

## Appendix I: Corrective Action Plan Excerpt

Action Office: Customer Service

- Provide telephone interpretation for basic transit questions and trip planning assistance in different languages. Use the Language Line for additional languages.
- Survey BART staff to determine existing multilingual resources.

Action Office: Government and Community Relations and Office of Civil Rights

- Place foreign-language information and notices in publications serving LEP populations to demonstrate BART's commitment to full information; to share current significant, service-related announcements; to increase comfort levels regarding access to information in a native language.
- Provide information to LEP populations of the available services in the language assistance plan that is free of charge.
- Notice of availability of language assistance.

### Inclusive Public Participation Plan

Responsible Office: Government and Community Relations and Office of Civil Rights

**3. Establish an Inclusive Public Participation Plan:** The District commits to developing a customized public participation program in order to offer early and continuous opportunities for the public to be involved in the identification of social, economic and environmental impacts of transportation decisions. The District's Plan will identify low-income, minority and LEP populations within the District's service area relative to specific transportation decisions and will identify population appropriate strategies to be utilized to engage such populations and to seek their input on specific decisions. Our inclusive public participation process will be constantly improving and expanding to include contacts with community-based organizations and networks that can reach the minority, low-income and LEP populations.

Government and Community Relations and the Office of Civil Rights will work with District staff going forward to ensure that inclusive public participation is included in transportation decisions during the planning and programming stages of projects and any fare change or major service change.

Government and Community Relations will tailor the District's Public Participation Plan for a specific action, and solicit public participation during staff planning phases. The elements listed below constitute a draft of the District's Inclusive Public Participation Plan. It includes some effective best practices already used in BART outreach and has also incorporated best practices from other transportation agencies. Once the draft BART Public Participation Plan has been circulated and comments received in a series of public engagements, the plan will be redrafted and recirculated before a final plan is completed.

BART has significant relationships already established with community-based organizations that serve low income, minority and LEP populations. Immediately, we will reach out to these organizations and ask to meet to discuss outreach and ask them to help us put together a survey, small meetings and focus groups with the targeted population to give them an opportunity to comment on outreach for BART and suggest improvements. Existing and newly established relationships with LEP community-based organizations will be used during the Factor 3 LEP analysis to assess the importance of BART's programs, activities and or services.

Below is a sample of community-based organizations that BART works with actively:

## Appendix I: Corrective Action Plan Excerpt

- Martin Luther King Jr. Freedom Center in Oakland – The group helped us fashion diversity training exercise for our police officers last year and continues to work with us on Citizens Oversight of the BART Police Department.
- Oakland Chinatown Chamber of Commerce – the group is an active participant with BART and the City of Oakland in a planning study of the Chinatown Area adjacent to our Lake Merritt BART Station.
- Oakland and San Francisco NAACP are working with BART on Citizens Oversight of the BART Police Department.
- Spanish Speaking Unity Council - BART's partner in an award winning transit oriented development project, which was completed in 2005. Currently, BART and the Unity Council are actively working together to complete the project's last phase.
- The Alameda County Office on Education, the SF School District and approximately 15 other school districts partnered with BART this year on our Free Rides for School Field Trips Program sponsored by American Express, which underwrote free BART trips for approximately 15,000 students and chaperones.
- Mission Housing Corporation, Urban Ecology and the Mission Community Council continue to work with BART on the 16th Street Station renovation of West (2003) and East (2006) plazas in San Francisco's Mission District. The plaza renovations required significant community outreach with local neighborhood residents and merchants. The community groups that partnered with BART also played a significant role in helping us to accomplish ethnic and socially sensitive outreach to groups who may otherwise never participate in such a process. The groups helped us to reach non-English speaking, low-income, disabled and homeless groups.
- The Monument Corridor Project in Concord is one of more than 40 youth groups, recreation centers and non-profit organizations that BART has partnered with over the last four years on our Summer Youth Tour Program, which invites 200 K-12 students each summer to ride BART, learn about transportation and take tours of our Central Control Command Center, the BART-SFO airport connecting line and learn what goes on in BART shops.

### Guiding Principles for BART's Inclusive Public Participation Plan:

Public participation is a dynamic activity that requires teamwork and commitment at all levels of the organization.

One size does not fit all – Effective strategies must be tailored to fit the audience – low-income, minority, and LEP populations – on each issue.

Effective public participation is about relationship and trust building.

Engaging interested citizens in transportation issues is challenging. We must approach the low-income, minority, LEP populations at the places where they live and gather and establish relationships with the community-based organizations that interact with them to help us connect.

Outreach to low-income, minority, and LEP populations must be an ongoing process, and our outreach plan must be constantly improved and refined to meet the changing needs of the communities.

Action Office: Operations, Transit Systems Development, Financial Planning, Treasury, Planning, Customer Access, BART Police/Security Programs

- Notify Government and Community Relations and Office of Civil Rights in the planning and programming stages of developing projects that could potentially impact low-income, minority and LEP populations.
- In conjunction with Government and Community Relations and Office of Civil Rights, determine appropriate outreach practices from the menu of outreach strategies as listed on Page 8, which constitute an Interim Inclusive Public Participation Plan for BART. This Interim Plan will be distributed for comment and discussion with low-income, minority and LEP populations from February 22, 2010

## Appendix I: Corrective Action Plan Excerpt

until April 30, 2010 using the outreach components listed below, including language assistance measures. The comments will be reflected in the Interim Inclusive Public Participation Plan that will be completed by May 21, 2010. Upon Completion of the LEP Plan, BART will incorporate the LEP Plan into the District's Final Inclusive Public Participation Plan.

### Action Office: Marketing and Research

- Provide 2000 (or more recent) census tract maps of BART station service areas to identify communities that have higher than average minority populations.
- Provide when available 2000 (or more recent) census tract maps of BART station service areas to identify communities that have higher than average low-income populations.
- Provide information about English Language Learners by School District to identify districts within BART's service area that are likely to have high concentrations of LEP populations.
- Use the 2008 System Profile Study to determine which BART stations have high percentages of minority and low-income passengers.
- Publicize Title VI Policy on the BART website in multiple languages. Upon completion, publicize Inclusive Public Participation Plan on the BART website in multiple languages.

### Action Office: Government and Community Relations

- Identify the low-income, minority and LEP populations relative to the transportation decision for which public participation is sought. Partner with community-based organizations so they may assist BART with conducting outreach to specific low-income, minority and LEP populations. In consultation with community-based organizations, BART will develop appropriate strategies to engage each population and determine the types of outreach most effective for each group. (Currently, BART has relationships with dozens of organizations, which have access to low-income, minority and LEP populations.)
- Identify appropriate outreach methods for each population.
- Where appropriate, schedule and implement public meetings using locations, facilities and times that are convenient and accessible and culturally appropriate.
- Where appropriate, use surveys (verbal or written) at appropriate locations (on-system, off-system), using community-based organization staff to lead, facilitate, translate or administer as appropriate.
- Public participation will commence during staff planning and programming phases.
- Create databases of community-based organizations and networks that have access to minority, low-income and LEP populations, and constantly refine and add additional elements.
- Provide multi-language invitation tools as needed. Make qualified interpreters available and outreach materials available in appropriate language.
- Accept oral comments. Incorporate comments from the public for further consideration by BART decision makers.
- Compile an Interim Inclusive Public Participation Plan based upon aforementioned public outreach.
- Finalize Inclusive Public Participation Plan by incorporating LEP analysis from final LEP Plan, conducting outreach to LEP populations to seek input, and revising based on experience with Interim Inclusive Public Participation Process.
- Upon completion, publicize BART's Final Inclusive Public Participation Plan in the community in multiple languages.

### Action Office: Media and Public Affairs

- Prepare in advance of public meetings, news media announcements in which communications are tailored to the news media that serves the particular communities or populations.

### Action Office: Customer Service

## Appendix I: Corrective Action Plan Excerpt

- Develop a standard to identify BART employees who accurately speak or write another language including sign language to accommodate members of the LEP population.
- Provide Language Line services access to BART employees who regularly provide information to the public (including the BART Police).
- Meeting notices shall include BART Telephone Interpreter telephone number to provide access to LEP participants.

Action Office: Government and Community Relations and Office of Civil Rights

- Publicize in the BART system in multiple languages the Title VI Notice to Beneficiaries of Protections under Title VI.
- Seek feedback from the low-income, minority and LEP populations including customer and community-based organizations about the effectiveness and inclusiveness of the District’s Inclusive Public Participation Plan.

Deliverables to FTA: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• District’s Interim Inclusive Public Participation Plan.</li> <li>• Upon Completion of the LEP Plan, BART will incorporate the LEP Plan into the District’s Final Inclusive Public Participation Plan.</li> </ul>	To FTA: May 21, 2010 May 23, 2011
--	---

<b>“Major Service Change” Threshold</b>
---

Responsible Office: Operations Planning

4. **Establish a “Major Service Change” Threshold:** In order to comply with FTA Circular 4702.1A, BART will develop, conduct outreach for, and establish a “Major Service Change” threshold.

4.a Draft a new guideline that defines BART’s threshold for what constitutes a “Major Service Change.”

Deliverables to FTA: Preliminary Draft “Major Service Change” Threshold	To FTA: Mar 15, 2010
--	-------------------------

4.b Pursuant to the District’s Inclusive Public Participation Plan (item 3), the District will reach out to low-income, minority and LEP populations and provide them with opportunities to review and provide input on the District’s draft “Major Service Change” threshold. Such an outreach plan would include, but not be limited to the following activities:

- Identify the low-income, minority and LEP populations relative to the transportation decision for which public participation is sought. Partner with community-based organizations so they may assist BART with conducting outreach to specific low-income, minority and LEP populations. In consultation with community-based organizations, BART will develop appropriate strategies to engage each population and determine the types of outreach most effective for each group. (Currently, BART has relationships with dozens of organizations, which have access to low-income, minority and LEP populations.)
- Identify appropriate outreach methods for each population.
- Where appropriate, schedule and implement public meetings using locations, facilities and times that are convenient and accessible and culturally appropriate.
- Where appropriate, use surveys (verbal or written) at appropriate locations (on-system, off-system), using community-based organization staff to lead, facilitate, translate or administer as appropriate.
- Public participation will commence during staff planning and programming phases.
- Create databases of community-based organizations and networks that have access to minority, low-income and LEP populations, and constantly refine and add additional elements.

## Appendix J: Minority and Low Income BART Service Area Census Tracts

### Predominantly Minority or Low-Income BART Service Area Census Tracts

The BART service area used in these analyses was the four-county region that BART serves: Alameda, Contra Costa, San Francisco and San Mateo counties. This is the same service area used in BART's Inclusive Public Participation Plan.

The following process was followed to identify census tracts in the BART service area that are predominantly minority or low-income tracts.

1. Using the 2000 Census data, the percent of minority population for the BART service area as defined above was estimated to be 52.7 percent.
2. Next, using the 2000 Census data, the percent of minorities for each census tract within the BART service area was estimated. If the percent of minorities in any single census tract was found to be greater than the four-county percentage of 52.7 percent, then that census tract was flagged as predominantly minority.
3. Using 2000 Census data, the percent of the population that is low-income within the BART service area was determined to be 21.6 percent. Low-income was defined as under 200 percent of the federal poverty level<sup>10</sup>. The 200 percent threshold was used to account for the high cost of living in the Bay Area compared to the rest of the country and therefore is a more inclusive definition of low-income populations. The 200 percent threshold is also consistent with the assumptions employed by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission in its February 2009 *Equity Analysis Report*.
4. Next, using the 2000 Census data, the percent of low-income population was determined for each tract. If that value for any single census tract was found to be higher than the service area percentage of 21.6 percent, then that tract was mapped as a predominantly low-income tract.

The results of this process indicate the following for the 819 census tracts that comprise the four-county BART service area, as mapped in Figure 1 and Figure 2:

#### ***Minority Population Tracts***

	<b>Service Area Census Tracts</b>	<b>% of Tracts</b>
<b>Minority Tract:</b> a tract is counted as predominantly minority if more than 52.7% of that tract's population is minority	<b>383</b>	<b>47%</b>
<b>Non-Minority Tract</b>	<b>436</b>	<b>53%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>819</b>	<b>100%</b>

#### ***Low-income Population Tracts***

	<b>Service Area Census Tracts</b>	<b>% of Tracts</b>
<b>Low-income Tract:</b> a tract is counted as predominantly low-income if more than 21.6% of the tract's households have incomes under 200% of federal poverty level	<b>327</b>	<b>40%</b>
<b>Non-Low-income Tract</b>	<b>492</b>	<b>60%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>819</b>	<b>100%</b>

<sup>10</sup> As a reference, for a single person household, 200% of the federal poverty level in 2008 was \$21,982. For a two adult, two child household, the 200% threshold was \$43,668. (Note that the data mapped are based on 2000 Census data as these are the only such data available at the tract level.)

## Appendix K: PPP Process – Topics of Ongoing Interest

### *Topics of Ongoing Interest to Community Members*

The following topics were raised at almost every community meeting held to develop the PPP. Regardless of the meeting agenda, BART is likely to continue to receive comments or questions about these topics. Given this high level of interest, BART staff and Directors should regularly provide information about these topics at all public participation methods.

#### **BART Employment and Job Opportunities**

Community members expressed interest in regular updates on potential employment opportunities with BART. Their interest included potential job opportunities with BART and with businesses that have been awarded contracts with BART for construction and professional services. Some participants were aware that many contracts were funded with federal monies and were subject to the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) requirements set forth in 49 CFR Part 26. Community members also expressed interest in being kept informed about internships and career development opportunities for youth and young adults. BART staff should be prepared to provide regular updates or have information available on this topic at public participation methods. For example, a hand-out translated into several languages could be provided that describes where community members can get this information online, by phone or in-person.

#### **Discounted Fares for Seniors, Youth and Educational Groups**

While BART has established programs to provide discounted fares to seniors, youth and educational groups, many community members do not know how to receive these discounts. BART should routinely remind community members of the availability of fare discounts and provide specific directions on how they can be received.

Along with the consideration of these factors, the public participation strategy for the geographic region will include community recommended methods drawn from the menu of public participation methods described in the following section.



## BART Public Participation Survey

BART will be organizing meetings to discuss transportation-related topics with local communities. Please complete this survey to help us determine how to make your participation as easy and productive as possible.

**1. How important are each of the following in your decision to attend a meeting to discuss BART-related issues?**

	<i>Very important</i>	<i>Somewhat important</i>	<i>Not important</i>
Topics of interest that affect me directly	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Co-sponsored by a familiar community-based organization	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Childcare provided during the meeting	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Refreshments served	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Convenient time and location of meeting	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Translation services available	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

**1a. Any other ways to make it easier for you to attend?**

Description \_\_\_\_\_

**2. When would you prefer to attend a meeting? (select only one)**

- During business hours (8:00 am to 5:00 pm)
- Evenings (6:00 pm to 9:00 pm)
- Weekends

**3. What is the best way to notify you about an upcoming meeting or event? (select only one)**

- Email notice
- Postcard or letter in mail
- Ad in newspaper (name of newspaper: \_\_\_\_\_)
- BART's website
- Announcement from community group (religious, political, etc.)
- Telephone
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

## Appendix L: Sample PPP Development Process Survey

**4. Which of the following methods would help you express your views on specific issues at meetings? (select one or more)**

- Translated written material in my preferred language
- Translator at the meeting

-----

- Large group discussion
- Small group discussion
- One-on-one discussion

-----

- Electronic voting
- Voting by questionnaire (written survey)
- Show-of-hands voting

-----

- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**5. What are the best ways to present detailed material to you for a meeting? (select one or more)**

- Information online for review before meeting
- Online video to watch before meeting
- Live presentation at meeting
- Tabletop display to look at before/during meeting
- Printed material to look at before/during meeting
- Map, chart or other visual aids at meeting
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**6. In addition to a meeting, how likely would you be to use the following to express your views on BART-related issues?**

	<i>Very likely</i>	<i>Somewhat likely</i>	<i>Not likely</i>
Online survey	○	○	○
Online discussion board	○	○	○
Submit comments by email	○	○	○
Mail-back survey	○	○	○
Participate in focus group	○	○	○
Write letter	○	○	○
Phone comment message line	○	○	○

**6a. Any other suggestions to help you express your views?**

Describe: \_\_\_\_\_

**7. BART would like to keep you informed of how your comments influence our decisions. What is the best way to inform you of BART's actions after meetings? (select only one)**

- Email
- Regular mail



## Appendix L: Sample PPP Development Process Survey

- BART website
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

--A final few questions about yourself--

**8. What type(s), if any, of community-based organizations do you participate in?**  
(select one or more)

- Religious
- Political
- Environmental
- Urban/regional planning
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**9. How often, if at all, do you usually ride BART? (select only one)**

- Never
- Less than once a month
- 1 – 3 days a month
- 1 – 2 days a week
- 3 days a week or more

**10. What is the total annual income of your household before taxes? (select only one)**

- Under \$25,000
- \$25,000 - \$40,000
- \$41,000 - \$75,000
- Over \$75,000

**11. In which language do you prefer to communicate? (select only one)**

- English
- Spanish
- Chinese
- Korean
- Tagalog
- Russian
- Vietnamese
- Other: \_\_\_\_\_

**12. What is your race or ethnic identification? (select one or more)**

- American Indian or Native
- Asian or Pacific Islander
- Black/African American
- Spanish, Hispanic or Latino
- White

## Appendix L: Sample PPP Development Process Survey

Other: \_\_\_\_\_

### 13. Do you have any additional comments or concerns?

---

---

---

### 14. Your Contact Information

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Mailing address: \_\_\_\_\_

City: \_\_\_\_\_

ZIP: \_\_\_\_\_

Phone: \_\_\_\_\_

Email address: \_\_\_\_\_