



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)  
Earthquake Safety Program**

**Citizens' Oversight Committee Meeting Minutes**

**Wednesday, March 11, 2020, 4:30 pm**

**Conference Room 1700, Kaiser Center Tower, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
300 Lakeside Drive, Oakland CA 94612**

<b>Meeting Number</b>	<b>Meeting Date</b>	<b>Meeting Time</b>
Term 7, Meeting 4	March 11, 2020	4:33 pm – 5:15 pm
Attendees	<i>Current Members</i> <b>Derek Schaible, chair</b> <b>Karen Varnado, vice chair</b> <b>Eric Tandy</b> <b>Clinton Loftman (via phone)</b>	<i>BART Representatives</i> Zecharias “Zach” Amare Jose “Ramiro” Salazar Chuck Bernardo Carl Holmes Tracy Johnson Robert Raburn Micaela Mazzini  <i>Member of Public</i> None
	<i>Alternate Members</i> <b>Tom Horton</b> <b>Ken Mark</b>	
<b>Agenda Item</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	
A. Welcome, Introductions, and Roll Call	Meeting called to order 4:40 pm on March 11, 2020.  M. Mazzini took roll call, noted members in attendance, and confirmed there was a quorum of 3 members.  M. Mazzini acknowledged the following BART representatives in attendance: Capital Projects Group Manager Zecharias “Zach” Amare; Senior Attorney Jose “Ramiro” Salazar (OGC); Chuck Bernardo (ESP); Tracy Johnson (D&C); Robert Raburn (BART Director); and introduced herself, The Allen Group (On-Call Community Relations).	
B. Project Update	Z. Amare, Capital Projects Group Manager, introduced the agenda items, including the project update and work progress, financial report and schedule, and a presentation regarding a scope of work reduction on the Transbay Tube (TBT) project.  As part of the Project Update, C. Bernardo provided an overview of the program’s progress since the last meeting, noting the completed, current, and upcoming activities, with photos representing construction activity. Below is a summary of the report: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• One project, A-Line Stations: Fruitvale and Coliseum, has been completed since the last COC meeting.</li> <li>• There is one contract remaining:</li> </ul>	



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)  
Earthquake Safety Program**

	<p align="center">- TBT Retrofit</p> <p><u>A-Line Stations: Fruitvale and Coliseum</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All major work has been completed.</li> <li>• Some punchlist items remain.</li> </ul> <p><u>TBT Retrofit</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Due to the Security Sensitive Information (SSI) nature of the project, details are limited and omitted per BART Attorney from COC Meeting Minutes</b></li> </ul> <p>C. Bernardo gave a presentation on the work that is being done in the TBT. He shared updates regarding the status of steel retrofits of the TBT including gallery and bore plate delivery and installation, and work to install a pumping system. Fabrication of steel plates had been delayed by more than a month due to the coronavirus pandemic, while the Chinese-based factory was shut down; however, remobilization is in progress. Work to install a pumping system and the related electrical work to support the pump stations continues. In-Service Track Testing work is nearly complete. C. Bernardo showed photos and explained the invert track testing work, including hardware and software used to monitor rail displacement and the data sets that were created. C. Bernardo described work sequencing, and details about the pilot cuts, demolition and other elements of the work. The final stages of prototype testing are expected to be completed in late March. T. Johnson asked if the results were as expected, and C. Bernardo confirmed that the test confirmed that design assumptions were valid.</p> <p>C. Bernardo gave an update on the Operator Training for the Maintenance Vehicle Consist (MVC) train. BART has been training operators to use the equipment, and currently 22 operators have been trained and nine are certified to operate the MVC train—a sufficient number to start work in the bore. A lot of work on the 800-foot work train continues (including testing and training to operate and maneuver the equipment in the workspace).</p> <p>C. Bernardo reviewed the status of Contract Change Orders issued, in progress, and protested.</p>
<p>D. Schedule and Financial Report</p>	<p>Z. Amare provided an overview of the Program’s schedule and finances, noting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The final tranche was issued and sold by BART to complete all \$980 million in 2004 Measure AA bond funds.</li> <li>• The ESP Program has spent \$854,690,376 from inception through January 2020.</li> </ul>



**San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART)  
Earthquake Safety Program**

<p>Special presentation on TBT Contract De-scoping</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Average monthly costs are \$6,615,055.</li> <li>• <b>Due to the Security Sensitive Information (SSI) nature of the project, details are limited and omitted per BART Attorney from COC Meeting Minutes</b></li> </ul> <p>Z. Amare led a lengthy presentation and discussion on the potential for de-scoping of the TBT project.</p> <p>Old modeling from the 1990's was based on limited data, resulting in broad assumptions of seismic demand on the structure and "over-engineering". More recent data and improved methodologies as well as the latest Peer Reviews and newest hazard assessments support the determination that the less retrofits on the TBT are needed. The current work on the TBT is expected to be reduced to focus only on specific areas in the TBT and its pumping systems. These changes will shorten the contract duration and result in cost savings to the District.</p> <p>Further evaluations will confirm the full extent of the reduction in scope.</p> <p>BART is in negotiations with the contractor to determine the course of de-scoping.</p>
<p>Review of Administrative Matters</p>	<p>D. Schaible reviewed the following administrative matter:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The November 20, 2019 meeting minutes were distributed at the meeting, and it was agreed that they would be approved at the next meeting.</li> </ul>
<p>Next Meeting</p>	<p>After review of COC member calendars, committee members voted to hold the next COC meeting on Wednesday, June 17, 2020.</p> <p>The Committee requested that the following agenda item be included in the next meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An update on the financial status of the ESP Program.</li> </ul>
<p>Public Comments</p>	<p>There were no members of the public present.</p>
<p>Adjournment</p>	<p>Motion to call meeting to adjourned was made by Chair D. Schaible at 6:16 p.m.; seconded by K. Varnardo; passed unanimously.</p>