

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, Oakland, CA 94612, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688
510-464-6000

NOTICE OF MEETING AND AGENDA
BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE (BATF)

October 23, 2025

2:00 p.m.

A regular meeting of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) will be held on Thursday, October 23, 2025, starting at 2:00 p.m. to 4:30 p.m. The meeting will be held at East Bay Paratransit's location at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, California 94612, 1st Floor conference room. The facility is served by public transportation. The nearest BART Station is the 19th Street BART Station and there are multiple AC Transit routes to the meeting site.

Please note that this meeting will be held in person in the East Bay Paratransit, 1st Floor conference room, Oakland, CA 94612 with an option for public participation via teleconference.

Presentation materials will be available via Legistar at <https://bart.legistar.com>

You may attend the Committee Meeting in person or join the Committee Meeting via Zoom by calling 1-833-548-0282 and entering access code **889 1297 0863** logging in to Zoom.com and entering access code **889 1297 0863**; or typing the following Zoom link into your web browser:
<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88912970863>

If you wish to make a public comment:

- 1) Submit written comments via email to evanloo@bart.gov, using "public comment" as the subject line. Your comment will be provided to the Committee and will become a permanent part of the file. Please submit your comments as far in advance as possible. Emailed comments must be received before 12:00 p.m. on **October 21, 2025**, in order to be included in the record.
- 2) Appear in person and request to make a public comment.
- 3) Call 1-833-548-0282, enter access code **889 1297 0863**, dial *9 to raise your hand when you wish to speak, and dial *6 to unmute when you are requested

to speak; log in to Zoom.com, enter access code **889 1297 0863** , and use the raise hand feature; or join the Committee Meeting via the Zoom link, <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/88912970863>, and use the raise hand feature.

Public comment is limited to two (2) minutes per person.

Please refrain from wearing scented products (perfume, cologne, after-shave, etc.) to these meetings, as there may be people in attendance susceptible to environmental illnesses.

BART provides services/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited English proficient who wish to address Committee matters. A request must be made within one and five days in advance of Board/Committee meetings, depending on the service requested. Please contact the Office of the District Secretary at (510) 464-6083 for information.

Meeting Location

East Bay Paratransit, 1750 Broadway, Oakland, CA 94612
1st Floor Conference Room

1. Roll Call of BATF Members. (Information) 5 minutes
Self-Introductions: Staff and Guests.
2. Public Comment. (Information)
An opportunity for members of the public to comment on items not on the agenda.
Public comment is limited to two (2) minutes per person
3. Approval of the September 25, 2025 Meeting Minutes. 5 minutes
(Information/Action)
4. BART's Restroom and Elevator Attendant Program Update. 20 minutes
(Information)
5. First Quarter: BART's Compiled and Analyzed Customer 20 minutes
Complaints Related to Accessibility. (Information)
6. Review and Approve 2026 BART Accessibility Task Force 10 minutes
(BATF) Scheduled Meeting Dates. (Information/Action)
7. Discuss Hosting January 22, 2026 BATF Meet and Greet Event 10 minutes
and Approve Flyer. (Information/Action)
8. Member Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
9. Staff Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
10. Chairperson Announcements. (Information) 5 minutes
11. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggest Topics. 5 minutes
Next Meeting Scheduled: November 20, 2025 – 3rd Thursday
December 18, 2025 – 3rd Thursday
12. Adjournment.



Approval of the
September 25, 2025
Meeting Minutes

BATF

October 23, 2025
Agenda 3

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE

DRAFT Committee Meeting Minutes

September 25, 2025

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Anita Ortega
2. Bruce Yow
3. Catherine Callahan (2nd Vice-Chair)
4. Clarence R. Fischer
5. Danny Kodmur
6. Daveed Mandell
7. Herb Hastings (Chair)
8. Hillary Brown
9. Janice Armigo Brown
10. Joshua Saunders (Vice-Chair)
11. Roland Wong
12. Sam Buman
13. Shana Ray
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of seven (7) in-person appointed BATF members.

Five (5) appointed BATF members participated remotely under the Just Cause provision of Government Code Section 54953 (f):

1. Catherine Callahan used her second Just Cause
2. Daveed Mandell used his second Just Cause
3. Janice Armigo Brown used her second Just Cause
4. Joshua Saunders used his first Just Cause
5. Shana Ray used her first Just Cause

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Ryan Greene-Roesel
Kevin McDonald

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Alex Walker (BART staff)
Susan Poliwka (BART staff)
Derik Calhoun (BART staff)
Ahmad Rassai (BART staff)
David Coggshall (BART staff)
Hannah Kanzell (ASL Interpreter)
Sankari Paisley (ASL Interpreter)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Sara Desumala (Guest)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Mussie Gebri (Guest)
Valerie Buell (Guest)
Esther Wiltz (Guest)
Jaimie San Nicolas (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Esther Wiltz and Jaimie San Nicolas each introduced themselves and expressed interest in joining the BATF.

Valerie Buell reported that smoking continues at the 12th St. BART Station and expressed concern that her previous complaints have not been addressed.

Aleta Dupree shared that she attended a recent BART Board of Directors meeting, where she learned about a pilot program for new faregate tones at selected stations. She expressed interest in testing the tones and providing feedback, noting their potential benefit for diverse communities.

Aleta Dupree also encouraged BATF members and the public to advocate for free elevator access for all individuals, regardless of disability status.

3. Approval of the July 24, 2025 meeting minutes

Clarence R. Fischer moved approval of the July 24, 2025, meeting minutes. Hillary Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with twelve (12) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstentions.

4. Senate Bill 63 Update

Alex Walker presented on the agenda item, with the full presentation included in the BATF September 2025 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few concerns and suggestions were provided:

- Clarence R. Fischer inquired about what would happen if Senate Bill 63 were vetoed.
- Clarence R. Fischer asked what percentage of this bill will go towards projects to improve conditions for seniors and people with disabilities.
- Clarence R. Fischer asked if this bill covers signal priority for bus services or emergency vehicles.
- Danny Kodmur asked how many previous funding measures similar to this have been in effect over the last few years.
- Danny Kodmur asked when Senate Bill 63 takes effect if it passes.
- Danny Kodmur asked how drastic the service cuts would be if the bill does not pass.
- Sam Buman asked if there would be a work plan for Senate Bill 63.
- Sam Buman asked why other counties were not part of the Senate Bill 63.
- Joshua Saunders emphasized the importance of passing this measure.
- Daveed Mandell expressed that the following counties (Alameda, Contra Costa, Santa Clara, San Mateo, and San Francisco) will be part of Senate Bill 63 and mentioned that the sales tax may be too high.
- Daveed Mandell expressed concerns that the bill does not address accessibility within BART.
- Herb Hasting asked about why expenditures are not the same for the five counties (Alameda, Contra Costa, Santa Clara, San Mateo, and San Francisco).

Aleta Dupree emphasized the importance of passing Senate Bill 63 and highlighted the critical role public transportation plays in the community.

5. Bay Fair Pedestrian Tunnel Accessible Ramp Concept

Susan Poliwka presented on the agenda item, with the full presentation included in the BATF September 2025 agenda packet. She also shared several design concepts for the new tunnel planned at Bay Fair BART Station.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few concerns and suggestions were provided:

- Danny Kodmur asked how the new tunnel, the Bay Fair BART Station and soon, TOD (Transit Oriented Development) will connect.
- Clarence R. Fischer asked about the ramp with switchbacks and wondered if there would be enough space for a variety of wheelchairs to use.
- Roland Wong voiced that it is important to have good wayfinding when the new tunnel is installed along with good lighting.
- Roland Wong asked if there would be benches in the tunnel for riders to sit down.
- Hillary Brown asked if this project's concept would be used at other BART Stations.
- Anita Ortega stated she would like to see this project completed.
- Joshua Saunders also stated that he did not know there was a tunnel at Bay Fair BART Station. He mentioned he can use the stairs to enter/exit the station.
- Daveed Mandell asked if there would be alternative ways to enter/exit Bay Fair BART Station for those who do not use wheelchairs.
- Roland Wong would like clarification on the location and design of the ramps, including whether the ramps would be zigzag-shaped. He also suggested incorporating seating areas or benches along the ramps for riders to rest.
- Herb Hastings agreed that the current tunnel is in a strange location and understands the confusion about the location.
- Herb Hasting expressed that the new tunnel ramps can be too steep and wanted to know what the ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) requires regarding ramp slope.
- Herb Hastings noted that the existing tunnel runs beneath the train tracks, connecting the Alameda County side to the San Leandro side of the Bay Fair BART Station.

Jerry Grace expressed concern that none of the proposed design diagrams may be suitable for the Bay Fair BART Station.

Esther Wiltz requested that adequate lighting be incorporated into the tunnel design to address safety concerns, particularly for elderly users.

Jaimie San Nicolas stated that the current tunnel is being used as a dumping area and recommended the inclusion of a ramp for bicyclists instead of stairs.

Aleta Dupree mentioned she has not visited the Bay Fair BART Station but emphasized the importance of good lighting and security cameras to ensure public safety.

6. Nominations and Elections for Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2nd Vice-Chair

Elena Van Loo led the agenda item.

Chairperson nominations and elections:

Herb Hastings nominated himself.

Voting results for Chairperson:

Herb Hastings – eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, zero (0) abstentions

Vice-Chairperson nominations and elections:

Herb Hastings nominated Clarence R. Fischer and he declined.

Herb Hastings nominated Sam Buman and he declined.

Shana Ray nominated Joshua Saunders and he accepted.

Voting results for Vice-Chairperson:

Joshua Saunders – nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, zero (0) abstentions

2nd Vice-Chairperson nominations and elections:

Hillary Brown nominated herself.

Voting results 2nd Vice-Chairperson:

Hillary Brown – nine (9) in favor, zero (0) against, one (1) abstention

Elena Van Loo announced the new BATF leadership appointments effective through September 2026:

- Herb Hastings will serve as Chairperson
- Joshua Saunders will serve as Vice-Chairperson
- Hillary Brown will serve as 2nd Vice-Chairperson

7. Member announcements

No member announcements

8. Staff announcements

Elena Van Loo announced the immediate resignations of Emily Witkin and Janien Harrison as appointed BATF members. As a result, there are now thirteen (13) appointed members, with five (5) vacancies remaining.

She also announced that third-quarter travel reimbursements will end effective September 30, 2025. Additionally, she reminded BATF members to contact her directly if they need to update their RTC card number.

Ryan Greene-Roesel informed the group that she will email BATF members with available dates and times to test the faregate tones. The pilot will take place at Civic Center/UN Plaza, Ashby, and Rockridge BART Stations.

Kevin McDonald reported that during the July 24, 2025, BATF meeting, members requested that “Accessibility” be added as a feedback type on the BART Customer Services contact form. After review, BART staff decided not to implement this change, explaining that the form is designed to capture the *type* of feedback (e.g., question, complaint, comment), not the subject. He added that Customer Services staff are trained to review the content of each submission and route accessibility-related feedback to the appropriate department.

9. Chairperson announcements

Herb Hastings shared that he continues to be involved with the new Clipper 2.0 project.

10. Future agenda items – member suggests topics

- Elevator and Restroom Attendants
 - San Francisco Downtown – Elevator attendants
 - 19th St. BART Station – Restroom attendants
- Reliability problems at enclosed faregates at downtown San Francisco Stations:
 - Embarcadero BART Station
 - Montgomery BART Station
 - Powell BART Station
 - Civic Center/UN Plaza BART Station
- Debrief on feedback regarding faregate tones

11. Adjournment

Clarence R. Fischer moved to adjourn the September 25, 2025, meeting. Hillary Brown seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:19 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, October 23, 2025.



**BART's Restroom and
Elevator Attendant
Program Update
(No Materials)**

BATF

October 23, 2025

Agenda 4



First Quarter: BART's
Compiled and Analyzed
Customer Complaints
Related to Accessibility

BATF

October 23, 2025

Agenda 5



1st Quarter: BART's Compiled and Analyzed Customer Complaints Related to Accessibility

BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) – October 23, 2025



- Quarterly Reports – Fiscal Year starts July 1st to June 30th of the following year
 - 3rd quarter – January to March – reported on April 24, 2025 (FY25)
 - 4th quarter – April to June – reported on July 24, 2025 (FY25)
 - 1st quarter – July to September – report on October 23, 2025 (FY26)
 - 2nd quarter – October to December – report on January 22, 2026 (FY26)

Examples of complaints – Customer service/personnel problem

- *“[BART staff] received a call from a member of the public, regarding an issue she encountered at the El Cerrito del Norte Station. She reported that when she asked a staff member for assistance with her Clipper card, no help was provided. Upon requesting a supervisor, she was informed that none were available. She also stated that she has a disability and required accommodation, but she felt that no effort was made to assist her*

Examples of complaints –

Accessible faregate not working or closed too quickly

- *“The fare gate at the platform level of the elevator at Powell station is in very bad condition. This afternoon, my wheelchair partner and I couldn’t get it to process our clipper cards at all. The gate was failed with the doors flopping open, so we passed through, but then had to explain at our destination why our cards weren’t processed properly. This gate has been in poor condition for a long time. Could you please fix it?”*
- *“Rider mentioned every time they go to the Concord BART station, the accessible gate is out of order, meaning my mobility device doesn't fit. Rider is asking to make the entrance accessible and mentioned the accessible faregate has been out of order for at least 10 days.”*

Example of complaints – Priority seating unavailable and/or people without disabilities using reserved seats

- *“I got on the train and they see that I’m disabled, I have a knee brace on, and I asked for people to give up their seats, but they aren’t getting up.”*
- *“People are not giving seats to people with disability.”*

1st Quarter Accessibility Complaint Results - July to September 2025

<u>THEMES</u>	<u>NUMBER OF CASES</u>
Accessible faregate not working or closed too quickly	16
Customer service/personnel problem	11
Elevator/escalator out of service or malfunctioning	10
New faregates	6
Misc	6
Priority seating unavailable and/or people without disabilities using reserved seats	3
Escalator direction problem	3
Slip/fall hazard	1
Accessible path issue	1
Communication/notification problem (system delays/incidents	1
Signage/wayfinding problem	1

48 total cases representing 59 themes

Quarterly Comparison – 1st Quarter of FY26 vs. 4th Quarter of FY25

<u>THEMES</u>	<u>Current Quarter</u>	<u>Previous Quarter</u>
Accessible faregate not working or closed too quickly	16	8
Accessible path issue	1	5
Communication/notification problem for elevator/escalator outages or train schedule	1	3
Customer service/personnel problem	11	15
Elevator/escalator out of service or malfunctioning	10	8
Escalator direction problem	3	2
Misc	6	3
New faregates issue	6	5
Priority seating unavailable and/or people without disabilities using reserved seats	3	3
Signage/wayfinding problem	1	9
Slip/fall hazard	1	1
TOTAL THEMES	59	62
TOTAL CASES	48	54

Thank you.

Questions ?



Review and Approve 2026
BATF Scheduled
Meeting Dates

BATF

October 23, 2025

Agenda 6

2026
BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF)
Regularly Scheduled Meeting Dates

Regular monthly meetings of the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) shall be held every fourth Thursday of each month, with the exception of the months of November and December 2026, which are the third Thursday, due to holidays.

Appointed BATF members must attend meetings in-person to establish a quorum.

Meeting Dates:

1. January 22, 2026 - Thursday
 2. February 26, 2026 - Thursday
 3. March 26, 2026 - Thursday
 4. April 23, 2026 - Thursday
 5. May 28, 2026 - Thursday
 6. June 25, 2026 - Thursday
 7. July 23, 2026 - Thursday
 8. August 27, 2026 - Thursday
 9. September 24, 2026 - Thursday
 10. October 22, 2026 - Thursday
 11. November 19, 2026 - Thursday
 12. December 17, 2026 - Thursday
- From February to December, BATF meetings will be held at East Bay Paratransit, 1750 Broadway, Oakland, CA 94612, 1st Floor Conference room.
 - January's meeting location will be either at BART Headquarters or at East Bay Paratransit. Will be confirmed at a later date.
 - All BATF meetings start at 2:00 pm and end no later than 4:30 pm.



Discuss Hosting the
January 22, 2026 BATF
Meet & Greet Event and
Approve Flyer

BATF
April 24, 2025
Agenda 7



BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) is hosting its annual:

Meet & Greet

An opportunity for BATF members, the BART Board of Directors, and BART staff to meet and greet one another.

Light snacks will be provided

When: Thursday, January 22, 2026
Time: 3:00 pm to 4:30 pm
Where: BART Headquarters (BHQ)
2150 Webster Street
1st Floor, Multipurpose Room
Oakland, CA 94612

Thank you - BATF Members

Contact Elena Van Loo, evanloo@bart.gov and/or call 510-874-7366 with any questions