

SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

Special BART Police Citizen Review Board Meeting Minutes
Monday, June 15, 2020

A Special meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held Monday, June 15, 2020, convening at 4:01 p.m. via teleconference, pursuant to Governor Gavin Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 and the California Shelter-in-Place mandate. The meeting was called to order by Chairperson David Rizk; Mag Tatum, Recording Secretary.

Chairperson Rizk gave instructions on the virtual meeting, accessing presentation materials online, Public Comment, and Members' remarks.

1. Call to Order.

The regular meeting was convened at 4:01 p.m. by Chairperson Rizk.

Members Present: Members Erin Armstrong, Zachary Bruno, Christina Gomez, Pete Longmire, Les Mensinger, Kenneth Loo, George Perezvelez, Darren White, William White, and David Rizk.

Absent: Member Robert Pirone.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

2. Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests.

Chairperson Rizk presented the Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests. The item was discussed.

Member Mensinger moved the Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests be sent to the BART Board of Directors. Member Darren White seconded the motion.

Member Bruno suggested an amendment to the original motion to replace the term "murder" with the words "outrageous killing" within the Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests. Member Mensinger did not accept Member Bruno's amendment to the motion.

Member Bruno made a substitute motion to remove the word "murder" and replace the word with "outrageous killing" within the Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests. Member Loo seconded the motion, which failed by roll call vote. Ayes – 2: Members Bruno and Loo. Noes – 8: Members Armstrong, Gomez, Longmire, Mensinger, Perezvelez, D. White, W. White, and Rizk. Abstain – 0. Absent – 1: Member Pirone.

Member Bruno made another substitute motion to strike the word “murder” and replace it with the following words “with murder being the charge” within the Draft Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests. Member Longmire seconded the motion, which failed by roll call vote. Ayes – 3: Members Bruno, Longmire, and Loo. Noes – 7: Members Armstrong, Gomez, Mensinger, Perezvelez, D. White, W. White, and Rizk. Abstain – 0. Absent – 1: Member Pirone.

Chairperson Risk returned to the original motion by Member Mensinger and seconded by Member Darren White. The motion carried by roll call vote. Ayes – 8: Members Armstrong, Gomez, Longmire, Mensinger, Perezvelez, D. White, W. White, and Rizk. Noes – 1: Member Bruno. Abstain – 1: Member Loo. Absent – 1: Member Pirone.

Chairperson Rizk called for Public Comment. No comments were received.

(Affixed to the Minutes is the Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd and Local and Nationwide Protests)

3. Open Discussion Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd.

Chairperson Rizk presented the Open Discussion Regarding the Death of Mr. George Floyd. The item was discussed.

4. Public Comment.

Chairperson Rizk called for Public Comment.

The following members of the BART Board of Directors gave comments:

Director Janice Li
Director Rebecca Saltzman
Director Robert Raburn
Director Elizabeth Ames

The following individuals addressed the Board via telephone:

Tyler
Yolanda Banks
Crystal Hartfelt
Marty James
Cars Taylor
Bobby White
Wanda Johnson
Cecil Gardner
Ziga Manual
Ben Douglas
Cephus Johnson
Jim Cringle
Tedder
Anna
Rachel

Emma
Demetris Tess
Jamie

5. Proposal of Potential Policy Reforms from BART Police Citizen Review Board and the Office of the Independent Police Auditor.

Chairperson Rizk presented the Proposals of Potential Policy Reforms from BART Police Citizen Review Board and the Office of the Independent Police Auditor. The item was discussed.

The following individuals addressed the Board via telephone:

Janice Li, BART Board member.
Russell Bloom, Independent Police Auditor.
Chief of Police Ed Alvarez.

Chairperson Rizk moved that the BART Police Citizen Review Board urges the BART Board of Directors to fundamentally re-examine public safety on the trains, including fare evasion, homelessness, quality of life and minor offenses, oversight, and alternative ways to achieve racial justice and fight racism on the BART system. We stand ready to support the Board of Directors in this endeavor. Member Loo seconded the motion.

Member Armstrong suggested an amendment to the original motion to include the review time in discipline cases. Chairperson Rizk accepted the amendment.

Member Zachary Bruno exited the meeting.
Member Christina Gomez exited the meeting.
Member George Perezvelez exited the meeting.
Member Darren White exited the meeting

Chairperson Rizk moved as amended that the BART Police Citizen Review Board urges the BART Board of Directors to fundamentally reexamine public safety on the trains, including fare evasion, homelessness, quality of life and minor offenses, oversight (including the time for disciplinary cases to be resolved), and alternative ways to achieve racial justice and fight racism on the BART system. We stand ready to support the Board of Directors in this endeavor. Member Loo seconded the motion which carried by roll call vote. Ayes – 6: Members Armstrong, Longmire, Loo, Mensinger, W. White, and Rizk. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 5: Members Bruno, Gomez, Perezvelez, Pirone, and D. White.

Adjournment.

The Meeting was adjourned at 7:02 p.m. and in honor of Sergeant Damon Gutzwiller, Santa Cruz County Sheriff's Office, California, and Patrick Underwood, Federal law enforcement officer, Oakland, California.