Quarterly Service Performance Review
First Quarter, FY 2017
July - September, 2016

Engineering & Operations Committee
November 17, 2016
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PERFORMANCE INDICATORS</th>
<th>CURRENT QUARTER ACTUALS</th>
<th>PRIOR QTR ACTUALS</th>
<th>YEAR TO DATE ACTUALS</th>
<th>LEGEND:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ACTUAL</td>
<td>STANDARD</td>
<td>STATUS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Ridership - Weekday</td>
<td>432,002</td>
<td>447,264</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer on Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peak</td>
<td>90.00%</td>
<td>95.00%</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily</td>
<td>91.97%</td>
<td>95.00%</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trains on Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peak</td>
<td>85.84%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily</td>
<td>88.24%</td>
<td>92.00%</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peak Period Transbay Car Throughput</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AM Peak</td>
<td>98.71%</td>
<td>97.50%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM Peak</td>
<td>99.72%</td>
<td>97.50%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Car Availability at 4 AM (0400)</td>
<td>596</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean Time Between Service Delays</td>
<td>5,179</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elevators in Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Station</td>
<td>98.50%</td>
<td>98.00%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garage</td>
<td>97.60%</td>
<td>98.00%</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escalators in Service</td>
<td>91.40%</td>
<td>95.00%</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Platform</td>
<td>96.67%</td>
<td>96.00%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automatic Fare Collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gates</td>
<td>99.12%</td>
<td>99.00%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vendors</td>
<td>95.92%</td>
<td>95.00%</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wayside Train Control System</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Control System</td>
<td>0.029</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traction Power</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Track</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment Outside Stations</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment Inside Stations</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Station Vandalism</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>3.19</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Station Services</td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train P.A. Announcements</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train Exterior Appearance</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train Interior Appearance</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train Temperature</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Complaints</td>
<td>7.41</td>
<td>5.07</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Station Incidents/Million Patrons</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>5.50</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vehicle Incidents/Million Patrons</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost Time Injuries/Ilnesses/Per OSHA</td>
<td>8.48</td>
<td>7.50</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSHA-Recordable Injuries/Ilnesses/Per OSHA</td>
<td>12.72</td>
<td>13.30</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unscheduled Door Openings/Million Car Miles</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.300</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rule Violations Summary/Million Car Miles</td>
<td>0.330</td>
<td>0.500</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BART Police Presence</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Life per million riders</td>
<td>29.08</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crimes Against Persons per million riders</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Auto Theft and Burglaries per 1,000 parking spaces</td>
<td>5.72</td>
<td>8.00</td>
<td>MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Response Time per Emergency Incident (Minutes)</td>
<td>6.43</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bike Thefts (Quarterly Total and YTD Quarterly Average)</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>150.00</td>
<td>NOT MET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>LEGEND:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal met</td>
<td>green</td>
<td>Goal not met but within 5%</td>
<td>yellow</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal not met by more than 5%</td>
<td>red</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FY17 First Quarter Overview…

- Six years of ridership growth came to an end, revenue loss requires expenditure reductions.
- Weekday ridership down slightly (-0.5%), weekends down more significantly (-4.3% and -6.2%).
- On-time performance down roughly 1%.
- Reliability: Car Computer Control System, Traction Power, Transportation met; Train Control and Track not met.
- Availability: Gates, Vendors, Station Elevators, Platform Escalators and Cars met; Street Escalators and Parking Garage Elevators not met.
- Passenger Environment: four Station indicators worse and goal not met; four Train indicators improved but goal not met.
- Customer complaints up.
Customer Ridership

†Total ridership decreased by 1.3% compared to same quarter last year
†Average weekday ridership (432,002) down 0.5% from same quarter last year
†Core weekday ridership down by 0.4% from same quarter last year
†SFO Extension weekday ridership down by 1.3% from same quarter last year
†Saturday and Sunday down by 4.3% and 6.2%, respectively, over same quarter last year
†Overall, ridership 6% below budget
On-Time Service - Customer

✓ 91.97%, 95.00% goal not met; down 0.77%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Destination</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Cause</th>
<th>Equipment/Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12-Aug-16</td>
<td>0416</td>
<td>N-B/S-B</td>
<td>B.Park I-Lock</td>
<td>Ground Wire Touching 3rd-Rail Causing Sparks/Smoke) (MUX Equipment Impaired/Fuses Kept Blowing Every Time They Were Replaced) (Service Truncated)</td>
<td>EQUIP 497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-Sep-16</td>
<td>0538</td>
<td>Northbound</td>
<td>Balboa Park</td>
<td>MUX (Shorted Circuit) (False Occupancy)(0538-1853) Required) (Manual Operation Required) (Multiple Cranks in Place/Renewal Project/Ref.: 0405)</td>
<td>EQUIP 86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-Aug-16</td>
<td>0722</td>
<td>N-B/S-B</td>
<td>Fruitvale</td>
<td>PG&amp;E Power Outage (480 V AC)(0722-1316) (MUX Equipment Impaired/Loss of Speed Codes &amp; Routing) (Congestion in the Oakland Wye/Also Ref.: 0513)</td>
<td>PG&amp;E 72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-Aug-16</td>
<td>0513</td>
<td>Southbound</td>
<td>E.C.D. Norte</td>
<td>MUX (Flashing) (Multiple False Occupancies)(0614-2311) (Manual Operation Required) (Lightning Arrester/Shorting Condition)</td>
<td>EQUIP 62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-Aug-16</td>
<td>1628</td>
<td>S-B/N-B</td>
<td>K &amp; A Lines</td>
<td>PG&amp;E Power (Loss of 3rd-Rail Power)(1628-1903) (MUX Equipment Impaired/Speed Restriction Required)</td>
<td>PG&amp;E 53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23-Aug-16</td>
<td>1332</td>
<td>N-B/S-B</td>
<td>W. Oakland</td>
<td>BPD Hold (Vandalism Suspect)(1332-1506) (Patrons Striking Car &amp; Station Windows With Golf Club) (Two Trains Ran Through)</td>
<td>PEOPLE 52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
88.24%, 92% goal not met; down 1.19%

Late trains by category:

1. Misc.(other)(patron loading, passenger transfer, congestion, multi-cause delay, person on trackway, weather) 1,299 late trains 26.6%
2. Police 776 late trains 15.9%
3. Train Control 602 late trains 12.3%
4. Wayside Maintenance Work 418 late trains 8.6%
5. Revenue Vehicle 394 late trains 8.1%
6. Vandalism 226 late trains 4.6%
7. Sick Passenger 224 late trains 4.6%
8. Operations 201 late trains 4.1%

51.7% of all late trains attributable to non-BART equipment/personnel causes
Wayside Train Control System

Includes False Occupancy & Routing, Delays Per 100 Train Runs

- Goal not met – Actual 1.08/ Goal 1.00
  - Improvement Over Same Quarter Last Year (1.68): 0.60
  - Improvement Over Last Quarter (1.11): 0.03
  - Two Major Delay Events:
    - August 26 at 0513 Hours, 62 Trains Delayed – R50 A Mux flashing false occupancies from shorted arrestor; no access to aerial until Blanket.
    - September 19, 0538 Hours, 86 Trains Delayed – M80 D Mux flashing false occupancies from debris in Mux box; no access to aerial until Blanket.
- Continuing progress in challenging/critical area
Computer Control System

Includes ICS computer & SORS, Delays per 100 train runs

Goal met
Traction Power

Includes Coverboards, Insulators, Third Rail Trips, Substations, Delays Per 100 Train Runs

- Goal met
- Initiated Quarterly 3rd Rail Inspections (all lines)
- Traction power distribution system “at risk” pending delivery of bond projects
Transportation

Includes Late Dispatches, Controller-Train Operator-Tower Procedures and Other Operational Delays Per 100 Train Runs

Delay Trains per 100 Train Trips

- July: 0.43; goal met and improved performance
✓ Goal not met
✓ One major delay event:
  - 8/12/2016 in preparation for M85 weekend outage ground cable was loosened and not properly secured. It made contact with 3rd rail, shorted wayside mux fuses, resulted in manual operation all day, delayed 497 trains
Car Equipment - Reliability

Mean Time Between Service Delays (Hours)

July Aug Sept Oct Nov Dec Jan Feb Mar April May June July Aug Sept

Results
Goal

✓ Goal met – MTBSD 5,179 hours
Car Equipment - Availability @ 0400 hours

- Goal met – 596 Actual vs. 579 Required
- Shops are delivering on higher car availability as resourced in last year’s budget; mild weather helps
- Able to make unplanned addition to car requirements – all Green Line trains now scheduled as 10 car trains
Goal met, 98.5%

Floor and door replacement projects on schedule to be completed by April 2017
Goal not met – Actual 97.6% / Goal 98% but improved performance
Pleasant Hill Garage Elevators continue to be problematic - Project to upgrade control electronics expected to begin in August 2017
Escalator Availability - Street

- Goal not met - Actual 91.4% / Goal 95%
- Significant 4.6% improvement over last quarter
- Beginning to see the benefit of a dedicated crew in downtown SF
Goal exceeded – 96.67%, improved performance

Several major planned & scheduled jobs initiated to improve reliability
Goal exceeded - 99.12
Asset Refresh in full swing - A, L & R lines complete
Reboot times increased, Station Agent training in progress
✓ Goal exceeded, 95.92%
✓ Asset Refresh complete on A, L & R lines
Environment - Outside Stations

Composite rating of:
- Walkways & Entry Plaza Cleanliness (50%) 2.60
- BART Parking Lot Cleanliness (25%) 2.96
- Appearance of BART Landscaping (25%) 2.66

- Goal not met
- Cleanliness ratings of either Excellent or Good:
  - Walkways/Entry Plazas: 58.5%
  - Parking Lots: 75.5%
  - Landscaping Appearance: 62.0%

Ratings guide:
- 4 = Excellent
- 3 = Good
- 2.80 = Goal
- 2 = Only Fair
- 1 = Poor
Environment - Inside Stations

Ratings guide:
4 = Excellent
3 = Good
3.00 = Goal
2 = Only Fair
1 = Poor

Goal not met

Cleanliness ratings of either Excellent or Good:
- Station Platform: 70.0%
- Other Station Areas: 58.9%
- Restrooms: 38.9%
- Elevators: 49.3%

Composite rating for Cleanliness of:
- Station Platform (60%) 2.81
- Other Station Areas (20%) 2.60
- Restrooms (10%) 2.17
- Elevator Cleanliness (10%) 2.37
Station Vandalism

Goal

- Goal not met

76.3% of those surveyed ranked this category as either Excellent or Good
Station Services

Ratings guide:
4 = Excellent
3.06 = Goal
3 = Good
2 = Only Fair
1 = Poor

Composite rating of:
Station Agent Availability (65%) 2.88
Brochures Availability (35%) 3.00

Goal not met
Availability ratings of either Excellent or Good:
Station Agents: 73.5%  Brochures: 78.2%
Train P.A. Announcements

Goal not met

Announcement ratings of either Excellent or Good:
- Arrivals: 77.9%
- Transfers: 75.8%
- Destinations: 83.7%

Composite rating of:
- P.A. Arrival Announcements (33%) 3.06
- P.A. Transfer Announcements (33%) 3.01
- P.A. Destination Announcements (33%) 3.19

Ratings guide:
- 4 = Excellent
- 3.17 = Goal
- 3 = Good
- 2 = Only Fair
- 1 = Poor
✓ Train Exterior Appearance

✓ Goal not met
✓ 74.4% of those surveyed ranked this category as either Excellent or Good
Train Interior Cleanliness

Composite rating of:
- Train interior cleanliness (60%)  2.70
- Train interior kept free of graffiti (40%)  3.33

- Goal not met
- Train Interior ratings of either Excellent or Good:
  - Cleanliness:  63.8%  Graffiti-free:  91.3%
Train Temperature

Goal: Comfortable Temperature Onboard Train

Goal not met

82.1% of those surveyed ranked this category as either Excellent or Good
Total complaints lodged this period increased 270 (12.8%) from last quarter, up 504 (26.9%) when compared with the first quarter FY16.

Complaints saw increase in the areas of AFC, M&E, Parking, Passenger Information, Police Services, Policies, Station Cleanliness, Train Cleanliness and Trains.

Decreases occur in Announcements, Personnel and Service. No changes was reflected in complaints about the Bicycle Program.

“Compliments” dropped to 116, down from 139 (one year ago these numbered 140)
Patron Safety:
Station Incidents per Million Patrons

Goal met
Patron Safety
Vehicle Incidents per Million Patrons

✓ Goal met
Employee Safety:
Lost Time Injuries/Illnesses per OSHA Incidence Rate

- Goal not met
- Sprains and strains are the most common reported injury
- ~70% of employees reporting injuries have reported injuries previously
Employee Safety:
OSHA-Recordable Injuries/Illnesses per OSHA Incidence Rate

Goal met
Operating Safety:
Unscheduled Door Openings per Million Car Miles

✓ Goal met – No Incidents for this quarter
Operating Safety:
Rule Violations per Million Car Miles

- Goal met
Composite Rating of Adequate BART Police Presence in:
- Stations (33%) 2.23
- Parking Lots and Garages (33%) 2.38
- Trains (33%) 2.24

✓ Goal not met
✓ Adequate Presence ratings of either Excellent or Good:
  - Stations: 41.4%
  - Parking Lots/Garages: 48.1%
  - Trains: 41.4%
Quality of Life incidents are down from the last quarter, and down from the corresponding quarter of the prior fiscal year.

*Quality of Life Violations include: Disturbing the Peace, Vagrancy, Public Urination, Fare Evasion, Loud Music/Radios, Smoking, Eating/Drinking and Expectoration
Goal not met

Crimes against persons are down from the last quarter, and up from the corresponding quarter of the prior fiscal year.
Auto Theft and Burglary

Goal met

The number of incidents per thousand parking spaces are down from last quarter, and down from the corresponding quarter from the prior fiscal year.
Average Emergency Response Time

The Average Emergency Response Time goal was not met for the quarter.
Bike Theft

Goal not met

163 bike thefts for current quarter, up 4 from last quarter and up from the corresponding quarter of the prior fiscal year.

* The penal code for grand theft value changed in 2011. The software was updated, which resulted in a change of bicycle theft statistics effective FY12-Q3.