NOTICE OF MEETING AND AGENDA BART ACCESSIBILITY TASK FORCE (BATF)

December 13, 2017

A meeting of BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) will be held on Wednesday, December 13, 2017 from 2:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.m. The **meeting will be held at San Francisco Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) Administration’s Building location at, 300 Lakeside Drive, 15th Floor, Room #1500, conference room.** The facility is served by public transportation. The nearest BART Station is the 19th Street Station and there are multiple AC Transit routes to the meeting site.

**AGENDA**

1. Self-introductions of members, staff, and guests. (Information) 05 minutes
   BATF roll call and introductions of individuals present.

2. Public comments. (Information) 05 minutes
   Opportunity to comment on items not on the agendas
   (Two minutes per speaker)

3. Approval of October 26, 2017 minutes and November 08, 2017 minutes (Information/Action) 05 minutes

4. Review the BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) By-Laws. (Information/Action) 25 minutes

5. Chairperson announcements. (Information/Action) 05 minutes

6. Staff announcements. (Information/Action) 05 minutes

7. Member announcements. (Information/Action) 05 minutes

8. Future agenda topics - Members suggest topics. (Information/Action) 05 minutes
   Next meeting scheduled:
   **Thursday,** January 26, 2017 at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, CA 94612
   (Meeting starting 2:00 p.m. – 3:00 p.m., Reception from 3:00 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.)


Please refrain from wearing scented products (perfumes, cologne, after-shave, etc.) to this meeting, as there may be people in attendance susceptible to environmental illness.

BART provides services/accommodations upon request to persons with disabilities and individuals who are limited English proficient who wish to address Board matters. A request must be made within one and five days in advance of Board meetings, depending on the service requested. Please contact the Office of the District Secretary’s Office at 510-464-6083 for information.
Material attached for November 8, 2017 BATF meeting:

- October 26, 2017 minutes
- November 8, 2017 minutes
- BART Accessibility Task Force (BATF) By-Laws

Future Agenda Topics:

1. Detectable path of travel
2. Accessible Capital Request list update
3. Station announcements (emergency and non-emergency)
4. Announcements on board trains (not always clear or too low)
5. Elevators; odor concerns
6. Cone clutter
7. Best practice standards for constructions/BATF travel obstacles mitigation-Checklist
8. Status, updates of signage
9. Alternative travel options while elevators are out of service
10. Policies regarding using discount tickets versus Clipper Cards
11. Editing BART app to include information of construction of at stations
12. Train safety presentation
13. Path of travel (yearly update)
14. Why there is not more signage at the Fremont Station for the hearing loop system; signage on the platform
15. Surcharge on the BART paper tickets
16. BART Watch app; more details of what it is and how it works
17. Sharp’s container in BART stations (for example: if diabetic and want to throw away the needle, what is the safest way at BART stations)
18. GDA (General Disability Awareness) pamphlet update-BART police status-Is it working?
19. Third door markings on the platforms for the new FOF (Fleet of the Future)-updates
20. Antioch eBART update
21. Fares for eBART and SVBX (Silicon Valley/Berryessa)
22. New paid area for elevators outside the paid area
23. Escalator modernization updates
25. Hayward project-maintenance
26. New Oakland “A’s” stadium
27. Balboa Station modernization
28. BART Walnut Creek Station improvements; parking and access
29. East Bay Paratransit Procedures
1. Self-Introductions of Members, Staff and Guests

Members: 
Janet Abelson  
Randall Glock  
Janice Armigo Brown  
Peter Crockwell - (ABSENT)  
Don Queen  
Hale Zukas  
Clarence Fischer  
Gerry Newell  
Herb Hastings  
Alan Smith  
Larry Bunn  
Brandon Young - (ABSENT)  
Roland Wong  
Esperanza Diaz-Alvarez  
Debby Leung  
Catherine Callahan  
Valerie Buell  
Chris Mullin

BART Staff present: Bob Franklin, Elena Van Loo

Directors, Speaker(s), Guest Staff, and Guests of the Public:

Director Robert Raburn  
John McCormick (BART)  
Officer Eric Hobstein  
Arnold Brillinger  
Jerry Grace  
Janice Dispo (Stenographer)

2. Public Comments

No public comment at this time.
3. **Approval for August 24, 2017 and September 28, 2017 Meeting Minutes**

No opposition to Alan Smith’s motion to approve the amended minutes of the August 24, 2017 meeting; second by Herb Hastings.

Motion passes with an abstention from Don Queen.

No opposition to Alan Smith’s motion to approve the amended minutes of the September 28, 2017 meeting; second by Herb Hastings.

Motion passes with an abstention from Gerry Newell.

4. **BART/VTA (Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority) coordination update**

[No presentation given at this time.]

5. **Proof of Payment Ordinance – The fare evasion ordinance, station hardening approaches, and an update on the swing gates**

After the presentation given by John McCormick, members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had.

A long discussion was held.

6. **GDA (Genera Disability Awareness) pamphlet/resources review**

After the update given by Officer Eric Hobstein, members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had.

A long discussion was held.

Randall Glock reminded members that an electronic copy of the GDA pamphlet has been e-mailed to them for further review.

7. **Best practice standards for construction/BATF travel obstacles mitigation review, and vote of approval of checklist**

After the presentation given by Alan Smith and Elena Van Loo, members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had.

Members who have any future questions or concerns should first e-mail Elena Van Loo, Bob Franklin or Randall Glock. These e-mails will then be forwarded up the chain accordingly.
No opposition to Herb Hastings’ motion to approve the Best Practice Checklist, (second by Gerry Newell).

Motion passes unanimously.

8. **Chairperson Announcements**

No opposition to Janet Abelson’s motion to adopt the proposed 2018 BATF meeting schedule, (second by Esperanza Díaz-Alvarez).

Motion passes unanimously.

Randall Glock told members that there are a number of new projects coming up and will work on getting staff in to present on some of them.

He reminded members that the next two BATF meetings are specially scheduled as follows:

- Wednesday, November 8, 2017, at 2:00 p.m., at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, California
- Wednesday, December 13, 2017, at 2:00 p.m., at 300 Lakeside Drive, 15th Floor, Oakland, California (BATF Holiday reception to follow)

Roland Wong, Janice Armigo-Brown, and Herb Hastings volunteered to work with Elena Van Loo in setting up the reception for the December meeting.

9. **Staff Announcements**

Elena Van Loo will be taking charge of travel reimbursements starting on January 1, 2018.

On December 1, 2017, Elena will send reminder invites to BART staff for the December BATF holiday reception.

10. **Member Announcements**

Alan Smith shared a few announcements. According to newspapers, BART’s new cars have passed all 1870 tests, and that they expect to have the new train out by Thanksgiving.

A new parking garage is being built at the Walnut Creek BART Station. Alan Smith suggested requesting for a presentation from staff.

Clarence Fischer requested for the BATF to receive notice from BART as to when the new train gets added to the fleet.
He added that the platform markings for the third doors should be installed and completed sometime before the new train rolls out.

11. **Future Agenda Topics**

- Tour of eBART, platform and transfer stations
- Update/Discussion of new ADA signage at stations
- Review of BATF bylaws
- Presentation on Walnut Creek new parking structure construction and relocation of buses and kiss-and-ride
- Presentation on third door markings
- Discussion of updating Braille standards around BART
- Presentation on Tech Speak technology re destination sign speakers

12. **Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned to the next specially scheduled meeting of **Wednesday, November 8, 2017, at 2:00 p.m., at 1750 Broadway, Oakland, California.**

(The meeting adjourned at 3:54 p.m.)
1. Self-Introductions of Members, Staff, and Guests

Members:
Janet Abelson
Randall Glock
Janice Armigo-Brown
Peter Crockwell
Don Queen
Hale Zukas
Clarence Fischer
Gerry Newell
Herb Hastings
Alan Smith
Larry Bunn
Brandon Young (ABSENT)
Roland Wong
Esperanza Diaz-Alvarez
Debby Leung
Catherine Callahan
Valerie Buell
Chris Mullin

BART Staff present: Bob Franklin (ABSENT), Elena Van Loo

Director (s), Speakers, Staff, and Guests of the Public:
Grace Crunican (General Manager of BART)
Director Robert Raburn (BART Board Member)
Roderick McFarland (BART Staff)
Robert Mitroff (BART Staff)
Sue Shaffer (BART Staff)
Shannon Hake (BART Contractor)
Jerry Grace (Guest)
Janice Dispo, stenographer (ABSENT)

2. Public Comments
3. Approval of October 26, 2017 Minutes

[No minutes to approve at this time; minutes to be approved at the next meeting, December 13, 2017]

4. BART to San Jose Project Update

PowerPoint presentation from BART Staff, Robert Mitroff. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after his presentation.

Members expressed concerns with the single bore being that there are major safety issues compared to the twin bores.

Robert Mitroff announced to members and public that there will be a public meeting with the BART Board of Directors on November 16, 2017 about the BART extension to Silicon Valley.

Alan Smith made a motion to have a subcommittee. Esperanza Diaz-Alvarez seconded the motion.

Motion carries unanimously.

No abstentions.

Before item #5, Third Door Marking for the New (FOF) Fleet of the Future, was presented, Randall Glock introduced Grace Crunican who introduced herself. Grace mentioned that she’s here to listen and observe. Randall Glock invited Grace Crunican to one of the early BATF meetings for 2018. Grace mentioned she would be honored to participate at a BATF meeting.

Randall Glock quickly wanted to go to item #8, Staff Announcements.

5. Third Door Markings for the New Trains FOF (Fleet of the Future)

PowerPoint presentation from BART Staff, Roderick McFarland. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after his presentation.

Randall has expressed that he has tried many times to set a time to have members look at the new Fleet of the Future (FOF) and really get an idea where things are: e.g., emergency handle, the intercom, the monitors, braille locations, how to guide dogs under the chair, etc.

Grace Crunican will look into setting a time to visit the FOF (Fleet of the Future).
6. **BART Walnut Creek Station Improvements; Parking and Access**

PowerPoint presentation from BART Staff, Sue Shaffer. Members were allowed to ask questions and/or share any concerns they had after his presentation.

A long discussion was held.

7. **Chairperson Announcements**

Randall Glock – Reminded members, public, and staff of the BATF Holiday Reception on December 13, 2017 at 300 Lakeside Drive, 15th floor in Oakland.

Randall Glock – Wanted to go back to discuss a subcommittee for agenda #4, BART to San Jose project update. Stated that BATF can’t have more than half of the members to be on the subcommittee or it will be a full committee. Asked who wanted to be on the subcommittee.

Subcommittee for BART to San Jose project:

- Valerie Buell
- Roland Wong
- Hale Zukas
- Herb Hastings
- Alan Smith
- Larry Bunn
- Randall Glock
- Janice Armigo-Brown

Alan Smith – Will work with Gerry Newell on the letter to BART Board of Directors. Roland Wong and Esperanza Diaz-Alvarez will follow through.

8. **Staff Announcements**

Elena Van Loo – Reminded BATF members and public of the BATF Holiday Reception on December 13, 2017. Elena will be emailing members more detailed information on how to get to the BART administration building. Announced that there will be other staff to help on that day due to members concerns of getting lost with the construction going on at the BART administration building. Also noted to members and the public to give themselves plenty of time.

9. **Member Announcements**

Chris Mullin – Last Monday, November 6th, he and Don Queen completed a site visit to the Downtown Berkeley BART Station, and they concluded that it is a station with access challenges.
Herb Hasting – Complimented a BART operator from Dublin/Pleasanton to San Leandro by announcing the next station clearly and the intercom was at a right volume.

Clarence Fischer – Asked about if there’s a website or number for information on escalators closures/repairs? Elena Van Loo showed an example how to navigate escalator/elevators alerts under BART.gov to the members and the public to see.

10. Future Agenda Topics – Members Suggestions Topics

Gerry Newell – An update, maybe in January or February, with BART Policy Department to see if the GDA (General Disability Awareness) is being used by the police in the field.

Alan Smith – Would like a BART Police Officer to discuss dirty needles at the BART Stations.

Herb Hastings – Would like to bring back the topic, “path of travel,” as an agenda. There was no clear conclusion on this topic.

Janet Abelson – Wants to talk about the bus locations at the El Cerrito del Norte BART Station. There are concerns regarding accessible pathways.

Randall Glock – Review of BATF By-Laws. NO changes to the By-Laws, JUST a review. Randall requests that members read the BATF By-Laws before December 13, 2017 BATF meeting.

Clearance Fischer – A presentation with East Bay Paratransit procedures. Laura Timothy (BART staff to present).

11. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned to the next regularly scheduled meeting for December 13, 2017, at 2:00 p.m., at 300 Lakeside Drive, 15th Floor, Oakland, CA 94612.

(The meeting adjourned at 4:14 p.m.)
ARTICLE I – NAME OF TASK FORCE

The name of this task force shall be the BART Accessibility Task Force and may be referred to as “BATF.”

ARTICLE II – MISSION STATEMENT

The mission of the BATF is to advise the BART Board of Directors and staff on ways to maintain and improve the accessibility of the BART system for people with disabilities and for seniors. This mission is consistent with the District’s Strategic Plan goal to encourage public input.

ARTICLE III – RESPONSIBILITIES

A. Work with staff to:

1. Review, analyze and prepare recommendations on issues and policies, capital projects, compliance with local, state and federal legislation relating to the provision of accessible services at BART and other issues that might be brought to the BATF by the public, staff or the Board.

2. Develop recommendations which take into consideration the needs of people with different disabilities and seniors.

3. Participate in the development of proposed new policies and the planning and implementation of new services that affect people with disabilities and seniors who use BART.

4. Provide a public forum for discussion of all BART related issues concerning people with disabilities and seniors.

5. Act as a resource group to BART staff who interact with people with disabilities and seniors to answer complaints, to develop new 1 programs, to solve architectural problems in the system, to conduct staff disability trainings, and other areas as needed.
B. In order to accomplish these responsibilities BATF shall:

1. Educate themselves about the BART system, the budget process, the administrative process, the ADA as it relates to transportation accessibility issues, the project cost-analysis process, and the Brown Act.

2. Establish annual goals for BATF.

3. Make reports or recommendations to appropriate BART staff through the staff member designated to support the BATF as needed.

4. Report to the BART Board of Directors and send additional reports or recommendations as needed, which reports may be accompanied by a staff report as appropriate.

5. Recuse themselves from any matter before the Task Force in which they have a financial interest.

6. Complete ethics training required by the State of California.

ARTICLE IV – MEMBERSHIP

A. COMPOSITION

Members should be active BART users, who are people with disabilities or seniors over the age of 65. Except as stated above, BATF does not discriminate based on race, color, origin, sex, religion, sexual orientation, disability, or age in its membership.

The BATF shall be composed up to 18 members. The number of active members and the actual vote on actions shall be included on all communications to the Board and staff. If there are more than 18 applicants for the BATF, BART staff shall recommend 18 from among all those endorsed by the BATF, taking into consideration the goal of including people from all the parts of the BART system representing a diversity of disabilities and ages. There shall be no minimum number of members.

Some exceptions may be made to these eligibility criteria. The membership may include up to two non-disabled persons with special knowledge or technical training regarding the transportation needs for a particular disability.
B. TERM OF OFFICE

The term for each member of the BATF shall end on June 30 of odd-numbered years or when the BART Board announces appointments and reappointments for a new term, whichever occurs later.

C. NOMINATION AND SELECTION PROCESS

During the 2nd quarter of each odd-numbered calendar year, the staff liaison will contact each member to determine if they are interested in continuing to serve.

In addition, staff shall seek members through notices, in stations, on the BART website, contact with underrepresented disabled groups and seniors, and other means as appropriate. Out of four consecutive meetings, an interested applicant must attend three and then apply for membership. Applicants must be endorsed by the members of the BATF through a majority vote. Their names are submitted by the BATF staff liaison to the BART Board of Directors for final approval. The BATF staff liaison will notify the applicant of the Board’s decision regarding their application.

D. VOTING RIGHTS

Each member shall be entitled to one vote and may cast that vote on each matter submitted to a vote at a meeting of the BATF. Proxy, telephonic, electronic, or absentee ballots shall not be permitted.

E. RESIGNATION

Members may resign by notifying the BATF Chair or staff liaison, who then will inform the staff and BART Board of Directors.

ARTICLE V – TERMINATION OF MEMBERSHIP

A. A member’s appointment to the BATF shall be terminated upon a determination by the BATF that:

1. A member has missed four regular meetings in a calendar year. Because it is important that all views be represented at meetings, there is no provision for excused absences.

2. At the time of appointment, a member materially misrepresented information on their application.
3. A member has engaged in a consistent pattern of disruptive behavior in BATF or other BART related meetings which includes use of slurs, derogatory comments, or any other conduct, whether physical, verbal or written directed at another person or based upon another person’s race, color, origin, sex, religion, sexual orientation, disability, or age.

4. A member has ceased to reside in the BART District.

5. Notification has been received that a person is not available to serve as a member.

6. A member has failed to complete the required ethics training.

B. Staff liaison will notify the terminated individual about the termination, first by e-mail. If there is no response, then by phone. If there no response, then the individual will be notified about the end of their membership during the next two regularly scheduled meetings.

ARTICLE VI – OFFICERS

A. CHAIR

The BATF shall elect from its membership a Chair. The Chair will work with BART staff to develop an agenda, lead meetings and keep order, appoint members to subcommittees, present reports to the BART Board of Directors, and prepare and sign all letters, reports and other communications of the BATF. The Chair shall perform such other duties as may be requested from time to time by the BATF or BART staff.

B. VICE-CHAIR

The BATF shall elect from its membership a Vice-Chair who, in the absence or inability of the Chair to serve, shall have all of the powers and shall perform all of the duties of the Chair. The Vice-Chair shall perform such other duties from time to time as may be requested by the Chair.

C. 2nd VICE-CHAIR

The BATF shall elect from its membership a 2nd Vice-Chair who, in the absence or inability of the Chair and Vice-Chair to serve, shall have all the powers and shall perform all of the duties of the Chair and Vice-Chair. The 2nd Vice-Chair shall perform such other duties from time to time as may be requested by the Chair.
D. ELECTION OF CHAIR, VICE-CHAIR AND 2ND VICE-CHAIR

1. Term of Office

The officers of the BATF shall serve for one year or until the next election is held.

2. Nomination

At the September meeting, nominations and election of officers will be held. People may self-nominate or be nominated by other members. Nominations will be accepted from the floor prior to the close of nominations on the day of elections. The election of officers shall be by simple majority vote.

3. Vacancy

A vacancy in any office shall be filled by election for the unexpired term.

4. Temporary or Permanent Vacancies

If the Chair, Vice-Chair, and 2nd Vice-Chair are absent from any meeting and/or are unable to act, the meeting shall be called to order by staff. The staff shall immediately call for the selection of a Temporary Presiding Officer.

5. Failure to Elect

If the BATF fails to elect a Chair, Vice-Chair, or 2nd Vice-Chair, the existing Chair, Vice-Chair, or 2nd Vice-Chair shall continue to serve until the BATF elects a successor.

E. STAFF SUPPORT

The BART General Manager or her designee shall designate a person to serve as BATF staff to prepare meeting notices, agendas, and minutes as required and to serve as liaison between BATF and other BART staff and the Board of Directors.
ARTICLE VII – MEETINGS

A. REGULAR MEETINGS

All regular and special meetings of the BATF shall be conducted in accordance with the Ralph M. Brown Act. Meeting agendas shall be posted in a public place in the same manner as agendas posted for meetings of the BART Board of Directors. Meetings will be open to the public, held in a location accessible to people with disabilities, and within the geographical boundaries of the BART District. At least 72 hours prior to a regular meeting, an agenda must be posted which contains a brief general description of each item to be transacted or discussed at the meeting. Members of the public have the right to directly address BATF during public comment for issues which are not on the agenda, or for any item on the agenda, before or during the consideration of the item. Agendas will be mailed or emailed (based on preference) to members of the BATF and to persons requesting them according to the requirements of the Brown Act.

B. SPECIAL MEETINGS

Special meetings may be called by the Chair when in the opinion of the Chair the business of the BATF requires it or by the request of a majority of the BATF membership. Notice for special meetings will conform to the requirements of the Brown Act. No other business shall be considered at such meeting.

C. QUORUM

A majority of the appointed members of the must be present in order to constitute a quorum necessary for the transaction of the business of the BATF.

D. ADVICE AND DECISIONS OF THE BATF

All decisions of the BATF which require a formal vote shall be made only after an affirmative vote of a majority of its members present and voting. Minutes of meetings, as well as any special reports or communications desired by the BATF, shall be forwarded by staff to the BART Board of Directors. In addition, the Chair or a designee may present reports to the BART Board of Directors or an appropriate committee in person.

E. BATF MEETING EXPENSES FOR MEMBERS

BART will cover travel costs on public transit for BATF members to attend regular or special BATF meetings.
ARTICLE VIII – AGENDAS, MINUTES, RULES OF CONDUCT, AND ACCOMMODATIONS

A. AGENDAS

Members may contact the chair to have items put on the agenda. Also, each meeting agenda shall have an item when members may ask to put items on future agendas.

The Chair shall schedule items on the agenda in consultation with the staff liaison. Staff shall be responsible for distributing the final agenda and preparing or compiling the associated agenda materials for each meeting. Agenda materials shall normally be mailed to members one week prior to each meeting, but agenda distribution shall always conform to the requirements of the Brown Act.

B. MINUTES

Draft minutes of each BATF meeting shall be prepared by staff and distributed to BATF members and others together with the agenda for the next meeting. Minutes shall be made final after a majority vote of those BATF members who were present at the meeting.

C. RULES OF CONDUCT

All regular and special meetings of the BATF shall be conducted in accordance with these bylaws and with the Rules of Order used by the BART Board. In case of conflict, these bylaws shall take precedence.

The Chair, or a member appointed by the Chair, may represent the BATF to the BART Board of Directors with prior notice to the BATF and staff if possible. No member shall represent the BATF or BART to the general public unless authorized by the Board of Directors or its designee.

D. ACCOMMODATIONS FOR MEMBERS AND THE PUBLIC

On-going arrangements will be made with individual BATF members to accommodate their disability-related need for alternative formats for minutes, correspondence, exhibits and other graphic information, sign language interpreters, and captioning. Non-routine requests for accommodation must be made in a timely fashion.
The general public can also request routine or one-time provision of materials in alternative formats by making a request to the BART staff liaison in a timely fashion in advance of scheduled meeting times.

**ARTICLE IX – SUBCOMMITTEES**

The Chair has authority with concurrence by the BATF to appoint subcommittees and/or ad-hoc committees to address issues as needed.

**ARTICLE X – BYLAWS AMENDMENTS**

The bylaws may be proposed for amendment or repeal by a motion that is made and seconded and passed by a three-fourths (3/4) vote of members present at any regular or special meeting. In addition, written notice of the proposed amendment must be agendized and distributed given at the meeting prior to that at which action will be taken. The notice must contain both the original language and the proposed amending language to the bylaws. The proposed bylaws change must be reviewed by the BART legal staff and will be made final upon approval by the BART Board of Directors or their designee.

In addition to the procedure above, any bylaw may be altered, amended or annulled at any time by a majority vote of the BART Board of Directors after consultation with or by recommendation of the BATF and approval of BART legal staff.

**ARTICLE XI – TERM OF BATF**

BATF Term: The BATF shall remain in existence until discharged by action of the BART Board of Directors. The Board may periodically review the need for the BATF and may modify its composition, structure or bylaws after consultation with the BATF.

Grace Crunican,
General Manager

Amended September 2017