Next Generation Fare Gate Vendor Selection

April 2023
Overview

- Vendor Selection Process
- DBE & Diversity
- Fare Gate Features
- West Oakland Pilot
- Deployment Schedule
- Motion
Vendor Selection Process

- Request for Information (RFEI) – Sep 28, 2020
- RFEI Responses – Dec 11, 2020
- Board approved procurement method – Jan 13, 2022
- Request for Proposal (RFP) - May 31, 2022
- Proposals Due – Oct 11, 2022
- Request to reject all Proposals – Dec 1, 2022
- Re-advertise RFP – Dec 2, 2022
- Proposals Due – Jan 10, 2023
- Informational Update to the Board – Mar 23, 2023
- Request to authorize the General Manager to award Contract - Today

Evaluation panel comprised of:
- 9 BART Cross Department Staff
Evaluation

Technical Approach
A. Ability to meet the project goals
B. Extent the proposal meets and/or exceeds the Technical Specification requirements
C. Extent of customization and new development required to meet the Technical Specifications
D. The efficiency of the proposed approach to system integration
E. Modularity and scalability of the solution

Price
A. Lowest Price receives 20 points
B. Others are based on a formula:
\[ 1 - \frac{B - A}{A} \times C = \text{Final Cost Score} \]
where:
- A – the lowest Proposer’s Price
- B – Proposer’s Price being scored
- C – the maximum number of cost points available

Qualifications of the Firm and Proposer’s Team
A. Number of years in business manufacturing gates
B. Strength of experience in fare gate manufacturing, system integration, training and equipment maintenance
C. Strength of experience of the proposed team

Oral Interview
A. Strength of the firm’s understanding of BART’s business needs
B. Degree to which demonstrated features match BART’s business needs
C. Innovative feature available to BART
## Recommendation

### Evaluations Summary and Final Ranking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proposer</th>
<th>Technical Approach</th>
<th>Team Qualifications</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Oral Interviews</th>
<th>Grand Total</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conduent Transport Solutions, Inc.</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>83.25</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cubic Transportation Systems, Inc.</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>77.89</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STraffic America LLC</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>93.21</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Sensors are cutting edge technology.”

“Monitoring tools are modern, slick and easy to use.”

“Flexibility to reconfigure the gates.”

“Gates will be easy to maintain.”

“Test bench is comprehensive and organized.”
Qualification Highlights

• Proposed solution met each BART requirement specifically, without exception
• Fare Gates in service for more than 3.94 billion rides annually (pre-COVID)
• 26 years of experience with sensor technology
• Fully open architecture and modular design
• Extensive integration experience with TR4 and legacy systems
• STraffic has deployed more than 16,000 fare gates
The STraffic DBE & Diversity Team

e² Engineering
Training
• DBE certified training firm specializing in Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS)
• Richard Easley, President: 35+ years experience in 34 states, DC, 22 countries

VST Engineering
Maintenance & Deployment Support, QA/QC Support
• DBE certified firm in the Bay Area
• 30 years collective experience delivering capital projects from conceptual design through implementation

Pride Resource Partners LLC
Contract Compliance, Scheduling, Supervisory Oversight
• Project & construction management organization, headquartered in CA
• Understands complex dynamics of critical infrastructure projects
• LGBT-owned & operated DBE; certified by the National LGBT Chamber of Commerce, Small Business certified by the CA DGS

Partnerships enhance STraffic’s team experience and fulfill BART’s project goals
Community Engagement Commitment

• 2,000 Hours of Internship Opportunities in Partnership with Bay Area Community Based Organizations
Improved Customer Experience: Accessibility

- STraffic has worked extensively with the ADA community and incorporated learnings into fare gate designs.
  - Equipped with top and side-mounted readers
  - Sensor technology for safe access of persons and service animals
  - Aisle lighting, messaging, and color-coding options
Improved Customer Experience: Customer Interface

Six (6) Readers per Aisle Possible

*Conceptual Rendering
Approach to Fare Evasion Management

DETER

- Physical Features
  - Fare Gate Performance

DETECT

- Sensors
  - ✔ Infrared
  - ✔ 3D Sensor

- Audit Registers
  - ✔ Gate Performance Monitoring

RESPOND

- Fare Gate Activation
- Alarms
- Fare Gate Performance
- Reporting

Data Supports Monitoring, Analytics and Ongoing Response

*Conceptual Rendering
Detect - Advanced Sensor Technology

- Infrared
- 3D Sensor
- Camera

Piggybacking
Bicycle
Luggage
Wheelchair (2 persons)
Tailgating
No facial recognition
Respond - Monitoring/Metrics

- Graphical User Interface for point-and-click, real-time control over fare gate.

**Fare Gate Module Status**
*Red - Out of Service*  
*Orange - Door Open*

**Operation and Direction Modes**

**Real Time Fare Gate Operating Status**

**Real Time Fare Evasion Event Log**

**Service Availability for this Fare Gate**
Improved Maintenance: Change Any Component

No Tools Required
- Cabling
- Board Replacement

Modular Design
- Plug and Play Replacement

Self Diagnostic Tools
Improved Troubleshooting—Comprehensive Test Bench
Improved Installation:

- Modular Overhead Bridge Design
- Gate Fits on Existing Footprint

*Conceptual Rendering
Pilot West Oakland

- Single Array
- Geographically Close to Maintenance and Engineering Staff
- Investment in West Oakland
Next Generation Initial Deployment Schedule

Award Project

Install Prototype at West Oakland

Issue Notice to Proceed

Develop Priorities and System Wide Deployment Plan

Project Progress Update to Board of Directors

Project Progress Update to Board of Directors

Deliver Base Contract 8 Stations

Deliver Option 1 15 Stations

Deliver Option 2 15 Stations

Deliver Option 3 Remaining Stations

2023

2024

2025

Deployment Plan – Shoulder to Shoulder

- BART Engineering/Maintenance in Design
- Training BART Maintenance
- Service Agreement for Hybrid Installation
- BART Labor working with Installers

O&M Plan Training Plan

Service Agreements for Installation & Infrastructure Modifications

Update Remaining Stations Deployment Plan
Board Motion

• The Board finds that STraffic America, LLC has submitted the proposal in response to RFP No. 47CJ-230A that is the most advantageous to the District based on the highest evaluation score received (which considers the proposer's technical proposal, price proposal, and other factors).

• To that end, the General Manager is authorized to award Contract No. 47CJ-230A to STraffic America, LLC in the base contract amount of $11,271,900 (including all applicable taxes) for the procurement of Next Generation Fare Gates, upon certification by the Controller-Treasurer that funding is available, pursuant to notification to be issued by the General Manager, and subject to the District's protest procedures and the Federal Transit Administration's requirements related to protests.

• The General Manager is further authorized to exercise any and all options for a total amount not-to-exceed $47,160,000 (base price plus option prices) (including all applicable taxes) upon certification by the Controller-Treasurer that funding is available.
Aileen Hernandez  
Albert Louie  
Albert Schmitt  
Alex Caburnay  
Alex Walker  
Amanda Cruz  
Amanda Palmquist  
Anaïs Mailinge  
Antoin Vo  
Bradley Harris  
Bruce King  
Calvin Yee  
Carlbert Fuertes  
Celestine Do  
Charlie Greer  
Dave Taylor  
David Garcia  
David Pultz  
David Wen  
Donna Lee  
Emily Chou  
Evan Brown  
Fernando Flores  
Harmanjot Singh  
John Yen  
Jonathan Castaneda  
Kenneth Tolbert  
Lacy Vong  
Man Hong Lam  
Markus Ngo  
Michael Hill  
Mitra Moheb  
Molly Golson  
Phaethon Brown  
Priya Mathur  
Qing Liu  
Ray Painter  
Raymond Pascual  
Richard Fuentes  
Rob Jaques  
Robert Day  
Robert Franklin  
Shannon Dodge  
Shelehia Meisner  
Steven Dietrich  
Sunni Gunawardena  
Tony Zielonka  
Weldon Chen  
Wendy Wheeler  

Thank you!