

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

Citizen Review Board
Minutes of the 16th Meeting
Monday, August 13, 2012

A regular meeting of the Citizen Review Board (CRB) was held on Monday, August 13, 2012, convening at 4:00 p.m. in the Board Room, 344 20th Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Benjamin Douglas (Chairperson), Sharon Kidd (Vice-Chairperson), Thomas Minshew, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Peter Barnett, William White, Ken Jones, and Daniel Buford

Members Absent: Sukari Beshears and George Perezvelez

BART Staff: Independent Police Auditor Mark P. Smith, Independent Police Investigator Kobia West, BART Deputy Police Chief Janeith Glenn-Davis, BART Police Lieutenant Lance Haight, and BART Police Officer Scott Hamilton (BART Police Officers Association President).

Others Present: BART Director Robert Raburn

Agenda Items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:04 p.m. by Mr. Douglas.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**
Sharon Kidd, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, Peter Barnett, William White, Ken Jones, Daniel Buford, and Thomas Minshew were present, amounting to a quorum.
- 3. Recital of Pledge of Allegiance.**
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Public Comment on Items 5 through 13 only.**
None.
- 5. Introduction of New CRB Member.**
Mr. Douglas introduced Thomas Minshew to the CRB. Mr. Minshew addressed the CRB.
- 6. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meetings. For Discussion and Action.**
A motion was made by Mr. Mensinger and seconded by Ms. Kidd to approve the minutes of the July 9, 2012 CRB meeting. The motion passed unanimously.

- 7. Chief of Police Report. For Discussion and Action.**
In response to a previous CRB request, Lieutenant Haight reported to the CRB on the Office of Internal Affairs' policy regarding audio-recording complainants and other interviewees. Deputy Chief Glenn-Davis responded to CRB questions regarding the BART Police Department's (BPD) activity logs and notifications to complainants about the Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA).
- 8. Independent Police Auditor Report. For Discussion and Action.**
In response to a previous CRB request, Mr. Smith reported to the CRB on transmitting CRB minutes to the BART Board of Directors. He also reported on updates to the CRB webpage. Mr. Smith encouraged the CRB to take advantage of opportunities for ride-alongs with BPD officers, including the K-9 unit of BPD, as well as invitations to attend training alongside BPD officers. Mr. Smith reported on OIPA's participation in National Night Out and the need for both OIPA and CRB to continue outreach efforts. He indicated that the next OIPA/CRB community forum was tentatively being scheduled for the end of September and will take place in Richmond. In response to a CRB request, Mr. Smith reported on the status of OIPA's recruitment of a Senior Administrative Analyst. He also discussed the circulation of OIPA brochures to BART stations and introduced proposed language to run on the BART Digital Station Sign system. Mr. Smith presented the July 2012 OIPA Monthly Report.
- 9. Proposal to the BART Board of Directors for Revision to the BART Citizen Oversight Model Regarding the Acceptance of Complaints Involving Juveniles, the Acceptance of Complaints in Death Cases, and the Handling of Complaints Involving Discrimination, Harassment, Profiling and Bias. For Discussion and Action.**
The CRB discussed a previously-adopted proposal to the BART Board of Directors for Revision to the BART Citizen Oversight Model (Model). Mr. Hambleton introduced some new revisions to the proposal to maintain internal consistency within the Model and moved that the proposal be adopted as amended. Mr. Mensinger seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.
- 10. Update from CRB Quarterly Report Subcommittee. For Discussion and Action.**
Ms. Kidd gave an update regarding the CRB Quarterly Report Subcommittee. She requested that the members of the CRB email her their relevant activities, from the start of the CRB to the present, that they want included in the quarterly/annual report. Mr. Hambleton relayed the sentiment of the subcommittee that a subcommittee was not necessary in order to produce a quarterly report to the BART Board of Directors.
- 11. Update from BART Police Department Recruitment and Advisory Committee. For Discussion and Action.**

Ms. Kidd gave an update regarding the BART Police Department Recruitment and Advisory Committee. She asked the CRB to use their contacts to help advertise current recruitment efforts for new police officers.

12. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 Minutes per Speaker.

Deputy Chief Glenn-Davis introduced new BART Police Officers Association President Scott Hamilton. Officer Hamilton then addressed the CRB.

Mr. Jones introduced the idea of receiving training on how to evaluate complaint investigation reports.

Mr. White discussed participation in National Night Out and the potential for a meeting of Bay Area law enforcement oversight professionals.

Mr. Hambleton discussed the responsibility of the CRB to review the BART Police Department's implementation of the NOBLE Report recommendations.

13. Closed Session:

A. To Consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release (Room 303, Board Conference Room). Govt. Code §54957.

This item was tabled and held for a future date.

14. Open Session.

(See item #13)

15. Adjournment.

Mr. Hambleton moved to adjourn the CRB meeting and Mr. Minshew seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting was adjourned at 6:02 p.m.