

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE
Committee Meeting Minutes
December 18, 2025

1. Roll Call of Members:

1. Herb Hastings, **Chair**
2. Joshua Saunders, **Vice Chair**
3. Hillary Brown, **2nd Vice Chair**
4. Anita Ortega
5. Bruce Yow
6. Catherine Callahan - ABSENT
7. Clarence R. Fischer
8. Danny Kodmur
9. Daveed Mandell
10. Janice Armigo Brown - ABSENT
11. Roland Wong
12. Sam Buman
13. Shana Ray
14. VACANT
15. VACANT
16. VACANT
17. VACANT
18. VACANT

Quorum of seven (7) in-person appointed BATF members.

Four (4) appointed BATF members participated remotely under the Just Cause provision of Government Code Section 54953 (f):

1. Clarence R. Fischer, his first “Just Cause.”
2. Danny Kodmur, his first “Just Cause.”
3. Joshua Saunders, his second “Just Cause.”
4. Shana Ray, her second “Just Cause.”

BART Customer Access and Accessibility Department Staff:

Elena Van Loo
Ryan Greene-Roesel

BART Director (s), BART Staff, Speakers, and members of the public:

Director Robert Raburn
Sabrina Batiste (BART staff)
Byron Toma (BART staff)
Esther Waltz (Guest)
Sara Desumala (Guest)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Aleta Dupree (Guest)
Wesley Morgan Toma (Guest)

2. Public Comments

Director Robert Raburn introduced himself and expressed his appreciation for the service of each BATF member to the BART Board of Directors.

Aleta Dupree thanked BART staff for including her email in the BATF agenda package under the public comments section. She noted that the email posted in December was originally intended for the November agenda.

Aleta Dupree expressed that all BART stations should make sure that all stations have raised platform tactile strips at the platform level.

3. Approval of the November 20, 2025 meeting minutes

Daveed Mandell moved approval of the November 20, 2025, meeting minutes with amendments. Hillary Brown seconded the motion.

- Motion passes with eleven (11) in favor, zero (0) against, and zero (0) abstentions

4. Title VI – Triennial Program

Sabrina Batiste presented on the agenda item with the full presentation included in the BATF December 2025 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Hillary Brown appreciated the presentation and expressed interest in seeing greater racial diversity represented within the BATF Advisory Committee.
- Sam Buman thanked Sabrina Batiste for the presentation.

- Clarence R. Fischer wanted to clarify if all fifty (50) BART stations provide language translation in Spanish and Traditional Chinese at the Clipper Card ticket fare machines and wanted clarification on whether this feature will also be available at the new BART stations being built in San Jose.
- Clarence R. Fischer requested confirmation that BART's Title VI Complaint Form includes both an email address and a phone number for contact.
- Herb Hasting appreciated the presentation and found it informative.

Esther Waltz observed that Spanish and Traditional Chinese are the two primary languages provided and asked whether additional languages, such as Hindi or Arabic, are available.

Aleta Dupree thanked Sabrina Batiste for the presentation and noted that Title VI can be complicated. She asked who qualifies for the process and sought clarification on its meaning. Aleta also expressed concern about potentially being denied elevator access because she does not appear to have a disability.

5. Next Generation Faregate Reliability and Access

Next Generation Faregate Reliability and Access to be rescheduled at a future BATF meeting.

6. Implementation of New Brown Act Rules Requirements for Advisory Bodies Under SB 707 (Effective January 01, 2026)

Byron Toma presented on the agenda item with the full presentation included in the BATF December 2025 agenda packet.

The BATF committee discussed the item. A few comments, concerns, and suggestions were provided:

- Roland Wong thanked Byron Toma for the Brown Act update and asked whether an in-person quorum will be required starting January 1, 2026, or if members attending via Zoom will count towards the quorum.
- Roland Wong asked whether travel reimbursements would be honored for the appointed BATF members participating remotely.
- Sam Buman noted that, in the past, attendees of public meetings were required to disclose their addresses publicly.
- Daveed Mandell asked when the BART Board of Directors will vote on allowing a fully remote option for the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) Advisory Committee.

- Roland Wong noted that there had been discussion about whether BATF should follow the Brown Act, requiring the BART Board of Directors to appoint its members, or not follow the Brown Act, allowing appointments without Board involvement. He stated that BATF members wish to continue having the BART Board of Directors appoint its members.
- Elena Van Loo confirmed with Anita Ortega that you can continue to attend BATF meetings either by calling or accessing the BATF meeting via Zoom with the access code that is provided.
- Hillary Brown mentioned that other committees that she is part of also does full remote meetings.
- Clarence R. Fischer had three questions:
 - Whether an agenda item could be added as an “action” item to approve full remote meetings and provide an update from the BART Board of Directors.
 - Whether a subcommittee is permitted to hold fully remote meetings.
 - What happens if a member lacks sufficient technology, such as a video camera, given the discussion that members must be visible during Zoom meetings?
- Joshua Saunders supports going full remote.
- Herb Hastings noted that if BATF meetings transition to a fully remote format, the “Just Cause” requirement would no longer apply. He supports fully remote meetings.

Dr. Raburn stated that the Service Review Advisory Committee (SRAC) was previously appointed by a BART Board Director and operated under the Brown Act. He noted that SRAC has since been renamed to East Bay Paratransit Rider Advisory Committee (EBPAC), which does not fall under the Brown Act and therefore does not require appointment by a BART Board Director.

Jerry Grace asked whether attendees are required to have a functioning camera when participating in BATF meetings.

Aleta Dupree found the presentation informative. She expressed concern that keeping the camera on at all times may limit her flexibility in her own household. Aleta voiced support for fully remote meetings to promote inclusivity.

Elena Van Loo asked to confirm that “Just Cause” no longer applies due to appointed BATF members can either attend in-person meetings or remotely.

7. Member Announcements

Sam Buman reported that a sidewalk ramp near 9th and Franklin in Oakland is not compliant with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). He acknowledged that this issue falls under the City of Oakland's responsibility, not BART's

Danny Kodmur requested BART's Customer Service email address.

8. Staff Announcements

Elena Van Loo shared three announcements:

1. Meet & Greet event is scheduled for January 22, 2026, at the BART Headquarters from 3:00 pm – 4:30 pm.
2. Effective January 01, 2026, Travel reimbursements to increase to \$17.74 from \$16.70 if attending in-person BATF meetings. She mentioned that travel reimbursements will not be honored if participating through Zoom but will receive travel reimbursements if attending in-person.
3. Contra Costa Transportation Authority (CCTA) is recruiting members for its Accessible Advisory Committee.

Ryan Greene-Roesel stated that BART staff had planned to include an agenda item at today's meeting to provide an update on efforts to improve the reliability of accessible faregates, acknowledging ongoing challenges across the BART system, but needed to reschedule due to the presenting staff person's illness.

Ryan Green-Roesel shared that the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is recruiting members for the Regional Network Management Customer Advisory Group, which focuses on regional transit policy and implementation.

9. Chairperson announcements

Herb Hastings shared that he visited the Concord BART station to test the accessible faregate sensors. He also noted that testing of the Clipper Card 2.0 has been concluded.

10. Future agenda items – member suggests topics

- Wayfinding
 - Introduction to the Visual Interpretation app for smartphones
- Tactiles within all BART stations
 - Updates

- Consistency across all BART stations
- Update to New Brown Act Rules to advisory committees
 - Update on BART Board action to authorize the BATF to adopt a full remote meeting policy on or after January 01, 2026.
 - BATF action to adopt a full remote meeting policy.

11. Adjournment

Herb Hastings moved to adjourn the December 18, 2025, meeting. Sam Buman seconded the motion. The meeting adjourned at 4:00 pm until the next regularly scheduled meeting, Thursday, January 22, 2026.