

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT  
2150 Webster Street, Oakland, CA 94612, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688  
510-464-6000

NOTICE OF MEETING AND AGENDA  
BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE (BATF)

May 22, 2025

2:00 p.m.

A regular meeting of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) will be held on Thursday, May 22, 2025, starting at 2:00 p.m. to 4:30 pm. The meeting will be held at East Bay Paratransit's location at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, California 94612, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor conference room. The facility is served by public transportation. The nearest BART Station is the 19th Street BART Station and there are multiple AC Transit routes to the meeting site.

Please note that this meeting will be held in person in the East Bay Paratransit, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor conference room, Oakland, CA 94612 with an option for public participation via teleconference.

Presentation materials will be available via Legistar at <https://bart.legistar.com>

You may attend the Committee Meeting in person or join the Committee Meeting via Zoom by calling 1-833-548-0282 and entering access code **859 7868 5859** logging in to Zoom.com and entering access code **859 7868 5859**; or typing the following Zoom link into your web browser:  
<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/85978685859>

If you wish to make a public comment:

- 1) Submit written comments via email to [evanloo@bart.gov](mailto:evanloo@bart.gov), using "public comment" as the subject line. Your comment will be provided to the Committee and will become a permanent part of the file. Please submit your comments as far in advance as possible. Emailed comments must be received before 12:00 p.m. on **May 20, 2025**, in order to be included in the record.
- 2) Appear in person and request to make a public comment.
- 3) Call 1-833-548-0282, enter access code **859 7868 5859**, dial \*9 to raise your hand when you wish to speak, and dial \*6 to unmute when you are requested

to speak; log in to Zoom.com, enter access code **859 7868 5859**, and use the raise hand feature; or join the Committee Meeting via the Zoom link, <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/85978685859>, and use the raise hand feature.

Public comment is limited to two (2) minutes per person.

Please refrain from wearing scented products (perfume, cologne, after-shave, etc.) to these meetings, as there may be people in attendance susceptible to environmental illnesses.

BART provides services/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited English proficient who wish to address Committee matters. A request must be made within one and five days in advance of Board/Committee meetings, depending on the service requested. Please contact the Office of the District Secretary at (510) 464-6083 for information.

**Meeting Location**

East Bay Paratransit, 1750 Broadway, Oakland, CA 94612  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor Conference Room

1. Roll call of BATF members. (Information) 5 minutes  
Self-Introductions: Staff and Guests.
2. Public comment. (Information)  
An opportunity for members of the public to comment on items not on the Agenda.  
**Public comment is limited to two (2) minutes per person**
3. Approval of April 24, 2025 meeting minutes. 10 minutes  
(Information/Action)
4. BART's compiled and analyzed customer complaints related to accessibility for the third quarter. (Information/Action) 15 minutes
5. Nominate and elect a BATF Chair; nominate and elect a Vice Chair and Second Vice Chair, if vacant. (Information/Action) 20 minutes
6. Discuss canceling the August 28, 2025, and December 18, 2025, BATF meetings. (Information/Action) 10 minutes
7. Discuss re-posting the BATF recruitment article on the bart.gov website. (Information/Action) 15 minutes
8. Review and discuss updated tones to assist blind and low vision customers entering and exiting faregates. (Information/Action) 15 minutes
9. Member announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
10. Staff announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
11. Chairperson announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
12. Future agenda topics – Members suggest topics. 5 minutes  
**Next meeting scheduled:** June 26, 2025 – Thursday
13. Adjournment.



**Approval of April 24,  
2025 meeting minutes**

**BATF**

**May 22, 2025**

**Agenda 3**

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE**  
Committee Meeting **DRAFT** Minutes  
April 24, 2025

**1. Roll Call of Members:**

1. Anita Ortega
2. Bruce Yow
3. Catherine Callahan (2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair)
4. Clarence R. Fischer
5. Danny Kodmur
6. Daveed Mandell
7. Emily Witkin - ABSENT
8. Herb Hastings (Chair)
9. Hillary Brown
10. Janice Armigo Brown – ABSENT
11. Janien Harrison
12. Joshua Saunders
13. Roland Wong
14. Sam Buman
15. Shana Ray
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of eight (8) in-person appointed BATF members.

Member Janien Harrison announced she was attending the meeting via teleconference under the Just Cause provision of Government Code Section 54953(f).

**BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:**

Elena Van Loo  
Bob Franklin  
Ryan Greene-Roesel

**BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:**

Director Robert Raburn

Lisa Raffetto (BART staff)  
Maureen Wetter (BART staff)  
Allen Chew (BART staff)  
Dennis Lee (BART staff)  
Mayra Perez (Captioner)  
Alicia Garispe (Captioner)  
Sara Desumala (Guest)  
Helen Walsh (Guest)  
Aleta Dupre (Guest)  
Lucky Maxwell (Guest)  
Nora Lewis (Guest)  
Troy Russell (Guest)  
Tyler (Guest)  
Nicola Fraser (Guest)  
Jerry Grace (Guest)

## **2. Public Comments**

Aleta Dupre shared that today's public comment was not easy. She stated that she found the behavior of one of the BATF members at a previous meeting to be very concerning to her because it sounded like it directly berated employees of BART and the institution of BART as a whole; however, she wished to focus more on the basic principles of conduct in meetings.

Aleta Dupre stated that she hopes that BATF will reach its full roster of eighteen (18) with a diversity of members, and that members will work together, and attend meetings regularly to share their thoughts.

## **3. Remembering Christine Arseneault**

Herb Hasting led the agenda item.

Herb Hasting stated that Christine Arseneault was efficient, punctual, and a very good note taker and organizer.

Hillary Brown mentioned that Christine was honored during the BART Board of Director's meeting.

Roland Wong stated that he had known Christine for a short time but enjoyed working with her and was sad when he heard of her passing.

Danny Kodmor said Christine was more than a role model – she was a “possibility model,” which means someone is showing you what is possible, and Christine was very good at that.

Clarence R. Fischer said that Christine had a unique way of running BATF meetings. She allowed each BATF member and members of the public to express their opinions and welcomed everyone.

Bruce Yow said that Christine was a strong leader. She kept the meetings together and he felt saddened she could not finish her term as chair.

Sam Buman shared that he met Christine over a year ago and she suggested he join the BATF. He said Christine was a wonderful person and her death is a devastating loss to the community.

Daveed Mandell shared that Christine had a lot of plans for the BATF, especially with the new fare gates. She had a strong commitment to accessibility.

Janien Harrison did not know Christine very long but believed she made people feel welcome.

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that she was impressed with Christine’s organizational skills. She mentioned Christine had asked about quarterly reports on accessibility complaints and an overview of the customer satisfaction survey, and wished Christine was present to hear the reports on these topics. Ryan stated that staff plan to honor her wish to bring a summary of accessibility complaints to the BATF quarterly.

Jerry Grace mentioned he knew Christine for a short time and she did a good job.

Aleta Dupre shared that she was sad when she found out about Christine’s passing. She said she felt Christine always welcomed her and took her seriously, and that Christine saw a bright future for the BATF, made connections with BART Board of Directors, and practiced external outreach.

Helen Walsh stated that she did not have the chance to meet Christine. She heard Christine inspired people to get involved and was touched by her leadership.

Herb Hastings thanked everyone for their comments honoring Christine Arseneault.

#### **4. Approval of March 27, 2025 meeting minutes**

Clarence R. Fischer moved approval of the March 27, 2025 meeting minutes with amendments. Hillary Brown second the motion.

- Motion passes with nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, and one (1) abstention.

#### **5. BART January 2026 fare increase**

Lisa Raffetto led the agenda item. The full presentation is part of April's BATF agenda package.

Daveed Mandell was concerned that the presentation had too many graphs which are difficult for people with visual impairments or people who are blind. He stated that he understands that all public transportation agencies are facing financial difficulties and voiced concerns that low-income people will not be able to afford public transportation when prices keep increasing.

Sam Buman commented that the public should be educated about why the fare increases are necessary.

Joshua Saunders asked for an example of how much fares will increase for a trip from El Cerrito Plaza to Downtown San Francisco. Lisa Raffetto gave an example of BART minimum fare which is currently at \$2.40 and effective January 01, 2026, the fare will increase to \$2.55.

Shana Ray echoed Daveed Mandell's concern that with the fare increase, BART may become unaffordable for low-income people and people with disabilities.

Clarence R. Fischer suggested that the next presentation on the topic of fare increases should provide examples of how much the fare will increase from one station to another.

Sam Buman asked if the fare increases are two-year or five-year increases. Lisa Raffetto stated the fare increase is biennial; every two years.

Roland Wong stated that the current fare between the Antioch BART station and the San Francisco International Airport (SFO) is already very expensive. He expressed concern that the fare increases will affect ridership, especially among low-income people and people with disabilities. He was concerned that BART is becoming too expensive for daily use and riders may need to find other means of transportation.

Janien Harrison wondered how the public, and especially seniors and people with disabilities, would know of the fare increases. Lisa Raffetto shared that the public will be informed of the fare increase.

Aleta Dupre expressed that the fare increase concerns her. She wondered if BART is getting any added revenue from reducing fare evasion.

Helen Walsh said that the fare increase was concerning, especially for people with disabilities, low-income people, and seniors.

Daveed Mandell stated that he would like fare discounts for people with disabilities and seniors to increase to 90% instead of the current discount of 62.5%.

Herb Hastings thanked Lisa Raffetto for her presentation.

## **6. BART's Customer Satisfaction Survey – Results for People with Disabilities**

Maureen Wetter presented on the agenda item. The full presentation was included in the April agenda package.

Danny Kodmor asked if the percentage of people who identify as having a disability has been 7% since 2022, and Maureen responded in the affirmative. Danny asked if the survey asked about the type of disability and Maureen responded that it does not. She said that the survey only asked, “Are you a person with a disability?”

Clarence R. Fischer asked if BART had considered handing out surveys as people come into the station. He said this approach could get more responses, especially from seniors and people with disabilities. He also suggested asking more detailed questions related to seniors and people with disabilities like, “did you find seating while waiting for the train?”

Shana Ray asked if there was an option to take the survey online and asked if this was accessible for people who are blind or who have low vision. Maureen confirmed that staff provided a link and a QR code to take the survey online if desired.

Joshua Saunders mentioned that QR codes do not work for him due to the difficulty of aligning the smartphone with the code. Maureen mentioned that the direct link to the online survey was also provided.

Sam Buman asked if Clipper Card value could be given as incentive to encourage responses to the survey. Maureen said that survey respondents are entered into a drawing and have the chance to win Clipper card value.

Daveed Mandell would like to see surveys in braille for people with low vision or people who are blind.

Jerry Grace saw BART employees distributing the surveys and he was pleased with this.

Herb Hastings thanked Maureen Wetter for her presentation.

## **7. BART's Fiscal Year 2026 and Fiscal Year 2027 Preliminary budget**

Allen Chew and Dennis Lee presented on the agenda item. The full presentation is part of the agenda package.

Daveed Mandell thanked Allen Chew and Dennis Lee for their presentation but wished they had made the presentation more accessible for people who are blind or people with low vision. He recommended referring to a recent book by Ron Brooks for best practices on making meetings accessible.

Sam Buman wanted to ensure that BART services will not be cut in the future. Dennis Lee stated that the BART Operations Planning Department and other departments will investigate what changes need to be made if a major budget cut occurs.

Shana Ray wondered if there will be a budget deficit in Fiscal Year 27 and if there will be a major increase in BART fares.

Bruce Yow asked how much capital funding is in the Fiscal Year 26 and Fiscal Year 27 budget.

Clarence R. Fischer asked if some of the budget for Fiscal Year 26 and Fiscal Year 27 is used to reduce fare evasion. Dennis Lee responded that some of the budget does go into station hardening.

Hillary Brown asked staff to define the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) revenues. Ryan Greene-Roesel stated the ADA revenues are collected from paratransit customers.

Helen Walsh asked about accessibility projects at BART. Ryan Greene-Roesel mentioned there is budget set aside to fund BART's Accessibility Improvement Program.

Herb Hastings thanked Allen Chew and Dennis Lee for their presentation.

**8. BART's compiled and analyzed customer complaints related to accessibility for the third quarter**

Agenda item to be moved to a future BATF meeting.

**9 Member announcements**

Sam Buman mentioned that a friend of his may be interested in being a BATF member.

Joshua Saunders shared that he used his Clipper Card from his smart phone at the new faregates recently installed at the El Cerrito Plaza BART station. He received notification that his Clipper Card had been processed and the doors should have opened to enter the faregate but he almost ran into the fare gate due to the fact that the door did not open fast enough.

**10. Staff announcements**

Ryan Greene-Roesel shared that there will be a scheduled a walkthrough at Lake Merritt Station on April 28, 2025 to review the wayfinding in place during construction of the new faregates.

Bob Franklin announced that he had been appointed by the BART Board of Directors to be the Interim District Secretary and he will be taking a brief break from BATF.

**11. Chairperson announcements**

Herb Hastings, Vice Chair, thanked BATF members and members of the public for their patience as he took the new role as Chair and thanked Elena Van Loo for her assistance with running an effective meeting.

Herb Hastings announced he has been selected to try the new, updated, piloted Clipper Card 2.0 program.

## **12. Future agenda items – member suggest topics**

- BART's compiled and analyzed customer complaints related to accessibility for the third quarter
- Tactile surfaces and directional indicators and guidance indicators

## **13. Adjournment**

Roland Wong asked to adjourn the meeting by honoring Christine Arseneault. Hillary Brown moved to adjourn the March 27, 2025 meeting and Clarence R. Fischer second the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:18 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, May 22, 2025.



**BART's compiled &  
analyzed customer  
complaints related to  
accessibility for the third  
quarter**

**BATF**

**May 22, 2025**

**Agenda 4**



# 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter BART's Compiled and Analyzed Customer Complaints Related to Accessibility

BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) – May 22, 2024



# Agenda

- Overview of complaint tracking at BART
- Defining accessibility complaints
- 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter Accessibility Complaint analysis

# Complaint Tracking at BART

- BART uses Salesforce to track all customer comments and complaints
- Complaint analysis (for all complaints) presented to the Board quarterly as part of the Quarterly Performance Report (QPR)
  - Top areas from last QPR: service, equipment, biohazard, trains, personnel
  - Full QPR available on [bart.gov/reports](http://bart.gov/reports)
- QPR also includes relevant accessibility metrics – uptime for elevators, escalators, and faregates

# Identifying "Accessibility Complaints"

- Include anything flagged as accessibility-related OR containing keywords related to accessibility
- Review to confirm relevance; ensure complaint mentioned a disability or concern about people with disabilities
- Sort/classify according to themes

*Accessibility keywords: wheelchair, mobility, deaf, blind, vision, hearing, powerchair, cane, service animals, service dogs, guide dogs, tactile, braille, hearing loops, and priority seating*

# 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter Accessibility Complaint Results

<u>THEMES</u>	<u>NUMBER OF CASES</u>
Customer service/personnel problem	12
Elevator/escalator out of service or malfunctioning	11
Communication/noticing problem for elevator/escalator outages or train schedule	4
Signage/wayfinding problem	4
Accessible faregate not working or closed too quickly	3
Escalator direction problem	3
New faregates issue	3
Accessible path issue	2
Priority seating unavailable and/or people without disabilities using reserved seats	2
Misc	1
Slip/fall hazard	1

**28 total cases representing 46 themes**

**Thank you.**

**Questions**



**Discuss re-posting BATF**  
**recruitment article under**  
**the bart.gov website**

**BATF**

**May 22, 2025**

**Agenda 7**

06.01.2023 (posted) under bart.gov (1<sup>st</sup> notice)

01-02-2024 (posted) under bart.gov (2nd notice)

## **BART is recruiting new members for the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF)**

Want to help make BART more accessible for seniors and people with disabilities? The BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) is recruiting new members!

The BART Accessibility Task Force is a public committee comprised of BART riders to advise the BART Board of Directors and staff on disability-related issues and advocate on behalf of people with disabilities and seniors to make the BART system accessible to all.

The BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) generally meets on the fourth Thursday of each month from 2 p.m. to 4:30 p.m. The BATF meetings are open to the public and are located at the East Bay Paratransit Office, 1750 Broadway, 1st floor conference room, Oakland, CA 94612, which is adjacent to the 19th Street BART station street level elevator. Times and/or locations may vary for the November and December meetings.

BATF member responsibilities include the following:

1. Provide input on issues and policies; capital projects; compliance with local, state and federal legislation; and other issues that might be brought to the BATF by the public, staff or the Board.
2. Develop recommendations which take into consideration the needs of people with different disabilities and seniors.
3. Participate in the development of proposed new policies and the planning and implementation of new services that affect people with disabilities and seniors who use BART.
4. Provide a public forum for discussion of all BART related issues concerning people with disabilities and seniors.
5. Act as a resource group to BART staff who interact with people with disabilities and seniors to answer complaints, develop new programs, solve architectural problems in the system, conduct staff disability training, and address other areas as needed.

To learn more about the BATF, please click here: [BART Accessibility Task force \(BATF\)](#).

To become a member of the BATF, people have to attend three of four consecutive BATF meetings and then apply for membership. So come on by and check it out. Here is the schedule for upcoming meetings, as well as agendas from previous meeting: <https://bart.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx>

If you are interested or if you have any questions, please contact Elena Van Loo at 510-874-7366 or by email at [evanloo@bart.gov](mailto:evanloo@bart.gov)