

July 16, 2010



Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Options Public Participation Summary Report

Prepared by MIG, Inc. for
San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District



Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
Key Findings	1
I. Introduction.....	4
II. Summary of Public Participation Results.....	4
Approach for Reviewing Public Participation Results	5
Key Findings	6
III. Process for Soliciting Public Input.....	8
IV. Public Input	13
A. Print Survey Results	13
B. Web Survey Results.....	18
C. Most Frequent Comments on Alternative Uses of Funds	21
D. Additional Suggestions for Alternative Uses for Funds.....	22
E. Comments on Public Participation Process.....	24
V. Next Steps.....	24

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Appendix B: Additional Comments

Appendix C: Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Printed Survey Results

Appendix D: Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Web Survey Results

Executive Summary

For Fiscal Year 2011 (FY11), which began July 1, 2010, BART projects a funding surplus because of a recent court ruling and recent legislation to support public transit that provided BART with about \$26 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funding for use in FY11. BART intends to use a portion of these funds to cover an \$11 million deficit that had been projected for FY11 and to increase reserves by about \$9 million.

BART is also considering using a part of the remaining available balance for programs and/or projects to show the District's appreciation for its customers. One such possible program is to temporarily reduce BART fares. The options under consideration are as follows:

Option A: Temporarily reduce BART fares by 3% for 4 months

Option B: Temporarily reduce BART fares by 5% for 3 months

In June 2010, BART conducted public participation activities that included 18 multi-lingual meetings to collect feedback on these options to report back to the BART Board. Comments regarding the temporary fare reduction options were expressed through five public input methods: print surveys, web surveys, e-mails to BART, comment cards at the meetings, and comments at the meetings recorded on large-scale paper. Findings were developed based on a review and analysis of survey results and comments. Comments were organized into 16 topics and reviewed for frequency of mention by public input method. Community members could provide input via more than one public input method.

Key Findings

The following are the key findings from the public participation activities.

A. Temporary Fare Reduction Options

Findings about the temporary fare reduction options were developed and divided into either quantifiable results or qualitative results, as described in the next sections.

1. Quantifiable Results

Three methods allowed for a basic computation or tallying of results: print surveys, web surveys, and email comments. The results of the print and web surveys were tallied and presented numerically. Comments made through the print and web surveys were put into a separate comments database where they were reviewed and tallied by topic.

Print Survey: Results indicated only 1/3 of the respondents supported either temporary fare reduction option (30% for Option A—49 of 165 respondents—and 31% for Option B—50 of 163 respondents).

Web Survey: Only 11% of respondents (19 of 167) expressed support for temporary fare reduction Option A, and 17% (29 of 167) for Option B.

Comments Made via Print and Web Surveys: Fifty out of 141 comments included on surveys specifically disagreed with the proposal for temporary fare reductions and described the fare savings as inconsequential. The remaining comments focused on alternatives, with suggestions that the funds be re-invested into station cleaning and maintenance, BART reserves, service increases and overall system improvements. There were also general comments about BART. None of the surveys contained comments specifically expressing support for the temporary fare reductions.

Emails to BART: 28 of 60 emails directed to the Board contained specific language indicating a lack of support for the temporary fare reductions. Most of the remaining email comments received expressed enthusiasm about the additional funds received and respectfully suggested that BART direct the funds to make car improvements, fund improved station and car cleanliness, and supplement BART reserves. None of the emails to BART contained statements of support for the temporary fare reductions.

2. Qualitative Results

Two public input methods from community meetings provided qualitative data: wallgraphic recordings of comments made and comment cards submitted at the community meetings.

Regarding wallgraphic comments, this report cites the frequency of mention of topics by meeting, but it is not possible to determine the number of people these opinions represent, due to the nature of these methods. Some comments may represent the opinions of many meeting participants while others may represent the opinion of the one person who made the statement.

Comment cards also should be considered qualitative, since they are designed as an additional input method for those who may not want to vocalize their opinion during the meeting or prefer to provide their comment in writing so that it is recorded exactly as they would like it to be received by BART.

Wallgraphic Comments: At two-thirds of the meetings, comments were received expressing lack of support for the temporary fare reduction options.

Those providing reasons for their lack of support described the temporary fare reductions as insignificant and potentially confusing. Other comments received at the community meetings focused on alternative uses for the funds and general comments about BART.

Comment Cards: Commenters recommended funds be put to uses other than a temporary fare reduction. Other preferred uses included cleaning the train cars and stations, service increases, car improvements, overall system maintenance and improvements, and funding BART reserves. None of the comment cards contained language specifically supporting the temporary fare reductions.

B. Preferred Uses for the Funds

A significant majority of feedback received through all five public input methods took the form of comments that, in lieu of a temporary fare reduction, BART should direct these funds to other uses. This information is qualitative and was volunteered by the commenters; BART did not suggest a specific array of choices for consideration by the public.

The recommended alternative uses for the funding were grouped into 16 different topics shown in Appendix A. The most frequently identified recommendations, in order of mention, were for BART to use the funds to:

- Clean the cars and stations
- Provide service increases and extended hours
- Make car improvements
- Supplement BART reserves
- Conduct overall system maintenance and improvements

I. Introduction

The San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) is made up of Alameda, Contra Costa, and San Francisco Counties and operates a rapid rail system that opened in 1972. BART now travels through 26 cities in the District's three counties as well as San Mateo County. BART's five service lines cover 104 miles, comprising 43 stations, and serve an average weekday ridership of 340,000 passengers. BART provides discounted fares for seniors, persons with disabilities, children ages 5 through 12 years (under age 4 ride free), students attending participating schools and qualified educational groups.

BART is governed by a directly-elected nine-member Board of Directors who serve four-year terms representing Alameda, Contra Costa, and San Francisco counties. While San Mateo County is not within the BART District, it is served by six BART stations, and various BART Board members act as liaisons to the County.

For Fiscal Year 2011 (FY11), which began July 1, 2010, BART projects a funding surplus because of a recent court ruling and recent legislation to support public transit that provided BART with about \$26 million in State Transit Assistance (STA) funding for use in FY11. BART intends to use a portion of these funds to cover an \$11 million deficit that had been projected for FY11 and to increase reserves by about \$9 million.

BART is also considering using a part of the remaining available balance for programs and/or projects to show the District's appreciation for its customers. One such possible program is to temporarily reduce BART fares. The options under consideration are to reduce BART fares by 3% for 4 months or by 5% for 3 months. In June 2010, BART conducted public participation activities to collect feedback on these options to report back to the BART Board. This report describes the process BART used to present the temporary fare reduction options to the public and receive input; reports the comments received; and summarizes the public input received.

II. Summary of Public Participation Results

During June 2010, BART conducted public participation activities to collect community input on two proposed options to provide temporary fare reductions. The options presented to the public were:

- Option A: Temporarily reduce BART fares by 3% for 4 months
- Option B: Temporarily reduce BART fares by 5% for 3 months

The public was invited to provide their comments on the proposed temporary fare reduction options using any of the following five public input methods:

- 1) Participation in multi-lingual community meetings held at 18 different locations throughout BART's service area (participants' verbal comments were recorded on wallgraphic paper);
- 2) Comment cards for participants to record their written comments, distributed at the community meetings;
- 3) Print survey, which included a section for additional comments, distributed at the community meetings;
- 4) Web survey, which included a section for additional comments, hosted on-line at www.bart.gov; and
- 5) Emails or written correspondence sent to BART Board of Directors or staff.

Consistent with BART's Public Participation Plan, which was submitted to the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) in May 2010, the selected methods were designed to be inclusive and responsive to different participation preferences. The multi-lingual community meetings encouraged in-person participation in a person's preferred language and local neighborhood. For those not comfortable commenting verbally at a public meeting or preferring to express their opinion in writing, a comment card was provided. Print surveys were available to collect some quantitative data at the meetings. An on-line survey was made available to those who stayed informed about BART through on-line and social networking sources and/or were not able to attend a meeting. Both versions of the survey included space for general comments. BART regularly encourages residents to provide feedback to their BART Directors, and sixty people chose to share their opinions in this manner.

Approach for Reviewing Public Participation Results

The consulting firm MIG, Inc. assisted BART with recording the meetings, reviewing the public participation results and documenting those results. BART relied on MIG, as a neutral third party, to review and analyze the public participation results recorded from the five sources of public input and develop the key findings outlined in the next section. While community members were asked specifically for their opinions regarding the proposed temporary fare reductions, most people who did not support the reductions volunteered comments for suggested alternate uses of the funds.

Reviewing Input from Survey Data

Print and web survey results were tallied by question. The results are reported later in this document, starting on page 13. Any comments were transcribed and were incorporated into a comments database, included as Appendix A to this report. Those results were summarized by topic and are

described in Section IV, which describes suggested alternate uses for the funds.

Reviewing Input from Public Comments

To facilitate analysis of the qualitative results from comments, as opposed to tallying the results from responses to the printed or web survey as described above, MIG transcribed and sorted the comments received through the five public input methods. MIG reviewed the individual comments and grouped the results into 16 commonly occurring themes or topics. MIG then created a chart noting the frequency of mention by topic and public input method. Given that the input was collected using a variety of methods, it would not be appropriate to tally the comments across the methods. The analysis takes into account the following:

- The result summary chart in Appendix A shows how many times the wallgraphic notes from the meetings represented a particular opinion; it does not indicate how many individual opinions the comment represents.
- Meeting participants satisfied with the discussion and recording of comments made by the group during meetings may not have felt compelled to provide additional comments via comment card or survey.
- Print surveys included a section for respondents to record additional comments—these comments represent the opinion of those attending the community meetings. While a survey was given to each attendee, completion rates for the surveys varied from meeting to meeting.
- Regarding comments recorded via the BART web survey, BART web survey protocols limit one survey response per IP (Internet Protocol) address; however, BART has no other information regarding the source of the web surveys and cannot verify that an individual did not submit multiple surveys.
- Community members could comment using multiple methods.

Key Findings

The following are the key findings from the public participation activities.

A. Temporary Fare Reduction Options

Findings about the temporary fare reduction options were developed and divided into either quantifiable results or qualitative results, as described in the next sections.

1. Quantifiable Results

Three methods allowed for a basic computation or tallying of results: print surveys, web surveys, and email comments. The results of the print and web

surveys were tallied and presented numerically. Comments made through the print and web surveys were put into a separate comments database where they were reviewed and tallied by topic.

Print Survey: Results indicated only 1/3 of the respondents supported either temporary fare reduction option (30% for Option A—49 of 165 respondents—and 31% for Option B—50 of 163 respondents).

Web Survey: Only 11% of respondents (19 of 167) expressed support for temporary fare reduction Option A, and 17% (29 of 167) for Option B.

Comments Made via Print and Web Surveys: Fifty out of 141 comments included on surveys specifically disagreed with the proposal for temporary fare reductions and described the fare savings as inconsequential. The remaining comments focused on alternatives, with suggestions that the funds be re-invested into station cleaning and maintenance, BART reserves, service increases and overall system improvements. There were also general comments about BART. None of the surveys contained comments specifically expressing support for the temporary fare reductions.

Emails to BART: 28 of 60 emails directed to the Board contained specific language indicating a lack of support for the temporary fare reductions. Most of the remaining email comments received expressed enthusiasm about the additional funds received and respectfully suggested that BART direct the funds to make car improvements, fund improved station and car cleanliness, and supplement BART reserves. None of the emails to BART contained statements of support for the temporary fare reductions.

2. Qualitative Results

Two public input methods from community meetings provided qualitative data: wallgraphic recordings of comments made and comment cards submitted at the community meetings.

Regarding wallgraphic comments, this report cites the frequency of mention of topics by meeting, but it is not possible to determine the number of people these opinions represent, due to the nature of these methods. Some comments may represent the opinions of many meeting participants while others may represent the opinion of the one person who made the statement.

Comment cards also should be considered qualitative, since they are designed as an additional input method for those who may not want to vocalize their opinion during the meeting or prefer to provide their comment

in writing so that it is recorded exactly as they would like it to be received by BART.

Wallgraphic Comments: At two-thirds of the meetings, comments were received expressing lack of support for the temporary fare reduction options. Those providing reasons for their lack of support described the temporary fare reductions as insignificant and potentially confusing. Other comments received at the community meetings focused on alternative uses for the funds and general comments about BART.

Comment Cards: Commenters recommended funds be put to uses other than a temporary fare reduction. Other preferred uses included cleaning the train cars and stations, service increases, car improvements, overall system maintenance and improvements, and funding BART reserves. None of the comment cards contained language specifically supporting the temporary fare reductions.

B. Preferred Uses for the Funds

A significant majority of feedback received through all five public participation methods took the form of comments that, in lieu of a temporary fare reduction, BART should direct these funds to other uses. This information is qualitative and was volunteered by the commenters; BART did not suggest a specific array of choices for consideration by the public.

The recommended alternative uses for the funding were grouped into 16 different topics. The most frequently identified recommendations, in order of mention, were for BART to use the funds to:

- Clean the cars and stations
- Provide service increases and extended hours
- Make car improvements
- Supplement BART reserves
- Conduct overall system maintenance and improvements

III. Process for Soliciting Public Input

Consistent with BART's Public Participation Plan completed in May 2010, BART conducted outreach and hosted 18 multi-lingual community meetings throughout its service region to solicit feedback from the public about the temporary fare reduction options. These public participation activities were combined with BART's efforts to solicit feedback on establishing a threshold for a major service change, which is required by the Federal Transit

Administration (FTA) as outlined in FTA Circular 4702.1A. The results of the public participation process for the major service change threshold are reported in a separate document which BART submitted to FTA on June 25, 2010 and which is posted on BART's website at www.bart.gov.

For those unable to attend the community meetings, BART conducted an online survey hosted on the BART website at www.bart.gov. The proposed temporary fare reduction options received considerable media coverage which likely generated interest in the topic. BART also received 60 comments through emails sent to the BART Board of Directors and BART Customer Services.

BART conducted outreach for the meetings using a variety of methods including:

- Community-based organization (CBO) newsletters and communications
- Targeted emails
- Targeted phone calls
- BART website, including applications and social networking sites
- Bay Area media, both print and online
- Ethnic media
- Flyer distribution at BART Stations
- Flyer placement on BART car seats
- Flyer posting within the community

The following is a complete list of the meetings conducted. Meetings were held at a variety of times and locations to accommodate a wide range of participants. Translated materials and interpretive services were available for all meetings.

Location	Address	Date and Time	Translation Services Requested
San Francisco - Chinatown	Chinatown Community Dev. Ctr. 663 Clay Street, SF	Tuesday, June 8 11:30 a.m.-1:00 p.m.	Cantonese
Oakland	Lao Family Community Ctr., 2325 E. 12th St, Oakland	Thursday, June 10 4:00-5:30 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
Hayward	City Hall, Room 2A, 777 B St, Hayward	Monday, June 14 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>

Location	Address	Date and Time	Translation Services Requested
Dublin	Dublin Public Library, 200 Civic Plaza, Dublin	Monday, June 14 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
San Francisco	SF Senior Center, 481 O'Farrell St, SF	Tuesday, June 15 1:00-2:30 p.m.	Cantonese, Mandarin, Russian, Spanish
Oakland	Claridge Hotel - Ballroom, 634 15th St, Oakland	Tuesday, June 15 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
Pittsburg	Senior Center, 300 Presidio Lane, Pittsburg	Tuesday, June 15 6:30-8:00 p.m.	Cantonese
San Francisco - Excelsior	Excelsior Family Connections, 49 Ocean Avenue, SF	Wednesday, June 16 10:00-11:30 a.m.	Cantonese, Spanish
Oakland	Youth Uprising, 8711 Macarthur Blvd., Oakland	Wednesday, June 16 5:00-6:30 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
Concord	El Rancho Restaurant, 1450 Monument Blvd., Concord	Wednesday, June 16 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
Richmond	Nevin Center, 598 Nevin Avenue, Richmond	Thursday, June 17 4:00-5:30 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
San Francisco – Bayview	Bayview YMCA, 1601 Lane Street, SF	Thursday, June 17 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
Union City	Community Center, 1333 Decoto Road, Union City	Thursday, June 17 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
San Francisco – Mission	Chavita's #2, 3161 24th St, SF	Monday, June 21 6:30-8:00 p.m.	Spanish
Lafayette	Veterans' Memorial Bldg., 3780 Mt. Diablo Blvd., Lafayette	Monday, June 21 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
South San Francisco	Municipal Service Bldg., 33 Arroyo Drive, So. SF	Monday, June 21 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>

Location	Address	Date and Time	Translation Services Requested
Berkeley	So. Berkeley Senior Ctr, 2939 Ellis St., Berkeley	Tuesday, June 22 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>
San Pablo	City Hall - Maple Hall, 13831 San Pablo Ave., San Pablo	Wednesday, June 23 6:30-8:00 p.m.	<i>None requested</i>

Approximately 300 people attended the community meetings, which were held at a variety of times and locations based on community recommendations developed during the preparation of the Public Participation Plan. Meeting attendance varied widely. Attendance numbers are based on the number of people who signed in and a general head count conducted by staff, since some people did not sign in. The meeting held in East Oakland at the Lao Family Community Center attracted the greatest number of participants—over 100. BART staff were able to modify their approach to the meetings with smaller attendance (about 10 or less) and have a more discussion-oriented format, with ample time for participants to ask questions, share comments and discuss their ideas with BART staff. The meetings held in Union City and San Francisco-Bayview did not have any attendees and the South San Francisco meeting attracted only one participant.

At each meeting, participants were asked to sign in and were provided a copy of the agenda. BART staff opened the meeting with welcoming remarks and introduced the presenters. They also recognized BART Board Directors in attendance and CBO partners who assisted with the meeting. BART staff briefly reviewed the agenda and meeting purpose, followed by a presentation which focused on explaining BART's current financial situation and proposed temporary fare reduction options. The survey was distributed after the presentation.

BART staff explained that the agency had unexpectedly received \$26 million in State Transportation Assistance Funding (STA) from the State of California for use in FY11. BART intends to use some of the funds to cover a projected \$11 million deficit for the upcoming fiscal year. BART also plans to deposit about \$9 million from these state funds into reserves. Use of reserve funds has helped BART balance its budget during past recessions. The remaining portion of the \$26 million could be used for customer appreciation options. These options include reducing BART fares by 3% for 4 months or by 5% for 3 months. The following charts give examples of temporary fare reductions under the two options:

Option A. 3% Temporary Fare Reduction for 4 Months

	Fare		Savings
	Current	3% Lower	
12th Street to Downtown San Francisco	\$3.10	\$3.00	\$0.10
Fruitvale to Downtown Oakland	\$1.75	\$1.70	\$0.05
Richmond to Downtown Berkeley	\$1.75	\$1.70	\$0.05
Embarcadero to Colma	\$3.25	\$3.15	\$0.10
Walnut Creek to Downtown San Francisco	\$4.75	\$4.65	\$0.10
Pittsburg/Bay Point to SFO	\$10.90	\$10.60	\$0.30

Option B. 5% Temporary Fare Reduction for 3 Months

	Fare		Savings
	Current	5% Lower	
12th Street to Downtown San Francisco	\$3.10	\$2.95	\$0.15
Fruitvale to Downtown Oakland	\$1.75	\$1.65	\$0.10
Richmond to Downtown Berkeley	\$1.75	\$1.65	\$0.10
Embarcadero to Colma	\$3.25	\$3.10	\$0.15
Walnut Creek to Downtown San	\$4.75	\$4.55	\$0.20

Francisco			
Pittsburg/Bay Point to SFO	\$10.90	\$10.40	\$0.50

Following the presentation, the presenters opened the meeting for questions and comments. A recorder took notes and wrote down comments and questions on large-scale paper posted on the wall of the meeting room. In several meetings, the BART presenters worked closely with interpreters who translated the proceedings. All comments received verbally or in writing in languages other than English were translated and transcribed and are included in the comments section of this report.

IV. Public Input

The public provided input through the five sources described in Section II above. These sources can be divided into quantifiable print survey and web survey data, and qualitative comments received from comments written on the surveys as well as gathered from the wallgraphic recordings at the public meetings, comment cards, and emails to the Board and staff. This section begins with results gathered from questions asked on the printed and web surveys, and is followed by discussion of public comments from the five sources. While a significant number of comments were received and survey results have been reported numerically, the data should be considered to be qualitative in nature. Data are not additive across methods.

A. Print Survey Results

Following the question and comment period, participants were asked to complete a brief survey. Translated copies of the survey were available in the following languages: Chinese, Khmer, Korean, Lao, Russian, Spanish, Tagalog, and Vietnamese.

The survey, which also covered the threshold for a major service change, included three questions related to the proposed temporary fare reduction. Meeting participants were asked to provide feedback on how well they felt BART staff explained the proposed temporary fare reductions and for their opinion on the temporary fare reduction options. The survey also provided space for written comments. A total of 195 surveys were completed at the community meetings. A complete summary of the printed survey results is included as Appendix C, "Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Printed Survey Results."

Question 1: How Well Do You Feel BART Staff Explained Issues Related to a Possible Temporary Fare Reduction?

The first survey questions asked participants how well they felt BART staff had explained the proposed temporary fare reduction. Participants were asked to comment on how well they thought BART staff described:

- BART's current financial situation
- How the public's input would be used in decision making
- Option A: BART's proposal to reduce fare by 3% for 4 months
- Option B: BART's proposal to reduce fares by 5% for 3 months

In each case, the possible responses were as follows:

- Very Well—I have a thorough understanding of the topic
- Somewhat Well—I understand the topic and most of my questions have been answered
- Not Well—I am still unclear on some points
- Do Not Know

Question 1a: How Well Did BART Staff Explain BART's Financial Situation?

Respondents' understanding of the source of the surplus funds and possible uses benefited from hearing an explanation of the topic, so the first question on the print survey asked how well BART staff had explained BART's financial situation. The following shows the breakdown of responses given to this question:

Very Well	% of Total*	Somewhat Well	% of Total*	Not Well	% of Total*	Do Not Know	% of Total*	No Answer
69	42%	67	41%	19	12%	8	5%	31

* The "% of Total" columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the "multiple answers given" or "no answers."

Question 1b: How Well Did BART Staff Explain How Your Input Will be Used in the Decision-Making Process?

Next, the survey asked participants how well they felt BART staff had explained how their input would be used in the process of deciding what to do with the surplus funds. Survey respondents answered as follows:

Very Well	% of Total*	Somewhat Well	% of Total*	Not Well	% of Total*	Do Not Know	% of Total*	No Answer
51	35%	67	46%	11	7%	17	12%	48

Question 1c: How Well Did BART Staff Explain Temporary Fare Reduction Option A?

Respondents were asked how well BART staff had explained the first of two proposed options for the temporary fare reduction, reducing fares systemwide by three percent for a period of four months. Survey respondents answered as follows:

Very Well	% of Total*	Somewhat Well	% of Total*	Not Well	% of Total*	Do Not Know	% of Total*	No Answer
68	46%	57	39%	12	8%	10	7%	47

Question 1d: How Well Did BART Staff Explain Temporary Fare Reduction Option B?

Respondents were asked how well BART staff had explained the second proposed option for the temporary fare reduction, reducing fares systemwide by five percent for a period of three months. Survey respondents answered as follows:

Very Well	% of Total*	Somewhat Well	% of Total*	Not Well	% of Total*	Do Not Know	% of Total*	No Answer
72	48%	53	36%	13	9%	11	7%	46

Question 2: Reducing my fares by 3% for 4 months is:

The second question on the survey solicited participants' opinions on whether they thought Option A for the temporary fare reduction was a good idea. Respondents selected from among the following possible responses:

- Great—it will save me money
- Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter
- OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...
- Do not know

Following is the breakdown of responses given to this question:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	49	30%
Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter	61	37%
OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...	33	20%
Do not know	16	10%
Not worth it; OK, but...both checked	6	3%
Multiple answers given	1	N/A
No answer given	29	N/A

Question 3: Reducing my fares by 5% for 3 months is:

Respondents' opinions on whether they approved of Option B were similar to responses regarding Option A, and were as follows:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	50	31%
Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter	61	37%
OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...	31	19%
Do not know	15	9%
Not worth it; OK, but...both checked	6	4%
Multiple answers given	5	N/A
No answer given	27	N/A

The approximately 60% of respondents who felt that the temporary fare reduction options were not worth it or would rather see the money spent on something else had a wide range of suggestions for alternative uses which are described in the comments section below. The approximately 30% of respondents who thought that either or both options were "great" appeared satisfied with the idea and made little additional comment.

The following tables describe the participants who completed the print survey.

How often, if at all, do you usually ride BART?

	No. selected	% of Total*
Never	4	2%
Less than once a month	44	25%
1 – 3 days a month	43	24%
1 – 2 days a week	26	15%
3 days a week or more	60	34%
Multiple answers given	1	N/A
No answer given	15	N/A

What is the total annual income of your household before taxes?

	No. selected	% of Total*
Under \$25,000	92	53%
\$25,000 - \$40,000	27	16%
\$41,000 - \$75,000	22	13%
Over \$75,000	31	18%
No answer given	21	N/A

In which language do you prefer to communicate?

	No. selected	% of Total*
English	114	64%
Spanish	11	6%
Chinese	23	13%
Korean	0	0%
Tagalog	0	0%
Russian	0	0%
Vietnamese	3	2%
Other	27	15%
Multiple choices made	8	N/A
No answer given	7	N/A

What is your race or ethnic identification?

	No. selected	% of Total*
American Indian or Alaska Native	2	1%
Asian or Pacific Islander	55	30%
Black/African American	28	16%
Spanish, Hispanic or Latino	18	10%
White	44	24%

* The "% of Total" columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the "multiple answers given" or "no answers."

Other	32	18%
Combination of two or more race or ethnic identifications specified	2	1%
No answer given	12	N/A

B. Web Survey Results

A version of the survey modified to omit questions related to the presentation was available online at www.bart.gov to allow input from participants unable to attend the community meetings. Twitter users received a “tweet” on the availability of the survey and were encouraged to respond. BART reviewed the survey results by source (print copy distributed at community meeting versus online survey). One hundred seventy-seven surveys were submitted online. Safeguards were in place to ensure that only one survey response could be submitted per Internet Protocol (IP) address. These responses were a useful source of additional input and are listed below. A complete summary of the web survey results is included as Appendix D, “Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Web Survey Results.”

Regarding Option A, reducing fares by 3% for 4 months, web survey respondents gave their opinion as follows:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	19	11%
Not worth it—it won’t save me enough money to matter	54	32%
OK, but I’d rather see BART spend the money on...	94	56%
Do not know	0	0%
No answer given	10	N/A

Web survey respondents gave their opinion as follows regarding Option B, reducing fares by 5% for 3 months:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	29	17%
Not worth it—it won’t save me enough money to matter	44	26%
OK, but I’d rather see BART spend the money on...	93	56%
Do not know	1	1%
No answer given	10	N/A

The following tables describe the respondents who filled out the web survey.

How often, if at all, do you usually ride BART?

	No. selected	% of Total*
Never	1	1%
Less than once a month	7	4%
1 – 3 days a month	30	18%
1 – 2 days a week	17	10%
3 days a week or more	109	67%
No answer given	13	N/A

What is the total annual income of your household before taxes?

	No. selected	% of Total*
Under \$25,000	23	14%
\$25,000 - \$40,000	24	15%
\$41,000 - \$75,000	48	30%
Over \$75,000	65	41%
No answer given	17	N/A

In which language do you prefer to communicate?

	No. selected	% of Total*
English	159	97%
Spanish	1	1%
Chinese	0	0%
Korean	0	0%
Tagalog	0	0%
Russian	0	0%
Vietnamese	1	1%
Other	1	1%
No answer given	15	N/A

What is your race or ethnic identification?

	No. selected	% of Total
American Indian or Alaska Native	0	0%
Asian or Pacific Islander	26	16%
Black/African American	6	4%
Spanish, Hispanic or Latino	8	5%
White	104	66%
Other (specified, see list below)	10	6%
Other (unspecified)	5	3%
No answer given	18	N/A

Online survey respondents echoed the comments of meeting participants, print survey respondents and those who corresponded with BART via email, expressing the opinion that the temporary fare reductions would hardly be worth the savings, and that the funds would be better saved against future shortfalls or spent on something else. Suggestions for alternative expenditures were also similar to those made by all other commenters.

C. Most Frequent Comments on Alternative Uses of Funds

While the meetings focused on seeking input on the temporary fare reduction options, many meeting participants, survey respondents and commenters suggested how they thought BART could better use the funds. This section describes the most frequently and consistently mentioned alternative uses for the funds, based on a review of input given using the five available public input methods. Comments have been organized by topic, and are summarized below. They are listed in relative order based on a consideration of the frequency of mention and public input method. A complete database of public comments received, along with a table summarizing this analysis, is included as Appendix A to this report. Comments too lengthy to fit in the database (due to a limit on the number of characters that may be displayed in an Excel spreadsheet cell) are included in Appendix B, "Additional Comments."

Fund Improved Station and Car Cleanliness

Commenters suggested the funds be used to maintain regular cleanliness of the stations, train cars, restrooms, escalators and elevators. There were specific suggestions that BART needed additional station cleaners to accomplish this and it was recommended that BART give the stations a "deep clean" to remove accumulated dirt, bird droppings and other materials that were beyond those addressed by the regular station cleaners.

Increase Service and Extend Hours

Commenters suggested BART use the funds to increase service and extend hours. Suggestions included: extending service and/or increasing the number or length of trains on, for example, the Richmond Line, especially on nights and weekends; and extending BART service beyond midnight. It was also suggested that BART provide 15-minute service on weekends.

Make Car Improvements

Commenters suggested specific improvements, such as replacing the seat cushions and carpeting in the cars. They believed this would update the cars and make for a "cleaner" ride. It was also suggested that the cars be improved or modified to increase capacity and better accommodate bicycles.

Supplement BART Reserves

Commenters recommended that the surplus funds be "saved for a rainy day" and be directed to BART reserves. Some commenters noted the economic uncertainty of the times and considered BART reserves to be a prudent investment.

Fund Overall System Maintenance and Improvements

Commenters suggested the funds be used for system maintenance and improvements. These commenters noted that a well-functioning transit system would benefit both riders and the broader public. It was also suggested that BART invest in both regular maintenance and new energy efficient technologies.

D. Additional Suggestions for Alternative Uses for Funds

The following suggested uses are included in the report to provide a complete summary of the feedback received. Though not mentioned as frequently or consistently as the five topics above, the ideas and perspectives expressed may be of interest to BART Board of Directors and staff.

Fund Reduced Fares for Seniors, Youth, Persons with Disabilities and Low Income

Commenters recommended that the funds available for the temporary fare reductions should be redirected to provide lower fares for seniors, youth, persons with disabilities and others with a fixed or low income on an ongoing basis.

Make Specific Fare Reductions

Commenters suggested that BART use the funds to permanently reduce the cost of travel to the San Francisco Airport. It was also suggested that BART reduce the cost of its high value tickets to help frequent users save money. BART could also consider using the funds to support peak and non-peak pricing, with current prices considered to be peak pricing and reduced fares offered during non-peak hours.

Fund Discounts, Events and Programs

Commenters suggested the funds be used to provide discounts or fund events and programs. It was suggested that funds be directed to help discount the price of a Fast Pass or create a monthly BART pass. Commenters suggested that BART support local community causes or provide additional support for transit for educational groups. There were suggestions that the funds be used to cover the costs of additional Spare the Air Days, and provide web access on trains. The suggestion was also made that a volunteer Transit Ambassador program be developed to provide information about BART to new riders.

Commenters suggested the funds be used to subsidize the costs of free transit one day a month; reduce costs for families; and provide free transit for children.

Cost Savings are Insignificant

Commenters described the temporary fare reductions as minimal or “not worth it” and said they were unlikely to notice the savings. Commenters noted they would only save \$0.05 - \$0.20, an amount they did not believe was consequential.

Make Station Improvements

Commenters recommended directing the funds to station area improvements such as opening and updating the bathrooms, renovation and increased maintenance of elevators and escalators, increased parking both for cars and bicycles, improved ticket vending machines, and installation of renewable energy sources.

Improve Signage and Announcements

Commenters suggested the funds be used for additional signage, or to improve the informational announcements made in stations. It was suggested that BART provide additional directional signage in the stations, system maps in the trains, and/or real-time arrival signs in or near the stations. Suggestions were also made to install signs that would encourage adherence to rules and guidelines, such as the rules regarding bike hours, not eating/drinking on the trains or “stand on the right, pass on the left” signs near the escalators.

Add New Lines

Commenters suggested the funds be used for new lines and service extensions throughout the BART system.

Improve Safety

Commenters suggested that BART use the funds for safety improvements, such as installing security cameras in BART parking lots, and providing additional patrols.

Fund Multi-Lingual Services

Commenters suggested BART use the funds to better meet the needs of non-English speaking riders. This could be accomplished by providing station announcements in multiple languages and installing multi-lingual signage in the stations. Chinese and Spanish were the languages most frequently mentioned.

Implementation Costs are Too High

Commenters opposed the temporary fare reductions specifically because they believed that implementing the temporary fare reductions would not be cost-effective due to the associated expenses.

E. Comments on Public Participation Process

Meeting participants made a number of comments on the effectiveness of the public participation process. They were glad to see that BART was continuing to conduct public involvement activities, and would like to see more regularly scheduled opportunities to provide input. Participants felt it is important to reach out to diverse populations, particularly youth, low income, and minorities, and to conduct bilingual outreach for those with limited proficiency in English. Numerous community-based organizations were suggested as outreach partners who could assist in reaching these communities. Some participants noted that meetings must be conveniently scheduled and well publicized and that care must be taken to ensure that everyone at the meeting can hear and understand explanations of BART policy. Another suggestion was to provide clear information at stations and on the BART website. Finally, participants requested that BART be responsive to community input, and that the Board be provided with all opinions expressed.

The meetings combined discussion of the proposed temporary fare decrease with a second topic, establishing a major service change threshold, which is required by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA). Most of the discussion at the meetings focused on the proposed fare decrease or an alternative use of the funds. Meeting participants also took the opportunity to share their issues and concerns with BART on a variety of topics. Issues raised included the cost of fares; the availability of discounts or subsidies for seniors, students, families, the disabled and economically disadvantaged, etc.; service improvements such as increases in hours or line extensions; and improvements to and maintenance of stations and trains.

V. Next Steps

The results of the public participation activities will be provided to BART Board of Directors for their review and consideration. The Board will be taking action on the proposed temporary fare reduction options at the July 22 meeting.

The public will have an additional opportunity to comment at the Board meeting and can also send comments to BART at boardofdirectors@bart.gov. The proceedings can be viewed on-line at www.bart.gov.

Appendix A: Public Comment Database
Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process
Summary of Verbal and Written Comments

Note: Printed survey results appear beginning on p. 11 of the Summary Report; web survey results appear on beginning on p. 15.

Topics	Frequency of Mention/Participation Method				
	Wallgraphic (WG)*	Comment Card (CC)*	Written Comments on Printed Survey (SV)	Written Comments on Online Survey (ON)	Emailed or sent directly to BART (EM)
Oppose Fare Reduction	16*	15*	8	27	28
Fund Improved Station and Car Cleanliness	13*	11*	8	15	14
Increase Service and Extend Hours	16*	12*	7	15	11
Make Car Improvements	16*	6*	3	13	20
Supplement BART Reserves	9*	5*	2	12	14
Fund Overall System Maintenance and Improvements	14*	5*	8	8	8
Fund Reduced Fares for Seniors, Youth, Persons with Disabilities, and Low Income	11*	15*	7	3	2
Make Specific Fare Reductions	10*	12*	5	6	0
Fund Discounts, Events and Programs	16*	3*	4	3	5
Cost Savings are Insignificant	3*	6*	3	11	7
Make Station Improvements	6*	11*	5	3	3
Improve Signage and Announcements	6*	4*	3	5	7
Add New Lines	7*	6*	3	5	2
Improve Safety	5*	5*	4	1	3
Fund Multi-lingual Services	1*	8*	0	0	0
Implementation Costs are Too High	4*	0*	1	1	1

***Note:** Wallgraphic notes taken during the meetings may represent multiple opinions; no recording was made of how many participants expressed a specific opinion. Comments expressed on written comment cards may also reiterate opinions expressed at the group level and recorded on wallgraphics. Therefore, these totals represent a simple tally of the number of times a specific opinion was noted in wallgraphic notes or on comment cards, rather than the number of people expressing that opinion.

Appendix A: Public Comment Database
Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process
Key to Codes

Code	Meeting	Date
SFC	San Francisco - Chinatown	6/8/2010
EOAK	Lao Family Cmty Ctr, Oakland	6/10/2010
HWD	Hayward City Hall	6/14/2010
DUB	Dublin Public Library	6/14/2010
SFSR	San Francisco - Senior Center	6/15/2010
DTOAK	Oakland-Downtown (Claridge Hotel)	6/15/2010
PTS	Pittsburg Senior Center	6/15/2010
SFE	San Francisco - Excelsior	6/16/2010
WOAK	Youth Uprising, Oakland	6/16/2010
CNC	Concord	6/16/2010
RCH	Richmond	6/17/2010
SFB	San Francisco - Bayview	6/17/2010
UC	Union City	6/17/2010
SFM	San Francisco - Mission	6/21/2010
LAF	Lafayette	6/21/2010
SSF	South San Francisco	6/21/2010
BRK	Berkeley	6/22/2010
SNP	San Pablo	6/23/2010

Language Key	
Code	Language
ENG	English
CH	Chinese
KH	Khmer
KO	Korean
LAO	Lao
RU	Russian
SP	Spanish
TG	Tagalog
VI	Vietnamese

Source Key	
Code	Source
CC	Comment card
EM	Emailed or sent directly to BART
ON	Online survey
SV	Printed survey
WG Wallgraphic	

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
BRK	ENG	CC	Maintenance - confusion - savings are very minimal - better reliability. Put in reserves.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	Please put zero dollars into fare reductions. Things to spend money on: fixing 19 minute timed-transfer (after 8 pm) on PBP-SF transfer to FRE-RICH trains; put into rainy-day fund; station improvements/cleaning	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	Agreed with most comments at this meeting - in summary, spending this money on a temporary fare reduction would be fiscally irresponsible and would not benefit your riders as much as better maintenance, better service (more frequent trains, more train cars on busy lines like Richmond), and long-term investment in infrastructure. A budget surplus is a rare event (especially for public transit!) PLEASE DON'T THROW IT AWAY!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	Extra money - <u>not</u> to reduce fair. Yes: clean cars; patrols - enforce rules; extra cars on short car runs; better station signage - more of them, more readable.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	I completely disagree with the use of the extra money for a temporary fare reduction. We should only use the money for maintenance or to keep the fares the same.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	We need to have part of trains dedicated for bicycles so that they are not in the way of other patrons. Bicyclists won't follow the rules so there needs to be easy ways to get around.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	SV	Clean cars; patrols on cars - enforce bicycle and eating rules; better station signage - should be a continuous ribbon of name	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	SV	Need more direct service on Richmond line. Trains are too crowded and hot, and don't run often enough. Transfers are not synchronized enough, esp. Richmond-Concord. Need service to San Jose and usable restrooms. Make schedules lighter in weight - too heavy to carry around.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	SV	No Oakland Airport Connector - only current system or Bus Rapid Transit should be options. No fare reductions - only use it for maintenance.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Fare reduction is not a wise idea	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Get advertisement for printed materials	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	It does not serve the local neighborhood	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	New bike space is not effective for bikes - bikes fall over; only one bike can be there; space specially dedicated to bikes; make it clear for bikers where to go; space to hook up bikes from ceiling like on Caltrans	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	One car for bikes (area dedicated to bikes)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Prevention is worth more than follow up	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Reducing fares is greatly irresponsible	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Service cuts affect people more (than fare reduction) - especially at night on the Richmond line. MacArthur transfer - it is impossible to catch the Richmond transfer. People waiting long at night makes them misbehave.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: inside every station should be a map of the site (parking lot)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: internet service on BART (all over not just in SF)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: make sure system is maintained (cars, computers)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: put money on reserves	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: reliability and maintenance will be better PR for BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Richmond line needs more attention - it is always crowded but is a really busy station all day and night	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: service people on BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: train cars are filthy - clean up BART/maintenance	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: use money on station signs - there are not enough. NY has the name of station at every pillar. Paint stations in different colors.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	There's nowhere to go with a bike - especially on weekends	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Too much money is spent in printed materials that then gets tossed - very wasteful and nobody looks at it	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Why did you have to rehab trains? It is too expensive!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	WG	Do not lower fares	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
BRK	ENG	CC	I totally disagree with the Oakland Airport Connector and I only think there should be a Bus Rapid Transit option or the current option.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	CC	Remove seats - for bikes not helpful	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Why change AirBART? Will it be more expensive to go to the airport? Reply: BART did not want bus rapid transit system [to go to Oakland Airport]. BRT would be a third of the price of Oakland Airport Connector and you just need a dedicated lane. Voters did not vote for this. Having a dedicated rail line can control schedules.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Are there any plans to go down the Peninsula?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	BART water condensation - sprinklers on parking lots	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Commuters depend on BART schedules for their daily plans	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Make bike rules known and make sure people know	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Water pressure washing in the rainy season does not make any sense	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	OAC was one of many projects on Measure B	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Stop putting seat protectors on the toilets they always get vandalized.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Toilets run forever	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
BRK	ENG	WG	Cut down on printing cost for new schedules; people look at schedules online	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
CNC	ENG	CC	I believe BART should be much more presentable; this includes the floors, seats and better security. The concept of expanding from the Pittsburg/Bay Point station is fantastic-many college students commute to Pittsburg/Bay Point from Antioch, Brentwood and Oakley.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	CC	Budget surplus: first and foremost, cleanliness and maintenance of the train cars and stations! Some of the cars have not been cleaned (or seem not to have been cleaned) in many years. Likewise, I wonder about things like transmission of viruses and bacteria-standers have to hold onto those handles and poles, but who else has done so and when were they (the poles) cleaned last?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	CC	Instead of rolling back fares, use the money to clean the cars. A 20 cent a day savings to SF adds up to approximately \$8-a month to SF based on a 5 day week-\$32. Over the 4 months the 2.3 million will be a lot more in a lump sum for BART rather than \$132 spread out over thousands of individuals.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	CC	Supplemental funds-do not provide fare decrease, instead clean fabric on seats. Cars have progressively gotten dirtier and dirtier over last five years.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	CC	Why lower fares temporarily when raising them after the "grace" period will only anger people? Why don't you focus on maintaining BART trains and tracks so that people will continue to use a reliable system? Keeping BART maintained is much more valuable than saving 20 or 30 cents a trip!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
CNC	ENG	SV	Clean the BART interiors with extra money. Seats are filthy.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	SP	SV	I would like to have special low prices for families	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	SV	I've always had a bad BART experience, but one thing is for sure that I've enjoyed- its convenience. Please do something about the clean ups.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	SV	Lowering fares and then raising them will cause an uproar- people will not remember	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	SV	Using temporary fare reductions would only confuse and irritate most riders. Putting the 2.3 million into some maintenance work to the trains would get my vote.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	SV	Want a well maintained system w/ frequent service 7 days a week	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Public will not be happy with reductions then fare increase - people will not notice fare drop	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: save for a rainy day	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: Maintenance affects everyone - \$2.3M should go to this - where everyone is served equally.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: BART trains are smelly and dirty	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: bulk of money will make a difference	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: cleanliness of stations - more frequent and thorough cleaning of cars	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: fix broken trains	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: increase operating hours - especially late at night	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: invest money in removing cushions, easy to clean	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: protect reserved from state	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: safety - non-slip surfaces	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: seat springs!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
CNC	SP	SV	Don't charge for children. I have 5 children	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
CNC	SP	SV	I hope you will send me information via e-mail or via mail.	Outreach
CNC	ENG	SV	Please continue community meetings	Outreach
CNC	ENG	SV	BART should be required to study social justice issues as required by federal law. Buses serve the underserved low income populations	Outreach
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Either discount From SF to West Oakland or commute in few night peak hours less to lightening this side	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Free BART monthly pass for senior disabled \$24.00 or \$48.00	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Free monthly BART pass for low-income, disabled, seniors. 24.00 for \$9.00 or 48.00 for \$18.00. I prefer \$48.00 for a cost of \$18.00	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Free to low-cost monthly pass for workers and students who are low income and need assistance (sliding scale) with transportation costs to and from work or school. Also include disabled.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Our organization needs access to free tickets for a few hardship cases	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Research discount tickets for parolees, students on parole through various agencies.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	1. Use of bathrooms; 2. the need to extend BART line; 3. Free fare days; 4. Lower rates for elderly and disabled; 5. Maybe some days of longer service; 6. Better security on trains	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Combine train from San Francisco Intl. with train to Richmond/ SF. ___ at 12th st station of Fremont/Richmond train or combine service with 4 line BART combination	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Cleaner way cleaner bathrooms. Open all underground. Bathroom was on the ___ is now over. Take BART to somewhere not the boondocks but major cities-San Jose, ___	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Contractor doing retrofit of earthquake retrofitting is costing lot of wasted money. Doing this same work for 3yr with no idea of completion. I want to see a contraction of __ with a lower bid. Do it faster. ____ faster time frame. Done by 2012 by black contractor for government work by Obama administration	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	I think BART should run longer than 12am because people have to work past that time and get stuck at the BART station. And why BART fare so high now? A lot of people are real upset about that too. They should make BART trains longer. Some are long and some are short.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Increase community service at all locations, not limited to stations but communities.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	SV	My comments are yall should give disable people's a free ride like once out of every month and adults and children's or just give us BART passes for free we spend too much money on bart to not get no feedback.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	SV	Subsidize low income seniors, disabled people for a month BART pass \$24.00 or \$48.00.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	SV	Cleaner bathrooms, quieter trains, longer trains, more space, service	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	SV	More rigorous pigeon abatement foot traffic circulation enhancement. More aggressive roll out of bike lockers.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Disabled passes	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: disabled discount added?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: discount card with higher value	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: free day for youth/disabled/senior	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: green day for people with bikes	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: senior discount	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: 24 hour rider to San Francisco	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: BART to San Jose	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: expansion to Tracy/Antioch	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: info booths at each station	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: cleaning the restrooms	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: leftover BART ticket money	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: resources for the Oakland community centers	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: To go car at BART stations (provide method for disabled to get between BART and home, other destinations)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: wheelchair space	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DTOAK	ENG	CC	how do we exchange tickets, the very low ones? When will BART be expanding to Antioch? I would like to see better bathroom conditions. Can we get a monthly BART card for students?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Ride BART to either Hayward or Fremont to catch Dunbarton express Transportation over the bay water-on the same level.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Are your stations equiped with signs saying area or track? Most I have tried are color coded and no signs. I'm color blind so I really need something more than color paint. Thank you.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Foot traffic problem; people pushin carriages or bikes get caught in the wide gates due to people blocking them, taking "short cuts" to the regular gates. Stanchion materials (chromed piping or stainless steel) can be salvaged from decommissioned buses, including all the fittings. Kiosk: the salvaged stanchions can be used for other foot traffic flow guidance at low bucks. BART should have announcements made in Spanish and in Mandarin at quarter hour intervals.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	CC	Public restrooms are badly needed especially for handicapped	General Comments/Questions re BART Service

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
DTOAK	ENG	SV	How often are the tracks maintained in areas like tunnels.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	SV	I would like more help coming from business and BART on helping the homeless	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Do not cut hours - expand them!	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Long waits on the Richmond line - need more trains to Berkeley stations; trains are always crowded	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	No phones on BART for comfort of others	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Construction going on too long at MacArthur/Grant St.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Tickets bought with credit card are hard to change	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Price different from/to SFO/East Bay	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Eating on BART (would like to be able to eat on BART - those with eating disorders - i.e., diabetes - need to eat at certain times)	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DTOAK	ENG	SV	We need more community outreach, "regularly"	Outreach
DTOAK	ENG	SV	This was the worst community workshop I have ever attended.	Outreach
DTOAK	ENG	SV	Yes, I will like to know more about Cac Cheree.	Outreach
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Outreach piece across the board to youth, disabled, etc. and a greeter at stations with info	Outreach
DTOAK	ENG	WG	Where did the extra money come from?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
DUB	ENG	SV	Keeping fares at same level makes more sense than changing them frequently.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	SV	Higher fares=lower ridership!; Lower income groups and unemployed need help in this time of recession-transportation is a fixed cost	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: Increase frequency of all trains	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: Need direct shuttle from BART Dublin to Livermore Park 'N Ride	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	WG	Make signs/maps easier to read	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: put extra money into operational improvements – improved visibility	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
DUB	ENG	SV	1. Tickets need to be less easily demagnetized; 2. Map/route indicators need to be more visible/accessible on the trains; 3. Tickets exchange booths need to be operating in more reasonable hours, more available; 4. On the train announcement should be uniform and audible	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Better web directions to SFO – transfer, where to get off	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Need 10 car train from Dublin at peak	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Watch for riders to get on train – sometimes trains take off before all passengers are on board.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Need more, better, more visible BART maps on trains	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Station announcements need to be more consistent, easy to understand, louder, easy to hear	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Need more places/times to change tickets	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Why do tickets so easily get de-sensitized? It's a hassle.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	WG	Need more info about the fare you've paid to appear on cards – Translink, red tickets, green tickets, BART and bus ticket. Fare is not displayed. How do you know if you've been charged a lower fee?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
DUB	ENG	SV	Meeting scheduled at 7:30-7:45 start; use the internet-meetings not cost effective	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	How you heard about meeting: newspaper	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	How you heard about meeting: TV/news	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: ACTIA	Outreach

Appendix A: Public Comment Database Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: BART task force	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: Genesis	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: LAVTA	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: PAPCO	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: Pleasanton/paratransit	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: Urban Habitat	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach partner suggested: WAAC	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach: Community for Independent Living	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Outreach: Senior centers	Outreach
DUB	ENG	WG	Fare reduction questions: More info about fares on cards	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
EOAK	ENG	CC	Are there discounts for San Francisco State student?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	CC	Can student have a BART pass like a bus pass?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	CC	Why don't they have student tickets which can help high school students or college students?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	CC	You guys should extend the fare hours and keep the BART fare at the same rate. Increase by 25% and extend hours for weekends. Shorten hours and decrease by 25%.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	SV	I think BART should be open 24/7 because commuters do travel late night and there would be more profit making fares more expensive after a certain hour. How did BART get deficits?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Discount cards for students	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: discount tickets for college students	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Translink to be used on BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: increase by 25% and extend hours on weekends	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: shorten hours and decrease by 25%	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: extend hours and keep same rate	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
EOAK	ENG	CC	I know that buses is changing from bus pass to translink. I want to ask does Translink work for BART?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
EOAK	ENG	CC	Translink to be used on BART?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
EOAK	ENG	SV	Sometimes BART is too crowded and don't have enough seats for all people	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
EOAK	ENG	SV	You guys come up with great ideas	Outreach
EOAK	ENG	SV	Main presenter speak louder	Outreach
EOAK	ENG	SV	They should speak louder	Outreach
EOAK	ENG	SV	This fare reduction is only for 4-5 months or all the time	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
HWD	ENG	SV	Small fare decreases don't help. Spend the money on infrastructure; Catch up on deferred maintenance so system is reliable; Or put more cars on night and weekend trains to avoid SRO through tube. It happens every evening on Dublin line.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	ENG	SV	Fix all air conditioning! Nickel & dime fare reductions aren't worth it	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	N/A	WG	Temp. fare reduction: bank the money or spend it! Board responsible for making this decision.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	N/A	WG	Temp. fare reduction: use money instead to improve existing infrastructure and system reliability.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	N/A	WG	Temp. fare reduction: Cleaning train car seats could be a nice way to spend money	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	N/A	WG	Temp. fare reduction: use money for general systems maintenance and upkeep	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
HWD	N/A	WG	Temp. fare reduction: Use money to fix and improve air conditioners so there is AC in all cars. This is important to improve comfort for all riders, including mothers with children and elderly riders.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
HWD	ENG	CC	I really enjoyed the opportunity to voice my opinion. I'm newer to the Bay Area and I have fallen in love with public transportation!	Outreach
HWD	ENG	CC	BART needs to respond to comments and complaints received in writing. In 2009 I wrote to Director Blalock re: concerns with the Dublin line and I got no answer.	Outreach
HWD	N/A	WG	Acknowledge and respond to community requests and concerns.	Outreach
HWD	N/A	WG	Temporary fare reduction: temporary "nickel and dime" fare reductions do not benefit riders.	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
LAF	ENG	CC	Can we build more parking at the Orinda and/or Lafayette lots? A second layer for midday parkers. Would increase use of trains midday. Or provide express bus from Moraga where there is parking to BART once or more the morning at 9:30 etc. for moms/dads dropping kids off at school when all parking is gone.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	SV	Please do not waste the money to reprint all the fare schedules for a temporary decrease. This is NUTS! Either save the money for your next deficit, or better yet, spend the money to increase ridership, midday especially.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	SV	A volunteer BART Ambassador program in non-peak hours by paid BART employee(s), would cost \$2 or \$1 million, and likely increase off-peak rider revenues by much more than \$1 million.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Changing fare schedule twice is crazy!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Confusing (short-term reduction)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Wasteful - cost of reprinting books	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: getting more people on BART should be priority - off-peak hours. Use money to generate more money.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: invest in volunteer ambassador program - invest in oversight training! - "meet and greet" on cars; smiles, answers to questions; "fear element" dissuades riders; not permitted during peak hours	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: set up a ride-pool - get info out about existing services and resources	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: save it for a rainy day	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: better serve moms	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: invest in express bus service	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
LAF	ENG	WG	More parking can improve ridership - change "moms!" - although many off-peak riders are transit-dependent, parking may not help	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
LAF	ENG	WG	Oakland Airport Connector - for wealthy people; replaces a bus system that works; would help get cars off the road	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
LAF	ENG	WG	Collect and use info on/from low-income minority, representative communities	Outreach
OAK-YU	ENG	CC	I would like for the board to do further reductions in the fares because it is effectively low income people of color such as American Indians, African Americans and Latinos-some of them don't use cars as their transportation. By using BART, they are fighting global warming.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	CC	Round trip BART cards; prepaid month long BART passes; both ideas would help workers and students alike.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	SV	Lighting, safety and cleaning of Coliseum Station-lots of trash, cars are dirty.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
OAK-YU	ENG	SV	Reduce the prices	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	SV	They should use the left over money to make the BART tracks longer.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: BART police funding and view (perception) after the death of young man	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: cleanliness - inside and outside of train, right of way of BART, outside of Coliseum and better lighting, bathrooms	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: Expand BART lines	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: greenway along BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction: relationship between BART and paratransit? Can those funds help paratransit?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
OAK-YU	ENG	SV	Why is it important to have customer service before the BART hire you?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	How to re-use leftover money on senior cards?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
OAK-YU	ENG	CC	What are the possibilities of having social awareness activities and events at the BART stations? Will there be available fee waivers?	Outreach
OAK-YU	ENG	SV	I hope that the BART's board of directors will do more, further educate. Some of the riders who take BART are low-income people of color such as American Indians, African Americans and Latinos.	Outreach
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	How are meetings being advertised?	Outreach
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction: how can this help low income workers that use BART?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Fare reduction seems disingenuous to some people	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
OAK-YU	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction: what happens after the 3 to 4 months?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
PTS	ENG	CC	Don't reduce fares for short time, delay raising fees for several months or even up to one year	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	CC	The psychology of reducing fares then returning the rate to the higher fare then increase rates in January does more harm for BART than not.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	CC	With the BART surplus of 4 million rather than lower the fares for a few months, either save the 4 million as a rainy day fund or freeze any further rate increases.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	CC	Is it possible to change senior rate date from 65 years to 62 years or even 63 years?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	WG	\$0.20 does not make a big difference	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	WG	2011 fare increase will seem bigger	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: potentially do not increase fares next January (2011) - until use \$4.5 million	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: save it for a rainy day	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: reduce parking costs	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
PTS	ENG	CC	Charging for parking is actually a hidden fare increase	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
PTS	ENG	CC	Can BART trains at Pittsburg station toward San Francisco on Sundays run 30 minutes earlier? Currently BART trains take off at 8:00 am on Sundays from Pittsburg. I appreciate it it can take off at 7:30 am because that way I won't be late to work in San Francisco.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
PTS	ENG	CC	Will BART ever install solar power to the stations?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
PTS	ENG	SV	Despite the current hoopla re: the shooting of passenger, need more safety personnel at BART stations	General Comments/Questions re BART Service

Appendix A: Public Comment Database Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
PTS	ENG	WG	Consider commuter hours, bikes, wheelchairs, when adjusting transfers	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
PTS	ENG	WG	No more than one transfer	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
RCH	ENG	CC	Make reduction to base fare, which would mean everyone got the same discount, but would likely benefit those who take shorter trips (which besides Airport workers) are probably more likely to be lower income.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Please be fair to your riders!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: provide commuter checks, outreach to employers	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: provide subsidies to youth programs, community - field trips	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	5 cents and 15 cents is not that much of an incentive to ride BART - should be a higher reduction.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: reduce fares for most traveled areas - provide fare reduction to where communities travel most	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: elevators - maintain and clean	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: safety precautions - police and station agents	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: surveillance cameras - repair and install - monitor and record	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	WG	Don't need new seats	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
RCH	ENG	CC	What is the real number of lost revenue due to rider reduction?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
RCH	ENG	CC	What percentage of the elevators are not working? How much would it cost to maintain the elevators?	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
RCH	ENG	WG	3% of riders go to SFO - 11% are airport employees	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
RCH	ENG	WG	Next fare raise January 2011	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
RCH	ENG	CC	Can the incentive option for fare reduction be extended longer than 3 or 4 months?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
RCH	ENG	WG	How many Richmond riders would this benefit?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
SFC	ENG	CC	Temp. fare reduction for 4-6 months as means to show appreciation to riders - what is the limitation on how the money is spent?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	CC	In many ways, the 4.5 M needs to be used for long term mitigations to service reduction to low-income communities of color. When asked the question, "How many Chinatown residents are BART users" the question should be rather "How many of Chinatown residents would like to be BART users if there have been more mitigations, such as: 1) Low -income discount pass/ not just for senior or disabled 2) Shuttle service to Market St. The Ping Yuer Public Housing is located 1 mile from Powell ST making it impossible for seniors on walkers to access the station. Unlike people who can drive themselves and park all day at the station, we would like to have stronger connections to make it feasible for our communities to use BART 3) Linguistic access, signage on BART and the stations	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	CC	Definitely need a bilingual signage program. Chinese media can help too. 20% of San Franciscans are now Chinese American majority Chinese speakers -We can do a lot more to encourage ridership	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
SFC	ENG	CC	Having something that produces results less temporary. Like improving access that residents in Chinatown have to current BART stations (Powell & Embarcadero) may have more benefits to Chinatown users since many use monthly MUNI passes anyways	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	CC	Need translation at the BART stations -Directions (clearer) - Ticket machines	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	CC	Station improvements - bilingual signs - increase service	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	CC	Create a better walking experience to BART from Chinatown people use the Stockton tunnel to walk to Powell station. Stockton tunnel needs some cleanup	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	CH	CC	1. To improve Car Interior (in English). To improve the facilities inside the train (e.g. seats, floor, etc.). 2. To improve the security inside the train (more police). 3. To improve the linguistic aspect of announcements (in Chinese and multiple languages) and facilities in the stations.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	SV	Talk to SF MUNI about fare reduction to fast pass youth fast pass for all not just some schools	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	ENG	SV	Youth discount for general commute: discount for seniors, why not youth?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: Fast Pass reduction	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: free ridership appreciation days	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: Outreach about discount tickets in different languages	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: Student discount tickets - orange ticket 50% for participating schools	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: transfer money to SF MTA to subsidise Fast Pass - have conversation with MTA to establish fare reduction for SF Muni riders	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: weekend and summer programs for kids and families (free days)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Need Sunday service to airport at earlier times	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction alternative: Embarcadero St. as connector to Chinatown - connection to SF neighborhoods	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFC	N/A	WG	Richmond to SF BART - how many trains? Have the number been reduced? Standing room only at Berkeley stations even on non-rush hours	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFC	ENG	CC	Senior/family BART tours to educate Chinatown residents to take BART - Special bilingual "How to take BART tours" Chinatown CDC is willing to help	Outreach
SFC	ENG	CC	This meeting is important for our residents (Chinatown) to know what kind of services BART can provide to the low-income community. We need more of these meetings in Chinatown with interpretation	Outreach
SFC	ENG	SV	Like to see programs for underserved communities that tie in cultural events with BART ride	Outreach
SFC	ENG	SV	More outreach is needed in the Chinese Community - A lot more so the community can use BART more! Chinatown in particular depends on public transportation	Outreach
SFE	ENG	CC	Do not use the money to decrease fares for a few months- A waste!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	SP	SV	I use the bus more [than BART]. I would like the cost of the ticket to be lowered, since today's economy makes it a difficult situation. Also, having them [the rides] be more frequent.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	SP	SV	Security is necessary, many incidents have taken place. Also, lowering the rates is necessary due to the economy.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	SP	SV	They must increase the time that BART users can use the parking lots around the BART stations. Maybe, with the use of a sticker on the car, the user can park for a longer time on the streets and keep the environment clean at the same time.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: don't tease the passengers!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: more Spare the Air days	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: reduce fares overall	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: save for a rainy day account	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: extend hours of service	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: more security	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: More trains to Richmond on Sundays (from SF) - a lot of UCB students - from now on look at this! Ridership and frequency of trains	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: fix air conditioning	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: open existing bathrooms, make accessible	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: rip out carpet, go back to linoleum - longer impact for money, waste to give temporary relief	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: Wifi on trains/capital improvements	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: more bathrooms in every station, maintain bathrooms and elevators	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: more cleanliness in stations	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	WG	We want something tangible, something we can see!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFE	ENG	CC	Late night service on weekends	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFE	ENG	CC	Sunday service to Richmond (or at least to Berkeley)	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFE	ENG	CC	Switch upholstery to plastic seating and linoleum floors!	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFE	ENG	SV	Please change the upholstery to plastic seating and linoleum floors. Long- late night service and Sunday Service to Richmond.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFE	SP	SV	The disabled* get everything dirty and treat us badly and they also offend the tourists. [*I think she means homeless]	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFM	ENG	CC	The temporary fare reduction is too small to amount to a savings. I would like to see more money placed into the reserves as well as cleaning up the cars - <u>hard plastic seats</u> and pulling up the carpet. (No more material seats - gross, yuck.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	Instead of fare decreases - better discounts for high value tickets - current discount of 6% is as about as small as the proposed decreases and it is clear that this is a miniscule amount. The better deal a riders gets over many trips, the more likely they are to expand their ridership. It is also nice to reward your riders - they are the ones who make the system work by paying fares on a regular basis.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	If you reduce fares - make it permanent not just for a few months. Don't pretend you are being "noble" by saving me a dollar today and then charge me two dollars next year!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	Keep the money for reserves.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	Re: temporary fare reduction: silly thinking to give back a "discount" which amounts only to a few dollars over 3 months - put the windfall money into resrves so that next year or the following year you don't have to increase the fares again and again.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	No temp fare reduction - use your imagination to create longer term proactive solutions, e.g.: attract new or disgruntled riders; assist riders in economic distress, e.g., on employment; upgrade 24th St. station; improve technology of vending machines; make an effort to improve community between BART and public	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
SFM	ENG	CC	Install signs upon entering Downtown SF stations which show which trains are pulling into station so people are not running down the stairs to catch the train and pushing people out of the way. Safety first -	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	Put some money into keeping the escalators at Balboa Park and Glen Park stations clean. "Pigeon poop" is unhealthy and disgusting.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	SV	A fare reduction is a waste of the funds. Riders are accustomed to current fares. Use extra money to clean the cars (get rid of carpet and upholstered seats) AND add more money into the reserve/savings. BART will need this surplus money later - <u>please</u> don't waste it on temporary, meager savings. It's not worth it!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	SV	Improve PA and signage in stations	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	SV	Save the money for the next deficit	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	SV	Stimulus fund should never subsidize fares, capital investments only.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFM	ENG	CC	I would like to see and hear each and every stop made on BART. Some announcers don't even bother making comments. I really would like a visual sign in each car. It would make life easier. (It would make it easier for first time riders.)	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFM	ENG	CC	Thank you for the opportunity to provide input to the Board. It would be nice to have more opportunities to have this dialogue, not just because you need federal funding; we promise not to bite.	Outreach
SFM	ENG	SV	My English is not so good, but I wanted to stay and participate with my presence. It was a nice meeting but I was only able to understand a little bit.	Outreach
SFM	ENG	SV	Thank you for the opportunity to interact with BART staff. This is my second meeting, and BART were a bit less dismissive of our comments. Good work!	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	CC	Use the money for the "Spare the Air Days"	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	<u>Cap</u> fares for fixed-income commuters: seniors, students, welfare recipients <u>permanently</u> .	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	Fare reduction: my proposal is for a permanent roll-back of the <u>one</u> staggering fee increase last year: the \$2.50 o.w. increase in fares to/from SFO. This "soak the tourist" measure has also soaked us Bay Area residents who try to do the right thing and take public transit and support BART. I've gone back to my car for many SFO trips.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	Global, futuristic fare structure: BART has considerable capacity at off-peak times and can use new and enhanced rider loads at those off-peak times. BART should charge the <u>current</u> fare at peak entry times/days and charge a significantly lower fare for entry to the system at off peak times (i.e., before 5:45am - after 9:30am and except for 3:30-6:30 pm M-F. This would attract many new riders who may well become full-price riders. This works well in Washington D.C. Metro.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	Lower the fare for one way trip from Powell Station to SFO.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	Can BART use the extra money to build a line from Oakland Coliseum to Oakland International Airport?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	CH	SV	Can't BART provide a monthly pass?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	SV	Extra money... don't believe it. Make sure the public knows what you did with the money.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	SV	Need more ideas? Take a look Japan Rail, London's Underground (the Tube), Euro Rail and other rail systems.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	SV	To make a minipass valid in Daly City to decrease the fare to SFO	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	SV	When you have more money go to San Jose, Bentwood, Stockton	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: use money to conduct a mailing of Bay Area	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Small reduction in fare, does not make a difference	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Senior fare reduction - 62.5% - at point of sale	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Spare the Air days	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Transfer for BART, Muni passes - Fast pass at Daly City	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: This is only temporary! - recommendation - cap fare for all riders on a fixed income (seniors, students)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: \$2.50 charge to SFO trips - too much! Cheaper to take SamTrans! - recommendation: reduce back to \$1.50 (first preference). Put funds to reliable service instead of fare reduction (second preference).	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: save for a rainy day - put the money in the bank! - earmark this so the public knows how it will be spent!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Fix problems with extra money	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: take a step back and aim to get more riders! - revamp system; 3 am train, longer trains, shuttles	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: build bigger parking lots	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: replace car seats	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SFSR	ENG	CC	Samtrans from downtown SF one way vs. BART - BART \$8.10; 292 (Local) \$4.00 - you save \$4.10; KX (Express) \$5.00 - you save \$3.10	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	ENG	CC	Bikes on BART: I see bikes brought on BART trains everyday at times disallowed by BART service rules (i.e. leaving downtown SF westbound at 5:00-5:30 pm. These bikes often block exits and conflict with high passenger loads. Enforcement? BART needs to either enforce the current rules or redesign access provisions for cyclists' bikes.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	ENG	CC	Other topics re. BART safety: commercial solicitors crowding egress at top of escalators, especially at Embarcadero and Montgomery stations. At these two stations, riders taking escalators to street level are often met <u>right at the top of the escalators</u> by solicitors passing out flyers, samples, newspapers, coupons and everything else. This causes an unsafe situation. There should be a solicitor-free zone of 15 feet around the top of BART escalators.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	CH	SV	I would like to know about the changes in SF bus lines. How are these changes beneficial to seniors? How are they convenient? How much have it save? (? Too scratchy to read)	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	CH	SV	I would like to know more about buses in SF, which is how seniors can be effort-saving and money-saving when taking buses.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	ENG	WG	Reduce salary of BART drivers - put this on survey (take one for citizens of SF)	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SFSR	ENG	CC	Kudos to the most welcoming BART outreach staff. This was a wonderful forum and staff made the public feel most welcome.	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	CC	When you seek public input/comment on a specialized issue ("major service reduction") put an explanation on your website.	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	CC	More meetings on weekends and weeknights	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	SV	I appreciate the community meetings like this. Thank you for your time.	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	WG	Comment cards/suggestions on BART trains to get input	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	WG	Provide the Board with all opinions	Outreach
SFSR	ENG	WG	Why is this only temporary? Not sure we will get it again	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
SNP	ENG	WG	Consistency and stability are important – fare reduction makes it confusing, not a great benefit	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	New floors are good!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Bike parking at BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Changes to bike parking services	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: cleaning cars	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Comply with AB32 (discussed re. issues of bicyclists on BART)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: elevator maintenance	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: improved coordination with other agencies – Translink, Clipper Card	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Increase hours when bikes can go on BART	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: More BART at night - more trains, more frequent	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: people who sell Translink cards have no idea at Walgreens - use money to educate people who sell tickets on options	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: put money in reserve to prevent more increase later	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: replacing seats	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: Retrofit cars to fit bikes	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Temporary Fare Reduction Alternative: senior discount	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SNP	ENG	WG	Airport Connector to Oakland need exact 3 dollars - too much money, too slow, inconvenient to have to pay cash	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SNP	ENG	WG	BART is not accessible to bike commuters	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SNP	ENG	WG	San Francisco connection goes to international terminal – takes too long	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SNP	ENG	WG	Translink card does not print balance on card	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SNP	ENG	WG	Direct BART to Oakland Airport – shuttle bus is too slow	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SNP	ENG	SV	I appreciate the opportunity to provide comments!	Outreach
SSF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: get rid of the 4 dollar increase to SFO	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SSF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: change seats to plastic (cleaner)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SSF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: clean up bird poo at South San Francisco	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SSF	ENG	WG	Temporary fare reduction alternative: maintenance and cleaning and sprucing up	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
SSF	ENG	WG	Hours of operation on weekends to airport	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SSF	ENG	WG	Noise on trains	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SSF	ENG	WG	Public transportation = too expensive/slow	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SSF	ENG	WG	The new floor is nice and looks clean	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
SSF	ENG	WG	What happens to the rest of the money?	Temporary Fare Reduction General Comments/Questions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: What to do with surplus Feedback: Please use the budget surplus to run more trains. Much less importantly, signs in front of the stations giving arrival information to prevent people from running for trains that already arrived or already left.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Why are commute hour trains on the Richmond-San Francisco line (both AM and PM) always shorted? They are always very crowded with standees, yet they are always only 9 or even 8 cars long. I would much rather you did not waste the millions of "surplus" dollars on a small, temporary fare reduction, but instead bought a few more train cars to add to the Richmond-San Francisco line.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: The BART Budget Feedback: As a daily rider of the BART system, please use the budget to do a thorough cleaning of the cars - NOT temporarily reduce the fares. Temporarily reducing fares is really only going to serve sporadic riders, not those people like myself who rely on the system every day to get them safely to work and home again. The cars, as i'm sure you're well aware, are disgusting. The fabric seats are stained and oftentimes its not evident if they are simply stained or if there's been a recent application of some sort of liquid. The cars smell badly as well. Perhaps the money that's been set aside for temporarily reducing fares could be used to convert the existing cars with the old floors to the new with the stain resistant finishes. I'm really open to pretty much anything but a reduced fare would be the last thing I would want you to do with the budget surplus. Thanks for your attention.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: BART surplus Feedback: Maybe BART could use a few of the surplus dollars to put up some "stand right, walk left" signs, for those people who think that "escalator" means "couch potato".	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Regarding the \$5 million surplus Feedback: Dear BART, I think the \$5 million should be added to the capital reserve fund. Any fare reduction will only be temporary and not worth the trouble. I'll feel better knowing that BART can recover from major catastrophes than receiving a minor fare reduction.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Parking Lot Security Cameras Feedback: I park on Orinda Bart daily. Two weeks ago my car, along with eight others cars, had their windows smashed and belongings rifled through. I'd like to know why there are no security cameras in the lot. I understand that with budget restraints a dedicated patrol car is probably out of the question but security cameras are fairly easy and cheap to set up these days. I now have to factor in the \$300 I had to spend to replace my window as an additional cost to my commute. Follow-up: Thanks for getting back to me with an honest response. It is a little troubling however since another round o break INS Have ocured since my incident. Last night there were three more piles of glass that I saw. Further follow-up: I just wanted to touch base with you about this issue again. Tonight as I got to my car I noticed several piles of glass throughout the Orinda parking lot. I've read in the news about barts surplus. Maybe some of that can be allocated towards better security. I think it's a shame that I'm charged for parking and feel so unsafe about the parking situation.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	As a BART rider in San Francisco, I wish to belatedly respond to your proposal to reduce fares with a projected, temporary surplus. If there is any surplus now or in the future, I would much rather see the return of more frequent evening and weekend service than a fare reduction. Thanks for listening!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Hello, If BART can save more money by putting in energy efficient lights then, please do that. I would also like to see newer seats in the trains. Thanks.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: \$5 Million Surplus. Feedback: recommend using \$5 Million Suplus to replace and reupholster all those caved in seats.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Surplus Money. Feedback: Could a public agency PLEASE make a responsible decision. Put the surplus in the rainy day fund. Have we learned nothing from the recent and current economy? Bart will need the money. Do not roll back fares. Pay back Bart customers like me by building a financially stable transit system I can count on.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: surplus. Feedback: DO NOT REDUCE FARES TEMPORARILY. Not a smart idea. Save it in reserve. \$5M is really just a drop in the bucket anyway. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: What to do with the unexpected surplus in the budget. Feedback: I hear that the Board is trying to decide what to do with the unplanned budget surplus. I understand that there are a few options being considered. While a short term fare reduction would be nice, I feel strongly that putting the money toward upgrading the fleet of cars is the smartest way to invest this money. The cars are ageing and I worry that they will start having problems before you can bring the new fleet of cars online. Thanks for considering the opinion of a 7-day a week rider!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Extra Money should be used for PLASTIC SEATS. Feedback: We don't want temporary roll back on fares. We need PLASTIC SEATS instead!!! The fabric seats absorb bad odors from throw up, urine, etc! Even if you can't replace all the train with plastic seats, some trains are better than none.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Board of Directors: It would be wonderful for the surplus money from this fiscal year be donated to local bay area school districts facing a fiscal crisis. I am an employee of the San Francisco Unified School District where 200 teachers received final lay off notices. A large portion of bart riders (such as myself) are either public school employees or public school students. Donating this money amongst local districts would be a wonderful contribution to public education. Thank you and God Bless! Peace, Love and Harmony	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	This morning I was elated to read in the Chronicle that BART has an operating surplus for the coming budget year. I am writing to strongly encourage restoring 15 minutes Sunday service, or even better, evening and last hour service. The Sunday service restoration reportedly costs a fraction of other proposals (at \$1.5 million), such as the fare cut gimmick (which could at best net daily commuters a total of \$2-\$3 per week and cost twice as much), and would go a long way towards incentivizing more weekend use of the system while simultaneously reducing the load burden at some of the busiest times on Sundays. As BART Board members frequently mentioned in 2007 and 2008, both the physical and psychological burden of having to wait up to, or late at night, in excess of 20 minutes, only to have a packed train show up, just give residents and odd-shift workers more reasons not to take the train. As Director Radulovich mentions, it is essential to build a reserve against future service and maintenance cuts. Please do the right thing, and don't throw Bay Area taxpayers' money away on frivolous election-year fare-cutting policies.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	BART Board Members, After riding daily on BART for over two years, I believe: The rollback of fares is not appropriate at this time. BART must have sufficient reserves for future unanticipated expenses; Deep cleaning is a waste of monies; I like the idea of synthetic seats or better yet, molded 'plastic' (something that does not require a lot of maintenance), as people eat, sleep, and put their feet on seats; remove the remainder of carpeting and replace with the other flooring; I like the idea of energy efficient lighting, but is it wise depending on the life cycle of individual cars. Thank you for reading and considering my observations.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Board Members, please use the surplus money you just received on funding for Spare the Air days. It was a very successful program while it lasted. Spending the money in this matter would not only benefit the riders, but also the environment. It could be a great publicity point for BART's efforts to go green. Please consider this option. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Board of Directors: fare reduction is <u>not</u> the best way to use the 4.5 million surplus to show rider appreciation. Since it is proposed to reduce fares on Sundays for a couple of months, most riders will not benefit from this fare reduction. The only type of fare reduction that should be considered would be a fare reduction that would benefit regular fare riders every day. The best use for the 4.5 million budget surplus is to use it to benefit all riders on long term basis such as cleaning, repairing or replacing seats in the cars. Another area that seriously needs improvement, it to educate station agents to be fair and unbiased in dealing with rider needs. Improving the condition of cars and improving station agent work ethics will benefit all riders in the long run and thus improve BART ridership and therefore, increase revenue from riders. Please consider only options for rider appreciation that will benefit all riders. Thank you. P.S. It is not necessary to spend any funds for consultants in how to use the surplus.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Regarding the \$4.5 million in projected surplus funds: <u>Please</u> commit more money to cleaning and updating the trains!!! A temporary fare reduction of 3% is not going to make any difference to anyone, and I'm saying that as a daily commuter traveling from Dublin/Pleasanton to Embarcadero. You'll just have people complaining that you are always raising fares when you remove the reduction. Some of the trains are disgusting, smell like urine, have little or no ventilation in the cars. Do any of you ever actually ride BART? I ride with Purell on hand at all times, and still tell my kids not to touch me when I get home until I change clothes and scrub my hands. Whose brilliant idea was it to install cloth seats and carpet on public transportation? If you go anywhere else in the world, plastic is used - health is actually more important to most people than comfort. Clean, and update - it is LONG overdue and much needed.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Please allot funds for cleanup of stations and station entrances. The station entrances, (especially stairs to the Berkeley station) ceilings in stations (especially Montgomery), and the waiting areas in general need cleaning, which has been neglected for very long. Please allow for regular cleanup. Thanks very much.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board of Directors, I would like to request that BART keep parking FREE at the stations that currently offer free parking. That would help. Thank you very much.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	To whom it may concern, as a daily BART rider I would like to see the money spend on better/more maintenance of the BART trains. It can get frustrating when trains get stuck or are taken out of service. This usually causes long delays, frustration, and full cars. The frequency of those delays has increased in my opinion and if I have a flight to catch or an important meeting, I would rather drive by car. To me, this is more important than a fare reduction. Thank you very much for your consideration.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Directors, I am writing a public comment with my concern for how you are planning on spending the "surplus" that BART has for the rest of this fiscal year. While I understand that this is an election year, I find it sad that you would try and provide temporary givebacks or gimmicks when in fact you have a gaping budget gap for next year. Why not save the money so that next year when there is a large budget gap, we can use the money saved from this years budget to pay for some of next year's gap. In any business organization and even in many public organizations such as the UC system, this would be the case. I fear that these budget gimmicks will make BART be in worse shape come next year and precipitate further fare increases or service decreases. Don't end up like SF Muni and have a responsible budget please.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	BART Board Members: I understand that you are considering how to spend a surplus. I recommend that you consider maintenance to reduce the noise level of the BART cars. I have ridden BART daily between South Hayward and Embarcadero for 35 years. For the last year or so, the noise level of trains entering Embarcadero station, as well as in transit through the tube and subways, has become excruciating. I am sure that, if you ask train operators, they will confirm that they see passengers on the platform plugging their ears when the trains enter the station. I suspect that the noise is due to misalignment of the train wheels, which results in rubbing the tracks and squealing. Better alignment should not only reduce the noise but also power consumption due to less friction, which would lower operating costs. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Directors: As I will not be able to attend any of the scheduled public hearings, I am forwarding my comments via email. While, on a personal level, it would be nice to benefit from four months of deferral on fare increases, I would prefer to see the surplus funds used for improvements such as new seats and hooks large enough for hanging purses, backpacks, and coats in bathrooms. It is quite unpleasant and unsanitary to have to put one's personal items on the bathroom floors, especially in the winter when long coats are a standard part of daily wear. Thank you for considering my comments. I commute daily from El Cerrito to Fremont and have been a full-time BART commuter for 22 years.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Allocation of Surplus Funds. May I suggest improvements to the MacArthur Station? The upper-level platforms are so noisy from the several lanes of freeway traffic just a few yards away that it's difficult to use a cell phone. MacArthur is perhaps the most important station in the system for changing trains. There are other stations in the system that are glassed-in to keep out street noise and cold wind. Why can't an important station like MacArthur be quieter and more comfortable?	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board Members, please consider not allocating funds to supplement fares. 3% over 4 months will mainly benefit those riders who qualify for the IRS Qualified Transportation Fringe, leaving other riders "out in the cold," I believe. I would sure like to see the inward facing seating around the mid-carriage doors reupholstered on as many cars as possible. I believe that these seats are the heaviest used and more susceptible to snagging from bicycles and wheelchairs. Please consider investing in physical plant improvements rather than "drop in the bucket" rebates. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Honorable BART Board Members: As a rider of both the Capitol Corridor and the BART to access my Continental Airlines flights to/from Newark and Cleveland in and out of San Francisco International, I would like to see the possibility of direct BART service out of the Richmond Station to the San Francisco International Airport. Your invitation to riders like me on your website, http://www.bart.gov/ was eye-catching to say the least. I hope you welcome my comments for developing your budget and your service plan for the upcoming 2010/2011 Fiscal Year, which begins on Thursday 01 July 2010. I'm almost certain there are riders that fit my profile and utilize Capitol Corridor Service to Richmond first and then BART to get to and from their flights at San Francisco International Airport. Please consider my comments and the importance of the role that Capitol Corridor Ridership plays into increasing ridership on the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) System. Your reply and/or feedback to me is very important.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Keep the money in reserve. A temporary reduction in fares will not give a good psychological effect when you raise the fare more than the decrease next time.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board of Directors, I am writing because I wanted to let you know my opinion on the proposed temporary fare reduction. I think it would be more beneficial to add service and extend hours rather than reduce fares at this point. Fares were already increased and people are used to the current fares. If they are reduced for a few months, customers will just get frustrated when they are raised again. I would much rather see longer service hours and more frequent trains. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	I read the following quote this evening. Board President James Fang of San Francisco, who is one of the directors running for re-election, said in a statement, "What the BART Board did was historic. I have never heard of a transit agency anywhere in the world lowering fares when times are good, let alone when times are bad." Of course it's historic. No other transit agency in the county is staffed with fiscally irresponsible idiots. BART can barely keep its head above water and you decide to give back what little surplus BART was able to eek out. I can't believe you and a majority of your colleagues on the board are so fiscally irresponsible. You will most likely have to raise fares again soon after your election battle. I can't believe you would stoop to such irresponsibility to get re elected. You should be ashamed of your self. I wonder how you can look at yourself in the mirror making such an irresponsible decision.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear honorable ladies and gentlemen of the BART Board of Directors, your decision is a no-brainer. CLEAN THE CARS and RE-DO THE UPHOLSTERY/SEATS. This will provide a better longer lasting environment than a temporary roll-back in fares. Thank you for your attention to this budget matter.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	As a 10 year user of the BART system I think that instead of giving the money back to riders in fare reductions you need to use the money to clean up the system. 1. The stations need to be cleaned up; the entrance and exits of many stations are filthy. (Civic Center and Powell are classic examples.) 2. The escalators in SF stations are filthy and they all smell of urine. (Civic Center and others.) 3. There are always 3-4 elevators out of service in the system at all times. How are the disabled supposed to use the system easily? 4. The seats in many cars are fabric, and are dirty and stained. There need to be more plastic seats. 5. You need to have more cars with linoleum flooring and plastic seats so the cars can be washed out with a hose and squeegee to remove the water. 6. There needs to be more BART police riding the trains to prevent theft and harrassment by the homeless. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	No fare reductions please...I didn't like the fare increases last year, but I learned to live with it. Any temporary fare reduction will be seen as a ploy for the directors up for reelection. Also, it'll lead to fare confusion because surely the fares will be raised up again. Use any budget surplus responsibly by building a reserve. There are many worthwhile projects that will be need funding. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Use the budgeted fare decrease for deep cleaning of the cars. As a BART rider who usually boards at North Berkeley then transfers at one of the Oakland stations, instead of a temporary fare reduction, you should be deep cleaning and maintaining not only the mechanical systems of "all" of the cars but the interiors as well, not only cars that are on lines other than the Richmond/Fremont line. It is like night and day between the Richmond/Fremont line cars and the others. You can tell which line you are on by looking at the state of the car interior or noting if the air conditioning is nonexistent. This is ridiculous. The cars will last longer if properly maintained, and it would be a much more pleasant ride without having dark grease marks on all of the seats where people's hair oils/products have soiled the upholstery. The carpeting is disgraceful. Why don't these decrepit cars ever end up on the suburban/SF lines? Because those riders won't and don't have to put up with it for some reason. It's time to clean up all cars.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Surplus. I think we need trains to run 24/7 and more frequently. At a minimum, trains should run later on fri night/sat am and sat night/sun morning.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Please use the surplus for additional BART service, more trains all of the time. Another idea would be to show the BART train status on the top of the platform to prevent unnecessary running up/down stairs or escalators	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Good Day! This past month, I have experienced numerous delays while using BART. Either I have 30-45 minutes late to work or going home. These delays negatively impact both my professional and personal life. Today, I must forgo one hour's wages as I am unable to make up the time I was late getting to work due to BART. Reducing fares temporarily won't solve the ongoing problem of equipment failure and delays. But using those funds to upgrade equipment will go a long way to improving service and increasing ridership. The most often cited reason people don't use BART is because of the on-going service delays, not the cost. I would rather forgo a few extra pennies in my pocket than continue to sacrifice my professional and personal time. I suggest WOWing the socks off the public by providing superior service. Word will spread and BART's coffers will surely swell. Thank you for considering my views.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Gail Murray, you represent me on the BART Board. Please vote to save money in a rainy day fund. In these touch economic times, families are finally realizing why they should have a financial cushion in a savings account. BART should have a similar cushion. I'd rather see savings now than reading about the need to cut benefits for your employees when the next contract is negotiated. The article in today's Contra Costa Times said the reduction would be 15 cents for a ride from Walnut Creek to downtown San Francisco. That wouldn't even give me one more ride on a \$60 blue ticket. I don't think I'd notice the difference until the temporary decrease was over. What I'd notice is the increase back to current levels. SAVE MONEY please. I want all directors to know how I feel about this.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	I would like to suggest that the extra money you are thinking of returning to riders in the form of free fares be used in a better way. I am a 13 year veteran commuter to San Francisco. I would like to see the funds put towards replacing the seats with plastic seats. The cloth seats are disgusting! Many of us commuters will not sit in seats that are stained with who knows what? I think plastic seats are more sanitary because they can be cleaned with disinfectant. Have you ever seen these stained seats? I have to search for the stain free seats that are few and far between to find on the Dublin line. Fremont cars, which I have an optoin to ride, are more disgusting! I am unable to attend the public forum on this matter, so please consider my opinion as a vote for cleaner cars! Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	As regular rider, I strongly oppose the proposal to institute a minor, temporary reduction in BART fares. BART should instead use its modest, temporary surplus either to replenish its reserve fund or to carry out one-time projects that will meaningfully improve the quality of BART service. Please do not squander this unusual financial opportunity on an obvious politcal gimmick that will do nothing either to improve BART service or to improve BART's long-term financial stability. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Subject: Radulovich, Murray and Blalock. Kudos to you for advocating fiscal responsibility and voting against a temporary fare decrease. I can't believe a majority of your colleagues are so fiscally irresponsible. BART can barely make ends meet. In these days of lower fare box revenue and cuts in funds from state, local and federal governments, BART should be proud of the surplus and put it in the bank for a rainy day. We know those days are coming. How does one attend one of the community hearings over the next few weeks to voice opposition to a temporary fare decrease? It's just a political ploy by the members running for re-election.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board, I am glad that BART passed an operating budget that contains a surplus. Rather than waste this surplus on a very temporary 3% fare reduction (a reduction that likely will not result in consumer behavior changes), BART should work to improve long term cost control that includes improving distribution of RFID fare-cards, which will reduce distribution costs. BART might also consider using RFID cards to improve use of BART in off-times, for example, people who use BART week-daily to commute might be offered free BART fare using their RFID card on the weekend, in doing so, they might take their family who might otherwise travel by car.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Hello again, I emailed my comments a few weeks ago, and the meeting at Richmond will not meet my work schedule, so I want to reiterate my concern about reducing fares for 4 months. There were two breakdowns this morning coming out of the Richmond BART station, which to me, indicates that these additional monies are sorely needed to keep trains running efficiently and on-time and not for a meager fare reduction. People want timely service that they can count on and that means trains and tracks that are maintained. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	So far in June here is my experience commuting on BART from Concord to Embarcadero: June 1: embarcadero escalator ooo and ten minute delay due to brake problems; June 2: embarcadero and concord escalator ooo; June 3: concord station agent servicing two ticket machines right during the morning commute – almost missed train; June 8: embarcadero escalator ooo; June 9: embarcadero escalator ooo; June 10: embarcadero escalator ooo; June 14: embarcadero escalator ooo; June 15: embarcadero escalator ooo. Out of days commuting from Concord to Embarcadero: 7 days have experienced a broken escalator = 78% of the time; 8 days experience some sort of inconvenience = 89% of the time. I think you should consider using any extra funds on infrastructure improvements and not fare reductions. Thanks.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Please spend some of the surplus to upgrade the bathrooms. They are a disgrace.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Hi - I am responding to requests for comments regarding the proposal to "return" BART funds to passengers. My suggestion is to use the "windfall" to 1) clean and maintain restrooms in BART stations and 2) clean BART stations.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Re: Safety concerns. I did wish to express my concern over the low train frequency to and from Fremont/Daly City...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 5, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Members of the BART Board, Thank you for consulting riders like me about how to allocate BART's expected 2010/2011 surplus...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 6, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Directors, I'm writing to express my opposition to the proposed fare reduction. I use BART daily for my commute to and from work...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 7, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	ATTN: BART directors (especially Mr. McPartland)...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 8, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	I would like to make a comment about the possibility of lowering the BART fare...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 9, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Hi, BART. I just heard on ABC7 News that funds were found, or received, by surprise...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 10, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Gail Murray, I just heard BART just "found" \$5 million and is reported to be considering if BART should reduce fares for a brief period or use it to repair the seats...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 11, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board of Directors, I cannot attend any of the community meetings due to conflicting schedules...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 12, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear Board of Directors, by the time anyone reads this email you will probably have voted on spending all of the 4.5 million dollar surplus on one thing or another...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 13, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear President Fang and members of the BART Board: Through the news and information being handed out at BART stations, I have become aware of the BART surplus...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 14, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board of Directors, I recently read that BART is considering fare reductions as a result of a (temporary) budget surplus...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 15, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	Dear BART Board of Directors, Thank you for this opportunity to provide input on a unique circumstance...a surplus!...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 16, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	EM	The talk of roll back of fares or customer appreciation days where a fare is not charged is ridiculous...(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 17, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Regarding the surplus, save it to prevent future fare increases. Honestly, a 5-to-30-cent fare reduction won't save my enough \$ to matter. Use the money for spare the air days!!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The money would be better spent on more frequent cleaning of cars and stations, longer or more frequent cars, or better supervision/monitoring of stations. (The 19th St. station is AWFUL with middle school/high school kids playing on the escalators and near the tracks.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Take BART to North Bay! At least just across the Richmond/San Rafael bridge	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	If you are considering what to do with a one-time windfall, I think the system could benefit from as much cleaning and repair as possible.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Would rather see a rainy day fund or expanded service than a tiny fare reduction. This sounds like political pandering rather than a meaningful change.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	My overall concern is, I think the surplus would be better utilized by placing it in a reserve fund for a "rainy day".	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I love BART- My only, only complaint is how often people refuse to use BART for recreation (eg. crossing the bay) because the service cuts off at such an early hour. Look at how popular it is for special events (NYE, or the bay bridge closures) - I'm sure that it would remain worth it!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I'm tired of BART lecturing us about how later-night or all-night service is impossible. The New York subway does it somehow; there's obviously a way to do it. If it takes more trains, people, or other resources, present a plan and ask for money, perhaps using the ballot measure or connections with Pelosi. Stop making excuses and find a way. At the very least, BART should run on weekends till after 2:00 a.m., when bars close. This would improve life for clubgoers and keep drunk drivers off the road.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Inconsequential short-term fare increases are goofy. People are concerned about making long term plans for their commutes -- so spend the money on something that will continue to be useful.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I'm concerned that spending the surplus on a temporary fare reduction will create backlash when the fares are increased again after the reduction period is over. I prefer fares to stay the same, even if they are high.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	quit defrauding the public. run bart like a public transit agency not a fortune 500 buisness	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	I think a major service change should be in the realm of 50%. The proposed fare reduction is ludicrous. I would much rather the money be spent on car maintenance or set-aside for replacement. Anyone who spends any amount of time in the BART cars knows how disgusting and cramped they can get. If you really want to make the riders happy buy better cars that can accommodate sittee, standers, and bikers and clean up easier and are easy to enter/exit.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Use the surplus to make long-term investments in increasing the frequency and length of trains, and maintaining the fleet. A short-term rebate to riders is short-sighted.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Please extend the hours of service on FRI and SAT only for another two hours. this would be good for safety, tourism, music, etc. without making all your down-time programs suffer. Give it 6 mos as a trial run. nightlife special.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Latenight weekend service please	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	oppose fare reductions, prefer money be put in reserves	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	If the extension from Walnut Creek to Dublin could be made, it would gather in many more BART users and assist people in general who need to get from one place to the other.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I have long been distressed that BART stops running around midnight. It would help to be able to go out and not have to make the choice between paying for a cab home or going home early.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	A temporary fare rollback is a gimmick of an idea that would hardly save riders money. A rider spending \$40 per week would see less than the minimum BART fare as their "giveback." Instead, please use the money to clean trains or increase service. Even a couple of extra trains in the "last hour" of service would be great: 25-30 minute waits from the outdoor airport stations at midnight are unpleasant, to say the least.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Since you just raised fares and this is 'one time' surplus, it would be better to use the funds to upgrade existing situation. Not for salaries though.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	To be a BART rider and to be ambulatorily challenged is a curse. Half the escalators are broken and the elevators require walking further when one already is having difficulties walking. The escalators seem to be out of service for months at a time.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I am concerned that the four directors up for re-election are using this temporary fare reduction as a political ploy to get re-elected...they will not get my vote. The temporary fare reduction does not really save that much money for me I will not even notice the 30 or 60 cent reduction. Save your money BART.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	A minor fare change will not make a big impact on individual riders- but well-functioning tracks, trains, and stations will make taking BART more pleasant for everyone. I rely on BART for nearly all of my transit needs and have experienced large numbers of delays, service interruptions, and malfunctions in recent months. PLEASE be fiscally responsible and invest this surplus into maintaining the functionality of the system for the long term.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	My primary concerns around BART (and any public transit service) are affordability, availability/reliability, and environmental impact. It needs to be a pleasant and affordable experience to encourage ridership. In terms of the available funds, there needs to be clear messaging around the fact that this was a one-time event. Making the rider experience more pleasant would make sense - it's a concrete improvement that you can tie to these funds and it has a long-term impact. Offering a temporary fare decrease or delaying a fare increase doesn't improve the experience of riding BART and it's easy for the impact to be dispersed too widely for people to appreciate. Interiors: For cleanliness concerns (including possible infestations of fleas or bedbugs) I encourage BART to incorporate hard flooring and seating in all its cars. I know there were some test cars with one or both. It should be as easy and inexpensive as possible to keep these clean. This also affects rider perception around performance.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	BART should use these funds to clean cars and install new energy-saving technologies, NOT use them as a political ploy to curry favor with riders.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Please consider adding a line directly from Hayward to Millbrae through Foster City. It'll alleviate traffic from Hayward to the Peninsula instead of taking a long trip to San Francisco. Also adding a line from Vallejo to El Cerrito Del Norte or Richmond, or from El Cerrito to Hercules. I commute from Vallejo to Burlingame everyday. I've met other people through casual carpool that work past SF, even to Redwood City and to San Jose.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The BART trains are very dirty and smell horrible. The newer trains with the carpeting removed are much better. I would like to see the money spent on continuing the removal of carpeting in all trains and coming up with a more health conscious way of covering the seats instead of cloth that just harbors bacteria, disease, and nasty smells.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Lowering fares permanently would be your best goal.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The BART trains are filthy, smelly and invariable over-priced. Frequency is good as it stands but I have regularly seen fleas and other pests crawling around the floors. Shame on you BART!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	BART cars are in need of serious cleaning or replacement. The carpets and seats are a disgrace. They should be pulled out and replaced with new upholstered floors and seats. I really dislike riding BART because of the dirt and smell. I ride it only when I have to and do so holding my nose.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Bart needs to replace current cars with modern, quiet cars. Current cars are old and outdated. Current cars produce way too much noise and should be considered a serious health hazard to those who ride BART often enough.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Examples should have been provided regarding major service changes of 25% or more. DO NOT SPEND THE SURPLUS MONEY! It is not much to begin with and I would rather that money be put into a reserve fund for future use or emergencies. With an uncertain economic climate, organizations and companies such as BART need to be responsible and look to the future. As a customer, I appreciate long term savings any day over short term savings.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	The system is CRUCIAL and ESSENTIAL to the Bay Area and when the system is working well it is the BEST commute option, Bar None, for me. When there are problems, however, it can be so miserable. Thankfully, there are not regularly or many issues, at least not on my commute times. THE ONE THING that I (and almost all of the other BART riders that I have discussed this with) is that the workers/union for an essential public transportation system SHOULD NOT BE ALLOWED TO STRIKE!! The loyal and dependent riders should NOT be held "hostage" or be the ones who quite literally PAY THE PRICE for labor negotiations THAT WE HAVE NO CONTROL OR SAY OVER WHATSOEVER! Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	A temp pay break won't help Board members get re-elected, do what's best in the long term.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I continually wonder why there is not a college student discount pass offered when there are passes for every other group- kids, seniors, disabled people, etc. I live in the East Bay and go to school in San Francisco and live solely off of student loans. For someone with no income of my own, the \$6.20 that I spend every day to get to and from school definitely adds up. At the very least, some sort of discount or monthly pass for commuters from the East Bay would be wonderful since we are all doing our best to decrease pollution and congestion in the city and on the Bay Bridge by using BART, yet don't have a monthly MUNI pass available to us like people who live in SF.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	How are decisions made as to <i>[comment cuts off here]</i>	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I would like to know when BART is *really* going to get serious about: 1) enforcing the bicycle rules 2) no eating on BART rules	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Trains are so LOUD - any way to reduce screeching would be great.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I would rather see the surplus be put into a fund to help offset future rate increases or to be used for urgent repairs.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The cost to implement the temporary fare reduction is wasteful. You have spend the same amount or more to change the fares back. Clean the trains, they are filthy. Clean the trains, they are smelly. Clean the trains, they are full of bacteria. JUST CLEAN THE TRAINS INTERIOR AND EXTERIOR NOW!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Save money for a rainy day fund. If BART prices could go back down permanently, it'd be nice to stimulate more people to take public transit. However, any small price reduction is not worth it at this point, as I'd not even save a dollar a week. If prices went back to where they had been before, I'd be able to save over \$3 a week.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Bart cars need to be maintained and cleaned more often. The inside is very smelly, feels dirty, and looks dirty. You would not want to ride in a dirty car, so why make everyone else ride in dirty trains.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I think a temporary fare reduction is a terrible idea. Riders will just get mad again when you have to eventually raise the rates back to where they were. There is a significant lack of appropriate station signage in most BART stations and it is very difficult for out of town visitors to know what station they are in without exiting the train to check. PLEASE take the extra money to IMPROVE STATION SIGNAGE so that riders can immediately tell what station they are in while seated in the train. I am a graduate of the MFA in Design program at the California College of the Arts and the BS in Design program at UC Davis and would be happy to help assist BART in working on station signage at no cost.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	Place BIG no smoking signs in BART stations, announce station name as trains come up, use BIGGER station signs so we can see it through the darkened train windows, open those closed restrooms and well-cleaned restrooms.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	to ride bart is too expensive ,plus we have to pay for parking is exploitation ,since we try to help the environmental and not to use the car ,but we thinking to use it because is becoming to expensive to ride bart.thank you whom may concern.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Monday-Friday I commute from Pleasant Hill to Montgomery Street. For me, the priorities are a safe ride, timeliness, and comfort, in that order. I believe cleaner, refurbished trains and stations would have a greater impact on the daily commute than a short term fare reduction.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	BART needs to extend its service beyond Fremont to Santa Clara County. Also, parking spaces need to be increased. The price of oil will keep increasing and therefore we really need a successful public transit system like BART to keep working and to keep increase geographical coverage.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Please replace new seats and floors!!! I take BART daily and the long 45-minute ride on a hard, springy seat is very uncomfortable. The trains also smell because of the carpeted surfaces. This BART article says it all: http://www.bart.gov/news/articles/2008/news20080327.aspx	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	This surplus is a GREAT opportunity to test nominal reduction of current fares during weekends and non-commute hours and should not be wasted on the short term! This is long overdue and I believe the best way to spend any current surplus, for this may likely grow your business. The beneficiaries are seniors, kids, families, and the unemployed and in my belief is most equitable use of \$\$\$\$. 3-6 month reduction is not enough to benefit most consumers and the later impending increase will be bad PR and sour to all. Now is time to encourage new deserving people to consider Bart for the long term. With this one-time surplus, what better opportunity to conduct a 12 month test, to see if this incentive improves Bart services to a wide deserving pool of riders and in fact improve your bottom line. As a recently unemployed marketing analyst, I feel this model best serves your ridership public and is the right decision. Good luck. - DA	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	you should use any surplus monies on air conditioning maintenance and ensuring the HVAC's on the cars are working for the summer months. I ride from the dublin station every day and have yet to sit in an adequately air conditioned car this year. spending money on cleaning seats is the same as throwing it away. the cost is far in excess of the small amount of cars that would be affected	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Would like to see a flat charge, instead of price based on distance used. Train is used X distance, so cost to run is constant, regardless how far any one passenger travels. Use the service, pay a flat rate. Let short trippers use local buses. Gear BART to service long distance riders and commuters.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Use the surplus money to postpone increases; less than 5% decrease for such a short period (ie less than 4 months) which equates only to 0.05-0.30 cents will NOT help. Just use it to stave off increases until funding runs out.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	please put the Surplus into an interest-bearing fund or emergency fund or capital improvements fund. not worth it to fund miniscule fare reductions. don't bother.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Get rid of underperforming or rude BART employees--that's a real waste of our taxpayers' money.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	I would just like to express as a daily commuter (Fremont to SF) that I DO NOT support the temporary fee reduction. I would MUCH rather prefer BART to spend the surplus on cleaning and refurbishing the BART cars/trains. Thank you.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The cars smell moldy and since we can't open windows we are stuck with the air quality. The bathrooms are gross. Your hands have to be dry to hold your ticket to get out, but the hand dryer is totally ineffective!!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Your meetings are designed to justify your mistakes. Your questions do not reveal how you made or are making decisions. You ignore public input You perpetuate fraud by mismanagement.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Please, if service is interrupted along a line running 2 routes, please don't run 3 trains for one route and none for the other. Fair's fair.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	It would have been useful to know what the consequences of declaring a Major Service Change would be. Also, I strongly oppose reducing BART fares for a few months. No one will be able to tell the difference and the money will be squandered.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	bart is too expensive for college students. i really wish they would implement some kind of student discount for students past high school. i spend \$7 a day traveling to school. even a savings of \$1 a day would be great.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I would like BART to increase the frequency from Fremont to SF. Or schedule trains in such a way that I can catch a connecting train to SF from Bay Fair or Lake Merrit. OR add some express trains in the early morning and evenings.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	How about you save the surplus for the next inevitable deficit and round of fare hikes? Temporary fare reductions seem like an incredibly irresponsible way of managing BART's finances.	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Street level next-train signs would be extremely helpful. If a person boards enters the pay area on the weekend just after a train has left the station, he is trapped in the station for 20 minutes (or he is forced to pay a heavy fee to exit through the same station he entered). 15 minute off-peak headways would be extremely appreciated on the Pittsburg / Baypoint line. Although I would appreciate lower fares, I would much rather pay the same (or more) and see the service improved. I don't own a car and use BART 7 days per week. Longer headways and wait times mean time whittled away from my day. Thanks much for you consideration!	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	I take BART daily to work from my home in Glen Park to Oakland City Center and usually take BART otherwise to other destinations as I rarely drive and BART is very convenient....(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 1 for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Please dont make any "temporary" roll-back on fees....(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 2, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	The Bay Area Transit agencies need to work together as one to move as many people as possible for the lowest cost....(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 3, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions
N/A	ENG	ON	Dear BART, I am a daily BART rider who commutes from Fremont to work in downtown Oakland....(full comment too lengthy to include, please see Appendix B, Additional Comments, Additional Comment 4, for continuation.)	Alternatives to Temporary Fare Reductions

Appendix A: Public Comment Database

Temporary Fare Reduction and Public Participation Process

Mtg.	Language	Source	Comment	Main Theme
N/A	ENG	ON	I have been taking Bart less often because o can't afford it and the wait for trains at night and on weekends is really frustrating in the east bay. I think that everyone should switch to clipper. It has made my travel so much easier.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	Justice for Oscar Grant!	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	Overall, I like BART. It's pretty dependable. I would like to see the cars cleaner. I would like to see different signage in the stations, like what they have in Washington DC's metro system. People like to see when the trains are coming ALL the time. We want to know what's next and when our train is coming. The current ones sort of do it but check out DC's. I would like BART etiquette plastered all over the place signage-wise. People are so rude and inconsiderate. They need reminders as many were not brought up correctly by their parents and haven't learned it or need reminders.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	Bicycle rules need to be enforced especially during commute hours. Fines for bringing a bike on a commute train should be higher than for eating/drinking on BART (drinking coffee doesn't take up extra seats or standing room). Bikes should be restricted to the last 2 cars of a train. A 2nd or subsequent infraction should lead to impounding of a bicycle. Change all signs regarding bikes so that the first words are "Bikes are not allowed on commute-hour trains or..." People only read the first 4-5 words and ignore everything else.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	Fremont line should have more direct trains to SFO. Time at 12th to switch used to be better---it's too scary to travel there for events in SF once it gets dark	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	Less drug use and alcohol on the BART please.	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	ON	remember oscar grant!	General Comments/Questions re BART Service
N/A	ENG	EM	Regarding these meetings: http://www.bart.gov/news/articles/2010/news20100603b.aspx - every single one of them is during working hours. This makes no sense - Bart is primarily used by commuters, and workig people cannot simply take days off to attend meetings they aren't getting paid for. There's simply no way that the people who come to these meetings represent the average Bart rider in any way. From now on, let's do the sensible thing and hold meetings outside of working hours. Thanks.	Outreach

Appendix B: Additional Comments

The following comments were received either as part of responses to the web survey on BART's website or in the form of direct emails to the BART Board of Directors or staff. Since, for technical reasons, these comments are too lengthy to fit in the comments database format, this appendix has been added to present them in full.

Additional Comment 1

I take BART daily to work from my home in Glen Park to Oakland City Center and usually take BART otherwise to other destinations as I rarely drive and BART is very convenient. My husband takes BART daily to work to downtown SF and our son, who is legally blind, takes BART daily to many destinations. In other words, my family is a big BART fan and we are BART/Bike people!! However, as to your money surplus, PLEASE CLEAN UP YOUR DIRTY CARS! There are times I won't even sit even in an empty car because the cloth seats are so disgusting ~ and the carpeting is as nasty as it gets!! Your new linoleum floors are a MUCH needed improvement! I notice most of the cars with the new floors are in the first car with the train operator ~ is this intentional for the operator's comfort? What about the rest of the cars with gross spills and stains all over the carpeting and seating where we must all sit or stand? I recently returned from Europe taking public transportation in London and all throughout Italy ~ their cars are spotless and comfortable!! Also, I've traveled in Caracas, Venezuela, and their subway system is also spotless ~ and that is considered a "third-world" country!! I always wonder what tourists think when they take BART from the airport where getting on dirty cars is their first impression... While I would love lower fares, and I understand there are challenges with the general public and their habits, I am happy to pay what I pay now if the cars are just CLEAN and well MAINTAINED ~ that the permanently stained seat covers (cloth, BAD idea) and flooring (carpeting, BAD idea) could be replaced and the rules of NOT eating or drinking on the trains be better enforced!! Thank you for the opportunity to give my input.

Additional Comment 2

Please don't make any "temporary" roll-back on fees. The best thing to do with any little bit of extra money is improve service or save for a rainy day. I like BART and I would like it to become my primary means of transportation one day. I'd like to give up the car completely, but its just not practical yet as 1) trains do not run late enough, especially on weekends 2)trains do not run frequently enough, especially on weekends 3) lines do not extend far enough. For one thing, Muni connections are there, but unreliable if you have to go anywhere other than Market St or Mission Dist in SF. I'd like to see a San Mateo Bridge line to connect San Mateo and Pleasanton, and I'd also like to see the BART go all the way around the Bay. Cal Trains link in Millbrae, as do buses, but again - there is poor coordination and too few trains/buses so you wait a long time for the connection, especially outside of commute hours. Very inconvenient. Only the BART leg works well. I'd like to see a BART connection to the Golden Gate, Marina District, GG Park and SF State areas. Also and finally I like the fact that BART remains less grungy than most city subways, it still has a more "upscale" feel and tends to be safer and more pleasant, so I like the policing and cleanliness factor to remain high. One more thing - if at all possible, - do something to reduce the noise in tunnels. I have to wear earplugs to protect my hearing, it gets that loud in there. In short, please use the money to improve and maintain high level of service. Thank you.

Additional Comment 3

The Bay Area Transit agencies need to work together as one to move as many people as possible for the lowest cost. Optimizing for efficiency and effectiveness in schedules and routes will drive greater ridership despite declining state revenues. This will help revive the entire Bay Area economy. As a 3.5 year CA resident, it is sorely disappointing to see the lack of coordination and cooperation between transit agencies (it's much more than inter-agency timetable coordination). It's critical for the Bay Area to optimize transit for both efficiency and effectiveness. Doing so should drive greater ridership despite declining state funding. Service cutbacks is not the way to go. We need: 1) Demonstrated servant leadership to fully leverage the investment in all forms of transit infrastructure and 2) to effectively communicate the efforts to optimize on efficiency and effectiveness to all stakeholders so they understand the process and expected results. Getting stakeholder buy-in is essential for any multi-modal investments and improvements. That hasn't happened. 3) Projects should be rated on cost-effectiveness. Which means that pet projects such as the heavy-rail OAK connector should fail the cost-benefit test and be replaced with BRT or other (much) lower cost options that still hire Alameda County firms and residents. This should result in a better transit connected Bay Area, a lower per-rider cost, and a more vibrant regional economy.

Additional Comment 4

Dear BART, I am a daily BART rider who commutes from Fremont to work in downtown Oakland. I am deep grateful for this wonderful transit system but there are a few issues that I, as well as my other friends and co-workers who also take BART daily, feel VERY strongly about: -- Lowering ticket prices 3-5% equates to about \$5-6 for us daily BART riders. Since this price decrease only lasts for four months, I save about \$20. To be blunt, what's really the point? I save \$20 and it is a one-time deal since prices will go back up afterward. Not only will this confuse the average occasional BART rider, it will also make us daily BART riders grumpy after four months because it was just a temporary prize dangled in front of us. Not only that, we still have to deal with the status quo. Which brings me to my next issue. This surplus money will be much better spent on upgrading the trains' facilities, aka the seats and floors. I have friends who prefer to drive rather than take BART due to, in their words, "the dirtiness of the seats and floors." With upgraded seats and floors, BART could simultaneously increase ridership as well as keep its daily riders happy. BART can even consider changing the cloth seats to plastic seats due to easier maintenance. 95% of the cushions I sit on daily are so worn down that I end up sitting on the springs or the bumpy plastic bottoms. Either way, the seats need to be changed. Same thing with the flooring. Due to the carpeted surfaces, bad odors are absorbed and linger for a LONG, LONG time. Did you know that 98% of conversations regarding BART is about: (1) the crazy people we all encounter there; (2) how BART was delayed somehow; and (3) how smelly it was on the train. If you don't believe me, please take a poll! Bottom line is, I am begging BART to please replace the seats and flooring instead of a temporary four-month 3-5% price decrease. No one is going to notice a 30 cent decrease and be ecstatic about it anyway. Thanks for your time! P.S. The smell has gotten so bad that I specifically walk from train to train looking for the new composite floors and newer seats now, every single time I board a BART train.

Additional Comment 5

Re: Safety concerns. I did wish to express my concern over the low train frequency to and from Fremont/Daly City. There simply isn't enough trains on this route and there is severe overcrowding on the trains. A typical day from Hayward to Embarcadero has about 30 individuals standing. This is a safety hazard as most individuals do not have/cannot reach the straps or poles above their heads. It is also a safety hazard because there isn't enough oxygen to breath with all the bodies hovering over and around you. I would also guess that we most likely are exceeding the weight capacity for each train. Heaven forbid we encounter an emergency requiring to evacuate quickly. In addition I am sure this violates the ADA Act as a wheelchair or other medical equipment certainly does not stand a chance to fit between all the standing bodies. I would also assume the lack of oxygen tends to aggravate and cause attacks and seizures. So my request is that BART retain the so called surplus and instead increase the train frequency instead of giving us a mere 4 month 3% discount (or \$24). Treat your customers with respect and allow us to keep our human dignity and not pile us up in an unsafe overcrowded train like if we were chickens about to be plucked.

Additional Comment 6

Dear Members of the BART Board,

Thank you for consulting riders like me about how to allocate BART's expected 2010/2011 surplus. Please accept the following suggestions:

I'm grateful to see the Board seriously considering the need to make BART more affordable. However, the proposed fare reductions of just 3% or 5%, for just 4 months, are too trivial to make any real difference to most riders' budget or behavior.

I shudder to think how much of this temporary surplus would be wasted just on reprogramming the faregates and printing new fare charts, then repeating the same exercise 4 months later.

So on the whole, I agree with the newspaper editorialists who have called on BART to bank most of the surplus as an operating reserve fund, to defer future fare hikes.

However, I do urge you to consider allocating a small portion of the surplus to one or more of the following five projects. The first three are already on your list of potential problems; the last three are new suggestions from me. These suggestions are NOT in prioritized order:

- (1) \$200,000 to delay fare increases for paratransit services for senior and disabled riders: This is a relatively inexpensive item. And BART's most vulnerable riders should get the first break from the system's improved balance sheet.
- (2) \$75,000 for real-time arrival monitors at station entrances: This would be a real convenience to riders -- assuming the monitors were updated to accurately reflect any system delays -- and might help market the system to new riders.
- (3) \$100,000 to improve customer service by station agents: This seems like a relatively inexpensive way to build goodwill among riders -- especially if its cost could be reduced from that figure. The issue isn't that BART station agents are bad people. It's that BART is so automated -- by design -- that station agents often interact with riders only when there is a problem.

This seems to have made some agents proactively wary of encounters with riders. Other agents seem to have become attached to their solitude. I'll never forget one agent who resented my coming to her booth window because it interrupted her knitting.

This proposed program could identify ways to encourage more positive contacts between station agents and riders. A good training program would be two-way, consulting station agents about how they would like to see their jobs enriched. (I train blue-collar union members, and I'm continually impressed by how much my students have to teach me.) They might tell you that they'd be delighted to get out of their booths more, and perhaps offer riders help with the vending machines and faregates. While they're out there, I'd be delighted if they'd sweep away the kids who block stairways by treating them as benches.

(4) Eliminate double door closings at terminal stations: I don't know what this operational improvement would cost -- but it would be a chief investment in riders' goodwill and security.

For reasons that I don't understand, BART locks riders into trains dwelling at turnaround stations (such as Daly City and SFO). At best, this is an annoying inconvenience: I've often been locked inside a train parked at Daly City, while another northbound train arrived and left on the parallel track.

At worst, this is a serious violation of riders' security -- and a lawsuit waiting to strike BART. Should there be a localized fire or smoke release, or an intentional act of harassment or terrorism, the needless door closings literally create a captive audience.

There is absolutely no evident reason why the doors need to close while trains are parked at these stations. Please invest a small amount of money into solving this problem.

(5) Quiet signage and "quiet cars": This would be another inexpensive investment in riders' comfort, goodwill, and loyalty. After years of being blasted by noisy riders, I was pleased to discover that BART actually has rules prohibiting riders from using "sound devices" like boom boxes. But I discovered this only by reading BART's statement to the press after citing a theater troupe for using amplification during an impromptu onboard performance.

Other transit systems (like S.F. Muni) have clear onboard signage about what noisemaking is prohibited. BART, unusually, does not. This places the burden on well-behaved riders to convince loud riders to quiet down. And this burden is unreasonable and unfair.

You have lots of daily riders who have long commutes to and from work. They pay a disproportionate share of your fares. And in return, they simply want to use their long BART rides to read, work, or nap. But they don't get that opportunity, because of fellow riders' routine antics: playing boom boxes, using cellphones as boom boxes, blasting music through headphones loud enough to disturb riders half a car away, letting cellphone ringers shriek, yelling into cellphones, and yelling to/at companions several seats away.

At a minimum, BART should place clear signage in every car, stating what sound devices are prohibited -- and asking riders to turn off audible cellphone ringers.

Beyond that, BART is far behind other transit systems in establishing "quiet cars." Given that BART operates largely as a long-distance commuter-rail system, there should be at least one of these on every BART train. Cellphone ringers, crying babies, and loudmouths should be prohibited in these cars -- period.

The time has come to invest a small sum in giving your core, long-distance commuters a break from noise.

(6) Discounted monthly passes: This is another overdue reward to BART's loyal, daily riders. With Clipper/TransLink terminals now having arrived, BART should finally have the technology to offer monthly passes. These could be priced to match fare zones, or even particular pairs of origin/destination station.

On most transit systems, the pricing standard for these monthly passes is: unlimited travel for the price of 20 round trips. Back in the 1960s, BART debuted as the sleek, automated, transit system of The Future. Isn't it time it caught up to most other transit systems in offering basic monthly passes?

Thank you for considering the merits of allocating most of BART's forthcoming surplus to an operating reserve fund, and to one or more of the above projects.

Respectfully yours

Additional Comment 7

Dear Directors,

I'm writing to express my opposition to the proposed fare reduction. I use BART daily for my commute to and from work. Frankly, a 3% rollback for 4 months on my \$4.10 daily fare from El Cerrito Plaza to 19th Street Oakland and back is an insult. Not only is this a negligible amount, but as a frequent BART rider I am only too aware of the myriad of other ways that that \$2.3 million could be better spent:

- Better soundproofing on trains. Going under the Bay between Oakland and San Francisco is a painful experience as the ride is so loud that one's ears hurt and one cannot conduct a conversation with another person.
- Deep clean and refurbish more trains.
- Provide constant, real-time expected arrival information on all platforms at all stations. I would much rather know when the next train is arriving than that I can get to the ballpark on BART. By all means, put up signs informing us of that fact, but use the announcement boards for the information that people really want.
- Provide a more frequent service. I am very well traveled and have lived in many developed cities with similar metro systems. BART is by far the worst. It is ridiculous that one has to wait so long for a train here.

I have discussed this matter with many people and the above are all factors that were mentioned more than once as reasons why they do not ride BART more often. I have not found a single voice of support for your proposed fare reduction. Please do not go ahead with it. It is not a "reward", as you have phrased it, it is an insult and a ridiculous waste of money that would be far better spent elsewhere.

In fact, I would be more than happy to pay a 3% fare INCREASE over 4 months to pay for the above.

Additional Comment 8

ATTN: BART directors (especially Mr. McPartland):

This is addressed specifically to Mr. McPartland (my BART district representative) and to the board in general. I write to comment on the proposal for a temporary fare reduction but would first like to express my appreciation to Mr. McPartland for his years of military service in Vietnam and Desert Storm.

The proposed temporary reduction is, in my opinion, a really, really terrible idea. It is akin to one of the candidates in the 2008 presidential race proposing a temporary gas tax holiday - an election season gimmick that would have accomplished nothing except to deplete the federal highway fund at a time when the country's road infrastructure is falling apart.

Don't get me wrong. I'd love lower BART fares - permanent reductions. The fares are the highest public transit fares in the nation, made necessary by many years of giving away the store to BART employees in exchange for union electoral support. But, if there are any "extra" funds available, there are several uses that are better than a few months of fare relief. Among these: building up the reserves to avoid lurching from one fiscal crisis to the next; cleaning the train cars; paying for capital improvements; cleaning the restrooms etc. It can hardly be said that BART has extra funds available for a temporary fare reduction when any improvement in fiscal conditions is due to \$26 million from the state; or when a deficit of \$10 million is projected.

"Customer appreciation?" Give me a break! Mr. Fang's slip of the tongue "...to express our appreciation to our voters..." says it all. As one governor of a Midwestern state recently said, "I was born at night, but not last night!"

This does not even strike me as a politically smart thing to do. I doubt many people would change their minds about who to vote for based on this. But they are more likely to use it against the next group of directors up for re-election when the fare reduction expires and BART perhaps needs another fare hike on top of that. Please, don't insult us. Don't do this.

Additional Comment 9

I would like to make a comment about the possibility of lowering the BART fare. I say it's a nice gesture but...WE as BART patrons don't want to hear about budget shortfalls or the money being used to give your staff a raise. Don't get me wrong, it's always nice to get a raise but...not when we are having a recession. It's not what any of us would like to hear. Just to keep my job, I have not had a raise for three years.

Another issue is if BART decides to lower the fare, we don't want to hear BART is going to raise the fare due to some budget shortfalls. We are paying way too much money and all the things that BART is supposed to do i.e., changing the seat covers, fixing the train/car, etc....is not being done. Just the other day, I thought the train/car I was on was going to die on me. I can feel the engine underneath the floor board like it's on its last leg. It would be nice to have the car/train soundproofed—the soundproof paneling (if any) is gone.

Yes, I see the floor changed and some seat covers has changed but 90% has not. Either use the money as a surplus so you don't have to charge us for more money or use the money to fix the broken trains/car.

Thanks for listening.

Additional Comment 10

Hi, BART. I just heard on ABC7 News that funds were found, or received, by surprise (paraphrasing), creating an alleged \$50 million dollar surplus in budget projections for the next, or the rest of your current, fiscal year.

If true (I'm a cautious optimist, so I think it is), please use it to clean train interiors 1st, esp deodorizing and disinfecting—both to the obviously ltd degree possible (remember people w. at least self-perceived, self-worked-up, and real chem allergies, while balancing that vs. the sig minority of riders who don't wash their outer clothing what a reasonable person, not living in a forest all the time, would call reasonably often).

Then please sweep the platform areas (incl the track sections in stations, esp.—obviously when system is closed overnite) and mop the middle 80% or so, at least, of indoor platforms, and lastly please check the downtown SF, Oakland, and (downtown again, esp.) Berkeley elevators, esp. street-reaching ones, for urine puddles. I encounter 'em about 1x/10 days, using elevators ~5x/10 days.

Thank you for doing as much as you do with the wrongly, at least to the degree they usually are, reduced—by the state, at least—resources you have—that supplement your income from other sources, of course.

Additional Comment 11

Dear Gail Murray,

I just heard BART just "found" \$5 million and is reported to be considering if BART should reduce fares for a brief period or use it to repair the seats. I do not understand how the BART Board thinks. BART says it needs new cars. I do not believe that the basic structure and on-board systems of even the oldest cars are not sound enough that a major rebuild of the old cars is less expensive than new cars. Rebuild the old cars. At the same time, replace the existing seats with low-maintenance seats such as used on MARTA in Atlanta and replace the carpets with the best of the floors BART has been testing. London's underground has cars just as old or older than BART and, though they look worse than BART's worst cars, they still are running effectively. When they were new, they looked old, with their slatted wood floors and sturdy but ugly seats.

If the BART Board can not think of anything else, pay down the debt! Next, we will hear that BART's highest paid employees in the nation will demand pay raises and the BART Board will consider it instead of stating clearly that pay raises are not an option, period. If the employees do not accept that, replace the lot of them and reduce the BART Board to half the current size at the same time.

Consider contracting out BART operation or selling BART to a private company.

Additional Comment 12

Dear BART Board of Directors,

I cannot attend any of the community meetings due to conflicting schedules. That is why I am submitting my comments/questions via email expressing my opinion regarding the \$4.5 million surplus and how it should be allocated.

Setting aside \$2.3 million to be possibly used for a 3% fare reduction for four months, pending the outcome of a series of public meetings to gather feedback on that option (this is basically feeding candy to a child for a short period of time, and then completely cutting him/her off. Why even bother for such a short period of time?)

Putting an extra \$1 million into rainy-day reserves (Why not take the money from the \$2.3 million for the temporary fare reduction, and putting some/most of it in these reserves?)

Committing \$750,000 for deep-cleaning of up to 50 rail cars, including new seats (I would LOVE to see ALL rail cars deep-cleaned with new seats and floors. Maybe this can come from the \$2.3 million?)

Committing \$200,000 to defer an increase in East Bay paratransit fares for four months (again, why bother?)

Committing \$150,000 for emergency services (What is considered emergency services?)

Committing \$75,000 for realtime monitors showing train schedules at venues surrounding BART stations (This would be nice, but I would rather see cleaner cars)

As you can tell, I am highly in favor of deep-cleaning the entire BART fleet. The temporary fare reduction is more of a tease to me.

Additional Comment 13

Dear Board of Directors,

By the time anyone reads this email you will probably have voted on spending all of the 4.5 million dollar surplus on one thing or another. I am writing to plead with you to save that money for a rainy day. I believe the spending of these funds may seem a great way to give back to riders and satisfy voters but I am both a poor young BART rider and a voter and I do not approve of this measure.

Profligate spending in a time when so many people are suffering great economic distress is disgusting to my sensibilities. Many of the proposals put forward make sense in only a very brief short term view. I understand that BART cars are also really really gross but that many of these cars are scheduled to be replaced so that spending money on refurbishing them seems a gross waste of funds. Paying people to clean the cars is also a novel idea that seems like a gigantic waste of time. How do you clean all of that fabric? If BART interiors were plastic then it could all be hosed down and that might make sense even though it would probably be uncomfortable to

sit on those seats. Giving away free rides though I could really use one right now is also a bad idea. Because we might ride free today but have fare hikes in the future.

I don't have any illusions that my comments will have any effect on the actions of individuals on the Board but I thank whomever reads this email for reading.

Additional Comment 14

Dear President Fang and members of the BART Board:

Through the news and information being handed out at BART stations, I have become aware of the BART surplus.

I have also heard that the Board is discussing how to use this surplus. I am writing to urge you to use the surplus to clean and renovate the BART trains. The cars that have been renovated are clean and comfortable. The cars that have not been renovated are quite unpleasant. The carpets that once were blue are now yellow and brown with dirt. The seats are soiled and stained with things I don't wish to imagine. And the odor in these non-renovated cars is awful.

I understand there is a plan to renovate some of the cars and provide a temporary fare reduction. I urge you not to use this money on a temporary fare rollback, but to invest the surplus in the BART system by having as many clean and sanitary train cars as possible. I ride BART during the week from San Francisco to Richmond and back. It costs me \$8.50 round trip. I do not mind paying my normal fare, as long as the surplus is being used to clean and renovate the trains.

Thank you for your time and your continued service to BART riders.

Additional Comment 15

Dear BART Board of Directors,

I recently read that BART is considering fare reductions as a result of a (temporary) budget surplus. Please don't make that mistake.

I am a frequent rider, a cyclist, and a commuter. While I don't appreciate exorbitant fares on transit any more than the next guy, I'd rather see your surplus funds go towards enhanced bicycle access, increased train frequency, extended hours of operation (post-2am please!), or interior upholstery and carpet removal (replaced with durable, sanitary surfaces – not more upholstery).

While keeping fares affordable and competitive with automobile costs is important, as long as BART's facilities and service are jarringly sub-par, your riders expect their fares to be funding critical improvements. A fare reduction would be only temporary, and would only hasten the next round of fare hikes in the future – needed to fund precisely the things that should be partially funded by this surplus.

As soon as BART has all of its physical and operational deficiencies fully funded and corrected, I'd support fare reductions. Until that time, don't throw away your funding.

And please, keep looking for other sources to fund BART's much-needed projects; fiddling around (up or down) with passenger fares isn't the answer.

Thank you for your consideration.

Additional Comment 16

Dear BART Board of Directors,

Thank you for this opportunity to provide input on a unique circumstance...a surplus! I have been a rider for 9 years, commuting on BART 5 days-per-week for 8 of those years, and recently scaling back to just 2 days-per-week. As a frequent rider, I am very interested in seeing this asset to the bay area be improved to maintain loyalty for long-time riders like myself, and to tempt others to ditch their car and seek this more sustainable solution.

Keeping this goal in mind...I would highly discourage a simple fare reduction. That is a short term solution and I don't think that is the issue that people are most concerned about. While I support offering programs discounting tickets for seniors, students, disabled, etc. I don't think the general public considers fares to be the determining factor to take BART. Especially considering the rising tolls for crossing the bridges, the existing fares seem reasonable.

Rather, keeping the fares at their current rate and implementing long-term solutions would be my recommendation. Here are a list of suggestions that I think would make riding BART a better experience, keep your riders happy, and even get you some new ones! And while some of these are much more expensive than the surplus, if it's a worthwhile idea, money should be set aside to pursue them or used to prepare plans, hearings, and environmental review, which entails time and money. Further, I suspect there may be federal grant money available should a plan be pursued and supported by the community. Now's the time!!!

- Longer service Thursdays – Saturdays. Bars close at 2 am and this would give people alternatives to drinking and driving.
- New seats – more sanitary like those used in the New York subway. While the cloth seats are comfy, and that is appreciated, they are hard to clean and given what I've seen on BART, really unsanitary. I would much rather have plastic or stainless steel and know that they are clean. It would also save money on cleaning costs, since it's easier to clean. If this option is pursued, I would also like the option to eat on BART. Many break this rule anyways and enforcement isn't worth the time or money. I would rather give riders what they want and removing all fabric would allow much easier cleaning.
- Shuttles to major employee based jobs (San Jose area, Oakland, etc.). Many don't take BART because it's not easy to get to. If a shuttle provided free or a monthly rider fee (like the Emery go round), I think it would serve many people.
- BART to Oakland airport connection. The BART to SFO connector is very convenient and successful. While I believe plans are moving forward for this, I wanted to echo my support and allocating additional fund to this effort if needed.
- BART to San Jose airport. While this is a long ways away, funds could be used to get the ball rolling. I am encouraged with each new BART extension (to Livermore, Warm Springs Fremont, etc.) Keep em coming!
- Designate certain cars as BIKE ONLY cars, paint them a different color (so that it's clear from the platform which cars are BIKE ONLY cars), and design the interior with a bike storage

area. Make sure that at least one BIKE ONLY car is on every line and allow bike riders at all times. This option allows more riders to get to use BART, encourages alternative, healthy, and environmentally friendly options, and would seem cheaper than building and maintaining more BART parking lots. Bikers should be applauded, their rides made easy, and storage not be a burden to them or other BART riders.

- Anti-bacterial dispensers on trains.
- WiFi access – allow use of internet on laptops. CALTRANS does this...let's catch up!
- Power outlets – on the side walls of the trains so they don't trip others or get tangled.
- Now arriving message boards (real time) just outside gates. Looks like you're planning on doing some of these in cafes in SF. I love it. Just outside the gate would be great! Once you're in, you're stuck.
- New transbay tube connecting Millbrae to Hayward. This would be HUGE and AWESOME!!!! Those in South SF could get much more direct access to Oakland airport or faster access to the East Bay (EB) and those in the EB faster access to SFO, SF city college, and CALTRANS. Currently, it is a very long commute from one-end to the other when you have to travel through the city to get to/from the EB. This also gives riders a back-up when there are issues in the existing transbay tube. It would create a loop, greatly reduce traffic on 101 and the San Mateo bridge, and really increase ridership.
- A third line for all trains. The benefits are many. It provides a "free line" if a train goes out of service for mechanical purposes. You could also do an express train on this line, which stops at key stations for faster commutes. The NY subway does this and it's great.

I really think its time to get riders excited about using BART again. Please use this rare opportunity to make long term solutions and think outside the box. A fare reduction is really a short term solution and I don't think it serves the best interests for your riders.

Thanks again for allowing your riders to share their ideas with you!

Additional Comment 17

The talk of roll back of fares or customer appreciation days where a fare is not charged is ridiculous. Customer appreciation days (no fare charged), while great PR for you, only brings people to BART who are NOT everyday users. Take for example the Spare the Air Days – business people still needed to ride but ridership only increased for people who wanted to ride free. Did it generate any long term increase in ridership?

The every-day users of BART need cleaner trains, not the interiors wiped down, but the fabric on the seats **steam cleaned and sanitized**. The interior of the trains have been neglected for too many years. It is common sense, if you want your car or your house to stay in good condition, you must maintain it. The seat fabrics are brown and not blue. I have actually witnessed people sitting on the edge of the seat so they don't lean back and touch the soiled seats.

You hire more people to clean the stations, but really, we only in the stations possibly 10 minutes. What is the point of "janitors" in the station sweeping up leaves. We are in the trains for fifty minutes – the trains should be the emphasis.

Please don't spend money stupidity as you did on repaving & reconfiguring the parking lots at Pleasant Hill and Concord about three years ago, especially when last year the parking lot at Pleasant Hill was torn up for the construction of the transit village. Total waste of money, but I

guess it was someone's brother/uncle/relative who had a foot in the door at BART. May not be true, but it sure does smell like graft.

Appendix C: Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Printed Survey Results

A total of 195 surveys were submitted by community meeting participants. Results received are detailed below.

***Note: for Questions 1, 2 and 3, the “% of Total” columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the “multiple answers given” or “no answers.”**

Question 1: How well did BART staff explain the following issues related to a possible Temporary Fare Reduction?

	Very Well	% of Total*	Somewhat Well	% of Total*	Not Well	% of Total*	Do Not Know	% of Total*	No Answer
BART’s financial situation.	69	42%	67	41%	19	12%	8	5%	31
How your input will be used in the decision-making process.	51	35%	67	46%	11	7%	17	12%	48
Option A. BART fares reduced by 3% for 4 months.	68	46%	57	39%	12	8%	10	7%	47
Option B. BART fares reduced by 5% for 3 months.	72	48%	53	36%	13	9%	11	7%	46

Question 2: Reducing my fares by 3% for 4 months is:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	49	30%
Not worth it—it won’t save me enough money to matter	61	37%
OK, but I’d rather see BART spend the money on...	33	20%
Do not know	16	10%
Not worth it; OK, but...both checked	6	3%
Multiple answers given	1	N/A
No answer given	29	N/A

Would rather see BART spend the money on:

- (Weekend) service restorations or improvements
- 1) Better service - longer trains, more frequent, fewer transfers; 2) better climate control - too hot; 3) building restrooms that are usable and compatible with security needs
- BART jobs for blacks

- Bath room
- Better high-value ticket discounts
- Build a line from Coliseum to the OAK airport
- Capital improvements
- Clean up the trains – reply given by 3 respondents
- Cleaning & maintenance
- Cleaning the cars - plastic seats
- Delay rate hikes
- Delaying later fare raises
- Direct shuttle between Dublin/Pleasanton and Livermore BART Park & Ride on Airway Blvd. every 15 minutes to meet trains
- Employment within the community
- Encouraging new riders
- Expanding status
- Facility, train and safety
- General cleanliness – reply given by 2 respondents
- Improving station and car maintenance and safety
- Infrastructure
- Letting the money go to small business
- Linkage/ Fastpass
- Linoleum floors
- Longer tracks
- Maintenance – reply given by 3 respondents
- Maintenance on station amenities
- Maintenance-cleaning and services the lines and cars
- More open hours for BART
- MUNI/BART pass
- Nice, but I prefer that BART spends the money in more cleanliness inside the elevators and inside the cars.
- On BART construction and renovation.
- On internal service quality (?)
- On other aspects.
- On service (? Too scratchy to read.)
- Put it in reserve. Will add confusion.
- Rainy day fund reserve
- Safety
- Save the money
- Seat cleaning
- Security
- Serving lowest income riders - youth
- Social community functions at BART station
- Subsidize low income riders – reply given by 2 respondents
- System maintenance
- That was posted on 6/14/2010
- The BART
- Tickets not demagnetized easily
- To improve restrooms.
- To improve the service aspect.
- Train maintenance
- Underserved Communities
- Upgrade seats and carpet in cars

Question 3: Reducing my fares by 5% for 3 months is:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	50	31%
Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter	61	37%
OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...	31	19%
Do not know	15	9%
Not worth it; OK, but...both checked	6	4%
Multiple answers given	5	N/A
No answer given	27	N/A

Would rather see BART spend the money on:

- (Weekend) service restorations or improvements
- 1. Physical connections to low income communities-shuttle buses 2. Free discount passes to CBOs 3. Reinvestment in communities more than running a subway under our communities invest in housing and capital improvements to bus lines
- 1. SFO instructions are terrible-transfer to another line can be done at several stations but not noted anywhere; 2. Use recorded notices for BART station approaches
- Bath room
- Better high-value ticket discounts
- Build a line from Coliseum to the OAK airport
- Building a reserve
- Centers for recreation
- Clean up the trains – reply given by 2 respondents
- Delay rate hikes
- Delaying later fare raises
- Direct shuttle between Dublin/Pleasanton and Livermore BART Park & Ride on Airway Blvd. every 15 minutes to meet trains
- Employment within the community
- Every stations must have public restrooms.
- Expanding status
- Expansion!
- Facility, train and safety
- Freeze fares
- Helping people during these difficult economic times
- I think it's a very bad idea; upgrade seats and carpet in cars
- Increase in how often trains come
- Infrastructure
- Linkage/ Fastpass
- Linoleum floors
- Maintenance
- Maintenance on station amenities
- Maintenance-cleaning and services the lines and cars
- More maps/route indicators on trains
- More time on the route – reply given by 2 respondents
- MUNI/BART pass
- Nice, but I prefer that BART spends the money on additional security. – reply given by 2 respondents
- Paratransit
- Pull out the carpet on the cars.

- Safety
- Seat cleaning
- Security
- Subsidize low income riders – reply given by 2 respondents
- System maintenance
- The BART
- To improve various facilities.
- To increase service quality on each line.
- Train maintenance

Finally, a few questions about yourself...

***Note: for Questions 4, 5, and 6, the “% of Total” columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the “multiple answers given” or “no answers.”**

Question 4: How often, if at all, do you usually ride BART? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Never	4	2%
Less than once a month	44	25%
1 – 3 days a month	43	24%
1 – 2 days a week	26	15%
3 days a week or more	60	34%
Multiple answers given	1	N/A
No answer given	15	N/A

Question 5: What is the total annual income of your household before taxes? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Under \$25,000	92	53%
\$25,000 - \$40,000	27	16%
\$41,000 - \$75,000	22	13%
Over \$75,000	31	18%
No answer given	21	N/A

Question 6: In which language do you prefer to communicate? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
English	114	64%
Spanish	11	6%
Chinese	23	13%
Korean	0	0%
Tagalog	0	0%
Russian	0	0%
Vietnamese	3	2%
Other	27	15%
Multiple choices made	8	N/A
No answer given	7	N/A

Languages specified under "Other:"

Bhutanese	1
Burmese	14
Burmese, Karen	1
Burmese, Karenni	4
Ebonics	1
French	1
Ghanian Twi	1
Khmer	1
Korean	2
Nepali	1

Multiple choices specified:

English/Chinese	6
English/Spanish	2

***Note: for Questions 7 and 8, the “% of Total” represents the percentage of all survey respondents who selected a particular answer.**

Question 7: What is your race or ethnic identification? (select one or more)

	No. selected	% of Total
American Indian or Alaska Native	2	1%
Asian or Pacific Islander	55	30%
Black/African American	28	16%
Spanish, Hispanic or Latino	18	10%
White	44	24%
Other (specified, see list below)	29	16%
Other (unspecified)	3	2%
Combination of two or more race or ethnic identifications specified	2	1%
No answer given	12	N/A

Race or ethnic identifications specified under “Other:”

Bhutanese	2
Burmese	14
Burmese, Karenni	5
Jamaican-American	1
Jewish	1
Latin European	1
Mixed	1
Negro	1
Refused	1
Spirit	1

Combinations of two or more race or ethnic identifications specified:

- Asian or Pacific Islander/White
- American Indian or Alaska Native/Black-African American/Spanish, Hispanic or Latino

Question 8: What type(s), if any, of community-based organizations do you participate in? (select one or more)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Religious	63	32%
Political	35	18%
Environmental	25	13%
Urban/regional planning	34	17%
Other	49	25%

Types of CBOs specified under "Other:"

- Bhutanese
- Biking
- C.C. Economic Opportunity Council
- CBO-Chinatown
- Chinatown Community Development Center
- Community
- Community based Chinatown Trip
- Community based org-the MCP transportation action team
- Community service group
- Education
- Gardening - street clean-up
- GLBT
- Government mental health board
- Indigenous peoples issues
- Mass transit meetings: AC Transit & MTC, ZMA
- MCP
- Media/Task force
- MRP
- Music
- Neighborhood
- NGO
- Non profit
- Outreach
- Residents Association (2)
- School volunteer
- Scientology
- Scouting (SFBAC)
- Self
- Senior center
- Senior issues/ transportation
- Seniors
- Social Service
- Spirit
- Transition housing
- Transportation
- Transportation service evaluation/ plug
- Urojas community services
- Urojas ministries
- Youth
- Youth Uprising (2)

Number of surveys filled out in each language:

	No. filled out	% of total
English	163	84%
Spanish	11	6%
Chinese	21	11%
Vietnamese	0	0%
Tagalog	0	0%
Russian	0	0%
Laotian	0	0%
Cambodian	0	0%
Korean	0	0%

Appendix D: Proposed Temporary Fare Reduction Web Survey Results

A total of 177 surveys were submitted online through the BART website. Results received are detailed below.

***Note: for Questions 1 and 2, the “% of Total” columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the “no answers.”**

Question 1: Reducing my fares by 3% for 4 months is:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	19	12%
Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter	54	32%
OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...	94	56%
Do not know	0	0%
No answer given	10	N/A

Would rather see BART spend the money on:

- 15 minute evening / weekend headways, next train signs at street level
- A rainy day fund
- Anything but the Oakland Airport extension
- Bathrooms - you're still letting 9-11 keep some bathrooms locked?
- Better access for bringing bikes on BART
- Better bicycle options.
- Bigger station signs like San Bruno's
- Can you put it in a "rainy day fund" and save it for future "shortfalls?"
- Capital improvement and optimizing transit by coordinating more effectively with other transit agencies
- Car interiors and seats
- Clean seats
- Clean Trains
- Cleaner cars and stations
- Cleaning – reply given by 2 respondents
- Cleaning and the Oakland Airport Extension and longer mid-day trains
- Cleaning car interiors
- Cleaning dirty cars, especially dirty cloth seats!!
- Cleaning or refurbishing cars or hire security private security guards for parking lots
- Cleaning or repairing car interiors, or postponing a planned fare increase.
- Cleaning stations
- Cleaning the cars; more police patrols
- Cleaning the trains! Remove the carpeting and clean the dirty seats!
- Cleaning trains, updating service, adding cars, later trains
- Cleaning up; upgrading, etc.
- Cleaning your filthy trains!
- Customer Service
- Deep clean car interiors
- Ensuring BART seats are clean

- Extended service hours
- Fare gates improvements - more handicapped gates, etc
- Finishing car upgrades
- Future improvement
- Great opportunity for long term Bart growth. Use surplus to reduce fares during non-commute and weekend hours. This would encourage seniors, kids, families, and unemployed to use Bart, possibly growing your business. This model is best for Bart and \$\$\$
- Higher fare reduction over shorter time (ie. 5% option below)
- Improvements for bike passengers
- Improvements for disabled or more cameras in prkg lots
- Improvements/upgrades to system, cars, seats, etc.
- Improving and cleaning cars
- Increased
- Latenights
- Later night service to and from SF, especially on weekends
- Longer trains, better service, maintenance, contingency planning, so many other areas for improvement.
- Maintenance
- More Bike Lockers
- More frequent or later service
- More frequent service on Sunday
- More frequent trains, esp on weekends, longer hours of operation, more lines
- More spare the air days
- More trains, extended reach
- Much-needed seat replacement and replace carpet floors with composite flooring
- New car seats
- New Cars! And functioning bathrooms in SF Stations
- New cars, cleaner stations
- New lines/more service
- New seats and floors
- New trains
- New trains, refurbish old
- New transbay tube
- Not reducing BART fare for short time; just postpone INCREASES until the money runs out
- postponing paratransit fare increase
- Real BART extensions
- Reducing month reserved parking fee
- Refurbishing the seats in the trains - they are so gross!
- Refurbishing/cleaning the BART trains/cars
- Removing carpet from trains
- Replacing and/or cleaning seats
- Replacing car seats – this reply given by 3 respondents
- Replacing car seats and cleaning car interiors
- Replacing carpet with flooring, replacing car seats, cleaning car interiors
- Replacing Seats or other infrastructure
- Replacing seats, cleaning or postponing paratransit increase
- Researching extending the lines from Walnut Creek to Dublin.
- Reserves
- Running service through the night
- Save it for emergencies
- Save it to prevent future fare increases. Honestly, won't save my enough \$ to matter.
- Security and cleaning
- Signage and sound reduction
- Student discount passes or commuter passes from the East Bay- a more long term money-saving plan
- Subsidizing reduced fares for elders, disabled and youth
- Testing cars for mold & mildew

- The projected renovations to the train cars themselves.
- Things that will last longer
- This is not OK, I'd rather see better maintenance.
- Track and train car maintenance
- Train car/engine repair
- Trains or infrastructure
- Trains that run later at night – this reply given by 2 respondents
- Upgrading car interiors
- Upgrading/cleaning trains – this reply given by 2 respondents

Question 3: Reducing my fares by 5% for 3 months is:

	No. selected	% of Total*
Great—it will save me money	29	17%
Not worth it—it won't save me enough money to matter	44	26%
OK, but I'd rather see BART spend the money on...	93	56%
Do not know	1	1%
No answer given	10	N/A

Would rather see BART spend the money on:

- 15 minute evening / weekend headways, next train signs at street level
- 1-security, 2-cleanliness of trains
- A rainy day fund
- Again, clean the dirty trains, they are disgusting these days
- Anything but the Oakland Airport extension
- Better access for bringing bikes on BART
- Better bicycle options.
- Bigger station signs, cleaning & replacing car seats
- Capital improvement and optimizing transit by coordinating more effectively with other transit agencies
- Car interiors and seats
- Clean seats
- Clean Trains
- Cleaner cars and stations
- Cleaner stations and functioning bathrooms in SF Stations.
- Cleaning – this reply given by 2 respondents
- Cleaning and the Oakland Airport Extension and longer mid-day trains
- Cleaning car interiors – this reply given by 2 respondents
- Cleaning or refurbishing cars or hire security private security guards for parking lots
- Cleaning or repairing car interiors, or postponing a planned fare increase.
- Cleaning the cars; more police patrols
- Cleaning trains!
- Cleaning trains, updating service, adding cars, later trains
- Clean-up, upgrades, etc.
- Creating a fund to expand BART hours to have at least one train run across the bay at 3 a.m.
- Customer Service
- Customer-service improvement training, displays, and other projects
- Deep clean car interiors
- Extended service hours
- Fixing escalators and elevators
- Frontline personnel customer service improvement program
- Improvements for bike passengers

- Improvements for disabled (elev repairs) and security
- Improvements/upgrades to system, cars, seats, etc.
- Improving and cleaning cars
- Improving frequency on Fremont - SFO line, adding express trains
- Infrastructure maintenance and upgrade
- Investing to keep fares lower for longer
- Latenights
- Later night service to and from SF, especially on weekends
- Maintenance
- Mold
- More Bike Lockers
- More frequent or later service
- More frequent trains
- More frequent trains, esp on weekends, longer hours of operation, more lines
- More spare the air days
- More trains, extended reach
- More trains, less wait
- Much-needed seat replacement and replace carpet floors with composite flooring
- New cars, cleaner stations
- New lines/more service
- New seats and floors
- New transbay tube
- Not reducing BART fare for short time; just postpone INCREASES until the money runs out
- Postponing a paratransit fare increase for four months
- Putting money away in reserves
- Real BART extensions
- Reducing month reserved parking fee
- Refurbishing the seats in the trains - they are so gross!
- Refurbishing/cleaning the BART trains/cars
- Removing carpet from trains
- Renovating cars
- Replacing and/or cleaning seats
- Replacing car seats – this reply given by 2 respondents
- Replacing car seats and cleaning car interiors
- Replacing carpet with flooring, replacing car seats, cleaning car interiors
- Replacing dirty carpeting with linoleum!!
- Replacing seats or other infrastructure renewal
- Replacing seats, cleaning or postponing paratransit increase
- Researching extending the lines from Walnut Creek to Dublin.
- Reserves
- Reserves so next hike is further away
- Save it for emergencies
- Saved for future “shortfalls” year.
- Security and cleaning
- See #3 above, run longer trains, improve service...
- Service past midnight
- Signage and sound reduction
- Student discount passes or commuter passes from the East Bay- a more long term money-saving plan
- Subsidizing reduced fares for elders, disabled and youth
- The bathrooms that are open are always gross - the floor is always wet, there are no hooks except at No. Concord, it smells bad, it looks dirty even when clean, and the hand dryer is the inefficient kind that doesn't work - look at Trader Joe's to compare
- The projected renovations to the train cars themselves.
- This is not OK, I'd rather see better maintenance.
- Train car/engine repair

- Trains running all night
- Trains that run later
- Trains, more cars during rush hours
- Upgrading car interiors
- Upgrading/cleaning the cars

***Note: for Questions 3, 4, 5 and 6, the “% of Total” columns represent the percentage of those who answered the question who gave that particular answer; it does not include the “multiple answers given” or “no answers.”**

Question 3: How often, if at all, do you usually ride BART? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Never	1	1%
Less than once a month	7	4%
1 – 3 days a month	30	18%
1 – 2 days a week	17	10%
3 days a week or more	109	67%
No answer given	13	N/A

Question 4: What is the total annual income of your household before taxes? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Under \$25,000	23	14%
\$25,000 - \$40,000	24	15%
\$41,000 - \$75,000	48	30%
Over \$75,000	65	41%
No answer given	17	N/A

Question 5: In which language do you prefer to communicate? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total*
English	159	97%
Spanish	1	1%
Chinese	0	0%
Korean	0	0%
Tagalog	0	0%
Russian	0	0%
Vietnamese	1	1%
Other	1	1%
No answer given	15	N/A

Languages specified under “Other:”

- Amharic

Question 6: What is your race or ethnic identification? (select only one)

	No. selected	% of Total
American Indian or Alaska Native	0	0%
Asian or Pacific Islander	26	16%
Black/African American	6	4%
Spanish, Hispanic or Latino	8	5%
White	104	66%
Other (specified, see list below)	10	6%
Other (unspecified)	5	3%
No answer given	18	N/A

Race or ethnic identifications specified under "Other:"

Asian, Spanish, white	1
Caucasian and Mexican	1
European-American	1
Irish American	1
Mixed	2
Mixed: Hispanic & White	1
Multi-racial	2
White/Native American	1

***Note: for Question 7, the "% of Total" represents the percentage of all survey respondents who selected a particular answer.**

Question 7: What type(s), if any, of community-based organizations do you participate in? (select one or more)

	No. selected	% of Total*
Religious	30	17%
Political	44	25%
Environmental	54	31%
Urban/regional planning	29	16%
Other	37	21%

Types of CBOs specified under "Other:"

- Animal welfare / rescue
- Animals
- Art
- Arts Organizations
- Ballroom, swing, and Irish dance, Dickens Fair, Burning Man
- Charity
- Civic/civil/nonprofit
- Decline to state
- Educational – this reply given by 3 respondents
- Educational, cultural, youth
- Emergency Preparedness
- Equality California
- Gender/Sexuality Activism
- Health care

- Healthcare Advocacy
- Kink
- Latina-based
- LGBT issues
- Mental Health Care
- Music center
- Non-profit art and education
- Professional
- Research
- School related (for my kids)
- Volunteerism
- Youth sports