

Surveillance Impact Report

BART Closed Circuit Television (CCTV)

Project 79PD000

In-Stations CCTV Cameras

(31 Stations, Phased)

Office of Infrastructure Delivery

ME-BCCTV-SIR-08

21 Day BART Board Notice – February 21, 2024

15 Day Public Notice – February 28, 2024

BART Board Meeting – March 14, 2024



Introduction

BART Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) Project 79PD000 for Stations Video Surveillance System Upgrade consists of upgrading and replacing existing communications equipment and CCTV Internet Protocol (IP) Cameras in thirty-one (31) District Stations. The project work will be completed in phases as funding becomes available. Cameras located in each of the station locations will capture video of the general public in areas such as concourses, platforms, stairwells/ escalators, and parking lots within District's station proper.

All cameras currently available in the market for the necessary replacement of end of life, obsolete legacy equipment are upgraded with industry's latest CCTV technology. In order to procure, install, and commission the new equipment, the Project is in need of Board approval for the implementation and use of CCTV equipment.

In accordance with Ordinance No. 2018-1, an ordinance of the San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District Codifying Its Surveillance Technology Policy, the Project hereby submits this Surveillance Impact Report as the first step taken seeking Board approval to commission and start up the new cameras which include the CCTV surveillance technology.

A. Information describing the proposed surveillance technology and how it generally works.

CCTV (closed-circuit television) is a TV system in which signals are not publicly distributed but are monitored, primarily for surveillance and security purposes. CCTV relies on strategic placement of cameras, and observation of the camera's input on monitors. Because the cameras communicate with monitors and/or video recorders across private communication links, they gain the designation "closed-circuit" to indicate that access to their content is limited by design only to those able to see it.

The various types of cameras that are employed for public surveillance purposes include visible and semi-visible, each having its own purpose. Visible cameras are intentionally designed to be visible to the public and for the most part, one can easily detect what is being recorded by the direction of the camera. Semi-visible cameras have become increasingly more common. These cameras have a dome-shaped covering that prevents the public from identifying the direction the camera is facing. For crime prevention efforts, this type of camera is more effective for deterrence purposes because would-be offenders are unable to determine whether they are being recorded and may therefore refrain from criminal activity due to fear of apprehension.

The CCTV system selected for the project will include fixed semi-visible dual (i.e. set of 2) and quad (i.e. set of 4) cameras.

Sample Image of Semi-Visible CCTV Camera



B. Information on the proposed purpose(s) for the surveillance technology.

The use of cameras based on closed-circuit television (CCTV) technology has proven effective in increasing the confidence of the community in public transport and improving the protection of patrons, employees, railcars, and critical infrastructure. The CCTV system captures and records video images of Passengers. It serves the following key purposes:

- Reduces the fear of crime and reassures the public and employees
- Prevents, deters, and detects crime, damage to infrastructure and vehicles, public disorder, unlawful behavior and inappropriate conduct.
- Acts as a risk management tool and as a defense against fraudulent claims, particularly for individuals alleging injury during accidents.
- Aids in dispute mediation, complaint resolution, accident investigation, employee monitoring, etc.
- Used to monitor, identify, apprehend and prosecute offenders for criminal offences, criminal damage, public disorder, roadway accidents, and harassment.
- Used to investigate complaints or offences and provide evidence upon which to take criminal, civil and disciplinary actions.
- Used to collect passenger and transport data to monitor and support network planning objectives and initiatives.

C. If applicable, the general location(s), it may be deployed.

The project will provide approximately thirty (30) IP cameras in both existing and new locations in each of the stations within public areas such as concourses, platforms, and stairwells/escalators, and parking lots. Cameras located at stairwell/escalator locations are pointed to street level and are directed towards the escalators. The detailed scope and final design remain preliminary at this time and may be subject to change.

The following is a list of the stations in the current scope of the project based on priority of work to be completed. Work will be completed as funding becomes available to the project.

Priority	Station ID	Station Name	Priority	Station ID	Station Name	Priority	Station ID	Station Name
1	A20	Fruitvale	11	C60	Concord	21	L10	Castro Valley
2	A30	Coliseum	12	C70	North Concord	22	L30	Dublin/Pleasanton
3	A40	San Leandro	13	C80	Pittsburg	23	M70	Glen Park
4	A50	Bay Fair	14	M60	24th St	24	M80	Balboa Park
5	A60	Hayward	15	M90	Daly City	25	R30	North Berkeley
6	R10	Ashby	16	A70	South Hayward	26	R40	El Cerrito Plaza
7	R50	El Cerrito Del Norte	17	A90	Fremont	27	W10	Colma
8	R60	Richmond	18	C10	Rockridge	28	W20	South San Francisco
9	C20	Orinda	19	C40	Walnut Creek	29	W30	San Bruno
10	C30	Lafayette	20	C50	Pleasant Hill	30	W40	Millbrae
						31	S20	Warm Springs

Anticipated Surveillance Impact Report – BART Station Closed Circuit Television (CCTV)

D. Crime statistics for any location(s), if the equipment is used to deter or detect crime.

The Closed-Circuit Television System is intended as a District wide security system having amongst other functions the purpose of prevention, deterrence and detections. The system will target crimes as measured by the BART Police Performance Measurements monthly report and the reported data from the BART official monthly FBI Uniform Crime Reporting (UCR) program.

Crimes Statistics for the 31 applicable stations for Project 79PD000 are as follows:

Station	Type of Crime					Station Totals
	Violent	Property	Select Vehicle	Electronic	Other	
A20, Fruitvale	20	98	48	12	16	194
A30, Coliseum	15	244	136	6	15	416
A40, San Leandro	13	87	60	2	12	174
A50, Bay Fair	14	48	15	6	33	116
A60, Hayward	19	85	49	7	17	177
A70, South Hayward	5	58	38	0	11	112
A90, Fremont	4	22	8	1	11	46
C10, Rockridge	1	23	16	0	4	44
C20, Orinda	2	27	18	1	2	50
C30, Lafayette	0	32	24	2	10	68
C40, Walnut Creek	4	15	8	0	12	39
C50, Pleasant Hill	5	45	32	0	11	93
C60, Concord	6	25	10	2	13	56
C70, North Concord	1	26	19	1	7	54
C80, Pittsburg	7	35	14	1	11	68
L10, Castro Valley	3	20	8	0	8	39
L30, Dublin/Pleasanton	7	45	21	5	19	97
M60, 24th St	32	14	0	18	14	78
M70, Glen Park	6	8	1	6	6	27
M80, Balboa Park	8	8	1	4	8	29
M90, Daly City	12	84	53	8	8	165
R10, Ashby	4	16	4	1	10	35
R30, North Berkeley	1	22	4	0	16	43
R40, El Cerrito Plaza	2	17	6	0	12	37
R50, El Cerrito Del Norte	7	33	14	2	16	72
R60, Richmond	3	57	41	1	8	110
S20, Warm Springs	0	20	8	2	5	35
W10, Colma	0	12	3	0	4	19
W20, South San Francisco	0	6	3	2	6	17
W30, San Bruno	0	8	1	1	9	19
W40, Millbrae	0	21	10	0	4	35
Totals by Crime	201	1261	673	91	338	2564

E. An assessment identifying any potential impact on privacy rights and discussing any plans to safeguard the rights of the public.

CCTV cameras will be used in strict compliance with their Use Policy adopted by the Board in 2018.

BART recognizes that all people have an inalienable right to privacy and is committed to protecting and safeguarding this right. Through the placement of these CCTV cameras, no still or video footage or audio of persons will be captured in areas where there is an expectation of privacy, such as restrooms; and will not be used to harass, intimidate, or discriminate against any individual or group. BART’s use of CCTV cameras will not include facial recognition or other biometric data collection.

Authorized Use: The CCTV security cameras and the images/video/audio they capture will be used in a lawful manner for BART business purposes only, including the uses identified in Section I of the CCTV Surveillance Use Policy, and not for personal use or other non-BART uses.

Data Access: Access to images and video footage will be restricted to the designated BART departments and staff.

Data Protection: BART will maintain data collected by CCTV System in a secure location where physical access is limited to authorized individuals and includes physical access protections and/or firewall protections from external intrusion.

Data Retention: BART will retain/stored data collected from the CCTV system per BART Police Department Policy 707. Relatively short retention periods will avoid the unnecessary over-accumulation of data.

Public Access: BART will grant Public access to data collected from the CCTV system per BART Police Department Policy 707. All video images/data will be used for District operations, law enforcement or public safety purposes only; except as required by law, subpoenas or other court process, such data will not otherwise be disclosed/released by the BART Police Department without the consent of the Chief of Police.

Third Party Data Sharing: BART will share data with third parties as follows:

- In response to subpoenas issued by a defendant
- Pursuant to a Court Order
- To assist criminal Investigations by Law Enforcement Agencies
- In adherence to the District’s Safe Transit Policy.

F. The fiscal costs for the surveillance technology, including initial purchase, personnel and other ongoing costs, and any current or potential sources of funding.

Initial Purchase Costs:

Camera	\$/Unit	QTY	Total
Dual, AXIS P3715	~\$700	465	~\$325,500
Quad, AXIS P3727-PLE	~\$1,500	465	~\$697,500
			~\$1,023,000

Anticipated Surveillance Impact Report – BART Station Closed Circuit Television (CCTV)

Ongoing Costs, including Personnel Costs:

According to the Annual Surveillance Report, in FY23 BART spent \$1,838,400 operating and maintaining 3,281 cameras, or an average of \$560/camera.

Since the cameras being installed as part of this project will be brand new, the cost to operate and maintain them should be lower than \$560/camera, approximately \$20,160.00/year.

The ongoing costs associated with the deployment of the Closed-Circuit Television System are for normal preventative and corrective maintenance.

The anticipated lifespan of the system is approximately ten (10) years. However, with proper maintenance and the absence of vandalism, staff anticipates the useful operational lifespan of the system could be extended.

Potential Sources of Funding:

- Department of Homeland Security Grant
- Operating Funds
- Other Federal Funds

G. Whether use or maintenance of the technology will require data gathered by the technology to be handled or stored by a third-party vendor on an ongoing basis.

Third party vendor support requires the use of log files and sample image data to be collected for analysis of errors and system malfunctions. The data is not stored after maintenance is complete.

H. A summary of alternative methods (whether involving the use of a new technology or not) considered before deciding to use the proposed surveillance technology, including the costs and benefits associated with each alternative and an explanation of the reasons why each alternative is inadequate or undesirable.

BART examined two types of technology in the implementation of the Closed-Circuit Television System, legacy Analog and current Digital IP Based technology. The benefits and disadvantages are:

Benefits of Analog Cameras

- Cost
- Larger pool of installers and vendors
- Simplicity
- Advancements in image quality

Disadvantages of Analog Cameras

- Image quality is significantly less than Digital IP Based Technology
- Less coverage
- More Cables
- No Encryption

Anticipated Surveillance Impact Report – BART Station Closed Circuit Television (CCTV)

Benefits of IP Cameras (PTZ and Fixed)

- Multiple image sensors in one unit.
- Decrease in cost
- Ease of Installation
- Image Resolution
- Intelligence and analytics
- Security -video is encrypted
- Less equipment
- Open Platforms

Disadvantages of Digital IP Based Technology (PTZ and Fixed)

- Cost of initial set-up
- Storage
- Training for new technologies

Disadvantages of No Camera Option

- BART's loss of the intended purpose and benefits of the surveillance technology.

I. A summary of the experience, if any is known, other law enforcement entities have had with the proposed technology, including information about the effectiveness, any known adverse information about the technology such as unanticipated costs, failures, civil rights or civil liberties issues.

BART's own prior experience with the existing technology is described in detail in BART's 2023 Annual Surveillance Report.

Experience:

BART uses CCTV technology for the following:

- Situational awareness for Transportation and Operations Control Center personnel for managing stations and special events.
- Allowing BART personnel to avoid train-holds in situations that can be resolved remotely by CCTV, reducing delays in revenue service.
- Accident/incident investigations, mechanical failure investigations, and for California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) compliance checks.
- Essential direct investigation evidence of violent crimes.
- Identification and capture of criminal perpetrators.

Effectiveness:

In FY23, BART Police detectives produced 310 wanted person bulletins using CCTV images to attempt to identify persons involved in criminal activity.

Establishing a causal relationship between the occurrence of crime and the presence, or absence, of CCTV is difficult, but CCTV is an essential part of the safety and security strategy that customers and employees expect the District to provide as part of running a Tier-I mass transit system.

Failures & Unanticipated Costs:

There were no significant CCTV equipment failures in FY23, and no unanticipated costs related to the use

Anticipated Surveillance Impact Report – BART Station Closed Circuit Television (CCTV)

of the equipment.

Civil Rights & Civil Liberties:

Access to the CCTV network is highly controlled, and BART has in place a detailed process for fielding requests for CCTV video from both internal and external entities. Copies of CCTV video are provided only in strict accordance with the District's Safe Transit Policy and Surveillance Use Policy.