

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

Citizen Review Board  
Minutes of the 37th Meeting  
Monday, May 12, 2014

A regular meeting of the Citizen Review Board (CRB) was held on Monday, May 12, 2014, convening at 4:00 p.m. in the Auditorium at the Joseph P. Bort Building, 101 Eighth Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Chairperson Sharon Kidd, Vice-Chairperson William White, Benjamin Douglas, Douglas Hambleton, George Perezvelez, Ken Jones, Sukari Beshears, Cydia Garrett, and Les Mensinger

BART Staff: BART Police Department (BPD) Chief Kenton Rainey, BPD Deputy Chief Janeith Glenn-Davis, BPD Lieutenant Lance Haight, BPD Administrative Analyst Frances Cheung, Independent Police Auditor Mark P. Smith, and Independent Police Senior Administrative Analyst Anita Grayson

Others Present: Director Robert Raburn and Meredith Smiedt, Center for Policing Equity (CPE)

Agenda items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:03 p.m. by Ms. Kidd.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**  
Sharon Kidd, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, William White, George Perezvelez, Cydia Garrett, Ken Jones, and Les Mensinger were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Public Comment on Items 5 through 10 Only.**  
No public comment.
- 5. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
A motion to approve the minutes of the previous board meeting was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Mr. Perezvelez. The motion passed unanimously.

**6. Chairperson's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Mr. White shared his experience at a recent award luncheon of the National Organization of Black Law Enforcement Executives (NOBLE). Ms. Kidd reiterated to the CRB the importance of serving on BPD recruitment oral boards.

No action taken.

**7. Chief of Police's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Deputy Chief Glenn-Davis shared her experience at a recent 2-day NOBLE symposium/award luncheon hosted by BPD.

Ms. Smiedt updated the CRB on the bias-based policing survey that was conducted by CPE involving BPD law enforcement data. She answered questions from the CRB.

Ms. Beshears entered the meeting.

No action taken.

Ms. Kidd returned to Agenda Item #4 and asked if there was any additional public comment. The following individuals made comments:

Yolanda Huang

Nubia Bowe (Ms. Bowe filed a complaint of misconduct with the CRB)

Ms. Bowe's father

Dollene Jones

**8. Review of NOBLE BART Management Audit and Consideration of Future Goals for the BART Police Department (BPD) as Recommended by the CRB. (Continued from April 14, 2014.) For Discussion and Action.**

Mr. Jones suggested that the CRB devote time, possibly once per quarter, to explore ways to more effectively engage the community and help diminish feelings of mistrust. Ms. Kidd asked for further suggestions to be emailed to her for inclusion in a report. Chief Rainey answered questions from the CRB regarding BPD accreditation from the Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies, Inc.

No action taken.

**9. Independent Police Auditor's Report. For Discussion and Action.**

**a. Review of the Office of the Independent Police Auditor's (OIPA's) Policy Recommendation Regarding BPD Policy #309, Electronic Control Device (continued from April 14, 2014.)**

Mr. Smith discussed proposed recommendations for changes to BPD Policy #309, Electronic Control Device, and answered questions from the CRB.

A motion to extend the meeting for 30 minutes was made by Mr. Hambleton and seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

No action taken.

**b. OIPA's Monthly Report**

The CRB indicated they would review the OIPA monthly report individually, without a discussion.

No action taken.

The CRB convened in closed session to address the next agenda item.

**10. Closed Session.**

**a. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in Office of the Independent Police Auditor Case #13-49.**

**Govt. Code §54957**

During the closed session, a motion to extend the meeting for 15 minutes was made by Ms. Beshears and seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

Subsequently, a motion to extend the meeting for 30 minutes was made by Mr. Hambleton and seconded by Ms. Beshears. The motion passed unanimously.

The CRB reconvened in open session and announced that they voted to accept the findings of OIPA in Case #13-49 with 8 votes in favor and 1 vote against.

**11. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 minutes per speaker.**

**12. Adjournment.**

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Mr. Perezvelez and seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 7:15 p.m.