

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2688

**BART Police Citizen Review Board Meeting Minutes**  
**Monday, August 10, 2020**

A regular meeting of the BART Police Citizen Review Board (BPCRB) was held Monday, August 10, 2020, convening at 4:00 p.m. via teleconference, pursuant to Governor Gavin Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 and the California Shelter-in-Place mandate. This meeting was a joint meeting with BART Board of Directors. The meeting was called to order by Chairperson David Rizk; Mag Tatum, Recording Secretary.

Chairperson Rizk gave instructions on the virtual meeting, accessing presentation materials online, Public Comment, and Members' remarks.

**1. Call to Order.**

The regular meeting was convened at 4:00 p.m. by Chairperson Rizk.

Members Present: Members Erin Armstrong, Zachary Bruno, Christina Gomez, Kenneth Loo, Les Mensinger, George Perezvelez, William White, and David Rizk.

Absent: Member Todd Davis, Pete Longmire, and Darren White.

The Pledge of Allegiance was recited.

**2. Opening Remarks.**

Lateefah Simon, BART Board President, David Rizk, BPCRB Chair, Mr. Robert Powers, BART General Manager, and Mr. Don Casimere, Facilitator, made opening remarks.

Members Todd Davis and Darren White entered the meeting.

**3. Public Comment on Item 4 Only.**

Chairperson Rizk called for Public Comment on Item 4 only.

The following individuals addressed the Board via telephone:

Cephus Johnson  
Nick Carroway  
Karen  
Wanda Johnson  
Joe Kunzler  
Gigi Gamble  
Patrick Mortiere  
Michael Petrelis  
David  
Dan

Kylie

Member Darren White exited the meeting.

4.

**a. BART Police Model Enhancements.**

Mr. Rodd Lee, BART Assistant General Manager, External Affairs, presented Roll Call for Introductions 20-832 to the BPCRB. The presentation was discussed.

**b. Overview of the BART Police Citizen Review Board Model.**

Chairperson Rizk presented an overview of BART Police Citizen Review Board Model. The report was discussed.

**c. BPCRB Stakeholder Input and Recommendations.**

Don Casimere, Facilitator, presented the BPCRB Stakeholder Input and Recommendations. The information was discussed.

The following BPCRB members gave comments:

Member W. White commented on the following subjects:

- his experience with police oversight
- his experience in the mental health industry
- the need for mental health professionals in the Bay Area
- the role of police unions

Member Gomez thanked the public speakers and commented on the following subjects:

- drug use and overdoses
- fare evasion
- utilizing police for behavioral issues
- partnerships between local counties to resolve issues of substance abuse
- platforms for homeless advocates and partnering with other entities

Member Armstrong commented on the following subjects:

- the need to reimagine what policing means
- ways to serve the community better and having the right tools to do the job
- assistance for homeless individuals
- policing crimes of poverty
- structural issues, structural changes and structural elements.
- the role of the police unions
- advocates for more compassionate policies on the detention of transgender individuals
- BART continuing to lead the way in reform. Reform is not a destination; it is a journey.

Member Perezvelez thanked the public speakers and commented on the following subjects:

- his experience with safety and the perception of safety
- his experience with transgender general orders
- various assembly bills and senate bills (AB392, SB230, AB1506, and SB776)
- the need for a BPCRB Use of Force Subcommittee
- the need for rapid response teams for mental health crisis
- the need to provide additional training for BART dispatchers
- his viewpoints on reassessing priorities and not criminalizing homelessness and poverty

Member Loo commented on the following subjects:

- his experience with professional rescues at stations
- homeless and behavioral problems in the stations
- the need for additional resources for more homeless outreach teams and after-hour homeless shelters
- safety and security of passengers
- partnering with regional and municipalities and advocating for additional resources

Member Bruno thanked the public speakers and commented on the following subjects:

- a rise in violent crimes at the stations
- opposition in taking funds away from the police
- fare evasion
- police reforms
- zero sustained complaints for racial discrimination or bias against police officers
- success stories of reform at BART's police dept.
- the need for riders to have clean, safe, and reliable transit

Member Davis commented on the following subjects:

- his experience with bias citations
- the need to re-envision police funding
- the need for culture changes in the police dept.
- the need to focus on the source or critical issues that cause use of force incidents

Member Rizk thanked the public speakers and commented on the following subjects:

- the need for evidence-based reforms
- the need to collect more data on what the police is actual doing
- Chief of Police monthly reports
- low level offenses
- the need to refocus on core public safety missions of the police dept
- fare evasion and proof a payment are equity issues
- the need to provide a report from Center of Police and Equity with racial demographics data
- racial disparities in fare enforcement

- the need for a transparent process and public input
- the need for changes in bias enforcement
- the need to refocus the police department on core issues

Member Mensinger thanked the public speakers and commented on the following subjects:

- assistance for homeless individuals
- partnerships between local counties to provide additional assistance for the homeless

- d. BART Board of Directors' Comments and Feedback. For discussion.  
Don Casimere, Facilitator, presented the BART Board of Directors' Comments and Feedback. The information was discussed.

The following Board of Directors gave comments:

President Lateefah Simon  
Vice President Mark Foley  
Director Debora Allen  
Director Elizabeth Ames  
Director Bevan Dufty  
Director Janice Li  
Director John McPartland  
Director Robert Raburn  
Director Rebecca Saltzman

Chair Rizk moved to extend the meeting to 6:30 p.m. Member Perezvelez seconded the motion which carried by a unanimous acclamation. Ayes – 9: Members Armstrong, Bruno, Davis, Gomez, Loo, Mensinger, Perezvelez, W. White, and Rizk. Noes – 0. Abstain – 0. Absent – 2: Members Longmire and D. White.

## **5. Summary and Next Steps.**

Don Casimere, Facilitator, stated that all recommendations will be continued to a future meeting.

## **Adjournment.**

The Meeting was adjourned at 6:25 p.m.

# BART POLICE CITIZENS REVIEW BOARD

---

## MEMORANDUM

**TO:** Board of Directors **DATE:** June 19, 2020

**FROM:** BPCRB Members Armstrong, Gomez, Longmire, Mensinger, Perezvelez, Rizk, D. White, and W. White.

**SUBJECT:** Statement from the BART Police Citizen Review Board - Regarding the Tragic Murder of George Floyd

The BART Police Department Citizen Review Board denounces, in the strongest possible terms, the needless and tragic murder of George Floyd, and hereby affirms that his life and all black lives matter.

Mr. Floyd's death has understandably deepened public distrust in law enforcement around the country, including in the communities that our members represent.

The BART Police Department Citizen Review Board was created after the death of Oscar Grant as part of a system of civilian oversight that "promotes integrity and encourages systemic change and improvement in the police services that [BART] provides to the public."

Although the BART Police Department has made many significant reforms since Mr. Grant's death, we have a duty to continue to advocate for greater change and improvement. We hear the call from our communities for dramatic changes to policing, and we as a Board commit to explore and advocate for structural changes to the way public safety is guaranteed throughout the BART system.

We welcome and encourage public participation and input, as well as collaboration with other stakeholders at BART, in this process.

We reaffirm our commitment to this movement in memory of Mr. Floyd and Mr. Grant.

cc: Board Appointed Officers  
Deputy General Manager  
Police Department

