SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT

POLICE DEPARTMENT

This document is the NOBLE Management Audit Response Matrix. The NOBLE Audit Report is broken into 16 chapters of recommendations, which focuses on 25 key areas of concerns. I am pleased to report that we have accepted and have been working on implementing the majority of the recommendations. Although I feel we have made substantial progress in our efforts, we definitely still have much more work to do on re-building the police accountability and management systems from the ground up.

The following five goals were established for the organization by the BART General Manager:

- 1. Strengthening service to our customers (visibility)
- 2. Strengthening management oversight of the department (accountability)
 - a. Current policies
 - b. Formalize process for tracking policies
 - c. Assured delivery of increased training
- 3. Strengthening services to our communities
 - a. Cultural groups/activities
 - b. Cultural competence
- 4. Helping to establish citizen oversight
- 5. Provide support & resources to PD employees (morale)

Using the corresponding numerical number in front of the before mentioned priorities, I have categorized each of the specific recommendations from the NOBLE Audit under one of the priorities. Along with the category that the recommendation falls under, the matrix also lists the major key area of concern, a brief description of the recommendation, the page number the specific recommendation can be found on in the NOBLE Audit, the current disposition of the recommendation, any department action that has been taken regarding the recommendation, and who his responsible for follow up or follow through for the completion of each specific recommendation.

Description Report Page Disposition Department Action Category Committee

Going forward, we will report out on our progress on the NOBLE Audit twice a year (June & December). We also will begin to vet our department actions regarding each recommendation through our newly established Citizen Review Board (CRB).

Chief Kenton W. Rainey

NOBLE BART Management Audit Response Matrix

Description, (including NOBLE recommendations)	Report Page	Disposition	Department Action	Category	Committee Name
CULTURE					
BART PD should form a proactive Police Advisory Board to provide non-binding feedback on proposed significant initiatives.	34	Completed/ ongoing		3	Chief
RECRUITMENT &					
SELECTION					
BART PD should require essential signatory documents be signed by police officer candidates as a condition of employment. • Core Values • Vision Statement • Mission Statement • Law Enforcement Code of Ethics • Canons of Law Enforcement Ethics • Law Enforcement Oath of Honor.	38	Completed/ ongoing		5	Chief
BART PD should establish Recruitment and Retention Advisory Council represent cross	39	Completed/ ongoing		3	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis&

section of private and public employees,				Lt. Haight
community members and stake-holders				
receiving BPD law enforcement services.				
BART PD should recruit qualified individuals from both private and public organizations who possess the following characteristics; • Integrity • Service orientated • Interpersonal relations • Team compatibility • Performance driven	40	Completed/ ongoing	3	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD should work to build a strong relationship with the community by identifying key community and business leaders. Suggest partnerships to include military, colleges, high school counselors, community-based organizations, student associations and private customer service organizations.	41	Completed/ ongoing	3	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD should develop a flexible profile of an effective police officer by identifying the "most viable candidates." BPD should identify the knowledge, skill,	42	Completed/ ongoing	3	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli

abilities, education, training, behaviors and traits that make an effective officer. This identifies a target upon which selection is					
based.					
BART PD should continue to conduct ongoing studies on where police recruit candidates come from and why they want to work for BPD.	43	Accepted/in progress	We are working with BART Human Resources to determine specific demographic information regarding our successful candidates Although much of the recommended information has been collected, the analysis process has not been implemented. ETA, by December 2012.	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Haight
BART PD should analyze recruitment effort by recognizing how much the department knows about its past recruitment efforts.	44	Accepted/in progress	We are working with BART Human Resources to determine specific demographic information regarding our successful candidates Although much of the recommended information has been collected, the analysis process has not yet been implemented. ETA, by December 2012.	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & <u>Lt. Haight</u>
BART PD should develop a recruitment plan that addresses the questions of whom, what qualities, where, why and how your agency will achieve its recruitment goals.	45	Accepted/ Pending	A recruitment plan will be incorporated as part of our strategic plan. Recruitment/Retention Plan to be completed by July 1 December, 2012, will work with CRB to complete Plan.	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis, & Lt. Haight
BART PD should not require more than two round-trip visits to complete the entire application process for out-of-state police officer candidates.	47	Accepted/ in progress	At the April 2012 test date, an out-of-state applicant was allowed to complete the written, physical and oral board testing in one day.	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Haight
BART PD should ensure	48	Accepted	Although we already	3	Deputy

			manimetric combact suith		Claire
contact is maintained			maintain contact with		Chief
with applicants for all			applicants we will develop		Glenn-
positions from initial			a written procedure and		Davis &
application to final			incorporate it into our RRP		Lt. Haight
employment			(due <u>December</u> 2012)		
disposition.			recruitment protocols		
BART PD should adapt a customer-focused hiring philosophy	49	Accepted/ pending	We are working with BART HR to determine if a written procedure is	3	Deputy Chief Glenn-
through personalizing the recruitment process.			required-We are investigating industry best		Davis & Lt. Haight
			practices and working with BART HR to complete this		
			recommendation. We <u>have</u> <u>implemented a</u> "practice"		
			physical agility (open to all, but geared toward female		
			candidates) to assist with		
			successful completion of that portion of the exam		
			we are investigating best		
			practices for implementing		
			a "family orientation		
			night," designed to		
			inform/educate attendees		
			about culture/expectations.		
			We will work with CRB to		
			look at implementing other		
			desirable, customer-		
			focused practices (to be		
			codified in RRP, <u>December</u>		
			2012).		
BART PD should	50	Completed/		2	Deputy
conduct behavioral-		ongoing			Chief
based interviews are					Glenn-
recommended.					Davis &
Interview questions					Lt.
must be based on job-					Lucarelli
related knowledge,					
skills, abilities,					
behaviors and traits.					
BART PD should	52	Completed/		2	Deputy
develop a writing		ongoing			Chief
exercise component as					Glenn-
part of the application					Davis &
process to assess written					Lt.
- Color to diocess williams					

A:11				
A written				
communication				
standard should be set.		0 1 1	_	.
BART PD should	53	Completed/	5	Deputy
expose recruit's family		ongoing		Chief
to law enforcement				Glenn-
culture/family				Davis &
orientation.				Lucarelli
TRAINING				
BART PD should	58	Completed/	2	Deputy
establish a Training		ongoing		Chief
Committee and develop				Glenn-
a written policy to				Davis&
outline the composition				Lt.
of the committee, the				Lucarelli
duties and				
responsibilities of the				
committee and its				
members, the meeting				
schedule for the				
committee and				
designate the				
chairperson of the				
committee.				
BART PD should	59	Completed	2	Deputy
establish a written	0,7	Completed	_	Chief
directive that governs				Glenn-
training attendance				Davis&
requirements.				Lt.
requirements.				Lucarelli
BART PD should	60	Completed	2	Deputy
establish a written	00	Completed	2	Chief
directive that governs				Glenn-
reimbursement to				Davis&
employees attending				Lt.
applicable training				Lucarelli
				Lucarem
programs.				
BART PD should ensure	61	Completed/	2	Deputy
that courses developed	01	ongoing	_	Chief
within the BART PD		ongoing		Glenn-
are routinely sent to				Davis&
POST for certification.				Lt.
1 O51 for certification.				
DADT DD -1 11	(2/62	C1 (1/	2	Lucarelli
BART PD should	62/63	Completed/	2	Deputy
develop and publish a		ongoing		Chief
directive establishing				Glenn-

agency policy concerning remedial training.				Davis & Lt. Lucarelli,
BART PD should develop and publish a directive establishing agency policy concerning the documentation of remedial training.	62/63 see above	Completed	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt. Lucarelli Lt. Forte
BART PD needs to undertake an evaluation and analysis of the Training records, maintenance protocols and system.	64	Completed/ ongoing	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt. Lucarelli & Lt. Forte
BART PD should consolidate the policies and procedures relating to training (recruit and CPTN) in one directive.	66	Completed	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt. Lucarelli
Despite the ability to waive the field training requirement for lateral entry officers, the BART PD puts each new officer through the entire program.	67	Completed/ ongoing	2	Deputy Chief Fairow & Lt. Alvarez
BART PD should expand the list of courses the Training Plan to include more courses in communication, verbal judo, human diversity, handling emotionally disturbed persons, community policing, etc.	70	Completed	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt. Lucarelli & Lt. Forte
BART PD should develop and publish a written directive that outlines the policy and procedures concerning	72	Completed	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt.

					7 11: 0
in-service, shift briefing					Lucarelli &
and advanced training.					Lt. Forte
BART PD should	74	Completed/		2	Deputy
develop and publish a		ongoing			Chief
written directive					Fairow
describing the policies,					Lt.
procedures and					Lucarelli &
purposes of shift/roll					Lt. Forte
call training.					
BART PD should	75	Completed/		2	Deputy
develop and publish a		ongoing			Chiefs
written directive		01.501.5			Hartwig &
describing the policies,					Glenn-
procedures relating to					Davis, Lt.
					Lucarelli &
specialized assignments					
and any pre-or post-					Lt. Alkire
training required for the					
position.	77	C 1.1/		0	D i
BART PD should	76	Completed/		2	Deputy
develop and publish a		ongoing			Chief
written directive that					Fairow &
documents the training					Lt. Franklin
requirements for all					
SWAT Team training.					
BART PD should	77	Completed/		5	Deputy
develop and publish a		ongoing			Chief
directive devoted to the					Glenn-
training requirements					Davis &
for non-sworn					Lt.
employees.					Lucarelli
Using the Training Plan	78	Accepted/	A career development plan	5	Deputy
as a foundation,		pending	has been drafted and		Chief
establish a career			submitted for review by		Glenn-
development plan and			Command Staff, to be		Davis
publish a written			finalized by December		Lt. Haight
directive outlining the			2012.		
policies and procedures					
associated with the					
plan. This plan should					
help employees of the					
BART PD in either their					
vertical or horizontal					
career plan					
development aspiration					
goals.	70	C- 1.11		2	D :
Defensive Tactics	79	Completed/		2	Deputy
		ongoing			Chief

					Glenn- Davis Lt. Lucarelli
Training Unit to be Commanded by Lieutenant and staffed by civilians.	79	<u>Accepted/</u> <u>pending</u>	BPD does not accept the recommendation to civilianize the Unit at this time, it is our intent to assign a dedicated lieutenant to the training unit.	2	Chief Rainey, Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis& <u>Lt. Haight</u>
Increased supervisory focus on COPPS/POPs. And directed patrol activities.	79	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Fairow
Executive Training	79	Completed/ ongoing		5	Chief & Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis
Community Policing	79	Completed/ ongoing		2	Chief & Deputy Chief Fairow
Evaluation of SWAT	80	Accepted/ pending	Evaluation will be completed by the end of the December 2012	2	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
Evaluation of Tactical Unit	80	Accepted/ pending	Evaluation will be completed by the end of the December 2012	2	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
Evaluation of Revenue Protection	81	Do not recommend at this time	No action taken	2	Chief
Fare Evasion (Also see Racial Profiling Policy, Report pg. 121, Audit pg. 9)	81	Accepted/ in progress	Lexipol Policy #419 developed. We have developed a comprehensive program and training curriculum with the Consortium for Policing Leadership in Equity (CPLE) to prevent bias-based policing and racial profiling. CPLE Training, review, and analysis began the 1st quarter of 2012 A majority of patrol	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & <u>Lt. Haight</u>

Visibility	82	Accepted/ ongoing	personnel have received the training, and the remaining will be trained by September 2012. Beginning January 2012, officers have increased their patrol train rides to 3 per shift. Officers will increase their patrol train rides to 4 train rides per shift by December 2012.	1	Chief & Deputy Chief Fairow
BART PD should utilize a formal in-depth post-training academy designed to provide any information which is not ideally suited for the basic training academy, but would be advantageous to understanding prior to beginning field training.	84	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chiefs Fairow, Glenn- Davis & Lt. Alvarez
BART PD should implement a leadership succession plan to assist in the development of supervisors' decisionmaking and leadership skills as it relates to preventing racial profiling.	86	Completed/ ongoing		5	Chief & Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis
EQUIPMENT BART PD should implement RAILS because the various systems and equipment located in the old center are not integrated.	89	Accepted/ in progress	New CAD & RMS scheduled to come online during FY 12-13 and we will evaluate whether the system adequately addresses the recommendation. Project management meetings are held and attended by BPD and IT consultants, staff. Various Dispatch personnel and Supervisors are receiving ancillary training	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Carissa Goldner

			(leadership/supervision' Comm Policing; tactical; communications, etc.)		
Communications with BART PD & BART IT See below sections from page 93 & 94	93	Complete/ ongoing	Monthly information exchange meetings are held between BART PD & BART IT; the COP regularly attends (next meeting to be held July 2012)	2	Chief Deputy Chief Hartwig & Carissa Goldner
BART PD and BART IT must improve communications. BART PD should form its own Information Technology and Support Unit.	93	Do not recommend at this time	No action taken	2	Chief
BART PD should train on RAILS and other related systems must be provided to all appropriate BART PD employees.	93	Accepted/ pending	No action taken due to the new CAD & RMS scheduled to come online during FY 12-13. Training will occur when RAILS is implemented.	2	Deputy Chiefs Hartwig, Glenn- Davis & Carrisa Goldner
All personnel assigned to the communication center should be certified by the Association of Professional Communication Officers (APCO)	93	Do not recommend at this time	All Dispatch personnel are POST certified and receive a minimum of 24 hrs. CPT every two years One dispatcher is CIT trained, two are on the Trauma Response Team. All dispatchers will receive CIT training as available classes are identified.	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig
MDT's should be installed in all appropriate BART PD vehicles.	93	Completed/ ongoing	New CAD & RMS scheduled to come online during FY 12-13; we will evaluate whether the system adequately addresses the recommendation. Officers are trained in the proper use of the MDTs during the FOCUS Program.	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Carrisa Goldner
MDT Policy	94	Completed	J	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Alkire

Need for a back-up communication center and computer system.	94	Do not recommend at this time	In the event we are unable to dispatch from the Integrated Security Response Center (ISRC), we have the ability to dispatch calls from a remote trailer located at one of our satellite facilities and from a location within Contra Costa County. However, we will continue to review our practices	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Carissa Goldner
BART PD should consider hand-held computers to facilitated completion of reports and streamline data entry.	94	Do not recommend at this time	No action taken	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Carrisa Goldner
BART PD should consider implementing Compstat process and using new RAILS technology	94	Accepted/ ongoing	New CAD & RMS scheduled to come online during FY 12-13. The CompStat process has been implemented, beginning January 2012, and coinciding with the implementation of zone policing.	2	Deputy Chief Fairow
BART PD should consider having a liaison with the Northern California Regional Intelligence Center in San Francisco and the Joint Terrorism Task Force.	94	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Franklin
Basic Radio Communication	97	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Fairow
Procurement	102	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig
Firearms/Sig Sauer	105	Completed		2	Lt. Franklin

					& Range Master
Does not agree with the practice of BART Officers being permitted to purchase their own "on-duty" pistols. (other than Sig Sauer)	106	Accepted/ pending	New officers are issued Sig Sauer 40, prior officers must maintain current weapon, no changes in duty weapon allowed.	2	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
Does not recommend that officers be permitted to carry back- up weapons.	106	Accepted/ pending	Back-up firearms were eliminated by the interim COP. However, the current COP is still reviewing this recommendation. Will be completed December 2012	2	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
Recommend that officers carry triple retention holsters which will provide safety for officers and general public.	106	Accepted/ pending	Although the COP accepts this recommendation in concept it is still under review. All new officers are issued triple retention holsters.	2	Deputy Chief Glen Davis & Range Master
An evaluation of the viability and usefulness of a SWAT unit should be assessed.	107	Not recommended at this time/Pending	The need for a SWAT Team is being evaluated by the COP and will be completed by December 2012	2	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
Not all Radio Patrol Cars are equipped with shotguns, they are optional equipment which properly trained and qualified officers may carry.	107	Accepted/ in progress	All officers are trained in shotgun procedures. Shotguns will be required to be utilized in all active marked patrol vehicles. Complete by December 2012	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Deputy Chief Fairow
BART PD should purchase a Firearm Simulator (FATS) or other similar technology	107	Completed		2	Chief, Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Deputy Chief Fairow
Directive #68 is outdated and needs to be revised.	107	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig Lt. Alkire
Recommends that	107	Accepted/	BPD has increased re-	2	Deputy

oversight be given regarding the firearms re-qualification of police officers.		Pending	qualification requirements to a minimum of 12 hours, annually. Lexipol Policy 312 (Sect. 312.4.5) will be amended to codify the requirement that officers returning from extended leave re-qualify prior to their return to duty. Sect. 312.4 will be amended to codify the requirement for Active Shooter training. All revisions will be completed by December 2012.		Chief Glenn- Davis, Lt. Franklin & Range Master
Each officer should be issued their own TASER. Does not recommend allowing employees to purchase their own Taser.	108	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Alkire
The use of 40 MM chem. Launchers does not appear practical.	108	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Deputy Chief Fairow
All practice ammunition should be lead-less during prequalification or practice.	109	Not recommended at this time	We do not shoot at an indoor facility so this is not an issue	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis, Lt. Franklin & Range Master
Police communications' center needs to be reviewed and rewritten to address several serious issues such as: • Access control • Policy review	110	Not recommended at this time	The Communication Center is now located in a secure, access controlled environment. Access by Treasury personnel is limited (for the approved purpose) and strictly controlled. Response actions completed.	2	Deputy Chief Hartwig
FACILITIES AND MAINTENANCE					
BART PD should move to a more professional	116	Accepted/ in progress	Potential locations have been identified and are	5	Chief, Deputy

building with adequate			being reviewed.		Chief
space to accommodate			Relocation committee team		Hartwig
its headquarters staff			visited five Bay Area		Lt. Haight
-			-		Lt. Haight
and clerical personnel.			police departments; San		
			Bruno Pd, Belmont Pd, San		
			Mateo Pd, Concord Pd and		
			Walnut Creek Pd to view		
			their departments layout		
			and facilities.		
BART PD must push for	117	Accepted/	Currently working with	5	Chief,
a new police facility to		in progress	BART Real Estate and		Deputy
house the command			Maintenance on		Chief
and clerical staff. Roll			recommendations, BPD		Hartwig
call is being held in a			meets regularly with		& <u>Lt.</u>
small room with no			Facilities Working Group		<u>Haight</u>
windows or air vents.			regarding on this subject.		
The facility lacks			BPD delivered a list of		
adequate room for the			priorities for satellite		
staff which must utilize			facilities to the Working		
it.			Group.		
The BART PD satellite	118	Accepted/	Property identified at the	5	Chief,
facilities are in dire need	110	in progress	building above the		Deputy
of renovation,		In progress	Berkeley BART station as		Chief
replacement, or			suitable for a police report		Hartwig
rebuilding. The low			writing room. BART Real		& &
quality of these facilities			Estate finalizing contract		Lt. Haight
an effective working			expect property to be		<u>Lt. Haight</u>
environment serves as a			available to BART Pd by		
disabling factor for all			July 15, 2012.		
_			July 13, 2012.		
the employees working					
in them. It also creates					
a perception that the					
BART administration					
does not value their					
contribution to the					
BART mission.					
RACIAL PROFILING					
BART PD should	121	Completed		2	Deputy
establish and					Hartwig &
implement a racial					Lt. Alkire
profiling policy that is					
known and adhered to					
by all members of the					
police department.					
The Chief of Police	123	Accepted/	Signed a Letter of Intent to		Chief,
should conduct annual		in progress	work with the Consortium	2	Deputy
internal reviews of the			for Policing Leadership in		Chiefs &
		I.	1 9 9 101111111111111111111111111111111	ı	

policies and procedures			Equity (CPLE) to develop a		Lt. Alkire
to determine if policy or			comprehensive program to		
procedural changes need to be made when			address biased-based		
applicable.			policing and racial profiling in-progress. BPD		
аррисане.			personnel interviews		
			completed; additional		
			CPLE assessment		
			scheduled		
			CPLE has visited BART		
			and completed internal and		
			external stakeholder		
			interviews. BART Legal is		
			reviewing CPLE/BART MOU. Once the MOU has		
			been signed we will work		
			with CPLE to develop a		
			comprehensive fair and		
			impartial policing program.		
			BPD command staff,		
			sergeants and FTO's		
			attended Fair and Impartial		
T 1 1 1 1 CC	104	C 1.1	Policing Training.	0	D (
To protect the officers from unwarranted	124	Completed		2	Deputy Chief
accusations of racial					Hartwig &
profiling and					Lt. Alkire
misconduct the BART					
PD should establish					
policy and procedure					
for the enforcement of					
fare evasion.	105	A	A manipultur of matural	2	Doronto
All officers of the BART PD should receive	125	Accepted/ ongoing	A majority of patrol personnel have received	2	Deputy Chief
training on racial		Origonig	the CPLE training, and the		Glenn-
profiling.			remaining 39 officers will		Davis,
			be trained by September		Lt. Haight
			2012. BPD to sponsor		
			training of in-house (Dept.)		
			trainers for F & I Training		
			in 2012. BPD to sponsor		
			training of in-house (Dept.) trainers for F & I Training		
			in 2012.		
The BART PD should	127	Accepted/	We will continue to use	2	Deputy
stop conducting racial		in progress	POST DVDs to facilitate		Chief
profiling training in			racial profiling training; In		Glenn-

DVD format and initiate instructor led training.	120	Consulated	addition, we will include instructor-led training in this area. We are moving to use of POST offered on-line training that will phase out the DVD-CPTN. In addition, all command officers have received Fair & Impartial Policing Training; and sergeants and FTO's are currently receiving this training. The majority of patrol personnel have received related training from CPLE In addition, BPD to sponsor training of in-house (Dept.) trainers for F & I Training in December 2012.		Davis, <u>Lt.</u> <u>Haight</u>
The BART PD should develop a written directive governing shift briefing training to keep officers up-to-date on current policies and law enforcement strategies to prevent racial profiling.	128	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis Lt. Alkire
The BART PD should develop and implement an Early Intervention (EI) management system to obtain information of potential patterns of at-risk conduct involving all sworn officers.	130	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis, & Lt. Lucarelli
The BART PD should expand their current data collection method.	131	Accepted/ in progress	CPLE has visited BART and completed internal and external stakeholder interviews. We have completed a CPLE/BART MOU. We are working with the CPLE to develop a comprehensive fair and impartial policing program.	2	Chief, Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Fairow and Hartwig

			BPD command staff attended Fair and Impartial Policing Training and our supervisors (sergeants and FTOs) are currently attending a F&I training course. Expanded bulletin on law enforcement contacts produced monthly.		
The Chief of Police should develop a directive regarding the development of community outreach programs.	135	Completed/ in progress		4	Chief
Strict guidelines should be developed and all personnel should be held accountable for receiving any complaint against a police officer, documenting the complaint and notifying the supervisor. Department fails to track use-of -force incidents Achieving transparency and attaining public trust are goals that must	139	Completed/ ongoing		4	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis, & Lt. Lucarelli
be pursuedTransform into					

a verifiable				
policing culture				
of fairness,				
openness,				
problem-				
solving and				
community				
engagement.				
Policy should				
indicate that				
complaints may				
be originated in				
person, from a				
toll free line,				
mail, email,				
third parties, or				
any other				
source.				
Complantation				
should be				
notified by mail				
to acknowledge				
receipt of their				
complaint,				
when				
investigation is				
completed and				
notified of				
finding in				
writing.				
DADT DD 1 11	1.40	C- 1.11	2	D. 1
BART PD should	142	Completed/	2	Deputy Chief
conduct employee evaluations at least once		ongoing		Hartwig &
annually				Lt. Alkire
Supervisors should use				
performance				
evaluations to				
encourage positive				
behavior and to correct				
unacceptable behavior				
by ensuring that				
appropriate actions are				

taken.					
It is recommended that	145	Accepted/	We have completely	4	Deputy
BPD enhance its		in progress	revamped our complaint		Chief
community outreach			process.		Glenn-
efforts relative to IA by			Complaint/Commendation		Davis , <u>Lt.</u>
implementing the			forms are available on the		<u>Haight</u>
following:			BART website; the forms		
241			are also available in the five		
• 24-hour toll free			core languages. The forms		
number			are located in IA, OIPA,		
BART PD			station agent booths, all BPD reporting facilities,		
mailing,			and all patrol vehicles.		
internet and			Patrol personnel are		
toll-free number			encouraged to carry the		
available within			forms on their person. We		
transit system			will be seeking permission		
 Citizen 			to "house" forms in the		
compliment			various public libraries of		
form developed			the cities that BART		
Other			traverses.		
informational			In addition to the		
material			information being included		
describing			in our brochures and on the		
complaint			website, BPD's		
process in			complaint/commendation		
1			process is also outlined in		
English and			the OIPA brochure and		
Spanish			website. We will seek to		
• On-duty			have the information		
officers			placed in the CRB		
required to			brochures and on their website.		
carry complaint			BPD has presented		
forms			information about the IA		
• Community			function via public CRB		
outreach			meetings and District's		
program to			Police Review Committee.		
inform public			BPD has also begun		
about			publishing an Annual		
department and			Report, and this report is		
Internal Affairs			currently on the BPD		
function			website. In addition, BPD		
Develop a			has developed brochures in five languages. These		
procedure for			brochures are made		
rio containe for			2. Contains are made		

monitoring phone lines to ensure courtesy and respect • Supervisors to conduct audit trails using questionnaires and telephone follow-up.			available to the public. Although BPD does randomly monitor some incoming calls, we will develop a policy and procedure for randomly monitoring in-coming calls (to Dispatch and IA), on a regular basis. This will be completed by July 2012. Chief Rainey is currently exploring audit processes for use at BPD. It is expected that a process will be in place shortly after the implementation of the Geographical Accountability/Area Command structure eta for completion December 2012		
BART should maintain a sufficient supply of policy manuals to distribute to each employee whose duties are affected by the policy and procedure document In-service classes should be conducted by supervisors to review and reinforce the contents of the policy manual BART should	147	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Alkire

be permitted to initiate pending been implemented. The Policy is detailed and provides information on Davis &	consider enrollment in CALEA accreditation process.					
provide feedback on an officers performance of duty Confidentiality is crucial to the success of the internal affairs function. Files should be maintained in a secure area BART police brochure should be maintained at all police facilities, trains, public libraries, patrol cars and other places accessible to the public BART police compiles limited shart police compiles limited statistical data regarding the internal affairs function. Files should be maintained at all police facilities, trains, public libraries, patrol cars and other places accessible to the public BART police compiles limited statistical data regarding the internal affairs function who investigates citizers to complaints; procedures to notify the relevant executive leaders of complaints, and other detailed information about the executive leaders of complaints, and other detailed information about the complaints, and other detailed information forms are available on the laterial affairs are located in IA, OIPA, station agent booths, all	be permitted to initiate complaints or provide feedback on an officers performance of duty • Confidentiality is crucial to the success of the internal affairs function. Files should be maintained in a secure area • BART police brochure should be maintained at all police facilities, trains, public libraries, patrol cars and other places accessible to the public • BART police compiles limited statistical data regarding the internal affairs	149	•	been implemented. The Policy is detailed and provides information on who investigates citizens' complaints; procedures to notify the relevant executive leaders of complaints, and other detailed information about the complaint/commendation process. Defined dispositions for IA cases are outlined in the Policy. Citizens may initiate complaints or provide feedback on personnel via a variety of methods (in writing; fax; in person, at a variety of locations; via telephone, etc.) Due to compromised security and privacy, IA has relocated to the Lake Merritt BART Facility. The IA Office is locked/secured, with "one-way" glass; it is accessible via a secondary entrance. Files are maintained in the secured IA office in locked cabinets. Complaint/Commendation forms are available on the BART website; the forms are also available in the five core languages. The forms are located in IA, OIPA,	4	

- IA policy should define who investigates citizens' complaints
- Policy should be clear by listing procedures to notify the executive leadership of the department of complaints against officers or the department
- Complainant should be notified of statues of investigation if not completed after 30 days
- IA to issue written notice to subject officer.
- A specific policy should be developed listing the procedures and prohibition of obtaining medical or laboratory examinations, photographs, participation in

BPD reporting facilities, and all patrol vehicles. Patrol personnel are encouraged to carry the forms on their person. We will be seeking permission to "house" forms in the various public libraries of the cities that BART traverses.

BPD has implemented a robust statistical data collection system. IA Pro tracks Uses of Force, complaints, and can be used to identify emerging trends and patterns, individually and Department-wide. BPD now creates and distributes a detailed annual report. Detailed information is also provided to the OIPA. The report is on the BPD website. In addition, limited statistical data is provided to the CRB.

Due to limited staff (two investigators), the BPD rejects the recommendation to advise parties of the status of an investigation that is more than 30-days old.

IA currently issues advisory notices to subject officers.

Policy 1020 (Section 1020.6.1) will be amended to address the use of photographs, line-up participation, and

a line-up, financial disclosure statements and polygraph examinations. Have defined dispositions for IA cases.			polygraphs in IA investigations, by December 2012.		
BART PD should develop and implement a computerized early intervention system.	153	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
 Employees receive basic IA training Train recruits in professionalism communication s, customer service and cultural diversity IA should provide training to recruits at police academy All supervisors should receive mandatory leadership training Department should track all training information Officers should 	155	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli

receive the					
highest caliber					
of community					
policing					
training from					
outside experts					
• Field					
supervisors					
should spend					
most of their					
time in the field					
Training					
officers should					
be among the					
best trained					
officers in the					
department.					
BART PD adopt a	157	Completed		2	Chief &
traditional discipline				_	Deputy
approach which					Chiefs
supports the concept of					
progressive discipline					
and contain the					
required elements of					
basic law enforcement					
disciplinary procedures.	150	A 1.1/	N. (11 T. (*)	0	D 1
BART PD should	158	Accepted/	Monthly Inspections are	2	Deputy Chief
develop a written directive that		ongoing	performed; however, a written directive will be		Hartwig
establishes the staff			completed in <u>December</u>		Hartwig
inspection function.			2012.		
DISCIPLINE					
Early Warning and	162	Completed/		2	Deputy
Disciplinary System		ongoing			Chief
The agency					Glenn-
should consider					Davis &
significant					Lt.
modifications to					Lucarelli
the agency					
disciplinary					
system as the					
current					
current					

disciplinary process does not provide for an effective Early Warning or early Intervention program The agency should adopt a more traditional police discipline system.					
COMMUNITY CONFIDENCE					
Community Survey of BART PD	167	Accepted/ in progress	BART Customer Access Department conducts random surveys of commuters' perceptions of BART PD and public safety. CPLE and BPD to complete additional community surveys	3	Chief Deputy Chief Fairow Lt. Alkire
Patrol Priorities	168	Completed/ ongoing		1	Chief & Deputy Chief Fairow
It is recommended that BART PD continue to maintain a transit police agency.	180	Accepted	No Action Required	5	Chief
BART PD needs to establish a coordinated Community Outreach Program with a clear champion.	182	Completed/ ongoing		3	Chief, Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Forte
BART PD should try alternative patrol strategies.	183	Completed/ ongoing		1	Chief, Deputy Chief Fairow & Lt. Forte
BART PD should be able to monitor and gauge the needs of the customers.	184	Completed		1	Chief, Lt. Franklin Sgt. Dixon & Lt.

					Alkire
BART PD needs to develop clear communications plans for officer interaction.	186	Accepted/ in progress	Command staff attend briefings, trainings, meetings, and ride trains when practical Recently the Chief completed "all hands" meetings to meet with all police personnel in discussion.	5	Chief
BART PD should reevaluate the Police Substation concept to see if this is still a viable option. CIVILIAN	187	Accepted/ In progress	We established a centralized 24 hr. Watch Commander's position in January 2011. The Zone Commander position was established, beginning in January 2012 to allow for geographic accountability. The substation concept remains viable due to geographical considerations and continues to be reviewed	2	Deputy Chief Fairow & Lt. Ledford
OVERSIGHT	100	6 1 1		,	
BART PD needs to review the entire organizational structure to lessen the span of control for the Commanders/Deputy Chiefs and create additional positions to lessen the amount to headquarters administrative responsibility and allow the Lieutenants to go in the field	189	Completed		4	General Manager
USE OF FORCE	100	Commisted		2	Domester
Use of force policies should be captured in a single use of force directive to avoid confusion and ensure a consistent response by agency members when a use of force event	199	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli

occurs.					
Complete a comprehensive, single use of force policy review and identify all definitions and conditional terms of weaponless and lesslethal force.	202	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD's prohibition of the use of "warning shots," policy is consistent with accepted police practices. BART PD's policy is consistent with accepted police practices.	204	Accepted	No Action Required	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Haight
BART PD should incorporate the various policies governing use of force into a single comprehensive policy to both reduce confusion and provide easy to find guidance in this critical area.	205	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
The intent of this standard is to minimize the severity of obvious injuries and non-visible trauma commonly associated with weapons and hand-to-hand tactics.	208	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Hartwig & Lt. Alkire
The purpose of establishing a clear and consistent use of force or response to resistance reporting system within an agency is to provide effective review and analysis of use of force events.	211	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
A single use of force policy, including a standard reporting and review process of each	217	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis &

incident involving a use of less-lethal and weaponless force should be employed by the agency.					Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD's policy is consistent with accepted police practices	222	Accepted	No Action Needed	2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
Combine the various policies into a single use of force mechanism. Develop an annual written examination for use of deadly and non-lethal force with mandated "satisfactory" pass level.	223	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD should conduct an annual analysis of all use of force events.	229	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
It is necessary for officers to know when and how detained suspects are to be restrained and when, where, and how particular restraining devices are to be employed, including special and prohibited methods.	231	Accepted/ in progress	Done (with the exception of the audit component). Mandated per Lexipol Policies 306 & 308, and reinforced via annual AOT and other periodic training. DC Fairow will ensure the implementation of the audit component by December 2012.	2	Deputy Chief Fairow Glenn- Davis & Lt. Haight
MANAGEMENT CONTROL					
BART PD should require that 80% of its manpower work during	236	Accepted/ in progress	Lexipol policy 216 (adopted 10/13/11) speaks to staffing levels, and provides for	2	Deputy Chief Fairow &

special events or occasions when there will be heavy usage of the transit systems, train stations, or parking lots.	001		recommended minimum staffing. It does not, however, speak to minimum staffing of special events. An 80% staffing requirement appears to be a contractual issue, absent emergency situations, which will be reviewed prior to the next contract negotiations (expected in 2013) with the affected associations.		Lt. Ledford
CALEA Accreditation	237	Not Recommended at this time	No action at this time		Chief
It is recommended that the BART PD add the job of Deputy Chief.	238	Completed		2	Chief
The BART PD should establish a system of daily accountability for all employees to ensure the Mission major goals of the agency and performance standards are being achieved. A daily activity report might be used to critique the officers" work load and activity during a shift.	239	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Fairow & Lt. Ledford
The BART PD should decrease the geographic span of control for first-line supervisors and increase the number of first-line supervisors to allow for adequate supervision of patrol shifts.	240	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Fairow & Lt. Ledford
All BART police supervisors should develop and adopt audit mechanisms (line inspections) for calls for	241	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chiefs Fairow, & Hartwig

service, activity reports					
and relevant police					
reports to uncover					
possible police					
misconduct.					
OPERATIONS					
The Chief of Police	244	Completed		5	Chief,
should facilitate a					Lt. Franklin
stakeholder group to develop a Mission					& Sgt. Dixon
Statement that describes					Dixon
the organization's					
function and purpose					
and hot that purpose					
will be achieved.					
The Chief of Police	245	Completed		5	Chief,
should develop a Vision					Deputy
Statement that describes					Chief
where the department is headed within the next					Glenn-
three to five year					Davis, Lt.
period.					Lucarelli
F					and Lt.
					Franklin
BART PD should revise	246	Completed		5	Chief,
their Core Values which					Lt. Franklin
identify the conduct					& Sgt.
and the character					Dixon
exhibited at every member of the					
organization while					
achieving the Mission.					
BART PD should	247	Accepted/	A SP Committee, consisting	5	Chief &
develop a multiyear		in progress	of a cross section of BPD		Deputy
plan which outlines its			personnel, was formed; the		Chief
major goals and			committee <u>has completed</u>		Glenn-
mission.			their proposed draft of the		Davis
			SP and members of the		
			committee are presenting the plan throughout the		
			Department. SP will be		
			approved and adopted by		
			December 2012.		
BART PD should	248	Completed/		2	Deputy
develop a written		ongoing			Chief
directive system that					Hartwig &
indicates how policies					Lt. Alkire

and procedures are developed and implemented.					
BART PD should provide training on its updated All Hazard Plan(s) for responding to critical incidents, such as natural and man-made disasters.	249	Accepted/ in progress	The majority of Command Staff completed ICS 300 and 400 in May 2012. Remaining Lts, will complete by December 2012. The majority of sergeants completed ICS update in June, remaining sergeants will complete by December 2012.	5	Chief & Lt. Franklin
BART PD should enhance their record management system to be able to capture sufficient data to effectively capture officer contact and track crime	250	Accepted/ in progress	New CAD & RMS scheduled to come online during FY 12-13. Comp Stat process has been implemented.	2	Deputy Chiefs Fairow & Hartwig
BART PD should have a written directive establishing crime analysis procedures.	251	Completed		2	Deputy Chief Fairow & Hartwig
Training on pursuit driving should be frequent and robust. Training on the pursuit policy entails frequent discussion and review for the police pursuit policy and procedures during shift briefings, in addition to annual inservice training sessions, including a written test.	252	Completed/ ongoing		2	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & Lt. Lucarelli
BART PD should create the position of Police Spokesperson in order to have a representative from the police department	256	Completed/ ongoing		2	Chief

communicate directly with the community under the authority of the BART Media					
Relations Office.					
BART PD officers should focus more time on being visible on the platforms and riding the trains during proactive time.	257 (See 182)	Completed/ ongoing		1	Chief, Deputy Chief Fairow
BART PD should implement training and develop a policy for Department members in addressing subjects that suffer from mental illness.	258	Completed/ ongoing	Hired "Crisis Intervention Outreach Consultant" in June 2012.	3	Chief, Deputy Chief Hartwig Fairow & Glenn Davis &Lt. Lucarelli & Lt. Forte
BART PD EMPLOYEE SURVEY					
Job Motivation	261	Accepted/ pending	Survey tool(s) pending review/development	5	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
PROMOTION					
 Written exam Assessment center Oral interviews Review of last performance evaluation Chief use rule of three to five of the top candidates. 	306	Completed/ ongoing	Promoted 5 lieutenants and 7 sergeants in the past three months.	5	Chief & Deputy Chiefs
BART PD should review the credit history of all police recruits more critically.	307	Accepted/No action at this time	Applicant credit histories are critically reviewed when assessing the viability of the candidate.	5	Deputy Chief Glenn- Davis & <u>Lt.</u> <u>Haight</u>
BART PD should develop a written directive that defines its	308	Completed/ ongoing		5	Chief & Deputy Chiefs

			4		
role in the promotional					
process for sworn					
personnel.	200	C 1 1 1/		-	C1 : (0
BART PD should	309	Completed/ ·		5	Chief &
develop a written	See 308	ongoing			Deputy
directive that vests in an					Chiefs
identifiable position the					
authority and					
responsibility for					
administrating the					
agency's role in the					
promotion process for					
sworn personnel	210	C 1 1 1/		-	Cl : Ca
BART PD should	310	Completed/		5	Chief &
develop a written	See 308	ongoing			Deputy
directive that describes					Chiefs
all elements and					
procedures used in each					
promotional process.	011	C 1 1 1/		-	Cl : Ca
BART PD should	311	Completed/		5	Chief &
consider adding an		ongoing			Deputy
updated background					Chiefs
check, evaluating					
performance appraisals,					
and an assessment					
center to the					
promotional process.	212	C1-1-1		Г	Cl.: - (0
BART PD should	312	Completed		5	Chief &
develop a written directive that					Deputy
					Chiefs
establishes criteria and					
procedures for the					
development and use of					
eligibility lists, if any,					
for sworn positions. BART PD should	313	Completed		5	Chief
	313	Completed		3	Chier
modify its policy and					
procedures to permit lateral entry hires for all					
promotional ranks.					
BART PD should	214	Completed		5	Donutu
	314	Completed		3	Deputy
develop a written					Chief Glen Davis
directive that requires at least a six-month					& Lt.
					& Lt. Lucarelli
probationary period for					Lucarelli
all sworn personnel					
who are promoted, with					

any exceptions defined.			