

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

Citizen Review Board
Minutes of the 48th Meeting
Monday, April 13, 2015

A regular meeting of the Citizen Review Board (CRB) was held on Monday, April 13, 2015, convening at 4:00 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 344 20th Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Chairperson Sharon Kidd, Ken Jones, Douglas Hambleton, William White, George Perezvelez, Sukari Beshears, Richard Knowles, Darren White, Cydia Garrett and Benjamin Douglas

Members Absent: Vice Chairperson Les Mensinger

BART Staff: BART Police Department (BPD) Chief Kenton Rainey, BPD Deputy Chief Janeith Glenn-Davis, BPD Lieutenant Lance Haight, BART Police Officer's Association (BPOA) President Officer Keith Garcia, BPD Police Administrative Supervisor Justin Morgan, District Secretary Kenneth Duron, Independent Police Auditor Mark P. Smith and Independent Police Investigator Russell Bloom

Others Present: Directors Nicholas Josefowitz and Robert Raburn

Agenda items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:10 p.m. by Chairperson Kidd.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**
Sharon Kidd, Doug Hambleton, Ken Jones, Cydia Garrett, Richard Knowles, George Perezvelez, Darren White, Benjamin Douglas, William White and Sukari Beshears were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Public Comment on Items 5 through 11 Only.**
No public comment.
- 5. Swearing In of CRB Member Richard Knowles.**
Mr. Knowles was officially sworn in as a member of the CRB by Mr. Duron.

6. **Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**
A motion to approve the minutes of the previous board meeting was made by Mr. Jones and seconded by Mr. D. White. The motion passed unanimously.

7. **Chairperson's Report. For Discussion and Action.**
Ms. Kidd discussed an upcoming Carnaval event in San Francisco. Ms. Kidd reminded the CRB members to try and serve on oral interview boards for BPD job applicants if their schedules permit.

No action taken.

8. **Chief of Police's Report. For Discussion and Action.**
Chief Rainey updated the status of his review of the policy recommendation presented to him addressing police interactions with transgender individuals.

a. **Discussion of BART Station Video Recording System**

Supervisor Morgan presented information on BART's closed-circuit video recording system and answered questions from the CRB.

Chief Rainey updated the CRB on BPD staffing levels.

Officer Garcia introduced himself to the CRB.

No action taken.

9. **Production of an Informational Pamphlet to Guide Youth on Interactions with Police (Continued from March 9, 2015 meeting). For Discussion and Action.**
This item was tabled to a future meeting.

10. **Independent Police Auditor's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

a. **Written Testimony for President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing.**

Mr. Smith discussed written testimony submitted to the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing on behalf of the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement.

b. **Policy Recommendation for BART Police Department Policy 1053 – Business Cards and Trading Cards.**

Mr. Bloom presented a draft policy recommendation for BPD Policy 1053 – Business Cards and Trading Cards and answered questions from the CRB.

Further discussion of the draft recommendation was tabled to a future meeting.

c. **Office of the Independent Police Auditor's Monthly Report.**

Mr. Smith presented the OIPA's monthly report and answered questions from the CRB.

The CRB recessed at 5:40 p.m., and then convened in closed session at 5:55 p.m. to address the next agenda item.

11. Closed Session.

a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in Office of the Independent Police Auditor Case #14-36.

Govt. Code §54957

During the closed session, a motion to extend the meeting by 15 minutes was made by Mr. Perezvelez and seconded by Mr. Douglas. The motion passed unanimously.

During the closed session, a motion to extend the meeting by 30 minutes was made by Mr. Hambleton and seconded by Mr. Perezvelez. The motion passed with 8 votes in favor and 2 votes against.

Ms. Beshears and Mr. D. White exited the meeting.

A motion to agree with the findings reached by OIPA was made by Mr. Douglas and seconded by Mr. Perezvelez. The motion passed unanimously.

The CRB reconvened in open session at 6:58 p.m. Ms. Kidd announced that the CRB voted unanimously to agree with the findings reached by OIPA in Case #14-36.

12. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 minutes per speaker.

13. Adjournment.

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Mr. Perezvelez. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 6:59 p.m.