

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

**BART Police Citizen Review Board**  
**Monday, August 13, 2018**

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held on Monday, August 13, 2018 convening at 4:00 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 344 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chairperson William White, Kenneth Loo, Pete Longmire, Les Mensinger, Aman Sebahtu, David Rizk, and Richard Knowles.

BART Staff: BART Police Department (BPD) Deputy Chief Lance Haight, BPD Deputy Chief Jeffrey Jennings, BPD Deputy Chief Ed Alvarez, BPD Officer Stephen Christ, Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom, Independent Police Investigator Patrick Caceres, BPD Senior Administrative Analyst LaTonia Peoples-Stokes, Interim District Secretary Patricia Williams, Deputy Assistant District Secretary Jackie Edwards, Senior Administrative Analyst Mag Tatum, BPD Temporary Staff Assistant Sharon Kidd.

Others Present: BART Director Robert Raburn.

Agenda items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:04 p.m. by Chairperson George Perezvelez.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**  
Chairperson George Perezvelez, Vice Chair William White, Pete Longmire, Les Mensinger, David Rizk and Richard Knowles were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
A motion to approve the minutes for the Prior Board Meeting was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Longmire. The motion passed with five votes in favor, zero against and one abstention.
- 5. October and November 2018 BPCRB Meeting Dates. For Discussion and Action.**  
Mr. Bloom addressed the BPCRB.

A motion to change the October 8<sup>th</sup> BPCRB meeting date to October 15<sup>th</sup> and the November 12<sup>th</sup> BPCRB meeting date to November 19<sup>th</sup> due to original dates falling on

holidays was made by Mr. Knowles and seconded by Mr. Rizk. The motion passed unanimously.

**6. BPCRB Officer Elections. For Discussion and Action.**

Chairperson Perezvelez addressed the BPCRB.

Mr. W. White nominated Chairperson Perezvelez for the position of Chairperson; the nomination was seconded by Mr. Mensinger. Mr. Perezvelez accepted the nomination for Chairperson. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairperson Perezvelez addressed the BPCRB.

Mr. Mensinger nominated Mr. W. White for Vice Chairperson; the nomination was seconded by Chairperson Perezvelez. Mr. W. White accepted the nomination for Vice Chairperson. The motion passed unanimously.

Vice Chairperson W. White addressed the BPCRB.

Mr. Loo entered the meeting at 4:13 p.m.

Mr. Sebahtu entered the meeting at 4:17 p.m.

**7. Chief of Police's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Deputy Chief Ed Alvarez presented the report on behalf of Chief Carlos Rojas, who was unable to attend the meeting.

- a. BPD Monthly Report for June 2018  
Deputy Chief Alvarez presented the BPD Monthly Report for June 2018 and he answered questions from the BPCRB.

Deputy Chief Jennings answered questions from the BPCRB regarding the January 3, 2018 Officer Involved Shooting and the Alameda County District Attorney's Investigation, which remains pending.

**8. BPCRB Participation in BPD Commendation Process. For Discussion and Action.**  
This agenda item was tabled until the September meeting.

**9. BPCRB Training Program. (The curriculum to be addressed will not satisfy AB 1234 training requirements for legislative body members.)**

- a. Use of Force / Crisis Intervention Training  
Deputy Chief Haight provided the training for this item and he answered questions from the BPCRB.

**10. Independent Police Auditor's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

- a. Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Monthly Report for July 2018.

Mr. Bloom presented the OIPA Monthly Report for July 2018 and he answered questions from the BPCRB.

- 11. General Discussion and Public Comment.** Limited to 3 minutes per speaker. (An opportunity for members of the public to address the BPCRB on matters under their jurisdiction and not on the agenda.)  
No general discussion. No public comment.

Mr. W. White left the meeting.

- 12. Closed Session.**
  - a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in Office of the Independent Police Auditor Case #18-01. Gov. Code §54957

A motion to extend the meeting to 6:15 p.m. was made by Mr. Rizk and seconded by Mr. Loo. The motion passed unanimously.

A motion to extend the meeting to 6:45 p.m. was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Chairperson Perezvelez. The motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Sebahtu left the meeting.

A motion to extend the meeting to 6:55 p.m. was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Chairperson Perezvelez. The motion passed unanimously.

The BPCRB reconvened in open session at 6:53 p.m.

Chairperson Perezvelez announced the votes taken during the closed session with regard to agenda item #12a. The BPCRB voted unanimously to accept the OIPA findings and the OIPA recommendation for a Supervisory Referral and Training Point including modified language in the investigative report.

- 13. Adjournment.**  
Chairperson Perezvelez called for the meeting to be adjourned and it was seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:53 p.m.