

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

Citizen Review Board  
Minutes of the 19th Meeting  
Tuesday, November 13, 2012

A regular meeting of the Citizen Review Board (CRB) was held on Tuesday, November 13, 2012, convening at 9:00 a.m. in the Board Room, 344 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Sharon Kidd, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, Ken Jones, William White, Thomas Minshew, and Sukari Beshears.

Members Absent: George Perezvelez, Peter Barnett, and Daniel Buford.

BART Staff: Independent Police Auditor Mark P. Smith, Independent Police Investigator Kobia West, BART Police Chief Kenton W. Rainey, BART Deputy Police Chief Janeith Glenn-Davis, BART Police Lieutenant Lance Haight, BART Police Lieutenant John Conneely, BART Police Administrative Analyst Frances Cheung, Amalgamated Transit Union Representative Antonette Bryant, and BART Attorney Byron Toma.

Agenda Items discussed:

1. **Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 9:07 a.m. by Mr. Douglas, Board Chairperson.
2. **Call for Quorum.**  
Sharon Kidd, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, Ken Jones, Thomas Minshew, and Sukari Beshears were present, amounting to a quorum.
3. **Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
4. **Public Comment Items 5 through 10 Only.**  
There were no public comments.
5. **Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
Mr. White joined the meeting at 9:09 a.m.

Ms. Kidd moved to approve the minutes from the October meeting, and Mr. Mensinger seconded the motion. Mr. Hambleton made a friendly amendment to approve the minutes after removing the text of his motion from Item 8 and

replacing it under Item 6. The motion passed, with Mr. White abstaining from the vote.

**6. Chief of Police Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Chief Rainey recognized the following citizens for their heroic actions responding to crime in the BART system: Station Agents Tiana Moore, Tamara Miller, Iesha Miller, and Eliab Negas.

Lieutenant Conneely conducted a presentation on BART Police crowd control training and policy, and he responded to questions from the CRB.

**7. Independent Police Auditor Report. For Discussion and Action.**

Mr. Smith addressed the CRB and presented the OIPA monthly report. Mr. Smith also responded to questions from the CRB during the presentation of the report and spoke about the 2012 NACOLE Conference in San Diego, CA, which Ms. Kidd and Mr. White had attended.

**8. Closed Session.**

**A. To Consider Public Employee Performance (Room 303 Board Conference Room). Govt. Code § 54957.**

The CRB entered into closed session at 10:06 a.m.

**9. Open Session.**

The CRB concluded the closed session at 10:50 a.m. and resumed the regular CRB meeting. Mr. Douglas reported that no action was taken during the closed session.

**10. Training Session: Training in General Ethics Principles and Ethics Laws Relevant to Public Service, in Accordance with California Government Code Section 53235. For Information. (2 hours)**

Mr. Toma from BART's Office of the General Counsel administered ethics training to the CRB and answered questions from members.

Mr. Mensinger made a motion to extend the meeting by 5 minutes from the then-current time. The motion was seconded by Ms. Kidd and unanimously approved.

**11. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 Minutes per Speaker.**

There was no discussion and there were no public comments.

**12. Adjournment.**

A motion was made by Ms. Kidd to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Beshears seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting was adjourned at 12:40 p.m.