#### SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT

300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

# BART Police Citizen Review Board Meeting Minutes Monday, October 21, 2019

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held Monday, October 21, 2019, at 4:05 p.m. in the BART Board Room, 2040 Webster Street, Oakland, California. The meeting was called to order by Chairperson David Rizk; Mag Tatum, Recording Secretary.

#### 1. Call to Order.

The regular meeting was convened at 4:05 p.m. by Chairperson Rizk.

Members Present: Members Erin Armstrong, Zachary Bruno,

George Perezvelez, Pete Longmire, Robert Pirone, William White and

David Rizk.

Absent: Members Christina Gomez, Kenneth Loo and

Les Mensinger.

Darren White entered the meeting later.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

# 2. Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of September 9, 2019.

Member Armstrong moved that the Minutes of the Meeting of September 9, 2019 be approved; Member Perezvelez seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote. Ayes – 7: Members Armstrong, Bruno, Longmire, Perezvelez, Pirone, W. White and Rizk. Noes – 0. Absent – 4: Members Gomez, Loo, Mensinger and D. White.

#### 3. Introduction to the BART General Manager, Mr. Robert Powers.

Member Darren White entered the meeting.

Chairperson Rizk introduced BART General Manager, Mr. Powers addressed the Board. The Board and Mr. Powers discussed various topics of mutual concern.

# 4. Selection of Members for the Subcommittee on Public Outreach. (Vice Chair Armstrong's request.)

Vice Chairperson Armstrong brought the matter of Selection of Members for the Subcommittee on Public Outreach before the Board. The item was discussed. Members Armstrong, Bruno, Rizk, D. White and W. White volunteered to be appointed as part of the Subcommittee on Public Outreach.

#### 5. Use of Force / De-escalation Training Materials. (Chair Rizk's request.)

Chairperson Rizk presented information regarding the Use of Force / De-escalation Training Materials. The item was discussed and will come back to a future BPCRB meeting.

# 6. Chief of Police's Report.

### a. BART Police Department's Monthly Report for August 2019.

Interim Police Chief Ed Alvarez presented the BART Police Department's Monthly Report. The report was discussed.

#### b. Proposed Modifications to the BART Police Use of Force Review Board.

Deputy Chief Lance Haight presented the Proposed Modifications to the BART Police Use of Force Review Board. The item was discussed.

Member Longmire exited the meeting.

Chairperson Rizk moved that the proposed Modifications to the BART Police Use of Force Review Board be implemented, by removing two Use of Force Review Committee Members from the Use of Force review process, to codify the new BART Police Use of Force Review Board process in the BPD Manual Policy; and authorize the Office of the Independent Police Auditor to participate in the Use of Force review process. Member D. White seconded the motion. Member Bruno requested a bifurcation of the motion. Chairperson Rizk withdrew the motion.

Chairperson Rizk moved that the Modifications to the BART Police Use of Force Review Board be implemented, by removing two Use of Force Review Committee Members from the review process. Member Bruno seconded the motion, which carried by roll call vote. Ayes – 7: Members Armstrong, Bruno, Perezvelez, Pirone, D. White, W. White and Rizk. Noes – 0. Absent – 4: Members Gomez, Loo, Longmire and Mensinger.

Chairperson Rizk moved to codify the new BART Police Use of Force Review Board process in the BPD Manual Policy; and authorize the Office of the Independent Police Auditor to participate in the Use of Force review process. Member D. White seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote. Ayes – 6: Members Armstrong, Perezvelez, Pirone, D. White, W. White and Rizk. Noes – 1: Member Bruno. Absent – 4: Members Gomez, Loo, Longmire, and Mensinger.

Member Perezvelez moved to extend the meeting until 6:15 p.m. Member Armstrong seconded the motion. The motion was approved by unanimous acclamation.

## c. Annual Use of Force Report 2018.

Deputy Chief Lance Haight presented the Annual Use of Force Report 2018. The report was discussed.

# 7. Independent Police Auditor's Reports.

a. Office of the Independent Police Auditor (OIPA) Monthly Report for September 2019.

Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom presented the OIPA Monthly Report. The report was discussed.

b. National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) Annual Conference Report-back.

Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom will bring back the National Association for Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement (NACOLE) Annual Conference Report-back to a future BPCRB Meeting.

- **c. Description and Discussion of OIPA's Use of Force Review Process.** Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom presented OIPA's Use of Force Review Process. The report was discussed.
- **d. OIPA BART Rider Survey Findings.** Independent Police Auditor Russell Bloom will bring back the BART Rider Survey Findings to a future BPCRB Meeting.

#### 8. Public Comment.

Chairperson Rizk called for Public Comment. No comments received.

Chairperson Rizk announced that the Board would enter closed session under Item 9-A (Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in OIPA Case #19-10) of the regular meeting agenda, and that the Board would reconvene in open session at the conclusion of the closed session.

The Meeting recessed at 6:15 p.m.

The Meeting reconvened in Closed Session at 6:16 p.m.

#### 9. Closed Session.

a. To consider Public Employee Discipline/Dismissal/Release in OIPA Case #19-10. Govt. Code §54957.

# 10. Adjournment.

The Meeting reconvened in Open Session at 6:17 p.m.

Chairperson Rizk announced that OIPA Case #19-10 will come back to a future BPCRB meeting.

The Meeting was adjourned at 6:18 p.m.