

**SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT**  
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688, Oakland, CA 94604-2888

Citizen Review Board  
Minutes of the 20th Meeting  
Monday, December 10, 2012

A regular meeting of the Citizen Review Board (CRB) was held on Monday, December 10, 2012, convening at 4:00p.m. in the BART Board Room, 344 20<sup>th</sup> Street, Oakland, California.

Members Present: Sharon Kidd, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, Ken Jones, William White, Thomas Minshew, George Perezvelez, Peter Barnett, and Sukari Beshears.

Members Absent: None.

BART Staff: Independent Police Auditor Mark P. Smith, Independent Police Investigator Kobia West, Senior Administrative Analyst Anita Grayson, BART Police Chief Kenton W. Rainey, BART Deputy Police Chief Janeith Glenn-Davis, BART Police Lieutenant Lance Haight and BART Police Administrative Analyst Frances Cheung.

Others Present: BART Director Thomas Blalock

Agenda Items discussed:

- 1. Call to Order.**  
The regular meeting was called to order at 4:04p.m. by Mr. Douglas, Board Chairperson.
- 2. Call for Quorum.**  
Sharon Kidd, Les Mensinger, Douglas Hambleton, Benjamin Douglas, Ken Jones, Thomas Minshew, George Perezvelez, William White, and Peter Barnett were present, amounting to a quorum. Mr. Douglas informed the Citizen Review Board of Daniel Buford's resignation.
- 3. Pledge of Allegiance Recital.**  
The pledge of allegiance was recited.
- 4. Public Comment Items 5 through 9 Only.**  
There were no public comments.
- 5. Approval of Minutes of Prior Board Meeting. For Discussion and Action.**  
Ms. Kidd made a motion to approve the minutes of the previous board meeting. Mr. White requested that his and Ms. Kidd's names be included as attending the 2012 NACOLE Conference. Ms. Kidd's motion was then seconded by Mr. Mensinger. The motion passed unanimously.

- 6. Chief of Police Report. For Discussion and Action.**  
Chief Rainey recognized Antwinette Turner as a new graduate from the Napa Valley Police Academy.

Ms. Beshears joined the meeting at 4:08 p.m.

Chief Rainey recognized the following citizens for their heroic actions responding to crime in the BART system: SF Firefighters John Baxter, Don Bendo, and Matthew Hutchinson, System Service Worker Kevin McNeary, Station Agents Sabrina Colon and George Lopez, and Mr. Karthik Damoor.
- 7. Review of Draft Annual Report of the Office of the Independent Police Auditor. For Discussion and Action.**  
Mr. Smith addressed the CRB and presented a draft of the OIPA annual report. Recommendations were made by the CRB members. Mr. Smith announced the resignation of Daniel Buford from the CRB and welcomed aboard Anita Grayson to the Office of the Independent Police Auditor's staff. It was noted that the January 14<sup>th</sup> CRB regular meeting will convene at 5:00 p.m.
- 8. Independent Police Auditor Report. For Discussion and Action.**  
Mr. Smith presented the OIPA monthly report and responded to questions from the CRB.
- 9. Closed Session.**  
**A. To Consider Public Employee Performance (Room 303 Board Conference Room). Govt. Code § 54957.**  
The CRB entered into closed session at 4:55p.m.
- 10. Open Session.**  
The CRB concluded the closed session at 5:27p.m. and resumed the regular CRB meeting. Mr. Douglas reported that a motion was made to table the matter discussed in closed session, and that the motion passed with 8 votes in favor, 1 abstention and 1 vote against.
- 11. General Discussion and Public Comment. Limited to 3 Minutes per Speaker.**  
There was no public comment. Kobia West addressed the CRB members and requested their support and assistance in organizing the next OIPA/CRB community outreach forum in January 2013.
- 12. Adjournment.**  
A motion was made by Ms. Kidd to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Mensinger seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously and the meeting was adjourned at 5:40p.m.