, like memory foam! Shock absorbent also.
- Feels ergonomic and supportive; don't feel like I'm sinking in/going to slide out; nice balance between firm and padded.
- Back-lower especially-cushion placement is really good. Didn't notice bottom seat comfort - it was fine.
- Firm bottom and back and a little softer than the B1 seat. I could ride on this seat. I could nap, too.
- Even more comfortable - extra cushion. Great back support.
- Nice blend of comfy and firm. I felt like I could sit for a long time comfortably in this chair. The lumbar "support" seemed too much curve.
- More comfortable than B2 because softer. Will be more comfortable for longer trips.
- This seat felt comfortable-not so firm to feel "stiff" for longer rides. Good padding for seat. Back rest was comfortable, too.
- Back of seat height is comfortable for me; cushion is sturdy but not too firm - seems comfy for a long ride.
- Both seat and back cushions are comfortable!
- Much better cushion feel than seat B2. The back rest doesn't feel intrusive or as if it is pushing awkwardly into my lower back. I like this seat far better than seat B2. When seat partner moves, it jostles the seat a lot.
- So comfortable! So much better than B3. Can sit down and instantly was comfortable. Softer and less stiff! Way better.
- Seat bottom seems more comfortable.
- I feel I had more space, which made me more comfortable. The back support was better for me and in general felt I had better support. The armchair seems too low.
- It had less restricting space and I felt more flexible than B3.
- It is very comfortable. Seems very sturdy.
- Can't explain. Feel less restricted. I now feel like B4 made me feel like the cushion was smaller width wise. The back also appears softer, more padded.
- The width seems smaller - touched my neighbor twice!! Cushions more comfortable, but seems smaller. Back rest was better than B.
- Seat feels soft, very comfortable.
- Feels good. Feels like it might be more cushiony than the last seat.
- Seat was comfy and the back of the seat has less curve.
- Nice overall support and cushion. Could sit in this seat for long period of time
- Shape fit well - supported back. Decent cushion - felt like a better fit.
- Feel better than B1, the seat has more cushion. So feel more comfortable. Supports good too.
- Very comfortable. It seems a lot of cushion that can be felt from the moment you sit down. A lot of cushion felt behind the back of my knees = comfortable.
- This one felt a bit more firm. I prefer this one for this reason. It's firmer but not enough to cause discomfort

- I didn't feel like I was in a chair. Felt good to my body.
- I like that there is lower back support and the seat cushion has a good amount of padding.
- The best so far. Great comfy seat. Back support. Relaxing!
- This one feels the best for my back.
- I find it very comfortable. Overall new seat design is so much better than current ones.
- Seems to be more fitting to the body. More comfort when having longer commutes.
- Very good back support.
- Back support better. Seat feels wider. Cushion feels better and more comfortable.
- Was conforming to body. Had some flexibility and vinyl was not sticky.
- Good back support - seems comfortable - at least for short time.
- The length of my feet to floor are comfortable. Like the feeling on my small back.
- Feels a little too far reclined back, but otherwise comfortable. Good padding thickness.
- It's firm, but maybe a little too firm.
- I like the lumbar curve. Slight padding is good also. Not too soft
- Both seat and back have sufficient cushioning that I could sit for a while. But not good enough for me to fall asleep. Maybe if I'm really exhausted.
- Good for back support and posture, cushion hard.
- Good lower back support; bad: could feel movement of neighbor.
- The seat cushion is soft, but I have to lean back.
- Firm cushion is good. Lumbar support is noticeable.
- Very firm, doesn't sink in, feel on top of it and would easily shift out of it.
- Bottom cushion not deep enough, kind of narrow.
- Comfortable seat cushions!
- I like the back support. But the padding feels a bit too firm. Also I wish the seat were wider.
- Very supportive (back and bottom); good height for my legs; spacious. Comfortable.
- It works, seems a bit small (and I'm a small person). I wish it was a bit softer and more "scooped" instead of L.
- The lumbar support is nice. The bottom part is a little sloped forward feeling, but not uncomfortable (just not super comfortable).
- There is a rise in the seat under my legs that is perhaps larger than I find comfortable- could be smaller
- Felt slightly on the verge of sliding off bottom cushion. A little more give would allow me to "settle in" better.
- Back lumbar feels good ~ bottom cushion ok- not as good as current seats.
- Seat is a little stiff but has fairly good padding. Don't know how it would feel after 50 minutes! It's hard to lean your head back.
- Nice and firm but feels that it can be a little wider or better armrest
- Supports back well. I like the way it supports my back.
- Bottom cushion is nice and firm, elevates back to a comfortable height for back support.
- Soft enough; a little short under my legs. Like the armrest in between seats.
- Plenty of room, which is great for a bigger person like me. The bottom of the seat is kind of stiff, but not uncomfortable.
- Good back support - not sure about space - feels crowded? With seat in front of me as well as the armrest.
- Firm but squishy. Like a tight memory foam, feels like it's fighting back a little bit.



- I really like the soft seat, for a person working long hours and then commute home on BART-I think these seats are great!
- Feels ok. Not that much better than B1.
- C1 preferable to B1 - softer cushions. Back support identical in effect to B1, but my leanness means I need cushioning of my hip-bones.
- The lower seat is more softer, comfortable than B1, more plus and giving. Strangely the back portion seems less comfortable than B1.
- The seat is comfortable again, but maybe a bit less comfortable than B1 but nothing very noticeable.
- This one was more comfortable than B1. Back feels a little more in place.
- Not much difference compared to the first one; maybe a bit harder
- More cushion, more comfortable,
- This seat felt a little better than the previous, it feels like the height is better.
- More comfortable than B1. More squishy and less firm. Feels more form fitting.
- Comfortable. But not as much as B2. Was hot from previous person, which I don't like. And I was more aware of my back pain.
- Feels cushier than the previous seat, which I don't like. Feels like I am sitting in rather than on this one. (Which becomes gross after 10,000 people have sat in this seat.)
- Back little more forward; very comfortable supports back.
- Better mix of comfort and support. Would be better for a longer ride.
- Bottom seemed to have more padding and the back of the seat felt like it was shaped better for my back.
- Again too short in seat. Cushions seemed to be not as form as B2.
- Less comfortable shape than B. Seems not to have much "give" again, no armrest next to wall?
- I like the feel of the seat bottom - more cushion. I like where the middle of the seat hits the middle of my back.
- The seat is comfortable, but would be better if it was a little bit longer. In terms of comfort, it is superior to seat B3. Again, it could do without the armrest which is too small and low to use, and feels confining.
- Much better, good back support, bottom feels widest, longer.
- Comfortable, but not curved to fit the body. Decent foam density, relaxing but not for long BART rides/trips.
- Good. Seems slightly not so soft as 1st seat. I like the bar/separator between the two seats.
- A bit more comfortable than B4. I like the back support, curves to entire back.
- This seat took less time to get comfortable in. The backs are great!
- Softer than B, no discomfort on bones, still firm enough for support.
- Seat is comfortable but a bit too short front to back, too close to seat in front.
- I like that this one has a lower cushion (I think?) I don't feel as high off the ground.
- The seat is better in terms of comfort. The cushion depth (comfort) feels the same as seat B4.
- Seat still feels stiff on the butt. The back padding feels nice and conforming to the back area.
- This one feels the most cushy in terms of butt padding. Which is nice, and if I hadn't sat in the others it would have felt fine. But I think I still would like a bit more lower back support than this seat provides.
- I preferred seat #B1. It had the right amount of softness. This one was too soft and might not provide as much back support.
- The bottom is comfortable and the back is much more comfortable.

- Back feels more comfortable + padded, but the butt part is too firm.
- Back not comfortable - better than B1 but not as good as A1.
- The cushion on this seat is comfortable. Much better than B2, but not as great as A2.
- I didn't rate all seats excellent because my legs are short and the height of all seats is higher so I couldn't put my feet flat on the floor, that would make me tired. The 1st and 3rd seats feel the same to me. But I love the back support on all seats.
- Good support, but would have been nice if it was a little softer. Reminds me of current new BART seats.
- Nice firm but I so far prefer B2 for the long commute I do but I was not sitting in seat I choose as best one either.
- Seems to be softer and have more give than B2, so more comfortable than B2. Between good and excellent, good plus? Also seems deeper from front to back, bigger? Also seems flatter, not as thick?
- Seat was not too much from seats B2. However, I felt the seat feels a little higher?? Feel like I am sliding off a little.
- Nicer than B. I think for a long ride this would be my preference.
- Feels most comfortable of the 3, although the bottom of the seat backs seems to stick out more and push me forward which isn't ideal.
- Cushion is better, still not big enough; back support is better and even.
- Not very comfortable because the bottom seat cushion is too firm.
- Seat seems flatter - it feels more comfortable overall.
- This one's about equal to B3 - firmer, but equally comfortable.
- A little too firm. Aside from that the seat was fine. Same opinion for the armrest: it's a little too low.
- The cushion is good I don't like the arm between seats. The back support is good- not enough room.
- This is the best among the three (A, B, C). It is comfortable with large seat.
- Because I'm left handed pole not so bad.
- Good lumbar support seat cushion hard but comfortable.
- C was in between A and B. All are good.
- Better knee/legroom, upper back flexibility firmer lower back, felt like a slightly forward tilt lower in seat, liked armrest.
- I rate this one good/great. The cushion is comfortable to me and does not ache my bottom in any way. The back is perfect and I am feeling comfortable in this seat.
- Comfortable. For some reason I felt as if I was sitting on the edge?
- A bit softer than the others, which I like. I still feel like my weight is sliding out. A bit slippery, I think. But overall experience is good.
- At first it felt really hard, but the longer I sat, the more I was okay with it. Overall shape/support with back is quite comfortable.
- Back support little better than A. Seat cushion similar to B maybe bit firmer.
- Much more comfortable! I feel like I fit into the seat much better (the lumbar region now feels comfortable rather than protruding). (I also don't feel elevated anymore.)
- I happen to like this cushion the best of all 3- soft, not too hard, not so thin that I feel the framing. Hate the armrest. Not enough room between seats.

### **Seat C – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- It's really uncomfortable the backside is hard, so is the bottom. I cannot get comfortable at all.
- Too hard, particularly the butt-cushion. Lower back support too low.
- Can't sink into this seat, or relax. Feels like the angle on the back is too upright and the texture is too hard. I feel like I slide off this seat.
- Firmness is noticeable and I'm concerned it may hurt on a long ride. I'm leaning forward as my lower back aches.
- Bottom cushion is a bit hard. Back support hits ok at the base of the spine.
- Feels stiff and does not give.
- Actual seat seems a bit hard/stiff. Backrest is not comfortable.
- Not so comfortable, can feel the base of the seat and I'm sure it's going to be kind of bumpy ride.
- Feels ok- not enough cushioning for a long ride.
- I don't like the back support. Wished for a little cushion just at the bottom of the back cushion is ok. My legs are short, so they dangle just a little and I don't like the armrest. Seats seem very close together.
- Cushion offers resistance; armrest helpful; too soft.
- Don't like the bump in the small of my back.
- Feel a little stiff.
- Seems very hard and is exacerbating or causing a pain in my lower back. Also, I feel like I am barely on a seat, meaning the bottom seat barely covers my rear.
- Back is comfortable. Seat bottom kind of stiff.
- Seat cushion is a bit hard; the back rest is uncomfortable, it doesn't align well on my lower back, though my upper back is fine.
- Comfort was ok, but it was not the most comfortable. I will say the leg distance from seat to ground was good, but not upper body.
- I feel like I am sliding off. Have had to readjust myself every few seconds. Good lower back support, though.
- I rated it fair because the seat seems to not have as much comfort cushion as I thought. On a rainy day I wouldn't want to sit.
- Too firm, not enough "give". Almost feels puffy or convex. I have to shift around to get comfortable. Like the back support.
- It has good lumbar support that feels well cushioned. The bottom cushion is not well padded and I can feel the hard undersurface easily. The padding should be thicker.
- It's comfortable at first, but the lumbar bump gets annoying, especially if you start to slouch.
- Gives my lower back pain. Armrest is intrusive and not sure it serves purpose. Maybe good to have these fold up/down.
- Definitely not as soft as the previous seat. A bit stiff but something about it makes it comfortable.
- My back feels great and supported, but my bottom feels a little less comfortable, the seat is a little harder at the bottom.
- Back part is stiff, but bottom is comfortable.
- This seat was also hard but a little better than B, for sure! It feels bigger and offers more support than the B seat.

- Cushion seemed a little too firm. Placed pressure on my lower back. Needed to shift body positions a few times to be comfortable.
- Seat did not feel comfortable. Felt too high didn't feel as though my feet were comfortable on the ground.
- The cushion feels just slightly too flat. I feel like it would start to hurt after awhile for those without much "natural cushion".
- The cushion is a bit too hard.
- Seems firmer, no real comfort, back support off - too low after long ride - no ILLEGIBLE of comfort probably.
- Better than B3 more cushion but still not too comfortable.
- Seat slightly more comfortable but lumbar support still a little low. Material seems softer than B3. Still not wide enough for me. I would rather have a wider seat with slightly higher lumbar support. There was enough room for my backpack at the back of the seat.
- "Fabric" feels plastic like.
- The arch is too low and makes me slide forward out of the seat. Lower cushion is comfortable. Armrest is nice. Seat seems more narrow.
- Stiff, somewhat unforgiving, and my legs feel too short. I feel like I'm going to slide out and I don't feel 'seated'. I feel insecurely seated.
- Too firm, definitely feels like a 'bus seat', again feet don't touch floor comfortably.
- Seat contour not as comfortable - definitely would get uncomfortable for an extended commute.
- Honestly couldn't tell the difference between this seat and B1. Both a little too firm
- Seat cushion on back of seat feels shorter - or I notice it more when leaning back. Bottom cushion feels firmer.
- Cushion is more, but back arch is less than "B". My feet felt like not touching the floor as good as the others (A + B).
- This seat cushion feels softer than the other two, but still not as comfortable as the seats already on BART, both old and new.
- The hardest of all 3, doesn't feel the comfort support of the other 2.
- Narrower. Very easy to touch the person next to me. Feels like going back to A2. Hard to rest my back also.
- Still round and firm, still somewhat slippery, but feels just a bit more comfortable but not that much.
- Better lumbar support, better comfort under my rear. But still too high, too shallow, and there's pressure on the backs of my thighs.
- This seat seemed to have even less cushion. It will be ok for short trip but not as comfortable for longer trip.
- Firm like 2nd seat. No specific complaints.
- Good firmness. Armrest too narrow to be shared not enough legroom. Not enough width. Feel boxed in. Seat back - less support than A or B options.
- Seat is very stiff, not as comfortable as A and B.
- Feels like less padding in C4. Perhaps an improvement in legroom? Back padding adequate.
- Not enough legroom, cushion not dense enough, wasteful elbow rest. Width okay (without elbow rest)
- Too hard.
- Very firm, do not like armrest in between seats.

- The seat cushion is hard. Not as comfortable as the current BART seats. The back is also stiff.
- Don't like or need the armrest. Don't like the plastic.
- This seat seemed uncomfortable. The angle of the lower part of the seat immediately irritated my lower back.

## **SEAT EVALUATION PART II (after sitting in one seat for 18 minutes)**

### **11. How do you rate this seat in terms of comfort?**

#### **Seat A – Rated Excellent or Good**

- The seat and the back were comfortable. I didn't feel like I needed to keep shifting to be comfy. Also there was no armrest. I did not care for the armrest at all.
- The back of the bottom seat was comfortable because it wasn't too stiff. The outer part felt more stiff and took a few minutes to get used to and get comfortable in. I would prefer this part to not be as stiff (like seat C was perfect) but overall it was comfortable and easy to get used to. (Arrows pointed at described areas)
- Easy to breathe and relax. Uncomfortable as the head rest and shoulder areas not support enough. Please replace with cushion for comfy.
- The back support form is excellent for long travel - the seat cushion is a good form with the minimum amount of seat cushion with sinkage. The curve in the lower back is set based on the most important part of the lower back needed as long as the material has a non sweat base that could have endurance. No divider is needed.
- This seat was very comfortable especially, that we sat for 18 minutes. Back support was great. I like the bar on the back of the seat for ease to get out of the seat.
- I normally sleep during my 43 minute train ride from Union City to Downtown Berkeley and back 5 days/week, round trip and I found this seat pretty comfortable for sleeping- good seat cushioning and back support, right amount of firmness, the height of floor to seat was good for my legs.
- All of the marked/circled areas on the diagram to the right are great. The chair is firm yet has some softness which makes the longer sit times comfortable and supported. I did not get fidgety or restless. Rather, I felt solid and comfortable. (Circled lower back cushion and front edge seat cushion).
- I thought that the BART seat was fine, like I said they are very comfortable!!
- As a semi-tall person, I feel the seat is low - I feel pressure on my knees just because my feet are on the floor. The cushion is ok, but seemed less thick than the seats in B.
- It was fine. After trying out the seat in the same section this seat felt fine-maybe I was used to it after seating in A4.
- Overall it is good experience. Feel the space is a little bit small though I am just average person (maybe on smaller side). If small space but with more seats available in a car. I am ok.
- The seat is pretty comfortable overall. There is good back support both upper and lower areas. Some improvements could be made by widening/lengthening the seats though it would feel more spacious and more separated from the person next to you. My left foot/leg was really uncomfortable from the side wall curving inward. The armrest feels thin and flimsy. ("U" on front edge of seat cushion, "C" on lower back cushion, and "C" on upper back cushion; "wall curve bad" Not spacious feeling.)

- The back support (1.) is very comfortable. The seat cushion (2.) is equivalent in comfort to the backrest and make for a comfortable experience. (Back middle seat labeled 1 and bottom seat labeled 2.)
- Nice for back like. Prototype did not have armrest. Like firm seat.
- Was a nice arch for back rest but not as good as seat C (arrow points to lower back on diagram). Armrest would have been nice since the vinyl makes the seats slippery, it would have made it easier to stay in my seat (arrow points to center armrest). After sitting longer the cushion seems too hard (arrow points to seat cushion). Basically my butt hurts.
- Held up better - more comfortable - for the long run than for the 2-minute test, Good support in the lumbar region (marked with X). Still some discomfort where seat meets bone. ("X" marked on lower back cushion.)
- There was enough padding in the seat that I was comfortable for the whole "trip" (arrow points to seat cushion on illustration). The upper part of the back leaned back a bit too far (arrow points to upper back on illustration) made me want to lean forward at one point.
- I was happier with the armrest gone (arrow points to armrest between seats). But my butt wasn't happy with the firmness of the seat bottom (arrow points to seat cushion).
- Found good support for back (arrow points to middle of back cushion). I was able to feel the passenger sitting behind me and putting his knees up against the back of my seat. Perhaps I did not notice it with the other seats but I felt sticky in this chair.
- No armrest in this seat is a +. Back-sturdy is a bit hard and doesn't mold well.
- "X" marks the spot where the middle of the seat hits my back (middle). It feels really good. The bottom seat seems a little uncomfortable. ("X" marked at lower middle back cushion and front edge of seat cushion on diagram.)
- Seats seem to be leaned back. I prefer the seat divider. More seat cushion. (Arrow points to described areas.)
- I found it cozy and sufficient. I wasn't too aware of the pain in my back which means I got good back support (arrow points to lower back cushion). I did find myself leaning forward when talking to my neighbor, which felt a little weird. I liked having the armrest there between us.
- Back cushion was comfortable but the seat cushion itself felt too thick for an extended seated period. Felt I needed to shift weight to be comfortable.
- My butt is a bit sore- perhaps the bottom cushion is too hard. I disliked the center armrest - it got in the way + took up soft comfy space. I enjoyed the space at the foot area - both under my seat and under the seat in front of me. I feel fine about my foot room and luggage room.
- Didn't like the middle handle separating the seat.
- The upper back of the chair started to feel a bit stiff against my shoulders - not sure if it was the angle or the stiffness of the cushion. (Circled upper back cushion "uncomfortable, circled lower back cushion and seat cushion "comfortable".)
- The seat is little firm over time it feels "harder." The back is fine! This type of firmness in the seat may be good for someone who has back problems. But it was a little uncomfortable for me over time. (Arrow points to seat bottom.)
- To sit in the seat a lengthy time, it is nice to have the back slightly back- current old seats are more comfortable because they were cloth- but all in all, these seat covers are much better vinyl.
- I liked the fit of the bottom as my legs were perfectly comfortable on the floor. I had a lot of legroom to stretch my legs. The rail didn't seem to make a difference. But it would if it were higher and I could rest my arm on it.

- Seat too short under the legs - at back of knee area. If person behind grabs handle, it brings you back in your seat. Not enough space between rows. (Circled and arrow pointed to seat cushion, marked depth of seat "too short".)
- The seat part is comfortable. I like the armrest in the middle I don't like the fact I can't rest my head on the top of my seat.
- Pros: Comfortable back cushion, good angle and curve to put me in a good posture. Armrest if I was the only one in the seat I would have used it. (Wished I had one hour on here.) Cons: When I slouched in the seat it was not comfortable. My lower back began to hurt so I back up.
- The seat back was very comfortable when sitting pressed against it (likely because of the contouring). The seat cushion became slightly uncomfortable after a long duration of sitting- I felt myself keep shifting around to become more comfortable. The armrest was nice when reading a book to rest my elbow on, but I could see how someone else's elbow on the armrest might invade my space.
- The numbers refer to comments mentioned on other pages. (1) circled back seat handles, (2) lower back cushion and seat cushion, (3) drew a picture of a taller back seat handle, (4) drew modified armrests, higher and without the vertical support of the horizontal portion of the armrests, one on each side of seat.
- Extra leg space is a plus -the middle handlebar is useful. Seats are comfortable; back of the seats are comfortable. (Arrow pointing to midback area.)
- I like the seat. The height was good and the back was perfect, the seat cushion could have been more comfortable maybe more of a bucket seat to cradle the back side!
- The middle part of the seat is fairly comfortable! It provided support without being too hard or squishy. The edge of the seat is not comfortable, it is very hard and stiff. The middle part is not bad and for long extended sitting, it would be fine. (Arrow points to side edge of seat cushion "uncomfortable", arrow points to mid-section of seat cushion "comfortable.")

#### **Seat A – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- The overall seat was OK, it felt too hard for long trips (18 minutes). The back support felt ok, not great and the seat cushion felt too hard. And relaxing felt as if on a city bus with hard plastic seats.
- Bottom is hard and I had to readjust myself a handful of times. Like that there was no handle in between the two seats. Back was fine. Not having the handle allows for legs to be spread out if the BART rider felt so compelled for reasons of comfort.
- Seat cushion was slightly too firm. Tail bone area was extremely uncomfortable, especially for someone with a fractured tail bone. Back area needs way more support as well.
- Seat was uncomfortable after sitting in it a long time especially under my buttocks. (Arrow pointing to seat bottom.)
- The seat is overall uncomfortable. I have marked (A) and (B) in seat to indicate the most uncomfortable area. This seat also has uncomfortable cushion. ((A) indicates middle of seat cushion, (B) indicate left side edge of seat cushion.)
- The leg area (A) is a bit low and feels like you are sliding off of the seat. B conforms to the back nicely, but when slouching to sleep, it's slightly uncomfortable. C is pretty stiff and doesn't feel good at first but is pretty comfortable over time. (Seat labeled as described.)
- The back support is just fair since the cushion's thickness make it not so comfortable. (Circled entire chair "need improvement".)
- After sitting in this seat for an extended period of time, I realized that the seats are very hard, especially where the seat bottom meets the seat back. Also, the seat bottom's surface area feels

- smaller than the current seats and would be more comfortable if they were wider and longer. Finally, the aisle seat needs an armrest on the outside (aisle) side.
- Lumbar support was too low and too rigid. No armrest was not a factor in seat comfortability. The seat needs to be 2-4 inches wider. The handle was slightly annoying, when it was pulled on. Overall material was too rigid, the padding was uncomfortable after 5 minutes. (Arrows pointing to described seat areas.)
  - The mid to lower back is well supported. The longer I sat, the more uncomfortable it was. Made me long for the present seats. My ride daily is approximately 45 minutes. I am not looking forward to any of them. Sorry. (Line drawn as lower back cushion on diagram.)
  - I like the lumbar support. Prefer the seat without the armrests. Person behind me is too close. He's coughing on me. Seat feels wide enough for my hips but don't like the stiffness. I can read a magazine here but not in the back row. Too close. Material doesn't breathe well (maybe because it's 80 degrees).
  - Poor back support. It was uncomfortable for a long time. As well as the bottom cushion for a long time in the seat it's not very comfortable. (Arrow points to back cushion, and circled seat cushion.)
  - This seat felt fine, but I think it would have been more comfortable if the sitting surface were contoured more. It could have been more comfortable on the back of my thighs.
  - If I maintained perfect posture in the seat it was reasonably comfortable. If I slipped down at all I began to get pain in my tailbone and head to readjust how I was sitting. \*Good lumbar support. ("\*" on lower back cushion on diagram.)
  - Lower back support is definitely an improvement but it would be nicer if the seat had overall softer cushions. It would be ok for short commutes but maybe not a long BART trip.
  - Well I enjoy especially the back curvature (arrow points to back cushion). I think it's easy on my back. For specifically A4 I think (arrow points to front right corner of seat cushion) the seat is a little harder on my bottom, makes me feel like there is more pressure on it.
  - I like the curve on the back is a good shape (arrow points to lower back cushion). But the cushion is not so comfortable. Is hard (arrow points to seat cushion). I didn't really like the top handle (arrow points to back seat handle).
  - Seat cushion too hard- my buttocks are sore and going numb ("falling asleep"). Armrest is uncomfortable to use. Lack of aisle end armrest present in old seats. These armrests (the old/current ones) are rubbery. I like the backrest arch. (Seat labeled with described areas.)
  - Bottom is too firm for longer rides. Also the same feeling of the seat being angled forward. All seats feel narrower than current seats.
  - The armrest makes the seat feel incredibly cramped. Also, with an armrest on only one side my arms feel uneven and comfort is difficult to come by. Seat back is much too low to rest head on. (Circles armrest on diagram.)
  - The center armrest feels very uncomfortable. I'm larger, but there may be even larger people who feel stuffed into the seat. It's also very difficult for the person sitting by the window to exit their seat without requiring the aisle person to get up, but that may just always be the design for overall space.
  - Don't like the armrest. Felt a bit crowded. Also don't like the armrest in center. Like the handles on seat backs but don't like that they seem to make the backs shorter and there's nothing to rest your head on. Seat cushion ok. (Armrest labeled A and seat handle labeled B.)

**Seat A – Rated Don't Know or No Answer**



- The seat was firm, but not too much. The inward angle cushion wasn't excessive like seat B. Normally I nap and the seat was comfortable, but I prefer the material seats with this design and cushions.
- (B) was very comfortable and fit pretty well into the back area. (A) was not comfortable and felt like it was pushing up into my legs (maybe too hard? Like I could feel the plastic underneath the cushion. (On illustration, (B) indicates middle of seat cushion, and (A) indicates front edge of seat cushion.)
- My problem with A4 is same as with B1/C1/A1: (1) seat is only about 13" from front to back. I am a borderline - tall male with a 31" in-seam (somewhat short-legged for my height and build) and I would appreciate a couple more inches. Viewing this from perspective of smaller people. (2) I prefer a seat where the front is slightly higher (1"-2") than the rear, to inhibit sliding forward during typical BART stops.

### **Seat B – Rated Excellent or Good**

- I'm sure I liked the legroom! Seat cushion was soft enough for prolonged sitting. (Circled space in front of seat, circled seat cushion, and circled middle back seat cushion on diagram.)
- I liked the fact there wasn't an armrest. I felt the same level of comfort throughout the time, it didn't deteriorate. There also was ample space between me and the other passenger.
- Lumbar support was nice (arrow points to lower back cushion). Not necessarily a fan of armrests (arrow points to center armrest). Shape + length of bottom seat section was comfortable (arrow points to seat cushion).
- It was good having padding for my shoulders which made the seat even more comfortable.
- I like B due to the medium lumbar arch compared to A and C (C being too much). Long trips lumbar of C would create pressure pain or get too hot compared to rest of back area.
- I like the handle. Feels more secure. Cushions all seem the same to me (now). Perhaps the first seat seem more firm only because it was the first seat.
- Seat was perfectly appropriate for longer rides. Seat cover remained cool and non-sticky. ("x" on mid back cushion on illustration.)
- Both the seat itself and the backing seemed to have a good balance between firmness and softness.
- Seat cushion is good for this duration - doesn't sink like current BART seats do. Area (1) seems a little deep to me - again, making me slouch. (2) seems good-supportive. ((1) indicates upper back, and (2) indicates lower back on diagram.)
- I have legroom and no armrest, which is fine - The armrest is really more of a handle - too low to actually use - I like the window seat since I can lean against the wall - the back support is good but the bottom seat is a little too firm for a longer ride.
- Overall, the seat wasn't too bad. After slouching a bit and getting more comfortable, the back rest was perfect and it aligned well to my upper and lower back. The seat cushion itself felt a bit hard, and my butt was starting to feel a bit sore. (Arrow points to circled front edge of seat cushion, and circled back of seat cushion on diagram.) It feels mostly hard on the backmost part of the seat and the front most part. I wish the cushions were more comfortable and softer.
- There was no discomfort for me when it came to the seats with the armrests, as I was in the aisle seat. The curve of the seat at times was awkward, but when performing the 18 min exercise, I was in very good comfort in my B1 seat. I would not be highly dissatisfied if these were to become BART seats - it is just that I had to lean my posture down a little to be in total

- comfort (as in, extend my legs forward so my butt and back do not hit the back of the seat, but is forward a little.
- Half way through time my lower back began to hurt. I had to re-adjust myself several times during the time. I want an armrest closest to window!! I'm uncomfortable without an armrest when I am by window. Lastly, when the passenger behind me used the "seat handle" to get up, it was super annoying when my chair moved as she lifted herself up. (B). ((A) reference to Question #6, points to front edge of seat cushion, (B) points to back seat handle.)
  - The bottom seat cushion was comfortable for about 5 minutes and then it makes my butt numb. The back support is fair because it lacks cushion. The back/butt area was roomy where it helped level my back. (Arrow pointed to seat bottom labeled "Good. Arrow pointed to upper seat labeled "Fair.")
  - It was reasonably comfortable it kind of made my butt feel numb- maybe by cutting off circulation? Overall, just fine though. I could live with it.
  - More legroom. No middle armrest. (An "x" on lower back cushion/all the way back of seat cushion.)
  - More comfortable without armrest. (Crossed out armrest and labeled, "not on this seat.")
  - This is my favorite of the seats. I like the bits of support the curves behind my back and under me. When the person behind me shifted and used the handgrip it moved my seat quite a lot, which made me like that aspect less than I stated in the earlier question. Finally, I do think the seat is rather firm, not hard like on the bus, but not as comfortable as I've found the older "original" BART seats.
  - I find the top curves-in part too low, and it pushes into my back awkwardly (arrow points to upper back on illustration). Despite the illustration, the seat is not appreciably inclined, which adds to the feeling of slipping off. Section B seems better than the others for this (arrow points to seat cushion). The armrest would get in the way of me shifting my bag to the center.
  - The cushions are not as thick as current seats. Would be ok for me - big people would not fit inside if armrest is there. Started to "fidget" after 10 minutes. I think that is normal. I like the lumbar support the bottom cushions not as comfy as current seats.
  - Overall seat comfort is good; good cushion support for long rides. However the height is too high. Center armrest is too low and gives no assistance to getting up from seat. Headrest/seat handle is good for pulling yourself up to get out of seat but very uncomfortable to rest your head back.
  - I tend to lean forward on long rides. The front edge is pitched up a bit much for me (arrow pointing to front edge of seat). Too much upward pressure on the back and the lower hamstrings. For the long ride, it was less comfy.
  - Seat was too short for my legs. I would prefer a longer/deeper seat that would allow my purse or even my child to sit on my lap. (Arrow points to depth of seat cushion on diagram.)
  - It's as comfortable, maybe slightly more comfortable, than current BART seats (the new ones). It wasn't particularly uncomfortable in any way. The length of the seat from butt to knee seemed a little short and I'm a pretty small person. It wasn't bad, but I noticed it.
  - I do not care for the armrest or the seat handle. Armrest is a little low for short people like myself and the seat handle isn't strong enough. As for the actual seat, I like it because it's firm. Soft items such as a bed or chair (seat) I prefer them to be firm. Not too much or too little padding in the seat or back rest. (An "\*" on back seat cushion on diagram.)
  - The arch in the back support (1) is great. Seat cushion itself is comfortable but not overly so. ((1) indicates lower back cushion, and an arrow on front edge of seat on diagram.)

- Back cushion - good profile, but sticky - vinyl? Bottom cushion - too flat, too hard (not soft), not deep enough for my legs (arrow points at depth of seat cushion). Armrest - no particular opinion of comfort except I like that there is divider.
- Just generally okay! The distance between the rows seems to be less than current.
- I like the lower back support. I like that the upper back has some "give" when I'm sitting, so I can push back against it to stretch a little bit. The seat bottom is a little too hard. Almost feels like it would cut off circulation over time, unless I shift around regularly. (Arrows pointing to described areas.)
- Seat not deep enough, just wider enough and the seat does not give. But the seat is good enough for a short 20 minute-ride and beats standing! (Circles seat cushion and writes "just okay", circles back cushion and writes "okay.")
- The longer I sat, the better the seat began to feel. I guess because I started to slouch a bit which allowed for the contour of the seat to actually fit in the pocket of my back (arrow points to lower back area of seat).
- The seat cushion (arrow points to seat cushion on diagram) could be more padded. It started to feel stiff after the 18 minutes of sitting. The lumbar part could be (arrow points to lower back cushion) higher to sit more on the curve of my back. I like the metal armrest, it provided a good separation point from the next seat.
- Armrest is good for limiting passengers to use up space. Seat handle is good for extra support when sudden stops occur or for use of hanging items on.
- Backs are comfortable (arrow points to back cushion), like seat back handles (arrow points to seat back handles). Too little depth for me - I'm very long-legged (arrow points to seat).
- The material (silicone?) isn't as breathable as fabric + foam, hence it gets a little hot. Otherwise it is good, I like the flexibility of the back rest; it absorbs shock.
- The cushion is moderate. Lumbar support is ok.
- It was easy to get used to. Normally I stand on BART, so sitting is a rare treat. There are no beer bottles rolling around underneath, which is nice too. I like the lumbar support where the arrow shows here (arrow points to lower back cushion on diagram). And the lady next to me was pretty which may have influenced my perceptions.
- Despite not having any personal discomfort, I'm still unsure whether center armrest is a good idea. Seat was pretty comfortable, it's a decent cross between the current sofa-like seats and a subway seat. I'm also curious about the seat will feel like without this extra leg. Still, this seat is not a bad option.

#### **Seat B – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- The curved back provided good lumbar support (arrow points to lower back of illustration). The bottom cushion is too thin and firm, so I felt fatigued after the 18 minutes.
- The lumbar bump gets uncomfortable especially if you aren't sitting completely upright. I can feel shaking when someone grabs the seat handle. It would be nice if it was more sturdy. Wish there was a headrest.
- I feel that the seats are a significant downgrade from the current BART seats. These seats are much thinner and have considerably less padding. They are only a notch above the plastic MUNI seats.
- The rail on the back of the seat was not at all comfortable for resting one's head/sleeping (arrow points to back seat handle). Padding was not great, started feeling achy after about 5 minutes (arrow points to seat cushion).

- The little curve at the back is not comfortable and since I'm short, my feet are not completely planted on the ground and I can feel my feet starting to go to "sleep."
- The bottom cushion (arrow points to seat cushion on diagram) is pretty comfortable but I feel as if it makes for uncomfortable lower back support as it pushed your lower back out and away from you (arrow points to lower back cushion on diagram). Overall it makes a good seat but not for long train rides.
- I like to rest my head on the back; the plastic handle was uncomfortable (circles back seat handle on diagram.)
- While the lower back rest is actually comfortable, but again, my ass is kind of numb. I wish there was more cushion.
- Seat bottom is stiff. Back is OK.
- Besides the point I stated on 3rd seat, I only find the benefit of having handle between 2 seats are preventing homeless from sleeping on the BART; with my body size, I'm easy to get in/out the seat but I notice it may not be convenient for elderly or overweight people to access or get out the seat. (Arrow points to lower back cushion "supportive", arrow points to middle armrest "not recommended", arrow points to side of seat "uncomfortable".)
- This seat is similar to seat C2 where the bottom cushion did not have indent. The indent allows your back/spine to align better with the seat curve.
- The seat is too low profile, would look forward for more cushiony seats that could absorb the bumpy rides on the BART. Nicer bend (arrow points to lower back cushion) that allows the person sitting on the seat a great back support, as well as the person behind the seat easy access. (Arrow points to armrest "nice separation, kind of give equal room to sit".)
- Space seems too small felt I couldn't move without touching the person seating next to me. Felt seat is too straight I cannot relax. I like the back support.
- The back support is not comfortable. Length from seat seating area seemed too short or not comfortable. Did not care for the divider. Seemed like there is not enough room between seats from my seat to the front seat.
- Same as B1 except for armrests. Lower back pain after 18 minutes. (arrow points to lower back cushion on diagram.)
- The backside of the seat is comfortable and relaxing but that doesn't matter that much because the seat cushion is so uncomfortable that my buttocks hurts.
- Felt pretty hard after a period of time. I was aching in my lower buttock, and around my shoulder blades, particularly my right. This may be due to my posture though, rather than the seat or cushions. (Arrow points to upper part of seat.)
- It's okay. It's not a seat that I feel comfortable sitting in - how could I put it - it feels like it's work to sit in this seat, then when you arrive at your destination, you want to find a chair to sit down and rest in after this seat. It's hard, it's not a seat you can sink into; it's very upright. For people who spend a lot of time on BART, it is not a seat you look forward to sitting in and relaxing on way back home after a hard day. Can't slump in these. Must remain as buckled in and upright as ever. They are functioned for what they need to be: support one's weight till you get to where you go.
- Rear end became very sore. Started to develop a small headache. Was this the same type as A4? Felt very firm sitting on wood or concrete (arrow points to bottom seat cushion "bad"). Seat back is great. Love the curve. Great seat other than the cushion.
- Really uncomfortable lower and upper back. Would like a small cushion (arrow points to all the way back the seat/lower back cushion). Upper back - really uncomfortable too (arrow points to

- upper middle back cushion). Maybe seats designed for big men! Also I couldn't put my feet on the floor - legs just too short for comfort.
- Not comfortable for a ride of any duration. Continuous moderate pain (arrow points to seat bottom). Questionable whether comfortable for 20 minutes; better would be more cushioning over the lumbar support; also in the seat.
  - Too close to the front seat. The seat bottom should be made larger to allow a heavyweight person to sit comfortably. (Circled seat cushion on diagram.)

**Seat B – Rated Don't Know or No Answer**

- I almost wonder if the A seats would be more comfortable for a long trip now. My legs and back definitely started sweating from the plastic and heat. Ultimately it's just fine. (Drew handles between seats by where passengers' heads are "what if there was a high/middle handle? front/back instead of armrests; drew handle by outer side of aisle seat "small side handle is better".)

**Seat C – Rated Excellent or Good**

- Better A and B group. I do BART from Orinda to Glen Park 40 minutes one way. (Arrow points to seat bottom.) Good, just a little thin. (Arrow pointed to lower back of seat.) Excellent.
- For an 18-minute trip, there were no pain areas, for me. The bottom seat cushion is comfortable and I have no aches there, and for sure I could sit much longer on this seat. The back area was very comfortable as well, and that area in particular is a problem area for me, especially the lower back. I have marked those areas on the seat. ("X" on the right lower back, "x" on the left lower back, and a "x" on middle of seat cushion.)
- A: This part of the seat gives good support to my lower back. I like it. B: No neck support. Hard to take nap. But this is the same situation for all 3 seat types. ("A" and "B" refer to specific areas of Seat C)
- Back support offers more comfort on long stay due to slouching.
- The whole seat was comfortable. It was better without an armrest. The armrest should not be allowed. It's going to limit freedom in the seat and movement.
- I like the lower back "bump" (you'll see that's a theme). The bottom cushion seems comfortable as well.
- Would be better if this is little thicker (arrow points to back seat handle). Would be more comfortable if it is little bit inclined (arrow points to lower back). Seat firmness and heights are so comfortable and nicely designed. I like dark green color (arrow points to front edge of seat cushion).
- I prefer the armrest because it defines my personal space. I don't want a larger than normal person cramming into me, I also prefer the seat which is next to the window for that reason too. And sometimes I like to lean. You will note I did not fidget or shift around- this is because I found all of the seats comfortable. My primary concern, however is there are not normally enough seats.
- The bottom part of the seat is pretty comfortable. The back arch also gives enough support and feels comfortable. I like the hand rail to get up and to put my hands on.
- I think the seat was comfortable enough in the back as well as in the seat. It wasn't too hard, it conformed to the curves of my body, and it wasn't too soft and squishy. It provided support. The "ride" was pleasant.
- Bottom cushion is thicker and good for long periods of time.

- Feel the same as C1. Enough cushion and support. My legs are more relaxed. Lower back is also relaxed.
- Lumbar spine gave good support. Armrest is helpful in keeping 1 passenger from taking over both seats. Seat cushion hard (on my bottom). (Arrows pointing at described areas.)
- The seat is fine. Knowing there is an armrest made me feel better knowing the person next to me is distanced. Overall, cushion is good and comfy.
- Seat back fairly comfortable too firm upright higher in seat (arrow points to upper back). Pitch too upright here (arrow points to lower back). Felt comfortable middle of seat (arrow points to middle of seat cushion). Very firm edges (arrow points to front edge of seat cushion).
- Did not feel the need to shift positions. That was nice though my posterior was starting to get tired.
- The seat cushion is pretty firm, but it's thick. For a short ride, it wasn't as comfortable, but it wasn't bad for a long ride. Mid-back is pretty supportive. Curves a bit where I put arrow. (Arrow points at upper mid-back, and "x" on lower back.)
- Seats overall are comfortable. The seats are firm. I can picture the armrest getting broken several years down the road (arrow points to middle armrest). Also, armrests should be in the first row seats since they don't have anything to help people get up. Back of the chair handles should be for all other seats. Back of the chair handles are very uncomfortable for the person who is sitting in the chair. Chair moves a lot when people behind use them.
- LR (lumbar region as labeled on seat) - uncomfortable on other seats. Better on C seats, but still get in the way in the long term. SB (seat bottom labeled on seat) - decent on C, but in the long run, I feel like I'm sliding off.
- More legroom. A. comfortable in C section. B. Hated my seat being all jerked back as the person behind me was using it to stand up. C. Not as comfortable as the seats in current use. (Seat labeled as described with A, B, C.)
- Comfortable.
- The seat cushion was better on the "C" seat than the others. It seemed flatter and better able to conform to a variety of body types. The center armrest is a mistake - it makes no sense and is just something to get in the way or to get items caught on.
- 1 and 2 the seats were a little too firm. 2nd seat I sat in was the best in terms of comfort. The armrest is a little too low.
- I rated the "C" seats the lowest but after an extended sit I felt comfortable and wasn't fidgety at all. I like the support of the chair back and the bottom seat's firmness kept me comfortable and feeling like I wasn't sitting in a seat someone else was just in. (Arrow points to back cushion "firm back good support", arrow points to bottom seat cushion "bottom didn't make me fidgety".)
- It is comfortable. The seat and back are all good. Is it easy to clean. BART train seats have been reputed rather unclean.
- Well I usually don't sit with a wide open space in front but overall it's good. Only minor thing is back gets hot with fabric. (Arrow points to front edge of seat cushion "love this" "cozy", arrow points to back seat handle "not high enough", arrow points to center armrest "horrible".)
- No specific complaints. Did what I normally did for 18 minutes (read) without issue.
- The main reason why I like this seat more than the others is the extra legroom. Lack of armrest also adds to feeling of having extra room. The seat cushion and back are firm; they are ok for short rides but might get uncomfortable for longer rides.
- Personally, I really like the armrest between the seats. It made me more comfortable because I felt like I was seated by myself. The cushion is comfortable as well.

- The back support is very comfortable (arrow points to lower back cushion). 2. The center armrest is a little low for me to put my arm on but it is a good separation between seats because some people do take up more space than they are supposed to (arrow points to center armrest).
- The seat was good, but would have liked more softness in the seat. There was good front leg support. I did not like the back, I felt like I was having the small of my back pushed out. ("X" circling lower back of illustration, and a "check" on front edge of seat cushion.)
- Needs a little more foam in the rear - gets a little bony after 18 minutes (circled seat cushion at far back).
- I like the lower back support. 2. The seat is slightly raised and sitting on it for a long period of time made my bottom go numb. Maybe the cushion is too firm?
- (Arrow points toward back seat handle "head rest not exactly comfortable to lean head against - interested in taking a nap". Arrow points toward seat cushion "seats=firm yet has good cushion".)
- Bottom cushion=good. Lumbar support= no strong opinion. Back cushion=good.
- If I want to rest my head, I need to slouch down and my body wouldn't be able to touch the seat. I would like to see head rests if possible. If possible, some hard and some soft seats for people to choose from. Not too hard or too soft.
- Overall these seats (C2/3) seemed the most comfortable. I don't feel like any part of the seat is making me uncomfortable. One person will use armrest and make other person feel cramped to one side.
- I previously didn't love the "C" seat that much, but after sitting in it for a longer period it kind of grew on me. Still would like a little more back support (lower back) but the butt cushioning is very comfortable. I feel like my butt is resting on a cloud. I would rate this seat Good+, not quite excellent but pretty good. (Arrow points to lower back cushion "B-", arrow points to seat cushion "A+!")
- Good upper back support (arrow points to upper back cushion). Good lumbar support (arrow points to lower back cushion). Back part of cushion (side against the back) could use some more padding - a little stiff (arrow points to far back of seat cushion).
- It is very comfortable, there seems to be enough cushion to sit comfortably the whole ride. This part made it comfortable on the back of my knees. Although comfortable the armrest could be a little thicker to actually rest your arm along with passenger next to you. (Circled seat bottom.)
- It seemed smaller than C1, maybe due to the divider.
- The back is comfortable. The butt part is too firm. Don't like the armrest. Inconvenient for travelling with small children, for resting on your friend (arrows pointing to described areas).

#### **Seat C – Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- Seat was comfortable. Ergo dynamic, added cushion. No armrest. I have long arms and need to rest them on something! Bottom of the seat is comfortable didn't seem to move around like the seats do now!
- The seat feels too narrow, like it's trying to push me out. I would like either: 1. a cushier seat I can sink into, or 2. push the lower part of the seat back (arrow points to lower back seat cushion) a little to leave more room for my butt and to not have such a dramatic slope away (arrow points to upper back cushion with arrows pointing back) from my upper back. I found I couldn't decide whether or not to lean back, because both sitting up and leaning back felt

- uncomfortable. Maybe it's just my bad posture, though. Also, the seat is too hard. It would hurt if the train started moving and I fell into the seat, which happens to me a lot.
- When riders from the back pull on handle to exit, the seat sways/flexes creating a negative, distracting rider experience ((1) indicated as back seat handle on diagram). Seats handles should be rigid enough to handle pull from back seat riders or eliminated. Overall comfort is good, but being pulled from backseat is a negative experience.
  - Despite my previous answers, it was better. Not enough density on cushions. I liked the back shape. Inside seat has more room because of curved ball head. These are chairs for small persons- the set depth is too short for me, and the seat is awfully low. (Arrow points to mid back area.) I liked this. (Arrows referring to seat width.) Too short. (Arrow referring to seat height from floor.) Too low
  - The curvy part in the back (arrow points to lower back cushion) is pretty uncomfortable and makes me want to not lean against it at all. The seat itself (arrow points to seat cushion) is fine.
  - The seat was uncomfortable for my back. It had no lower support. The cushion was good. When the person next to me moved, my chair moved also. I wouldn't want to sit in this chair for more than 5 minutes.
  - It feels hard overall, the back not stable (arrow points to top of seat).
  - Back seat is too cramped, too firm (arrow points to upper back cushion), seats not wide enough, not much cushion; (arrow points to seats), too skinny (arrow points to armrest), not much cushion; not wide enough (arrow points to front edge of seat cushion).
  - Similar as previous ones, I don't like the seat slippery. Also the seat seems too short as my knees stick out way too much from the seat even though I am sitting all the way back. It feels like I'm not completely on the seat. Same as the other three. I don't think I like vinyl for the seats as they all seem too slippery and while they may be easier to clean, I prefer the non-slippery fabric seats. (Drew a leg on illustration indicating mid-thigh on bottom seat cushion and knee is all the way out in front.)
  - This bump created pressure under my thighs and is uncomfortable (arrow points to front edge of seat cushion). I like the lumbar support (arrow points to lower back cushion). This measurement is too short. And I'm only 5'2"! (Arrow points to drawn scale measurement of seat depth.)
  - Lumbar support and angle are good for me but again I don't feel 'seated'. If the train were moving I feel I would be slipping and sliding. My legs feel short. The cushioning feels stiff and uncomfortable, unforgiving. Unpleasant.
  - I felt as though I was sinking in the chair and it outlined my posture and I wasn't feeling as good of back support that I might have in the other mode of chairs. (Arrow points to lower back on illustration.)
  - The front edge of the bottom cushion (A) is too firm, causing a bump which as time went on became uncomfortable for my legs as my feet were not flat. (I am 5'2" with shoes with 1/2 in-sole.)
  - Circled areas uncomfortable. My back feels better on current BART seats. (Circled middle back seat cushion on diagram.)
  - Not cushy enough for long commutes. The firmness of the cushion made my butt numb. Also I notice the lack of flexibility up top hurt my back too (arrow pointed at lower back area).
  - Seat bothers my low back when sitting up straight. It's better when slouching down more though. I would not want to sit on this seat for more than 30 minutes or so. Center bar is unobtrusive and ok but not comfortable to place arm on really.



- General feeling was that I don't feel particularly comfortable nor uncomfortable. Feels like the space in front of me is quite spacious. Seat itself is sturdy cushion has not been a very important issue to me, so I think this one is good (better than the other 2). Armrest is good if it's higher than this one (for me) only when my neighbor is as slim as this person I am sitting with, or sits properly as she is now, otherwise it can be something not recommended. The seat handle is good to support me when getting up, but it definitely feels not comfortable when I rest my head to take a nap, as I always do when taking my usual BART trips.
- Of all of the seats I sat in, the "C" seats were the most uncomfortable. I have slightly lower back pain and this was immediately aggravated when I sat in the seat. The pain increased as time wore on and I had to lean forward or shift position to attempt to get comfortable.
- Bottom seat cushion is not comfortable for any extended period of time. Felt discomfort after 1 minute sitting in this seat. Definitely would not want to commute riding in this seat. Would prefer to stand for 40 minutes!

**Seat C – Rated Don't Know or No Answer**

- All of the seats felt particularly the same, they were all pretty uncomfortable due to the cushions.

**SEAT HANDLE**

**10. Please tell us why you rated the seat handle this way.**

**Rated Excellent or Good**

- Works just fine. I would not normally need to use one to get up.
- Easy to use, convenient. I liked it made it easy to balance and get up much more convenient than current BART seat handle.
- Excellent area to hold onto securely when exiting and entering seat.
- Easier to get up in a semi-confined space.
- It provides help when trying to stand up, you don't strain yourself on the way up.
- Sturdy, comfortable and easy to reach.
- It's good leverage in helping me to get up. I like the width of the handle, its opening is large, which makes it easy to grab using any hand. It's non-obtrusive also for the person grabbing the handle and for the person sitting on that chair.
- Good feel when grasping.
- Seat handles make it a lot easier to stand up. I did notice that the person in front of me reacted so she "felt" the pull on her seat which could be slightly uncomfortable. But I feel the handles greatly aid getting up and sitting down in the seats.
- Ample room for larger hands and a step up from the current handle design because handles are located on both seats.
- Easier to exit the seat with the open grip - many passengers struggle trying to hold onto cushion - (width).
- Easy to grip and stand up to get out quickly while in a hurry.
- It helps me to get up when I get off work. I need a little help getting up, so thank you and also it is a separator for me to have my own space.
- It seems to have worked the way it was meant to. Also grab surface is nice and wide so it could be used by either hand (or both). There is movement of the seat in front which isn't desirable.

- I like having the handle larger, I also like how when you pull it the person in front feels the seat move so they are not alarmed if you accidentally touch them.
- Great and better way to stand up and exit. I prefer the seat handle instead of the armrests!
- Feel comfortable and secure.
- Comfortable to grip - large handle is nice compared to the current handle.
- Less chance of accidentally touching the person in front of me when standing up.
- Certainly preferable to none, I like that I can put my hand through it. Also think it would help me if I was standing in the aisle.
- Wide area to grasp firmly with clenched hand around handle - rather than top of unhandled seat where slip are possible.
- Strong enough to support me. Seems stable.
- Easy to grab.
- It doesn't get in the way but could be helpful for riders that might need a little assistance getting up.
- I can steady myself and collect my bag. Seems to offer a better grip than current seats.
- Comfortable, sturdy and easy to get out of the seat.
- Seat handles are well designed and it has no sharp ends. Perhaps little wider will be so much better. It is very good as it is.
- Fixed hand holds are great and every seat should have them. Every handle when the train is full. People standing need more solid handholds.
- It's great for those that need the extra assistance but personally I wouldn't use it.
- Easy to grasp - to help get out.
- Great support. This is what people use instead of Armrest to pull themselves up.
- It is a good size and shape (can grasp easily and wrap my fingers around it). Because it isn't cloth, I feel it can be cleaned regularly, which is important!
- Good height and easy to grip. It expands across the whole seat top, so can grab with either hand easily.
- Right size to grip for my hand.
- It is light and somewhat flexible, so there's a good feel under the fingers. It's not slippery or cold, yet it is hard enough (porous) to be easily cleaned. It's nice and wide.
- Much better than grabbing on back of seat.
- I like this. I often use the back of the seat to get up. The handles provide a better surface than the regular (as they are now) seat backs.
- I think it is a good idea for those who may need a little assistance getting up from their seat. Also, it helps you balance when you are getting up when the train is in motion, or coming to a stop. Also, this is something I find myself already doing when I am on BART.
- I like the idea of a seat handle because I always see elderly people trying to use the seat to get up on BART trains.
- Wide enough and I don't bother the person sitting there as it is not (exactly) a part of his seat.
- I have something to hold on when trying to exit train when in motion.
- The handle is easy to hold on and it is high above the back of the people in front so I won't accidentally touch his shoulder. It is easier to get up with the handle to help steady the movement.
- I like the separation and being able to press/pull against when I get in or out of the seat.
- Easy to grab, makes for a great stability.

- Hard enough, longer means more support than the current seats. I feel like I can grab on something to get up is a better idea. For standees, it's comfortable to grab as well.
- I did not touch the person in front of me.
- The handle works fine, but my concern is the person standing beside the seat. The handle seems further in from the aisle.
- It is high so people who want to lean back and have neck and shoulder support have it. Some elderly, disabled, or obese people need the handle, it looks fine.
- It seems fairly sturdy. Would prefer more "heavy duty." Also, the opening is too large. Consider dividing the space into 2 smaller spaces with a wall in the middle. It would allow some support on the side of your hand.
- Sometimes it is difficult to get up from the seat with purses/bags. Being able to grab the handle gives support.
- Sturdy; good grip.
- Provides plenty of grabbing area, comfortable. Grip and measurement for my hand, seat (front) flexed too much, would make it sturdy so the front passenger is not bothered or upset at the movement of her/his seat.
- It's functional and wide enough.
- Thin design means less interference with passenger in front.
- It's good to excellent. It will work for me. It's wide - and that's good; because if the person in front has his/her head resting on it, I can still grab a part of it.
- The plastic handle feels like it can easily break, but I do like the handle as it is necessary for a lot of older passengers who need the support. Great idea!
- I wouldn't likely use the seat back handle but see the value in it for those who need assistance standing.
- It seems to help with getting up - but I use them as a standing passenger sometimes for stability. These seem a little obtrusive - like I would grab the person's hair or something. They would be better higher.
- Doesn't feel sturdy, the motion of pulling on the seat in front of you is annoying to the rider of the seat being pulled on. Could result in unhappy riders.
- Helpful in standing up- it might annoy person occupying that seat.
- Good grip, easy to hold firmly, but the seat back gave a little when pulled, made me feel a little off balance.
- Handle has an easy feel and grip. Definite improvement.
- It was easy to reach and grip.
- Help to stand up, especially when you're tired. Not sure if it will impact the passenger front or not.
- Don't rely on this normally. It's good to maintain balance.
- Provides stability when alighting.
- Handle is wide, giving good surface area to grab to get up. Comfortable shape and easy to grab.
- Good for person getting up. When I was in front, though, and the person behind me used it, my seat was way too flexible.
- I say the seat handle is good because it helps people to rise up when they are trying to get out of their seat it serves as a support if needed.
- I like having the grip. But it disturbs the person in front of you. But overall, seems like a nice and sturdy feature.
- It's thin enough to grip and feels sturdy to use. There's not enough clearance and I had a difficult time avoiding the passenger in the seat. It should be wider.

- Good for another alternative for helping passengers get up. To touch their neck and hair might be dangerous if BART has sudden stops might hit head.
- I slightly don't like the way the seat back yields when someone behind me use them. But this is only a minor and ephemeral (means "fleeting" or "transitory") concern.
- It seemed fine; don't necessarily know that I'd need it.
- Large area to grasp and feels sturdy. Looks like it didn't disturb the passenger in front of me.
- Like the material the handle is made of - not "tacky" feel like the current handles. There is enough room for larger hands.
- Good feel. Appears to be sturdy, did not give much as I used it to stand. Nice large grips to hold onto. Softer material would be nice.
- It's a good way to get out and have support. Will use in the future if implemented.
- Like the length across (good for quick grab). Was a little wobbly (gave a little when I pulled).
- It is a good idea. I am wondering if it jiggles the seat in front for the passenger sitting in it and disturbs them.
- It seems useful, but wiggled the passenger in front of me.
- I think it could be sturdier and thicker. I felt like I was pulling back the person in front of me.
- Like the idea of a seat handle for easier movement in getting up and out of the seats, but it may also bother the passengers sitting in front of me, with the movement.
- May make it easier to exit the train, because when it is commute hours and people try to get up a little before the stop, it is slightly difficult with train in motion. Seat handle gives more security.
- Felt like it helped me rise, somewhat flexible good/nicely fit hand, not too big or small.
- It's fine I don't have a preference as there isn't something to compare it to like the current BART handle. This one worked fine for its purpose.
- I feel like I would be disturbing the person sitting in the seat if I were to use it to get up. It would be nice when there no seats to have it to hang onto if I had to stand.
- Easy to grip but "square" edges feel sharper than necessary.
- It doesn't make a difference for me standing up from a sitting position, but as someone who is short, I can imagine really appreciating it when I'm standing on BART. I can never reach the taller handles, and I feel awkward exposing my armpits to others.
- It's good because now I will not feel like I am going to fall or do not have something to catch onto in case of sudden stop. Also it's good to have when you have umbrellas, etc.
- I like how the handle feels and looks. It does not cause me to touch or disturb the person sitting in the seat.
- It is easy to grasp and allows firm grip. It is good feature to help us get up from our seats. Also safety feature.
- Wide enough and handle is not too big to grip; even the front passenger's head was resting on it, still provided enough space to grip.
- Useful for getting up.
- The handle is grippable (not a word I know) but that makes it easier to use as a crutch to get up. But also it's a handle, it's hard to not do its job.
- It helps with getting up and is high enough. I think the legroom is poor - especially when the window seats tries to get out - not much space to do this - it would be hard when carrying more items too. There is not any room to cross your legs either.
- No real opinion on the seat handle. Easy to grip. But I probably wouldn't use it to get up. But for those who need it I think it would be fine.

- Because sometimes if you are carrying heavy bags you need a little lift, and what better way than to use the front seat handle for support.
- When I use the handle to stand up, the person's seat in front of me moves. If that's going to be like that on BART, it would be so annoying getting your seat jostled.
- I think this is a great idea. It eliminates the need for a center armrest, which some people might not like. The seat handle seems to be sturdy but might bother the people sitting in the seat being pulled on. While sitting in the front seat, it was slightly annoying to have someone pull on the seat while they were getting up.
- It's great for getting up out of my seat. But in my opinion it feels more flimsy than the ones on BART already...I feel like I may disturb someone's space by shaking their chair with these, and that would definitely prevent me from using it to not upset someone.
- It's helpful when necessary to have the handle to use.
- The seat handle can be better if my standing up will not make the seat in front of me move.
- I like the wide width of the opening (across the entire back of the seat). It does seem to jar the chair a lot of the person sitting in front.
- It's nice and slim, easy to catch up and great support while getting out of the train rather than falling all over while train/BART is moving.
- When I hold onto it I feel the person in front of me will be affected. The material doesn't seem firm enough.
- The seat handle is well-positioned and useful. However, it could be improved with a cylindrical shape which would be much more comfortable to grab, especially when gripping tightly due to the moving train.
- It does the job but it will move the seat and the person sitting on it. Not sturdy enough handle make the seat or space feel smaller.
- Nice to have if you need it. I really didn't. I worry about the movement to the seat in front of me or brushing against person in front of me (they might get upset).
- It was good because it works. Seems likely that people would rest their heads on it, making it uncomfortable for people to use it.
- It's sort of a thin shape, it feels slightly awkward to grip. Also, the riders in the front seats make it seem invasive to grab the handles.
- Easy to grab.
- It did the job.
- It's nice to have a handle in case you want it, but this one doesn't seem quite as strong as the current ones and might not hold up for as long before getting wobbly or breaking.
- Okay to use, but will be annoying for person sitting in the seat. Also, for women in the seat where someone is using the handle people may touch or pinch their hair.

**Rated Only Fair or Poor**

- Handle is a little shaky.
- It is helpful, but seems to be a bit flimsy. Also, I worry about touching/bothering/moving the seat of the person in front of me.
- Can pull up to only semi-erect (I'm 6'6"); handle/seat moves when pulled; position of knees against back of seat; they're pulled harder into back of forward seat.
- Hole not near enough to the edge, so I have to change hand positions. Poor design.
- The handle looks flimsy and will likely break. Does not provide a grip for people in the aisle.

- It's not too big and it's sturdy. I do think that there should be a handle because I don't like strangers sitting so close to me, but I don't want the handle to be too big because then it gets in the way of getting in and out of the seats.
- It's not strong and solid enough to support my weight to get up feeling fragile and unable to rely on this handle to balance myself while BART is running or stopping at the station.
- Felt flimsy like it might give way, but I like the ability to hold as I sit down (especially if I am passing over someone).
- Feels flimsy. Probably would bother the person in front of me. Would be better if it was more sturdy.
- It would be easier to grip if it were thicker, like the current seat handles on BART. Otherwise it seems fine.
- Perhaps it would be better with rubber so that it's not so hard.
- Seems a bit flimsy. The entire seat moves when pulled. May disturb passenger sitting in seat.
- The amount of flex in the back of the seat that supports the handle gives the feeling that it might break. Overall, design not bad.
- Doesn't feel strong and stable. It seems to affect the person sitting at front seat because the seat handle and back tie together
- When sitting, I like that the seat back has some give. But pulling on the handle of the seat in front of me, and feeling it shift a bit, doesn't make me feel confident in the quality of the car. Also, I feel like I have to reach too close to the passenger sitting in front of me. I don't want to brush their back or neck with my hand.
- The handle felt a little weak. For a heavier person, the person on the front seat might feel jolted
- Seat back handle should be stronger. They seem to be made of cheap plastic materials. The size of the handle is perfect.
- It's helpful for people who need extra support. I wouldn't want the person behind me pulling on the back of my chair when exiting.
- Didn't seem like there was enough resistance. For myself it was fine, but I wouldn't normally use it.
- The handle doesn't feel stable. The material seems too light and fragile. Also I don't need the handles help to stand up or sit down.
- It seems like it has a very good grip but it seems to bend the seat back which can lead to easier tearing and might cause discomfort to the passenger sitting on their seat.
- The handle is fine for pulling yourself up, but it is annoying when you're the person in the seat that's being pulled on because then your seat gets jerked on. It felt very wobbly from that side.
- Too much wiggle in seat - I feel inconsiderate rocking the person in front of me. Also, the seat handle does not offer as much balance as either an armrest or maybe a bar to the ceiling or overhead. It's a little awkward. I think that has to do with the angle of the seat.
- I don't like this. Feels like I am disturbing the person in the seat in front of me. Plus it does not feel sturdy for some reason.
- Having seat handles is very good but at the same time, holding it should not move the seat for the passenger in the front. Seat should be strong/steady enough that it doesn't move when the passenger at the back holds it to get up.
- Found myself trying to avoid poking the passenger in front. Handle really did help me stand.
- Just right to support me getting up, better than the current seating which I don't use the handle. But seemed more of a disturbance to the one sitting in the front.
- When I used it to get up, it felt like I pulled the whole seat toward me - not very sturdy. I would be worried I was disturbing the person sitting in front of me.

- It's not my normal behavior to touch the seat in front of me as I might disturb the person in the seat.
- It seems very flimsy and not super sturdy.
- The shape is not comfortable to grab. Did not seem rigid enough to offer support to someone who was unstable. Someone grabbing from behind really bent the seat backwards.
- Feels flimsy, like I could break it.
- Good shape and support, but it moves when I used it to pull up. Felt unsupportive or like I would damage it. Would definitely irritate person in seat in front of me because it moved the seat.
- The seat handle feels awkward. I might accidentally pull a few hairs of the person sitting in front of me.
- Seems flimsy; moves the front seat a lot, which might bother those riders.
- Flimsy – with person in front of me. I could move chair.
- It feels invasive to the person in front of me to grab in a place so close to their neck. Their seat also moves when I grab the handle. It does not help me stand up... I don't like the seat handle.
- Didn't really ever use back handles to stand up. Felt a little awkward. But I guess it's ok for those who actually do use it to get up from a seat.
- Wiggled when I put my weight on it.
- It is ok to use seat handle this way. But I like armrests better. If using the seat handle in front of your seat, not bad idea. Both seat handle and armrest are acceptable and should exist.
- Using it moves the person in front of me.
- It didn't seem to have much of an effect on me- if the seat handle were higher to rest my arm on that might make a difference.
- It should be more rounded, if I'm going to actually use it to pull myself up. Kind of pinched my hand. And I have my seat being all pulled on, my front seat isn't firm enough.
- It serves the function of lifting oneself up, but I wish they were more ergonomically designed-like rounder vs. angular, a smoother feel for the hand.
- Easy to grab from behind as a passenger, though. I miss having somewhere to lean my head back on - handle is hard!
- Don't use rails, armrests and other places where common viruses can be transferred.
- Seems to bother person in front. Seems "flimsy."
- Seat handle curves towards the neck of person on chair. There might be obstacles in grabbing, example, hair, overcoats, etc. I didn't want to touch anybody and watch them go off!!
- Kind of hurts my hand to pull on. Too thick and sharp (angled). I would prefer it to be thicker and more rounded. Also, it pulls on the people in front and might disturb them because the chair moves a bit. Because of that, I would avoid using it if the seat in front were occupied.
- I think the seat handles are real thin!
- Doesn't matter for getting up and down but it doesn't let you hold onto it very well when standing.
- Doesn't help to get up.
- When passengers get up using the seat handle it pulls back on the seat back in front and is not particularly useful otherwise.
- Doesn't seem sturdy. You risk hitting someone while trying to get up or you hand slipping and injuring yourself
- Feel too insecure for real world. I think it would make for trouble for person in front. It will cause fights re: pulling hair by accident. Bad idea.

- It pulls the seat and disturbs the person in front of you. It's too close to the back of their heads. I would not use it to stand up. Note: the current small handles on the aisle seats are great for standing passengers who can't reach the ceiling bars.
- Because is too high maybe, feel like I might hit the passenger in front, it wasn't that available. It should be sticking out at the back of the seat.
- Way too flexible. I feel bad about bothering the poor guy in front of me.
- In general, it may provide to be more difficult for larger persons, or difficult for parents with 2 kids in a seat, groceries. There is no way a person who is larger could exit the window seat without requiring the person in the aisle seat to stand up. Pulling on the front seats to stand up really jostles the front seats, very uncomfortable.
- I don't know if a seat handle is a prudent design option. I believe it is helpful to someone needing to get up, but the passenger in front will be annoyed.
- Don't like touching seat of other passengers. Seems invasive. What if it cracks or breaks off? Is that safe? What about germs? Flu season will be a nightmare.
- It's in the way.
- By configuration, one will bump into next passenger as soon as one sits in the seat.
- Very hard plastic that is a bit uncomfortable to grip.
- I could feel the handle bending back when I pulled on it, and it disrupted the person in front of me.
- The handle feels flimsy and too narrow to offer much support to get out of the seat quickly. I also think it disturbs the rider in front.
- Needs to be a lot stronger. Too weak!

#### **Rated Don't Know**

- I don't use the handle on the back of the seat to stand-up. I use it to hold on when I don't have a seat and need to brace myself.
- I only use the seat handle when it is standing room only and I'm stuck in the aisle. I have no opinion of these handles.
- It's nice to have a handle at times but I see that it moves the person back rest in front of me and I imagine people's clothes and hair would get in one way. Plus I like to lean my head back on the top of the rest and I wouldn't be able to do that with these.
- Never use.
- Don't use the seat handle.



## FINAL QUESTIONS

### 15. Do you have any other comments about the seats for BART's new train cars?

- The current/old cushions including vinyl replacements are much more comfortable than the prototype cushions.
- A1 feels better than old seats.
- Make sure to test these seats with people who have mobility challenges and/or difficulty standing! I do worry about how accessible they will be.
- Doesn't have between-room. Seems to be less than current.
- Be sure to have adequate legroom: at least 2" more than in the models. Better would be 3".
- The seats look better and cleaner. Afterthought, the A seat are much more comfy.
- Thank you for exploring seat cushions, often I ride for a long distance on BART and seat comfort is important for me. Legroom was poor in prototypes.
- Use the DC Metro seats. They discourage hogging of the seat by inconsiderate riders, they center you, so they provide separation, and you don't sink in, so they are easy to get up from.
- I like the current vinyl seat cushions better than the A, B or C groups to be honest. But I like the seat handles and armrest in the center because the handles make the seat higher and the center armrest provides more privacy.
- Vinyl is a good idea over fabric mainly due to ease of clean up and minimal absorption of dirt, odor, etc., that would be lodged within the fabric material.
- It would be great to have them be anti-bacterial/anti-microbial. Glad the fabric seats will be gone forever. Keep some softness to the seats - it's especially important for longer trips or commutes.
- They need more regular cleaning! Also, the old fabric seats should be all replaced ASAP.
- Very modern compared to the very "dated" 1970's seats.
- Look forward to the new seats.
- I appreciate your research about the seats seeking riders' input. Average BART ride is long enough and the seats need to be functional.
- I cannot believe BART is conducting this survey. I think it is silly. All the seats appear flimsy with little seat support. I would like to see more comfortable seats. I've sat in plastic seats (no cushion) that were more comfortable.
- Not really, just the same as previously stated. Also the seat handles depend on the size of the handles, I would only want them about half the depth of the seat, any more and it would be too big.
- This is a subway system, not a "couch on wheels". Even hard plastic seats would be fine. The seats in operating BART trains are too cushiony. In fact, you should have fewer seats and more standing room and doors for on-boarding and off-boarding with ease.
- I'd suggest BART remove the carpet since it stinks during the rainy season and looks so dirty when we step on it. At the same time, try to use bench instead of seat, which makes more room for people to fit in the BART (check MTR in Hong Kong). Create six exits for people to get on/off the BART in fastest time by remove the seats.
- I really like the new vinyl seats currently installed. These today are too hard. I also think the armrests between the seats are a big downgrade. It means you can't recline if the train's empty, you can't cuddle with your partner, and there's not enough room for my 1-yr-old on my lap. Also they may cause injuries if the train lurches before you've fully sat down. Also my baby might get his leg caught on the armrest. Strong "no" vote on armrests.

- I like the firmness of new seats. The current ones are too soft.
- The fabric ones are nasty! I generally like them and find them to be an improvement.
- No armrests! Very limiting. We are human beings, the tiniest amount of interaction isn't a negative thing.
- Really like the vinyl and NO CARPET. The trains seem a lot cleaner without carpet and cloth seats. I should also note I've never felt that BART seats were uncomfortable - they just have grossed me out a little.
- Thanks for the consideration of upgrades. We do appreciate it.
- I would look into a better and more adaptive material than silicone, perhaps a memory foam silicone hybrid that adjusts to the individual.
- Vinyl is good- stays cleaner and smells cleaner.
- The legroom of these seats is slightly better.
- I enjoyed vinyl seats better. Because they appear more sanitary. I do think you overlooked the fact many don't actually sit in the chairs, but use them to brace themselves when they have to stand on a crowded train.
- I like that in all of the new seat prototypes you don't sink in as much as you would in the current seats. Also, yes to vinyl!!! So much better than the old grubby fabric seats.
- Maybe use the same style and material as the vinyl seats or the old ones, these new seats are too hard on my bottom.
- I'm divided on the armrests - I like separation, but as a "reverse commuter" I often swing my legs across the seat row when the next seat is empty for more legroom. Armrests would make this difficult.
- The current BART seats are wider and I feel like I have more personal space. The cushions seem more comfy and are softer. However, I like the taller seats of the prototypes. They are better for my height and give me more support.
- The vinyl covers feel more solid and better quality than the vinyl covers I sat on. Doesn't look so cheap.
- New seats should be wider and have more legroom. There are nowadays more large and obese people so the extra room is important for comfort. Make sure the new seats are cleaned regularly. The current old fabric seats are dirty and also pose a health risk due to the existence of the harmful MRSA found on the seats. MRSA can cause serious illness and can even be fatal.
- Seat stability - if I put my leg on front seat, or person uses seat handles to get up, it will move and disturb. Even if neighbor moves or shifts around. (2) Headrest - Either needs to be curved or more preferably, cushioned. (3) Height of seat very, very important - Needs to be higher, can't lay back head to rest - while sitting straight. Need to slip down on the seat to be able to rest head. Seat armrest - Needs one on the aisle side too, to rest arm. Make both armrests foldable so as to not obstruct path. A little higher up too. Center needs two, if other passengers need to rest arm. Feel seats are narrower. Would be difficult for two heavier co-passengers. Also don't have room to turn and lie on the side to sleep. Sleep is important, majority of BART passengers do sleep on the BART!
- I think these seats would be unbearable for a long commute like I have (Pittsburg/Baypoint to Embarcadero). My back hurts from sitting in them only 30 minutes.
- Hope we will have more seats in a car.
- If there will be more seats, then the space is fine. Bikes should not be allowed on cars other than in the back. I think there should be a bike car like Caltrain.
- Only comment is that vinyl is rather toxic to produce and to recycle. Toxic in a fire as well.

- I am not fond of the middle bar for the back seats. Larger than this will make it more difficult to get in and out of the back seat which can already be a chore.
- The vinyl seats in general are better than the cloth seats. There is an impression of more room in the new cars.
- These new seats need extra padding! Why fix something that isn't broke? These are a significant downgrade.
- Elevate the armrest.
- The seat prototype B4 felt the most comfortable and shaped for a person's body.
- If seats will have grab bar, they'll need to be stiffer. You feel it too much when person behind you uses it. Are the rows closer together? Might be difficult to climb over someone.
- I would really appreciate foot rests.
- I think they shouldn't put the middle seat handle on all the seats, also the seats.
- I like them.
- I prefer seats that are more plush and have a sturdy back support. These two factors are ideal for my long commutes.
- Even the prototype seats appear to be more susceptible to damage (less than the current) than they should be. Make a seat that is easy to clean and not subject to damage! Comfort should be way down the list. After all, a BART trip isn't a five-hour flight to New York.
- Why don't they have plug-ins so I can charge my phone/tablet? They do this on airlines why can't they do this on the BART? This is the Bay Area. Why don't you guys be innovative! Especially considering how much we pay for fares.
- I like that the new seats aren't fabric but are still comfortable, they seem more sanitary and don't stink up the cars like some of the old seats did.
- Vinyl is not a good material for public transit seats. It's prone to scratch and not easy to maintain.
- I like being able to stretch my legs out underneath the seat in front - I'm glad I can still do that. I wouldn't feel comfortable holding on to the seat handle if I'm standing in the aisle. Not strong enough, too close to person.
- The cushions should be thicker and have center and side armrests to provide support when I read and distance from other passengers. The vinyl seats are much better than fabric as they are easier to clean and do not absorb liquids, food or odors.
- I would like the fabric seats because the vinyl seats can burn + be toxic + can be written on with graffiti.
- If BART had seats that massage you while riding, I would be on BART a lot more. Overall these seats are much better than before! Thank you.
- More cushion provides more comfort. Or else I would think my buttocks might be numb or my back may ache after a 20-30 minute ride.
- Worry about slashers damaging fabric. Worry about ultimately filthy seats. Will they actually ever be cleaned?
- Some people may not fit comfortably in these seats. I don't think my husband of 250 pounds would fit.
- Overall superior. I am very concerned about cleanliness and vandalism. These seem more durable.
- Comfort is important, space is necessary.
- As someone who is tall, I appreciate as much legroom as possible. That actually is more important to me than the seat itself.

- These seats don't seem to fit a person with a smaller build. Armrests might be a bad idea. Please go easy on the lumbar bump. That is the most uncomfortable thing for me.
- The vinyl fabric is a significant improvement over the fabric of current cars. There should be more luggage rack space in the cars.
- Not a bad blend of space saving and acceptable level of comfort for my commute.
- Remember that many of us have extended commute on BART (40 minutes for me) and seat comfort is critical for the extended commute. Decreasing comfort could drive me back to my car if new seats are markedly uncomfortable compared to the current seats. Seat bottoms are the most important to me!
- If the seats are too hard I'd rather stand and would ride BART less. The seats should last but shouldn't feel like concrete.
- I would like to have the same, if not more, cushion on the new seats, but I know durability and ease of cleaning is important. I would prefer to sit on clean seats than soft seats.
- Current vinyl seats are significantly thicker, cushier. That said I don't mind thinner seats.
- No. I think C is a better option.
- I preferred the B prototype.
- I like the back rest better on the prototypes since they have a small bent to them that make it more comfortable on your back.
- Good about the vinyl!
- The dimension changes I recommend would amount to about 2 feet in a 20-seat car (20 x 2") assuming standing room the same. Perhaps one foot could be subtracted from each of the two entrance ways.
- The back arm pulls should have more stability so that people who grab onto your handle to pull themselves up don't disturb you as much. I like the overall look of the seats though.
- I sit so seldom on BART I don't know if I have enough experience on the seats to comment. Want me to redo the survey after standing for 18 minutes?
- Seat "A" was most comfortable to me. I really would like an armrest in the chair closest to the window. I do not like the thin armrest between seats. I hate how the seats in front move when someone behind you uses the "seat handle" to get up.
- Yes. Can you do something about vinyl seats being cut by sharp objects? I have seen a couple seats were cut.
- I like the vinyl, seems more sanitary. I also think they should work on the seat cushion comfort just a little more.
- Not really. Thanks for upgrading.
- Vinyl seats are great improvement over the old fabric ones!! Better for the cleanliness and environment, too!
- Like the B rows much better than any other seats.
- I am totally appreciative of the fact that the fabric is being changed because the old fabric is quite disgusting!
- Not looking forward. Hope the seat handle doesn't happen.
- Really do not like seat front hand holds. Like older style much better.
- A little too tight on these prototypes.
- Overall felt adequate for most trips. Long trips in some seats may be tiring to back. All seat cushions adequate. All seats felt ok if I crossed my legs (I do this a lot).
- I like not only the vinyl seats, but also the non-carpeted floors - they seem like they must be easier to clean and have fewer stains.
- I think the seat prototypes today are better than the existing new seats.

- It seems like there is more legroom for the back seats, which is a much needed improvement.
- Happy to see they are changing the seats as the original seats are long overdue to be changed.
- Love the armrest and support for back rest. Bottom cushions are hard and slippery. Seats are too close together front to back. Like that the seats will be cleaner and easier to maintain. Side to side there is plenty of space.
- I like the overall design. Stylish and good back support.
- New seat designs are so much better.
- In general, I prefer the current vinyl seats over the prototype. I like that it's bench-style (and can accommodate for 3 small people when I'm with friends!). Of the prototype seats, I only like the seat handles - but that's more important if I'm standing.
- Too soft (bottom cushion).
- I am happy to see them coming. They are long overdue.
- Bike hooks look like the VTA light rail. Hand holds should be all firm/fixed. Don't like the loops now. Hooks for bags-instead of putting the bag on the ground.
- Like I said I think these seats are very soft and comfortable!!
- For me, the seats are a little too high and I am 5'6" tall. But it is probably just right for the tall people. Not a big concern. I can live with this.
- The vinyl seats are definitely better than the fabric seats. However, the new seats need better armrest and back handles need to be sturdier.
- I like the overall shape of it, the curve notch back and the flare bottom. But the "B" seats were most comfortable overall because of the cushion. Not too hard, but not too soft.
- Leave off the armrests.
- I like the material because fabrics are filthy and hard to clean. Outside seat/aisle seat should have armrest. Armrest between is good to have to deter a person occupying two seats, but should be wider.
- Maybe the possibility of a tray table for those of us who work on laptops on long trips (like on an airplane).
- Armrests against the walls would be helpful. Center armrests may discourage transients from taking over seats as sleeping areas.
- I really feel cramped and my ass is pinched. One seat really felt like I was perched on a bleacher seat. I like the vinyl covers but not these bus seats.
- I currently prefer the vinyl covers.
- I'm really not a fan of the armrests. I think if you do have them, consider only having them on half of aisles. I like the seat color. The vinyl has been fine to ride on and I support anything that can be cleaned more easily.
- The seats look nice. Don't like the armrest in the middle.
- These new ones visually look nicer than the vinyl ones but are less comfortable in general.
- The seats are much sleeker and lighter, but feel smaller. The back rest is not comfortable for me when sitting up straight - it bothers lower back. The vinyl seats are nonstick - I tend to slide on them depending upon what material the clothing is I'm wearing.
- I think all 3 prototypes are good. As I've said before several times, I think lower back support is important for a lot of commuters and I'd like to see that in the new BART seats. But none of the 3 were uncomfortable to me - so I would be satisfied with any of these.
- I prefer the cushions on the old BART trains in terms of comfort and support. It would be great if the new BART trains could have the same cushion, but with a cleaner fabric. Also, how will this fabric react/conduct heat during hot days? Will the vinyl cause more passengers to sweat on the seats? Please remove the center armrest. It's not comfortable and may negatively impact

- overweight people and maybe parents with small children, people with groceries or luggage, etc. If possible, please help to make the seats support strong enough so that people aren't constantly jostled if their seat mate is moving a lot.
- I would trade less legroom and seat depth for more seats on train - my commute is 37 minutes each way - I often don't get a seat.
  - The softer the cushion on the bottom, the more comfortable, I believe, it is for the rider.
  - Make sure and use vinyl seat covers. Prefer no middle armrest.
  - Seat cushions that are not as stiff like seat C was the most comfortable!! Overall much improvement from what BART vinyl seats are now.
  - I feel very uncomfortable in seat A1. B1 and C1, though they varied in their quality of discomfort, didn't hold a candle to the comfort of A1. I didn't feel my legs were too short in A1 even though each seat height is the same.
  - I wonder how well the firmness will hold up after years of use and abuse. Those seats today were significantly more firm than those on BART now.
  - I am glad BART is upgrading its fleet. I believe these seats will be cleaner and durable. I don't know how to resolve the issue of providing support to people to move in and out of their seats.
  - Please no armrests! Make the butt as comfy as possible for those long BART rides. + more stroller space by seats please =)
  - Seats are harder and tighter. Too close. Armrests potentially hazardous. Feels more like a bus. Not as comfortable as current seats. Shady characters ride BART. Don't want to be close to them.
  - Taking into account that there are limitations to the amount of width, I would still want to have a slightly wider chair. These seats seem too rigid.
  - Any of the seats would be okay (B preferred), but the armrest is really discomforting.
  - For some reason I feel like the new vinyl seats already on BART are more comfortable than these prototypes.
  - Keep focusing on cleaning inside of trains.
  - Any chance to get fabric seat?
  - Nope - love BART - it allows me to get to places I do not want to drive.
  - Please make sure to leave ample legroom for those of us who tower over everyone else. At 5'10" I need quite a bit of legroom. Also please put some kind of gel or foam in armrest for added comfort. Let us eat and place trash cans on BART. They do on Caltrain and the experience makes a difference. Thank you.
  - Seats should have a little more space between front and back rows. I have long legs and felt cramped in the second row.
  - I haven't sat in the current vinyl seats on BART that many times or for very long to notice much difference to these prototypes. Although, if the prototypes are narrower, I'd like the new ones to be just as wide as the current ones are.
  - All in all very comfortable- you are not at home and watching T.V. For hours on end - they are cleaner than cloth. I have no rear end any more so all kinds of seats will be uncomfortable for me after awhile.
  - I really like the recent vinyl style of seat and think overall they are better than any tested here today.
  - Is space between rows less? It appears to be so as now the length of the seat bottom. Do like the idea of separate seats of vinyl. Cloth seats difficult to clean and pick up every odor.
  - Does this new seat cost a lot of money? Germs and dirt easy to clean on this new system? When the train is crowded do the seats allow more space for standing?

- The armrest seems to make the seats feel smaller as neither party wants to actually use it (like on an airplane) so both end up sitting with your elbows tucked in close to your sides.
- As mentioned earlier, would look for more cushioned seats, better absorb the shocks or bumps on the ride. Divider between the seat does give equal room to riders but could be problem to heavy guys.
- I prefer the current ones in terms of body-feel, but the other properties of the new seats outlined in the pre-sitting take seem appealing.
- I believe that the vinyl seats are probably easier to clean. But the fabric seats are much more comfortable and less warm.
- I hope to see them spread around on all trains, not just some. I see them car after car on Pittsburg trains, but there will only be one car with them on Dublin or Fremont trains. The same goes for Richmond trains.
- Going for lighter seats is a great thing but don't sacrifice the comfort. Comfort is the reason I choose BART over the bus ALWAYS.
- I really prefer the cushions in the "A" seats. I think the new designs are much better than the old seats.
- :( I will miss the old seats.
- Frankly, I would prefer plastic seats like the NYC subway. Dirty seats are so gross.
- The lower back curve on the seats is a great idea that can improve comfort levels greatly.
- Since I get used to the wide seats, some of us may not get used to the narrower seats. Since some people have soft and some have hard mattress. If possible, there should be two choices of seats available on trains to choose from.
- Although vinyl is cleaner and newer than fabric covers, I like fabric covers better because it feels softer and warmer.
- The current seats are already very comfortable and just needed to be reupholstered. I like the vinyl seats in the train now. The prototypes, while much more modern-looking, are not comfortable, especially for longer train rides.
- Not enough space. Too close to person next to me.
- I actually like the new vinyl seats better than the prototypes - more cushion.
- I like that the vinyl seat's back rest has a little shape to it.
- I like to have a little thicker cushion of B2.
- These are all terrible. Ok for shorter rides, I suppose, but would be awful on longer ones.
- I prefer the current seats with vinyl seat covers over the new designs.
- Color too light after one month would be tagged with Sharpies. Looks great when new! For the amount of time I have on the train they are ok for me. I do think "C" seats were best.
- I'm not sure about the armrests. Felt kind of flimsy and not readily accessible. Overall the new seats are a much needed improvement.
- As long as they can be and ARE regularly cleaned, I am happy with them! The main flaws in BART's "comfort" design for passenger cars are the smell and obvious lack of cleanliness. If these new seats can help to remedy that, I'm for them 100%!! They seem nice and well made (with the exception of the back handle, maybe).
- Seats are smaller and cushions are stiff.
- I think the seat would be more comfortable if they had more cushioning. They also don't seem to be as wide as the current seats.
- I like to old current seat cushions? Seems like the vinyl is more smarter? Easier to clean? Vinyl is better than cloth!! After rethinking- I like the backseat handle.

- The handles on the backs aren't so good because they're like trays on airplane seats - they work okay for the person in the back seat (who is using them), but they aren't very nice for the person whose seat they're attached to because the whole back moves when they're used. Also the seat divider thingies would be inconvenient if you are travelling with lots of stuff or are trying to fit three friends into two seats.
- Window seats feel more cramped than current. I'm a fairly small guy. I think window seat/armrests will become issue for larger/obese passengers.